

ORCA - Online Research @ Cardiff

This is an Open Access document downloaded from ORCA, Cardiff University's institutional repository:https://orca.cardiff.ac.uk/id/eprint/112666/

This is the author's version of a work that was submitted to / accepted for publication.

Citation for final published version:

Khaki, M., Hamilton, F., Forootan, E., Hoteit, I., Awange, J. and Kuhn, M. 2018. Non-parametric data assimilation scheme for land hydrological applications. Water Resources Research 54 (7), pp. 4946-4964. 10.1029/2018WR022854

Publishers page: http://dx.doi.org/10.1029/2018WR022854

Please note:

Changes made as a result of publishing processes such as copy-editing, formatting and page numbers may not be reflected in this version. For the definitive version of this publication, please refer to the published source. You are advised to consult the publisher's version if you wish to cite this paper.

This version is being made available in accordance with publisher policies. See http://orca.cf.ac.uk/policies.html for usage policies. Copyright and moral rights for publications made available in ORCA are retained by the copyright holders.



Non-parametric Data Assimilation Scheme for Land Hydrological Applications

M. Khaki^{a,1}, F. Hamilton^b, E. Forootan^c, I. Hoteit^d, J. Awange^a, M. Kuhn^a

^aSchool of Earth and Planetary Sciences, Discipline of Spatial Sciences, Curtin University, Perth, Australia.
 ^bNorth Carolina State University, Raleigh, North Carolina 27695, USA.
 ^cSchool of Earth and Ocean Sciences, Cardiff University, Cardiff, UK.
 ^dKing Abdullah University of Science and Technology, Thuwal, Saudi Arabia.

Abstract

Data assimilation, which relies on explicit knowledge of dynamical models, is a well-known approach that addresses models' limitations due to various reasons, such as errors in input 2 and forcing datasets. This approach, however, requires intensive computational efforts, especially for high dimensional systems such as distributed hydrological models. Alternatively, 4 data-driven methods offer comparable solutions when the physics underlying the models are 5 unknown. For the first time in a hydrological context, a non-parametric framework is imple-6 mented here to improve model estimates using available observations. This method uses Takens 7 delay-coordinate method to reconstruct the dynamics of the system within a Kalman filtering 8 framework, called the Kalman-Takens filter. A synthetic experiment is undertaken to fully 9 investigate the capability of the proposed method by comparing its performance with that of a 10 standard assimilation framework based on an adaptive unscented Kalman filter (AUKF). Fur-11 thermore, using terrestrial water storage (TWS) estimates obtained from the Gravity Recovery 12 And Climate Experiment (GRACE) mission, both filters are applied to a real case scenario 13 to update different water storages over Australia. In-situ groundwater and soil moisture mea-14 surements within Australia are used to further evaluate the results. The Kalman-Takens filter 15 successfully improves the estimated water storages at levels comparable to the AUKF results, 16 with an average RMSE reduction of 37.30% for groundwater and 12.11% for soil moisture esti-17 mates. Additionally, the Kalman-Takens filter, while reducing estimation complexities, requires 18 a fraction of the computational time, i.e., ~ 8 times faster compared to the AUKF approach. 19 Keywords: Non-parametric filtering, Data assimilation, Data-driven, Kalman-Takens, Adaptive unscented Kalman filtering (AUKF), Hydrological modelling.

Email address: Mehdi.Khaki@postgrad.curtin.edu.au (M. Khaki)

20 1. Introduction

21 A precise study of terrestrial water storage (TWS) changes is essential to better understand the spatio-temporal variations of water resources and their effects on the hydrological 22 cycles. In this regard, hydrological models become valuable tools for simulating hydrological 23 processes at global (e.g., Döll et al., 2003; Huntington, 2006; Coumou and Rahmstorf, 2012; 24 van Dijk et al., 2013) and regional (e.g., Chiew et al., 1993; Wooldridge and Kalma, 2001; 25 Christiansen et al., 2007; Huang et al., 2016) scales. These models are formulated based on 26 physical/conceptual principles to represent 'reality' and are still being developed to accurately 27 simulate all complex hydrological processes, including interactions between water cycle compo-28 nents (e.g., surface and sub-surface water exchange). These models, however, can be subject to 29 various sources of uncertainties, e.g., errors in input and forcing data, and imperfect accounting 30 for the physical underlying dynamics, such as those used to simulate evapotranspiration (van 31 Dijk et al., 2011; Vrugt et al., 2013). 32

