

This is an Open Access document downloaded from ORCA, Cardiff University's institutional repository:<https://orca.cardiff.ac.uk/id/eprint/104076/>

This is the author's version of a work that was submitted to / accepted for publication.

Citation for final published version:

Franklin, Robert 2014. The future of journalism: in an age of digital media and economic uncertainty. *Journalism Studies* 15 (5) , pp. 481-499. 10.1080/1461670X.2014.930254

Publishers page: <http://dx.doi.org/10.1080/1461670X.2014.930254>

Please note:

Changes made as a result of publishing processes such as copy-editing, formatting and page numbers may not be reflected in this version. For the definitive version of this publication, please refer to the published source. You are advised to consult the publisher's version if you wish to cite this paper.

This version is being made available in accordance with publisher policies. See <http://orca.cf.ac.uk/policies.html> for usage policies. Copyright and moral rights for publications made available in ORCA are retained by the copyright holders.



THE FUTURE OF JOURNALISM

In an age of digital media and economic uncertainty

The “age of digital media” is witnessing innovation and radical change across all aspects of journalism, creating economic difficulties for legacy media and a frenzied search for alternative business models to fund a sustainable journalism for the future. The global recession since 2007 continues to deepen the sense of economic uncertainty arising from a period of unprecedented change with significant and wide-ranging consequences for the journalism industry as well as scholarly research in the field of journalism studies.

The Future of Journalism conference hosted by Cardiff University on 12 and 13 September 2013 was convened by the School of Journalism, Media and Cultural Studies, to address these concerns via five broadly framed questions concerning the current circumstances and future prospects for journalism. How are developments in digital and mobile media, for example, creating new possibilities for producing, distributing and consuming journalism and, in turn, informing an innovatory journalism practice? What are the implications of these changes for traditional business models and for the emergence of new financial strategies to fund journalism? How are these developments evidenced in particular national contexts with their bespoke journalism cultures, histories and professional practices? What are the consequences for journalism education, training and employment, along with journalists’ changing perceptions of their professional roles? Finally, what are the implications of this fundamental restructuring of journalism for the ethical, political and democratic life of communities locally, nationally and globally?

The subtitle of the conference, “The Future of Journalism: *In an Age of Digital Media and Economic Uncertainty*”, was chosen to encourage a particular focus on developments in digital media, but also on the financial strategies designed to resource a viable and democratic digital journalism. The presence of Robert Picard as plenary speaker was intended to underscore that latter focus. The 2013 conference attracted 200 scholars from more than 35 countries, with 184 authors presenting 113 research-based papers in 30 seminar sessions across the two days.

The Future of Journalism 2011–2013

By way of setting the agenda, if not risking what Tony Harcup called stating “the bleeding obvious” (Harcup 2011), this is undoubtedly a *significant* time in the history of journalism when almost every aspect of the production, reporting and reception of news is changing. The significance of the future of journalism, with its many implications for communications within local, national and international communities, for economic growth, the operation of democracy, and the maintenance and development of the social and cultural life of societies around the globe, is all but impossible to overstate. But it is the *pace* of change, as much as its

character, which is striking and which leaves publishers, industry analysts and academics struggling to make their research findings and scholarly discussions relevant and timely. Shapiro, for example, describes the speed of the transformation of journalism as “dizzying”, but laments that publication schedules too often transform cutting-edge findings into “yesterday’s news” (Shapiro, 2014). The modest ambition for this Introduction is to record what seem to be key developments and trends emerging between the Future of Journalism conferences in 2011 and 2013. The hope is that it might signal some of the concerns highlighted by subsequent contributions, provide some brief context for these contributions, as well as offering some signposts to the infinitely variable but possible future(s) for journalism: to help us to explore what has been described in a wonderfully expressive phrase, as “this moment of mind-blowing uncertainty in the evolution of journalism” (Domingo, Masip, and Costera Meijer, 2014).

The Crises of “Financial Viability” and “Civic Adequacy?”

The contraction of legacy media continues apace, characterised by falling audiences, readerships and advertising revenues. Editorial staffs are still shrinking although more slowly than during the 2008–9 peaks and at differential rates reflecting the circumstances of distinctive media platforms, media sectors and national settings. The number of daily papers in the United States has fallen from 1611 in 1990 to 1387 in 2009; editorial jobs are also down with the Paper Cuts website reporting 16,000 job losses in 2008, reducing to 1850 in 2012 (Paper Cuts 2014). Pew’s *State of the News Media 2013* report, perhaps a little optimistically, characterises newspapers as “stabilizing but still threatened”, despite a fall in print advertising for the sixth consecutive year: and by a substantial \$1.8 billion in 2013, or 8 per cent. Measured by revenues, the newspaper industry in the United States has shrunk to 60 per cent of its size a decade ago. Newspaper companies struggle to meet pension and debt commitments and continue to reduce news staff, while some papers have shrunk publication frequency to three times a week. Major newspaper titles have sold their presses and “aggressively” seek to contract out printing: “imposing headquarters buildings ... are relics ... and with the real estate market improving, selling makes more sense” (Edmonds et al. 2013, 8).

In the United Kingdom, national, regional and local newspapers confront similar problems, but the larger city-based, daily local papers have suffered disproportionate losses of titles, circulation and staff, compared to the traditional weekly paid newspapers. The loss of advertising revenues has been critical in shaping this decline. By 2017 newspaper advertising in the United Kingdom is projected to have fallen to £1.9 billion (11.2 per cent of market share), while significantly, digital advertising spend will grow from

£7.1 billion (47.5 per cent) in 2014 to a prominence above all legacy media at £9 billion (53.8 per cent) in 2017 (Reynolds 2014). Leading newspaper group Johnston Press, which owns 250 local newspaper titles (approximately one-quarter of the UK local newspaper market), announced losses of £248.7 million in the first

six months of 2013 (McCulloch 2013). This “crisis of financial viability” is closely related to a “crisis of civic adequacy”, to employ Blumler’s preferred terms (Blumler 2010). Starved of economic and editorial resources, these local newspaper watchdogs are constrained on a tight financial leash, no longer able to hold local politicians and governments to account. Research in the United States (Fico et al. 2013) and Sweden (Karlsson and Holt 2014) signals that the newly emerging participatory, hyperlocal news organisations are insufficiently resourced to substitute for the democratic oversight provided by the disappearing local papers; they are “imperfect substitutes at best for most newspapers when it comes to local government coverage” (Fico et al. 2013, 166).

But, intriguingly and counterintuitively, Neil Thurman’s recent analysis of on and offline newspaper reading trends in the United Kingdom revealed that in 2011, 96.7 per cent of the time domestic audiences spent reading was devoted to print editions (Thurman 2014); so some good news, for those allegedly suffering from “crisis of journalism” *ennui* and fatigue (Chyi, Lewis, and Zheng 2012).

Paywalls: A Viable Business Model?

Paywalls are being erected at break-neck speed, seemingly reversing the earlier industry mood that “news must remain free”. But they are also being demolished—and promptly. In mid-August 2013, for example, *The San Francisco Chronicle* announced the collapse of the paywall erected in the previous March. Others—if not collapsing—are “softening” and reducing prices in the face of competition. A study by Pickard and Williams (2014) notes that the *New York Times*’ “metered” paywall has halved its free offer of 20 stories to only 10.

The reasons for all this tumbling masonry are apparent. A recent eight-country survey of paywalls (Myllylahti 2014) found that they deliver only 10 per cent of media companies’ revenues, while *Business Insider* magazine posed the killer dilemma: while the average print subscriber generates \$1100 a year, the equivalent figure for a digital subscriber is \$175. Myllylahti concludes that paywalls are “not a viable business model”. Paywalls, moreover, contribute to a democratic deficit by using “the ability to pay” to gatekeep exclusion from quality news (Pickard and Williams 2014). In this way, paywalls constitute a modern version of the enclosure movement in which the common pastures of high-quality, wide-ranging news reporting—which were open and accessible to everyone— are suddenly fenced off to allow access to only a privileged few. Add to this the fact that a study of content provided on *Die Welt*’s online edition, before and after the erection of a metered paywall in December 2012, detected no discernible improvement (“no added value”) in the quality or uniqueness of published news stories, above that which was available for free elsewhere on the internet, and the rationale for “paying for news” becomes inexplicable. The study concludes that “the rather remarkable result is that *welt. de* now

demands money for content and services [in the Business and Finance section] which the news website offered for free before erecting the paywall and which users can get elsewhere on the Web without payment” (Brandstetter and Schmalhofer 2014).

“Multiple Revenue Streams” or “Low-pay, No-pay Journalism?”

There seems to be no agreement (within the journalism industry or the academy) about the appropriateness of particular alternatives to the advertiser model, as legacy media experiment with various mixes of pay walls (Myllylahti 2014; Pickard and Williams 2014), advertising on mobile devices (Reynolds 2014; Nel and Westlund 2012), the sale of newspaper apps (Franklin 2013a), crowdfunding, crowdsourcing and co-creation (Aitamurto 2013), hyperlocal business models (van Kerkhoven and Bakker 2014), not-for-profit models which secure funding from international non-governmental organisations, private foundations and think-tanks (Requejo-Alemán and Lugo-Ocando 2014), a mix of public funding, sales and subscription to finance minority-language journalism (Zabaleta et al. 2014), efforts to monetise hyperlinks (Doherty 2014) and, finally, even the bizarre-sounding but expansive provision of machine- or robot-written news (Clerwall 2014; van Dalen 2013). The latest digital media innovation which offers the promise of a revenue stream is grabbed with all the enthusiasm previously reserved for lifebelts on the Titanic, rather than with any sense of certainty about resourcing a sustainable new era of journalism. But Picard (2014) is ultimately optimistic, celebrates the diversity of business models and revenue streams, and concludes:

What is clear is that news providers are becoming less dependent on any one form of funding than they have been for about 150 years. Multiple revenue streams from readers and advertisers, from events and e-commerce, from foundations and sponsors, and from related commercial services such as web hosting and advertising services are all contributing income. It is too early to assess fully the efficacy and sustainability of these sources, but they provide reason to believe that workable new business models are appearing in news provision. (Picard 2014) scholars such as Piet Bakker demur from this assessment arguing that increasing pressures to produce cheaper content for digital platforms by using “aggregation, content farms and Huffinization” have given rise to a “low-pay and no-pay journalism” where content is no longer King and, following its abdication, “part-timers and amateurs” rather than professional journalists proliferate (Bakker 2012).

Four Hundred Million Tweets Posted Daily—and Growing!

The expansive popularity of social media, especially Twitter, offers a further development of consequence for the future of journalism. On the occasion of its seventh birthday in March 2013, Twitter claimed more than

200 million active users, with 400 million tweets posted daily (Hermida 2013). The use of Twitter by journalists as well as readers—surely the definitive “blurring boundary”—is clearly significant. For journalists, Twitter is a substantial and invaluable *source* of breaking news but, as Farida Vis’ study of covering the London Riots in 2011 revealed, it is also a significant platform for *reporting* breaking news (Vis 2013). It is, moreover, an important vehicle for more participatory forms of citizen journalism, even if the 140-character format requires the journalistic skills of tabloid compression to be highly developed. Journalists’ uses of Twitter for news- gathering and reporting have become a normalised aspect of their professional practice (Lasorsa, Lewis, and Holton 2012), although the extent and regularity with which journalists use Twitter and other social media, in their private and professional lives, varies substantially reflecting their age, and professional attitudes (Hedman and Djerf- Pierre 2013).