Classically, data assimilation can be used to improve imperfect models by integrating avail-33 able observations with the underlying physical model. Many studies have implemented data 34 assimilation techniques in the fields of ocean and atmospheric sciences (e.g., Bennett, 2002; 35 Hoteit et al., 2002; Kalnay, 2003; Schunk et al., 2004; Lahoz, 2007; Zhang et al., 2012; Hoteit 36 et al., 2012; Tardif et al., 2015; Zhao et al., 2017) and hydrology (e.g., Seo et al., 2003; Vrugt 37 et al., 2005; Weerts and El Serafy, 2006; Rasmussen et al., 2015; Kumar et al., 2016; Girotto 38 et al., 2016, 2017; Schumacher et al., 2018). Data assimilation is often used to improve model 39 simulations of soil moisture (e.g., Entekhabi et al., 1994; Calvet et al., 1998; Montaldo et al., 40 2001; Reichle et al., 2002; De Lannov et al., 2007, 2009; Kumar et al., 2009; Brocca et al., 2010; 41 Renzullo et al., 2014; Kumar et al., 2015; Lievens et al., 2015; De Lannov et al., 2015), TWS 42 (e.g., Zaitchik et al., 2008; van Dijk et al., 2014; Tangdamrongsub et al., 2015; Schumacher 43 et al., 2016, 2018; Khaki et al., 2017a, 2018a,b), evapotranspiration and sensible heat fluxes 44 (e.g., Schuurmans et al., 2003; Pipunic et al., 2008; Irmak and Kamble, 2009; Yin et al., 2014), 45 surface water and river discharge (e.g., Bras and Restrepo-Posada, 1980; Awwad et al., 1994; 46 Young, 2002; Madsen and Skotner, 2005; Vrugt et al., 2006; Andreadis et al., 2007; Neal et al., 47 2009; Giustarini et al., 2011; Lee et al., 2011; McMillan et al., 2013; Li et al., 2015). Stan-48 dard data assimilation techniques have their limitations though, e.g., the general requirement 49 of intensive computations for high dimensional systems in realistic applications (Tandeo et al., 50 2015). Furthermore, when a physical model (i.e., model's underlying equations) is not available. 51

the application of a traditional data assimilation framework that relies on these equations for forecasting can be limited (see, e.g., Palmer, 2001; Reichle and Koster, 2005; Hersbach et al., 2007; Arnold et al., 2013).

A number of studies employ data-driven (non-parametric) approaches to produce accurate 55 statistical simulations (e.g., Sauer, 2004; Tandeo et al., 2015; Dreano et al., 2015; Hamilton et 56 al., 2016; Lguensat et al., 2017). Hamilton et al. (2015) and Berry and Harlim (2016) considered 57 the case when models are partially known. In other cases with completely unknown systems, 58 e.g., no available information about the physics of the underlying models and correspondingly 59 their equations, the application of data assimilation becomes rather complicated. Hamilton et 60 al. (2016) developed a new model-free filter based on the non-parametric Takens approach and 61 Kalman filtering when the physical model is not available. The main idea of Takens' theorem 62 is that the model equations can be replaced by a data-driven non-parametric reconstruction 63 of the system's dynamics. The filter implements Takens' method for attractor reconstruction 64 within the Kalman filtering framework, allowing for a model-free approach to filter noisy data 65 (Hamilton et al., 2016). Takens method has been used in various studies for non-parametric 66 time series predictions (see, e.g., Packard et al., 1980; Takens, 1981; Sauer et al., 1991; Sauer, 67 2004). This technique replaced the model with a delay coordinate embedding scheme and has 68 been shown by Hamilton et al. (2016) to not only obtain comparable results to a standard 69 Kalman filter-based framework, but also may perform better when model errors are significant. 70 A similar idea has been used by Tandeo et al. (2015) and Lguensat et al. (2017) to simulate the 71 dynamics of complex systems using a non-parametric sampler. They applied an Analog Data 72 Assimilation (AnDA) scheme that reconstructs the system's dynamics in a fully data-driven 73 manner. While AnDA does not require knowledge of the dynamical model, it assumes that a 74 representative catalog of trajectories of the system is available. They show that the data-driven 75 method performs well without using the physical model. 76