The implications for legacy media seem significant, although occasionally some claims risk challenge for hyperbole: Siapera, Papadopoulou, and Archontakis (2014), for example, assert that “if the advent of the internet did not undermine the existing media system and journalism, then the rise of social media surely did”. Other research studies counsel greater caution concerning the role of social media in two ways. First, Ju, Jeong, and Chyi (2014) argue that the business strategy of newspapers concerning the contribution of social media to revenue streams risks replicating the errors of their earlier “web experiment by seeking eyeballs before locating a revenue stream, giving content away for free and granting audiences access to aggregators”. Their analysis of 66 US newspapers revealed that while the distribution of newspapers’ content through social networking sites has become “common practice”, their “contribution to ... advertising revenue seems underwhelming” (Ju, Jeong, and Chyi 2014). Second, research has also revealed the dissonance which can characterise social and legacy media evidenced in

newspaper editors’ choices of content and the topics chosen for sharing by social media users (Twitter, Facebook, Google+, Delicious, Pinterest and StumbleUpon). A study of the *New York Times* and the *Guardian* revealed that while newspapers emphasise sport, the economy, entertainment and celebrity stories, users of social networking sites, in “sharp contrast”, prefer to share opinion pieces as well as local, national and global news stories. Consequently, despite their prominence in both newspapers, sports stories, for example, “fail to actively engage the social media audience” with only a quarter of sport-related articles published by the *New York Times* featuring on Facebook or Twitter. The study also highlights the marked differences between the social media presence of newspapers, with 86 per cent of *Guardian* articles appearing on Facebook and a very striking 96 per cent on Twitter, compared to 40 and 36 per cent, respectively, for the *New York Times*, perhaps reflecting the presence of a paywall at the latter paper

(Bastos 2014).

Mobile Devices and News on the Move

The sheer scale and pace of the growth in ownership of mobile phones and tablets by journalists and the public has been extraordinary. The *Guardian* (21 August 2013) claimed the sale of tablets in the first six months of 2013 had doubled compared to the same period in 2012; PCs and laptops have rapidly become yesterday's news. In the United Kingdom, mobile advertising revenues are forecast to overtake newspaper advertising revenues in 2014 as they rise to £2.3 billion from £1.9 billion in 2013 while newspaper revenues (national and local) continue their decline from £2.2 billion to £2.1 billion across the same period (Reynolds 2014). In the United States, Pew's *State of the News Media 2013* report's section on "Tablets, Smartphones and Social Media" claims:

Even if growth slows from exponential to merely fast, each of these three platforms has become huge and stands to get bigger. Nearly half of US adults have smartphones and 31% have tablet devices ... A rising share of news consumption goes to each of these platforms. Some digital business analysts see mobile largely supplanting desktop/laptop consumption within two or three years. (Edmonds et al. 2013)

Mobile devices are undoubtedly a game changer, offering journalists liberation from the newsroom in a way that John Pavlik anticipated more than a decade ago (Pavlik 2001). Journalists can use smartphones and tablets to access legacy and social media news reports, use them in turn as news *sources*, respond to them and upload their own reports and/or post comments. Technologically, mobile devices provide the necessary preconditions to make "news on the move" a reality.

Oscar Westlund's (2013) concluding observation in his magisterial overview of research studies of mobile devices, that six billion people worldwide now enjoy network access via a mobile device which is a greater number of people than are connected to electricity, makes it difficult not to speculate about the possible implications of this compelling statistic for the future of journalism.

Data Journalism and "Emerging Forms of Story Telling"

A significant development since the Future of Journalism conference 2011 has been the emergence of new "genres" of journalism, most notably data journalism, defined and understood as an "emerging form of storytelling" which combines the skills and techniques informing journalists' professional practice with data analysis and programming skills (Appelgren and Nygren 2014). Data journalism involves interrogating large data sets, that may be crowdsourced, and hence initial assessments of the possible contribution of

data journalism is judged to be to enhance news production, with particular emphasis on the potential to invigorate investigative journalism (Gray, Chambers, and Bounegru 2012). Data journalism has affinities with what Meyer (1991) termed “precision journalism” and (Flew et al. (2012) designated “computational journalism” (Karlsen and Stavelin 2014). In the United Kingdom, the *Guardian* newspaper has done much to pioneer practitioner developments in data journalism, while in the academy this new genre is emerging rather than established and scholarly literature is relatively sparse; a special issue of *Digital Journalism*(3.3) intends to profile this new area of scholarship within the journalism studies field.

Journalism’s Culture, Professional Roles and Ethics

The Leveson Inquiry raised significant concerns about journalism’s professional culture, journalists’ professional roles, ethics and identity; and all this in the context of a debate about journalists’ relations with sources, especially politicians, as well as a heated debate about regulation and the balance between privacy and press freedom (Dawes 2014; Franklin 2013a). Phone hacking by journalists at the *News of the World* shocked the public, led to the closure of the title, and witnessed the charging and arrest of journalists and newspaper executives. At the time of writing, the case against Andy Coulson, previously editor of the *News of the World*, and Rebekah Brooks, the former Chief Executive of News International (News UK since 26 June 2013), is ongoing.

Lord Justice Leveson opened the hearings for his Inquiry on 14 November 2011 by stressing the fundamental importance of newspapers to the broader democratic functioning of a polity. The press, he announced “provides an essential check on all aspects of public life. That is why any failure within the media affects us all”. It follows for Leveson that the “one simply question” at the “heart of this inquiry ... may be: who guards the guardians?” (Leveson Inquiry 2012). The central proposal of Leveson’s final 2000 page report, published on 29 November 2012 (Leveson Inquiry – Report 2012), which recommended the establishment of a statutory body to oversee the new independent press regulator (the “guardian” who “guards the guardian”), was promptly rejected by Prime Minister Cameron. On 9 July 2013 the successor to the Press Complaints Commission (PCC), the Independent Press Standards Organisation (IPSO 2014 <http://www.ipso.co.uk/>), was announced but derided as a “cynical rebranding exercise” (Hacked Off 2011).