The main motivation of this study, therefore, is to apply for the first time the Kalman-Takens method in a hydrological context and investigate its capability to enhance a hydrological model's estimates. Its performance is then compared with that of a traditional data assimilation system. The motivation behind selecting the Kalman-Takens method is that it does not use the model's equations, and requires less computational burden to predict high-dimensional systems compared to other existing methods (e.g., Hamilton et al., 2015; Tandeo et al., 2015; Berry and Harlim, 2016). This study extends the Kalman-Takens approach to enable its application to

a more complicated state observation transition systems, e.g., for a case of updating various 84 variables (e.g., soil moisture and groundwater) using only TWS observations. The proposed 85 scheme exploits model trajectories for these variables as the training data and is then applied to 86 assimilate TWS data derived from the Gravity Recovery And Climate Experiment (GRACE) 87 satellite mission into the hydrological system states over Australia for the period 2003–2013. It 88 should be pointed out here that the use of model trajectory in this method, and the reliance 89 of data-driven on data in general, results in updating observable state variables only. This, 90 however, is different in a standard data assimilation, which can further update other variables 91 subject to availability of the physical model. 92

GRACE TWS data have been assimilated in many studies, where they have proved to 93 be highly capable of improving the performance of hydrological models (e.g., Zaitchik et al., 94 2008; van Dijk et al., 2014; Eicker et al., 2014; Reager et al., 2015; Schumacher et al., 2018). 95 Nevertheless, GRACE data assimilation has always been challenging due to the unique charac-96 teristics of its measurements, such as the coarser spatio-temporal resolution compared to most 97 of the existing hydrological models (Khaki et al., 2017b). A successful data assimilation method 98 should be able to account for these limitations in GRACE products while vertically spreading 99 their information into various water compartments (see, e.g., Schumacher et al., 2016; Khaki 100 et al., 2017b). Khaki et al. (2017a) showed that assimilating GRACE data can significantly 101 improve the hydrological model performance over Australia (see also Khaki et al., 2017c; Tian 102 et al., 2017). In order to benchmark the performance of the proposed data-driven technique, its 103 outputs are compared to those of a standard data assimilation framework based on an adaptive 104 unscented Kalman filter (AUKF, Berry et al., 2013). The results of both methods are evalu-105 ated against in-situ measurements, as well as through a synthetic experiment to fully investigate 106 their efficiency in assimilating GRACE TWS data. 107

The remainder of this contribution is organized as follow: datasets are presented in Section 2, the filtering scheme described in Section 3 and the results discussed in Section 4 before concluding the study in Section 5.

111 2. Model and Data

112 2.1. W3RA

¹¹³ The 1°×1° version of the World-Wide Water Resources Assessment (W3RA; ¹¹⁴ http://www.wenfo.org/wald/data-software/) model from the Commonwealth Scientific and In-

dustrial Research Organisation (CSIRO) is chosen for the study. The model is designed to 115 simulate landscape water stores and describe the water balance of the soil, groundwater and 116 surface water stores in which each cell is modeled independently of its neighbors (van Dijk, 2010; 117 Renzullo et al., 2014). The model's forcing includes daily meteorological fields of minimum 118 and maximum temperature, short-wave radiation, and precipitation from Princeton University 119 (Sheffield et al., 2006). The model state vector in our experiment is composed of storages of 120 the top, shallow root and deep root soil layers, groundwater, and surface water for the period 121 of January 2003 to December 2012. 122