Scholarly comment on the hacking affair has been perhaps predictably slower to emerge, but in an effort to explain the press’ “longstanding resistance to accountability”, Thomas and Finneman (2014) analysed four “meta-discourses” (catastrophisation, self- affirmation, minimisation and localisation) encoded in press reporting of the phone- hacking scandal. Their concern was to explore journalism’s own views about Leveson and

press regulation or, in their preferred phrase, “journalism about journalism”. In aggregate, these four discourses signal an “institutional ideology” which is “quick to assert rights” but reluctant to accept any reciprocal responsibilities (Thomas and Finneman 2014).

But the journalism “Hunters” in turn became the “Hunted” when in August 2013 the *Guardian* began to report the ease and regularity with which the American National Security Agency (NSA) and the UK’s Government Communications Headquarters (GCHQ), seemingly hack everyone; especially journalists, but also citizens, other governments and even the private mobile phones of heads of state—including Angela Merkel (Oltermann 2013). The “whistle blower” on this occasion was Edward Snowden whose prominence in the news coincided with the sentencing of Chelsea (previously Bradley) Manning to 35 years imprisonment for releasing classified information to WikiLeaks. Both cases raised important issues concerning the protection of sources and government accountability, as well as sparking boundary disputes about “interlopers” and precisely who is a journalist, along with shifting perceptions of journalists’ roles in the context of organisations like WikiLeaks (Eldridge 2014).

Implications for Journalism Studies

Finally, these developments have, in turn, helped to reconfigure the scholarly agenda of journalism studies and this is wholly appropriate, if not inevitable, given that a good deal of research in the field seeks to reflect on changing professional practice and to be relevant to such changes. Consequently, new journals are blossoming in response to the impact of digital media on journalism practice and theory. In February 2013, the publisher Routledge Taylor & Francis launched *Digital Journalism*, which has enjoyed considerable editorial success and a burgeoning readership, with a decision to move from three to four issues a year taken within six months of the journal’s launch. Sage has similarly launched a new journal, called *Mobile Media and Communications*, which will undoubtedly find a similarly enthusiastic readership. Major innovations and developments within the field deservedly and therefore inevitably require the establishment of new journals to offer a forum for the discussion and publication of relevant research; as I expressed it in the launch Editorial for *Digital Journalism*, journals should be “A place to hang out ... a place of intellectual companionship ... a place to hang our intellectual hats” (Franklin 2013b).

But the transformation of journalism in this “age of digital media” has not merely created new topics, themes and subjects for scholars to investigate and explore to complement the existing concerns of journalism studies. Rather, the considerable changes to all aspects of journalism, noted in the contributions to this collection, have challenged and contested even the most enduring and fundamental theoretical concerns of journalism scholars, prompting them to revisit and confront again, albeit in a fresh

context and guise, such perennial questions as What is journalism? and Who is a journalist? The posing of existential questions and the analysis of “blurring boundaries” seems ubiquitous in contemporary discussions of journalism studies. In much the same way, radical changes to journalists’ professional practices and journalism’s online and digital products increasingly require new methodological tools and research strategies to generate evidence and argument to inform the field of “digital” journalism studies (Strömbäck and Karlsson 2010). Consequently, scholars are conducting a re-examination of the theoretical and methodological foundations of journalism studies. One example of this intellectual reassessment is a series of special issues of academic journals devoted to exploring the scholarly implications of recent developments. In addition to this “Future of Journalism” collection, there are issues planned and in press exploring “Theories of Journalism in a Digital Age” (edited by Laura Ahva and Steen Steensen) in *Digital Journalism* (3.1) and *Journalism Practice* (9.1), and “Research Methods in the Age of Digital Journalism” (edited by Michael Karlsson and Helle Sjøvaag) in *Digital Journalism* (4.1). Seth Lewis’ issue devoted to the analysis and consideration of “Journalism in an Era of Big Data” (*Digital Journalism* 3.2) and Stuart Allan’s collection exploring “Photojournalism and Citizen Journalism: Cooperation, Collaboration and Connectivity” in *Journalism Practice* (9.4), continue this theme of examining fundamental shifts in the academic and scholarly terrain of journalism studies.

Capturing the Moment of Mind-blowing Uncertainty

The Future of Journalism 2013 Conference at Cardiff tried to capture a moment of calm in the “mind-blowing evolution” of journalism and journalism studies to enable discussion and analysis of their uncertain and variously conceived and theorised futures. Many of the papers presented at the conference offered a retrospective glance, cataloguing recent changes, thereby helping to offer a useful balance between diagnosis and prognosis. This Introduction has explored some of the key developments in journalism between the two conferences in 2011 and 2013, along with the different ways in which scholars have analysed and reflected critically upon them, in the hope that they might anticipate the concerns of authors whose work is presented below, while also offering milestones to help explore the developing futures for journalism and journalism studies.

Digital Journalism, *Journalism Practice* and *Journalism Studies* assign considerable importance to securing an audience for these studies to encourage further discussion, challenge and interrogation, but also to inform readers’ own thinking and research on these significant issues which sit at the head of the research agenda in journalism studies. I hope readers will find the argument and evidence of the various and diverse research

studies published below fascinating, important, but mostly valuable and useful for their own work.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I need to thank a number of people for their contribution to the 2013 conference. Annie Rhys Jones, the editorial advisor and administrator for *Digital Journalism*, *Journalism Practice* and *Journalism Studies*, has worked incredibly hard and with great enthusiasm on all aspects of the planning and organisation of the conference. Her contribution has been unique and central to each of the four conferences and she is owed a special debt of gratitude. Thanks also to Kath Brown at Routledge, colleagues here at JOMEC, especially James Clemas, Deb Lloyd, Jon Adams and Chris Yeo—as well as Judith Fathallah, Hyunju Lee, Marina Morani, Ye Weihua, Matthew Winston and Xin Zhang who gave their time, effort and support to help make things work! Finally, thanks to the many presenters, speakers and session chairs for their contributions—and thanks to everyone who came along to contribute. We all learned, as well as contributed, a good deal to the discussions across the two days of The Future of Journalism 2013 Conference.