123 2.2. GRACE TWS

For the same period, GRACE level 2 (L2) Stokes' coefficients (up to degree and order 124 90) and associated full error information are obtained from the ITSG-Grace2014 gravity field 125 model (Mayer-Gürr et al., 2014). Three degree 1 coefficients (C10, C11, and S11) and degree 2 126 and order 0 (C20) coefficient are replaced by those of Swenson et al. (2008) and that of Cheng 127 and Tapley (2004), respectively. Further, we apply the DDK2 smoothing filter (Kusche et al., 128 2009) to mitigate a colored/correlated noise in the coefficients (see also Khaki et al., 2018c), and 129 thereafter convert them into $1^{\circ} \times 1^{\circ}$ TWS fields following Wahr et al. (1998). The mean TWS 130 for the study period is taken from the W3RA model and is aggregated to the GRACE TWS 131 change time series to reach absolute values related to W3RA (Zaitchik et al., 2008). Error 132 information of ITSG-Grace2014 is used to construct an observation error covariance matrix 133 (Eicker et al., 2014; Schumacher et al., 2016). 134

135 2.3. In-situ measurements

In-situ groundwater and soil moisture measurements are used to evaluate the perfor-136 mance of the proposed data assimilation framework. Groundwater data is provided from the 137 New South Wales Government (NSW) within the Murray-Darling Basin, which includes 70% 138 of Australia's irrigated area, covers an area of over one million square kilometers, and extends 139 over much of the central and south-eastern parts of Australia (Mercer et al., 2007). The data is 140 rescaled to a monthly temporal scale to be consistent with GRACE and time series of ground-141 water storage anomalies. Considering that a specific yield for converting well-water levels to 142 variations in groundwater storage (Rodell et al., 2007; Zaitchik et al., 2008) is not available, we 143 use the value of 0.13 specific yield obtained from the range between 0.115 and 0.2 as suggested 144 by the Australian Bureau of Meteorology (BOM) and Seoane et al. (2013). 145

Furthermore, in-situ soil moisture products are acquired from the moisture-monitoring net-146 work, known as the OzNet network (http://www.oznet.org.au/), over the Murrumbidgee catch-147 ment (Smith et al., 2011) and rescaled to the same temporal scale as above. The data contains 148 long-term records of measured volumetric soil moisture at various soil depths at 57 locations 149 across the Murrumbidgee catchment area. Soil measurements at 0–8 cm, the 0–30 cm, and 0–90 150 cm layers are used to assess the estimated soil moisture results of the proposed assimilation 151 framework. The results can be evaluated using representative soil moisture sites within the 152 basin. Here, we use an analysis suggested by De Lannoy et al. (2007) to acquire the represen-153 tative soil moisture in-situ measurements (see other methods, in e.g., Famiglietti et al., 2008; 154 Orlowsky and Seneviratne, 2014; Nicolai-Shaw et al., 2015). The method is based on relative 155 differences $d_{m,n}$ for site m and time step n, which can be calculated as (De Lannoy et al., 2007), 156 157

$$d_{m,n} = \frac{SM_{m,n} - \overline{SM}_n}{\overline{SM}_n},\tag{1}$$

where $SM_{m,n}$ is the soil moisture measurement at m and n, and \overline{SM}_n represents the spatially averaged soil moisture. Once $d_{m,n}$ is calculated for each site, the temporally average difference (\bar{d}_m) and its standard deviation $(STD(d_m))$ are computed. The most representative site is then the one with \bar{d}_m and $STD(d_m)$ closer to 0.

162 **3. Methodology**

¹⁶³ 3.1. Adaptive Unscented Kalman Filter (AUKF)