REFERENCES

- Aitamurto, Tanja. 2013. "Balancing between Open and Closed: Co-creation in Magazine Journalism." *Digital Journalism* 1 (2): 229–251. doi:10.1080/21670811.2012.750150.
- Appelgren, Ester, and Gunnar Nygren. 2014. "Data Journalism in Sweden: Introducing New Methods and Genres of Journalism into 'Old' Organizations." *Digital Journalism* 2 (3): 1–12. doi:10.1080/21670811.2014.884344.
- Bakker, Piet. 2012. "Aggregation, Content Farms and Huffinization: The Rise of Low-pay and No-pay Journalism." *Journalism Practice* 6 (5–6): 627–637. doi:10.1080/17512786.2012.667266.
- Bastos, Marco Toledo. 2014. "Shares, Pins and Tweets: News Readership from Daily Papers to Social Media." *Journalism Studies*. doi:10.1080/1461670X.2014.891857.
- Blumler, Jay G. 2010. "Foreword: The Two-Legged Crisis of Journalism." *Journalism Studies* 11 (4): 439–441. doi:10.1080/14616701003802519.
- Brandstetter, Barbara, and Jessica Schmalhofer. 2014. "Paid Content: A Successful Model for Publishing Houses in Germany?" *Journalism Practice* 8 (5). doi:10.1080/17512786.2014. 895519.
- Chyi, Hsiang Iris, Seth C. Lewis, and Nan Zheng. 2012. "A Matter of Life and Death? Examining How Newspapers Covered the Newspaper 'Crisis'". *Journalism Studies* 13 (3): 305–324. doi:10.1080/1461670X.2011.629090.

- Clerwall, Christer. 2014. "Enter the Robot Journalist: Users' Perceptions of Automated Content." *Journalism Practice* 8 (5). doi:10.1080/17512786.2014.883116.
- Dawes, Simon. 2014. "Press Freedom, Privacy and the Public Sphere." *Journalism Studies* 15 (1): 17–32. doi:10.1080/1461670X.2013.765637.
- Doherty, Skye. 2014. "Hypertext and Journalism: Paths for Future Research." *Digital Journalism* 2 (2): 124–139. doi:10.1080/21670811.2013.821323.
- Domingo, David, Pere Masip, and Irene Costera Meijer. 2014. "Tracing Digital News Networks: Towards an Integrated Framework of the Dynamics of News Production." *Digital Journalism*. doi:10.1080/21670811.2014.927996.
- Edmonds, Rick, Emily Guskin, Amy Mitchell, and Mark Jurkowitz. 2013. "Newspapers: Stabilizing but still threatened." *The State of the News Media 2013*, PEW Research Center's Project for Excellence in Journalism. Accessed April 1 2014. http://stateofthemediamedia.org/2013/news_papers-stabilizing-but-still-threatened/
- Eldridge II, Scott A. 2014. "Boundary Maintenance and Interloper Media Reaction: Differentiating between journalism's discursive enforcement processes." *Journalism Studies* 15 (1): 1–16. doi:10.1080/1461670X.2013.791077.
- Fico, Frederick, Stephen Lacy, Steven S. Wildman, Thomas Baldwin, Daniel Bergan and Paul Zube. 2013. "Citizen Journalism Sites as Information Substitutes and Complements for United States Newspaper Coverage of Local Governments." *Digital Journalism* 1 (1): 152–168. doi:10.1080/21670811.2012.740270.
- Flew, Terry, Christina L. Spurgeon, Anna Daniel, and Adam Glen Swift. 2012. "The Promise of Computational Journalism." *Journalism Practice* 6 (2): 157–171. doi:10.1080/17512786.2011.616655.
- Franklin, Bob, ed. 2013a. *The Future of Journalism: Developments and Debates*. London: Routledge, Taylor and Francis. 1–19.
- Franklin, Bob. 2013b. "Editorial." *Digital Journalism* 1 (1): 1–5. doi:10.1080/21670811.2012.740264.
- Gray, Jonathan, Lucy Chambers, and Liliana Bounegru 2012. *The Data Journalism Handbook: How Journalists can Use Data to Improve the News*. Sebastopol, CA: O'Reilly Media.
- Hacked Off. 2011. Hacked Off. <http://hackinginquiry.org/>.
- Harcup, Tony. 2011. "Questioning the 'Bleeding Obvious': What's the Point of Researching Journalism?" *Journalism* 13 (1): 21–37. doi:10.1177/1464884911400843.
- Hedman, Ulrika, and Monika Djerf-Pierre. 2013. "The Social Journalist: Embracing the Social Media Life or Creating a New Digital Divide?" *Digital Journalism* 1 (3): 368–385. doi:10.1080/

21670811.2013.776804.

Hermida, Alfred. 2013. "#Journalism: Reconfiguring Journalism Research about Twitter One Tweet at a Time." *Digital Journalism* 1 (3): 295–313. doi:10.1080/21670811.2013.808456.

IPSO. 2014. Independent Press Standards Organisation. <http://www.ipso.co.uk/>.

Ju, Alice, Sun Ho Jeong, and Hsiang Iris Chyi. 2014. "Will Social Media Save Newspapers? Examining the Effectiveness of Facebook and Twitter as News Platforms." *Journalism Practice* 8 (1): 1–18. doi:10.1080/17512786.2013.794022.

Karlsen, Joakim, and Eirik Stavelin. 2014. "Computational Journalism in Norwegian Newsrooms."

Journalism Practice 8 (1): 34–48. doi:10.1080/17512786.2013.813190.

Karlsson, Michael, and Kristoffer Holt. 2014. "Is Anyone Out There? Assessing Swedish Citizen-generated Community Journalism." *Journalism Practice* 8 (2): 164–180. doi:10.1080/17512786.2013.859830.

Lasorsa, Dominic L., Seth C. Lewis, and Avery E. Holton. 2012. "Normalizing Twitter: Journalism Practice in an Emerging Communication Space." *Journalism Studies* 13 (1) 19–36. doi:10.1080/1461670X.2011.571825.

Leveson Inquiry. Accessed April 1, 2014. <http://webarchive.nationalarchives.gov.uk/20140122145147/http://www.levesoninquiry.org.uk>.

Leveson Inquiry – Report. 2012. <http://webarchive.nationalarchives.gov.uk/20140122145147/http://www.levesoninquiry.org.uk/about/the-report/>.

McCulloch, Scott. 2013. "Johnston Press Report £248.7mn Pre-tax Loss for First Half." *Business Insider*. Accessed March 18, 2014. <http://www.business7.co.uk/business-news/company-results-and-forecasts/2013/08/28/johnston-press-reports-248-7m-pre-tax-loss-for-first>.

Meyer, Philip. 1991. *The New Precision Journalism*. Bloomington: Indiana

University Press. Myllylahti, Merja. 2014. "Newspaper Paywalls- the Hype and the Reality: A Study of How

Pad News Content Impacts on Media Corporations Revenues." *Digital Journalism* 2 (2): 179–194. doi:10.1080/21670811.2013.813214.

Nel, Francois, and Oscar Westlund. 2012. "The 4 C's of Mobile News – Channels, Conversation, Content and Commerce." *Journalism Practice* 6 (5): 744–753. doi:10.1080/17512786.2012.667278.

Oltermann, Philip. 2013. "NSA Bugging Turns Spotlight on World Leaders' 'safe' Communications" *Guardian*, October 25. Accessed April 1, 2014. <http://www.theguardian.com/world/2013/oct/25/nsa-bugging-angela-merkel-german-us-spying>.

- Paper Cuts. Accessed April 2014. <http://newspaperlayoffs.com/home/>.
- Pavlik, John. 2001. *Journalism and New Media*. New York: Columbia University Press.
- Picard, G. Robert. 2014. "Twilight or New Dawn of Journalism: Evidence from the Changing News Ecosystem." *Journalism studies* 15 (5). doi:10.1080/1461670X.2014.895530.
- Pickard, Victor, and Alex T. Williams. 2014. "Salvation or Folly? The Promise and Perils of Digital Paywalls." *Digital Journalism* 2 (2): 195–213. doi:10.1080/21670811.2013.865967.
- Requejo-Alemán, José L., and Jairo Lugo-Ocando. 2014. "Assessing the Sustainability of Latin American Investigative Non-profit Journalism." *Journalism Studies* 15 (5).
- Reynolds, John. 2014. "UK Mobile Advertising Set to Overtake Newspaper Ad Revenue in 2014" *The Guardian*, October 3. <http://www.theguardian.com/media/2014/mar/10/uk-mobile-advertising-overtake-newspaper-revenue>.
- Shapiro, Oliver. 2014. "The Future of Journalism; Developments and Debates." *Book Review Digital Journalism*. doi:10.1080/21670811.2014.895499.
- Siapera, Eugenia, Papadopoulou, Lambrini and Archontakis, Fragiskos, "Post-Crisis Journalism; Critique and Renewal in Greek journalism." *Journalism Studies*. doi:10.1080/ 1461670X.2014.916479.
- Strömbäck, Jesper, and Michael Karlsson. 2010. "Freezing the Flow of Online News." *Journalism Studies* 11 (1): 2–19. doi:10.1080/14616700903119784.
- Thomas, Ryan J., and Teri Finneman. 2014. "Who Watches the Watchdogs? British Newspaper Metadiscourse on the Leveson Inquiry." *Journalism Studies* 15 (2): 172–186. doi:10.1080/ 1461670X.2013.806068.
- Thurman, Neil. 2014. "News Consumption in the Digital Age: Measuring Multi-channel Audience Attention and Brand Popularity." *Digital Journalism* 2 (2): 156–178. doi:10.1080/21670811. 2013.818365.
- Van Dalen, Arjen. 2013. "The Algorithms behind the Headlines: How Machine-written News Redefies the Core Skills of Human Journalists." In *The Future of Journalism: Developments and debates*, edited by Bob Franklin, 144–154. London: Routledge.
- Van Kerkhoven, Marco, and Piet Bakker. 2014. "The Hyperlocal in Practice: Innovation, Creativity and Diversity." *Digital Journalism* 2 (3). doi:10.1080/21670811.2014. 900236.
- Vis, Farida. 2013. "Twitter as a Reporting Tool for Breaking News: Journalists Tweeting the 2011 UK Riots." *Digital Journalism* 1 (1): 27–47. doi:10.1080/21670811.2012.741316.

- Westlund, Oscar. 2013. "Mobile News: A Review and Model of Journalism in an Age of Mobile Media." *Digital Journalism* 1 (1): 6–26. doi:10.1080/21670811.2012.740273.
- Zabaleta, Iñaki, Carme Ferré-Pavia, Arantza Gutierrez, Itxaso Fernandez, and Nikolas Xamardo. 2014. "Future Business Innovation in Minority Language Media: Back to basics." *Journalism Practice* 8 (5). doi:10.1080/17512786.2014.895518.

Appendix

Papers presented at The Future of Journalism 2013
(Presented alphabetically by first name of first author)

Amplifying distortions: How mobile phone content serves to emphasise violence and conflict in broadcast foreign news coverage
Adrian J. C. Hadland and Eddy L. Borges-Rey

A comparative analysis of digital paywall systems: Challenges to journalism of "quality" daily mastheads
Andrea L. Carson

The value of hyperlocal community news to democracy
Andy Williams, Jerome Turner, Dave Harte and Glyn Mottershead

Where the (inter)action is: Journalists'—and the audiences'—social media use
Annika Bergström and Ulrika Hedman

Using tweets to report from afar: Newspaper coverage in the Netherlands and Britain compared
Ansgard Heinrich

Assessing journalists' presence in social media
Ari Heinonen, Elina Noppari and Eliisa Vainikka

The rise of a news problem: How media groups may redefine their business model within the digital context?
Arnaud Anciaux

The robot eye witness: Visual conquering of unwatched realities through unmanned aerial vehicles
Astrid Gynnild