¹⁶⁴ Consider the following nonlinear system,

$$\mathbf{x}_t = \mathbf{f}(\mathbf{x}_{t-1}) + \mathbf{v}_{t-1}, \tag{2}$$

$$\mathbf{y}_t = \mathbf{h}(\mathbf{x}_t) + \mathbf{u}_t, \tag{3}$$

where **f**, the system dynamics, describes the evolution of state vector, **x**, over time (t) and **h**, the observation function, maps \mathbf{x}_t to the observations, \mathbf{y}_t . \mathbf{v}_{t-1} represent the process noise, which is assumed to be Gaussian with mean 0 and covariance **Q**. \mathbf{u}_t indicates observation noise with covariance **R**, which is assumed to be known (see Section 2). In the present study, **x** consists of different water storages including top, shallow and deep soil water, vegetation, snow, surface, and groundwater storages while **y** represents the GRACE TWS data. For nonlinear systems, the unscented Kalman filter (UKF) (Julier and Uhlmann, 1997; Julier et al., 2000; Julier and Uhlmann, 2004; Simon, 2006; Wan and van der Merwe, 2001; Terejanu, 2009) can be used for state estimation. The UKF approximates the propagation of the mean and covariance of a random variable through a nonlinear function using a deterministic sampling approach that generates an ensemble of state values known as sigma points. Given the current state and covariance estimates \mathbf{x}_{t-1}^a and \mathbf{P}_{t-1}^a at step t of the filter, 2L + 1 sigma points (where L is the dimension of the state vector) are generated by,

$$\mathbf{x}_{t-1}^0 = \mathbf{x}_{t-1}^a, \tag{4}$$

$$\mathbf{x}_{t-1}^{i} = \mathbf{x}_{t-1}^{a} + \left(\sqrt{(L+\lambda)\mathbf{P}_{t-1}^{a}}\right)_{i} \quad i = 1, \dots, L,$$

$$(5)$$

$$\mathbf{x}_{t-1}^{i+L} = \mathbf{x}_{t-1}^a - \left(\sqrt{(L+\lambda)\mathbf{P}_{t-1}^a}\right)_i \quad i = 1, \dots, L,$$
(6)

with $\left(\sqrt{(L+\lambda)\mathbf{P}_{t-1}^{a}}\right)_{i}$ being the i^{th} column of the matrix square root (e.g., lower triangular Cholesky factorization, Wan and van der Merwe, 2000) of $(L+\lambda)\mathbf{P}_{t-1}^{a}$. The corresponding weights to the above sigma points defined as,

$$w_s^0 = \frac{\lambda}{(L+\lambda)},\tag{7}$$

$$w_c^0 = \frac{\lambda}{(L+\lambda)} + (1-\alpha^2 + \beta), \tag{8}$$

$$w_s^i = w_c^i = \frac{1}{2(L+\lambda)} \quad i = 1, \dots, 2L,$$
(9)

where $\sum_{i=0}^{2L} w_s^i = \sum_{i=0}^{2L} w_c^i = 1$. In Eqs. 5–9, λ is the scaling parameter, which can be calculated as $\lambda = \alpha^2 (L + \kappa) - L$. The scaling factor α determines the spread of the sigma points around \mathbf{x}_{t-1}^a , and κ is a secondary scaling parameter usually set to 0 (the specific value of kappa is not critical, see e.g., Julier and Uhlmann, 1997; Van der Merwe, 2004). β is employed to incorporate a prior knowledge about the noise distribution (e.g., the optimal choice for Gaussian distribution is $\beta = 2$, e.g., Wan and van der Merwe, 2001).

Between these factors, the selection of α has larger impacts on the ensemble spreads and controls the "size" of the sigma-point distribution. α determines how the sigma points can be scaled towards or away from the mean of the prior distribution. For example, $\alpha = 1$ and correspondingly $\lambda = 0$ leads the distance between \mathbf{x}_{t-1}^a and the sigma points to be proportional to \sqrt{L} . Positive values of λ (for $\alpha > 1$) scales the sigma points further from \mathbf{x}_{t-1}^a while negative

values of λ (for $\alpha < 1$) scales the sigma points towards \mathbf{x}_{t-1}^a . In other words, the larger values 192 for this scaling factor causes a larger spread in the sigma points while smaller values result in 193 more concentration around prior distribution (Van der Merwe, 2004). Ideally α should be a 194 small number, e.g., $1e - 4 \le \alpha \le 1$ (Song and He, 2005) to avoid sampling non-local effects 195 when the nonlinearities are strong. However, optimal sets of this factor along with κ and β are 196 generally problem specific and can be optimized arbitrary. For the current study, the values 197 of parameters are assumed as $\alpha = 0.5$, $\kappa = 0$, and $\beta = 2$. Nevertheless, it is found that the 198 implemented AUKF is not very sensitive to the parameter selection as long as they result in a 199 numerically well-behaved set of sigma-points and weights (see also Van der Merwe, 2004). 200

The sigma points are advanced forward one time step using model **f** and observed using the function **h**,

$$\mathbf{x}_{t}^{f,j} = \mathbf{f}(\mathbf{x}_{t-1}^{j}), \quad \mathbf{j} = \mathbf{0}, \dots, \mathbf{2L},$$
(10)

$$\mathbf{y}_t^{f,j} = \mathbf{h}(\mathbf{x}_t^{f,j}), \quad \mathbf{j} = \mathbf{0}, \dots, \mathbf{2L}.$$
(11)

The transformed points $(\mathbf{x}_t^{f,j} \text{ and } \mathbf{y}_t^{f,j})$ are then used to calculate their respective forecast means and covariance matrices,

$$\mathbf{x}_t^f = \sum_{j=0}^{2L} w_s^j \mathbf{x}_t^{f,j}, \tag{12}$$

$$\mathbf{y}_t^f = \sum_{j=0}^{2L} w_s^j \mathbf{y}_t^{f,j}, \tag{13}$$

$$\mathbf{P}_{t}^{f} = \sum_{j=0}^{2L} w_{c}^{j} \left(\mathbf{x}_{t}^{f,j} - \mathbf{x}_{t}^{f} \right) \left(\mathbf{x}_{t}^{f,j} - \mathbf{x}_{t}^{f} \right)^{T} + \mathbf{Q}_{t-1},$$
(14)

$$\mathbf{P}_{\mathbf{y}_{t}^{f}} = \sum_{j=0}^{2L} w_{c}^{j} \left(\mathbf{y}_{t}^{f,j} - \mathbf{y}_{t}^{f} \right) \left(\mathbf{y}_{t}^{f,j} - \mathbf{y}_{t}^{f} \right)^{T} + \mathbf{R}_{t},$$
(15)

205 as well as the cross covariance between \mathbf{x}_t^f and \mathbf{y}_t^f ,

$$\mathbf{P}_{\mathbf{x}_{t}^{f},\mathbf{y}_{t}^{f}} = \sum_{j=0}^{2L} w_{c}^{j} \left(\mathbf{x}_{t}^{f,j} - \mathbf{x}_{t}^{f} \right) \left(\mathbf{y}_{t}^{f,j} - \mathbf{y}_{t}^{f} \right)^{T}.$$
(16)

²⁰⁶ In the analysis step of the filter, the measurements (e.g., GRACE-derived TWS) are used ²⁰⁷ to correct the forecasted state and respective covariance matrix using the Kalman update 208 equations,

$$\mathbf{x}_t^a = \mathbf{x}_t^f + \mathbf{K}(\mathbf{y}_t - \mathbf{y}_t^f), \tag{17}$$

$$\mathbf{K} = \mathbf{P}_{\mathbf{x}_{t}^{f}, \mathbf{y}_{t}^{f}} \mathbf{P}_{\mathbf{y}_{t}^{f}}^{-1}, \tag{18}$$

$$\mathbf{P}_{t}^{a} = \mathbf{P}_{\mathbf{x}_{t}^{f}} - \mathbf{K} \mathbf{P}_{\mathbf{y}_{t}^{f}} \mathbf{K}^{T}.$$
(19)

where \mathbf{K} is the Kalman gain.

Critical to the success of the UKF is the selection of the filter noise covariances, and in particular the process noise covariance matrix \mathbf{Q} . Here, we use the method of Berry et al. (2013) to adaptively estimate this covariance matrix. We refer to this as the *adaptive unscented Kalman filter* (AUKF). Building on the method of Mehra (1990, 1992), the general idea of Berry et al. (2013) is to use the increment, $\epsilon_t = \mathbf{y}_t - \mathbf{y}_t^f$, to estimate the noise covariance at each time step. The method begins by forming an empirical estimate \mathbf{Q}_{t-1}^e for \mathbf{Q} ,