Paid content: A successful business model for publishing houses in Germany?
Barbara Brandstetter and Jessica Schmalhofer

Blurring boundaries or embracing journalistic ideals? Explaining journalists views on public relations

Bengt Johansson and Magnus Fredriksson

Newsroom convergence and user participation in interplay with journalistic practices: A case study in Switzerland
Brigitte Hofstetter and Philomen Schönhagen

How Portuguese cultural journalism coverage is changing: A study about the first decade of the XXI century
Carla Maria Batista

A rhetorical illusion? Bridging the gap between journalism's normative discourse and everyday digital news use
Chris Peters and Marcel Broersma

Everyday images: News ecology and the digitalization of photojournalism
Chris Peters and Stuart Allan

The necessity of investigating garbage: The possible anachronism of journalism studies
Chris van der Heijden

Assessing the quality of automated content
Christer Clerwall

Journalists as innovation agents: The development of a measure for journalistic role stress
Christian Fieseler, Stephanie Grubenmann and Miriam Meckel

Follow-up communication in the blogosphere: A comparative study of bloggers linking to professional and participatory media
Christian Nuernbergk

The journalistic quality of internet formats and services: Results of a user survey
Christoph Neuberger

Innovation through practice: Understanding the cultural valuation of technology
Christoph Raetzsch

Journalism & the city: The impact of urban space on foreign correspondence
Cristina Archetti

Institutional learning from a newsroom minority in times of change: The case of the Swiss public service broadcasting company
Daniel Perrin, Mathias Fürer, Aleksandra Gnach and Thomas Gantenbein

From a Nairobi dumpsite to a Los Angeles fundraiser: Exploring a global crisis reporting project and an emerging NGO-media partnership

David Conrad

Live reporting terror: Online news and citizen crisis communication
Einar Thorsen

Watchdogging in code
Eirik Stavelin

Live Journal blog platform as a tool for professional work of Russian
journalists
Elena Johansson

Media meets climate: Field dialogues
Elisabeth Eide and Risto Kunelius

Guidelines on balance in choices of sources: A European comparison
Els Diekerhof

A new generation of non-fiction narratives as One of the Futures of
Journalism?
Erik Neveu

An undressed newsroom: Application of visual ethnography in media
research
Katerina Sv. Gillarova, Alice N. Tejkalova and Filip Lab

Defining the blurring boundaries of journalism in a digital news ecosystem
Florence Le Cam and David Domingo

The impact of civil and public journalism on audience involvement
Gabi Schaap and Liesbeth Hermans

Visualizing news: Make it work
Gerard Smit, Yael de Haan and Laura Buijs
Disaster-journalism anno Twitter
Gert van Wijland

Data journalism in Sweden: Introducing new methods and genres of journalism
into “old”
organizations
Gunnar Nygren and Esther Appelgren

Professional autonomy—challenges and opportunities: A survey of 1500 journalists
in Poland, Russia and Sweden
Gunnar Nygren, Boguslawa Dobek-Ostrowska and Maria Anikina

Revisiting the idea of public service-oriented journalism
Halliki Harro-Loit

Dialogue as a journalistic ideal

Harald Hornmoen and Steen Steensen

Five arguments for public media accountability

Harmen Groenhart

The worst of both worlds: Journalism between online and offline environments

Heikki Heikkilä

Anyone can take a photo, but: Is there space for the professional photographer in the 21st century newsroom?

Helen Caple

The effect of ownership on content: Newspaper consolidation and the homogenisation of news

Helle Sjøvaag

Journalism as cultures of circulation

Henrik Bødker

Charting the future of global journalism: China's soft power in Africa

Herman Wasserman, Xiaolin Zhang and Winston Mano

Future business models for minority language journalism: Back to basics

Iñaki Zabaleta, Carme Ferré and Arantza Gutierrez

Pitching Pussy Riot: Cultural narratives, news and digital network activism

Inka Salovaara

The new newsworthiness of poverty: Neoliberal news for non-neoliberal purposes

Isabel Awad

Sketching the future of journalism? The challenging potential of "comics journalism"

Isabel Macdonald

Why democracies need a functional definition of journalism now more than ever

Ivor Shapiro

Participants, entertainers, neutrals and investigators: Role perceptions of future journalists in five democratic corporatist countries

Jan Fredrik Hovden

Towards the Liberal Model: The professional identity of Swedish journalists

Jenny Wiik

Revealing the news: How online news changes without you noticing

John Fass and Angus Main

Generations in a changing media landscape: Reporters viewpoints of the future for journalism in Sweden, Poland and Russia
Joran Hok

Media convergence revisited: Lessons learned on newsroom integration in Austria, Germany and Spain
José A. García-Avilés, Andy Kaltenbrunner and Klaus Meier

Latin American investigative non-profit journalism: A landscape for a new phenomenon or a revival of muckraking journalism by other means?
Jose Luis Requejo-Alemán and Jairo Lugo-Ocando

Cutting out the middle man? The changing role of the local news media in engaging citizens in local democracies
Julie Firmstone and Stephen Coleman

Citation needed: Investigating the use of hyperlinks to display sources in news stories
Juliette De Maeyer

The challenges of balance and impartiality in broadcast news
Karin Wahl-Jorgensen, Richard Sambrook, Mike Berry, Kerry Moore, Lina Dencik, Iñaki Garcia Blanco, Arne Hintz and Jenny Kidd

The future of journalism and the future (and past) in journalism
Keren Tenenboim-Weinblatt and Motti Neiger

News media old and new and their fluctuating audiences: A longitudinal mapping of cross- media news consumption
Kim Christian Schrøder

The freedom of the press or the fear factor? Exploring political decisions and non-decisions in British media policy 1990–2012
Lars W. Nord and Torbjörn von Krogh

Theorizing the gap: From journalistic role conception to role performance
Lea Hellmueller and Claudia Mellado

Getting citizens involved in news
Liesbeth Hermans, Gabi Schaap and Jo Bardoel

Trust in economy in letters to the editor
Liina K. Puustinen

The role of the non-government organisation (NGO) in practicing documentary photography in a globalised media environment
Louise Grayson

Hypertext in online news stories: More control, more pleasure
Luuk Lagerwerf and Daniël Verheij

International journalists' credibility towards international news source organizations (AP, AFP, AJE, BBC, Bloomberg, CNN, Fox, Reuters, Xinhua)
Mao Xi, Rebeca de Dobbelaer and Karin Raeymaeckers

Practice what they preach?
Marco van Kerkhoven and Piet Bakker

Reporting with the iPadJournos: Educating the next generation of mobile and social media journalists
Marcus Messner

Follow me on Wall Street: How business news media and their journalists engage on Twitter
Marcus Messner and Vivian Medina-Messner

The enhancement of new possibilities for proximity journalism: The contribution made through the design of "ivoz"
Maria Jose Arrojo

Constructing the crisis of journalism: A Cultural understanding of the economic collapse of newspapers in the digital era
Maria Luengo

Envisioning of news use in times of crisis
Marina Ghersetti and Oscar Westlund

Sources in the news: The influence of source affiliation and similarity perceptions on the perceived credibility of news
Mariska Kleemans, Liesbeth Hermans and Gabi Schaap

Political journalism and mediated visibility: News coverage of (parts of) Danish politics
Mark Blach-Ørsten and Rasmus Burkal

Political journalism and strategic visibility the mediation of (parts of) politics
Mark Blach-Ørsten and Rasmus Kleis Nielsen

Tidings, tittle-tattle and the Twittersphere
Martin Conboy and Farida Vis

Morbid symptoms: Between a dying and a re-birth (apologies to Gramsci)
Scott A. Eldridge II and Martin Conboy

Accounting for journalism
Martin Eide

The value of transparency in journalism for audiences and (public) media organizations

Martje R. Doeve and Irene Costera Meijer

Proximity as a journalistic keyword in the digital era: Audiences' experiences of the closeness of amateur images

Mervi Pantti and Laura Ahva

Digitalization and tabloidization: A longitudinal study of tabloid, quality and local newspaper websites in U.K. and Sweden

Michael Karlsson

Transparency and credibility: An experimental study

Michael Karlsson, Christer Clerwall and Lars W. Nord

The future of breaking news online? A study of live blogs through surveys of their consumption, and of readers' attitudes and participation

Neil Thurman and Nic Newman

Amateur visuals changing news icons of political leaders? The case of Muammar Gaddafi

Nete Nørgaard Kristensen and Mette Mortensen

When attention matters: Market strategies and content strategies in newspapers

Nina Kvalheim

Human-led versus machine-led publishing of mobile news

Oscar Westlund

Digital gatekeeping: News media versus social media

Peter Bro and Filip Wallberg

Dark matters: The representation of outer space online

Phil MacGregor

Mr. Gates returns: Curation, community management and other new roles for journalists

Piet Bakker

The hyperlocal business model in practice innovation, creativity and diversity

Piet Bakker and Marco van Kerkhoven

Youth, media and the future of journalism

Regina M. Marchi

Location matters: Place-based apps-as-business and as-news

Robert E. Gutsche Jr

MijnZ: Can an internet site strengthen the connection between regional journalism and youth?

Rolien Duiven, Nico Drok and Liesbeth Hermans

“I knew what I got into, when I took the job”: Professional journalism at the fringes of the journalistic field

Susanne Kirchhoff, Roman Hummel and Dimitri Prandner

Reporting on the legal aspects of the use of drones in international conflicts: A case study of covering the use of drones in *Aftenposten* and *The New York Times*

Rune Ottosen

Engaging the social news user: Comments on news sites and Facebook

Sanne Hille and Piet Bakker

The Flemish journalist in 2013: A new wave of journalists surveys

Sara De Vuyst and Karin Raeymaeckers

Networking or not working? A comparison of Arab Spring coverage in Belgian newspapers and TV news

Sarah Van Leuven, Annelore Deprez and Karin Raeymaeckers

Code, collaboration, and the future of journalism: A case study of the hacks/hackers global network

Seth C. Lewis and Nikki Usher

Energy use and greenhouse gas emissions in digital news media: The ethical implications for journalists and media organisations

Stephen Wood, Christopher Hodgson, Paul Shabajee, Daniel Schien and Chris Preist

Are all tweets heard? Source credibility of social media in newspapers

Steve Paulussen

Identifying and verifying news through social media: Developing a user-centred tool for professional journalists

Steve Schifferes, Nic Newman, Neil Thurman, David Corney, Ayse Goker and Carlos Martin

Domesticating distant suffering: How do news media discursively invite the audience to care?

Stijn Joye

Small media, big impact: The national minorities media in Germany

Swea Starke

Retiring democracy in journalism scholarship: In search of new understandings

of the social relevance of journalism in a digital age
Tamara Witschge and Chris Peters

Tailor-made news: Meeting the demands of news users on mobile and social media

Tim Groot Kormelink and Irene Costera Meijer

Public interest or self-interest? How professional journalism attracts future journalists

Ulrika Andersson and Ingela Wadbring

Definitions of journalists in the United States

Wendy Marie Weinhold

Both sides of the story: Assessing audience participation in journalism through the concepts of inclusion level and inclusion distance

Wiebke Loosen and Jan-Hinrik Schmidt

The construction of participation in news websites: A conceptual and empirical interrogation

Yacov Netzer, Keren Tenenboim-Weinblatt and Limor Shifman

Is there citizen journalism in China? The impact of globalisation, digitalisation and professionalisation on citizen reporting

Yan Wu

Retrenchments and recovery: Reallocating media organizations' resources in a digital age

You Li and Lea Hellmueller

The textual DNA: The delayed and partial acknowledgement of photojournalists in Western press

Zvi Reich and Inbal Klein-Avraham

A time of uncertainty: the effects of reporters' time schedule on their work

Zvi Reich and Yigal Godler

Bob Franklin