$$\mathbf{P}_{t-1}^{e} = \mathbf{F}_{t-1}^{-1} \mathbf{H}_{t-1}^{-1} \epsilon_{t-1} \epsilon_{t-1}^{T} \mathbf{H}_{t-1}^{-T} + \mathbf{K}_{t-1} \epsilon_{t-1} \epsilon_{t-1}^{T} \mathbf{H}_{t-1}^{-T},$$
(20)

$$\mathbf{Q}_{t-1}^{e} = \mathbf{P}_{t-1}^{e} - \mathbf{F}_{t-2} \mathbf{P}_{t-2}^{a} \mathbf{F}_{t-2}^{T}, \qquad (21)$$

where \mathbf{P}_{t-1}^{e} is an empirical estimate of the background covariance. In Eqs. 20 and 21, **F** and **H** are local linearizations of the nonlinear dynamic models **f** and **h**, respectively, and are estimated using a linear regression on the ensembles (see Eq. 7 in Berry et al., 2013, for details regarding this linearization). It is worth mentioning that we must store linearizations $\mathbf{F}_{t-2}, \mathbf{F}_{t-1}, \mathbf{H}_{t-1}, \mathbf{H}_t$, increments $\epsilon_{t-1}, \epsilon_t$, analysis covariance \mathbf{P}_{t-2}^{a} , and Kalman gain \mathbf{K}_{t-1} from the t-1 and t-2 steps of the filter. To form a stable estimate of **Q**, the noisy estimate \mathbf{Q}_{t-1}^{e} is combined using an exponentially weighted moving average,

$$\mathbf{Q}_t = \mathbf{Q}_{t-1} + (\mathbf{Q}_{t-1}^e - \mathbf{Q}_{t-1})/\tau, \qquad (22)$$

where τ is the window of the moving average. Berry et al. (2013); Hamilton et al. (2016) provide additional details on the estimation of noise covariance.

225 3.2. Kalman-Takens Method

The main idea of the Kalman-Takens method is to replace the model-based forecast in the AUKF with the advancement of the dynamics non-parametrically, thus requiring no knowledge of **f** (in Eq. 2). We provide a brief description of the method below, specifically highlighting modifications in adopting the algorithm to our problem. Full details of the methodology can be found in Hamilton et al. (2016, 2017).

In the present study, we consider a different setup to implement the Kalman-Takens filter for 231 a more complicated state observation transition systems. While the data available are gridded 232 GRACE TWS, our interest is in estimating the different water variables (i.e., top, shallow 233 and deep soil water, vegetation, snow, surface, and groundwater). These variables with no 234 independent observation available, are provided by the W3RA model and are used to produce 235 delay-coordinate vectors. We generate a synthetic set of model trajectories (open-loop run) for 236 these variables to serve as the training data for the Kalman-Takens filter. The training data 237 represents the state of the system. It is also used to generate a local proxy $\tilde{\mathbf{f}}$ for the unknown 238 model \mathbf{f} (cf. Eq. 2), which is not available in the non-parametric framework, so Eq. 10 for 239 advancing the ensemble forward in time in AUKF is not implementable. This brings us to Eq. 240 23, which defines the delay-coordinate vector \mathbf{z} at each step of the filter using the historical 241 state variables from the open-loop run by. 242

$$\mathbf{z}_t = [\mathbf{x}^{\mathbf{o}}_t, \mathbf{x}^{\mathbf{o}}_{t-1}, \dots, \mathbf{x}^{\mathbf{o}}_{t-d}],$$
(23)

where d is the number of temporal delays. $\mathbf{x}^{\mathbf{o}}$ contains the open-loop top, shallow and deep soil 243 moisture, vegetation, snow, surface, and groundwater. Once the delay coordinate is created, 244 the assimilation procedure can be applied. At each AUKF step, an ensemble of delay vectors 245 is formed and advanced non-parametrically using a local approximation \mathbf{f} . This nonparametric 246 prediction helps to build local models for predicting the dynamics at the forecast step (Hamilton 247 et al., 2017). Given the above current delay-coordinate, the non-parametric advancement starts 248 by locating the N nearest neighbors (i.e., points located within a given Euclidean distance; not 249 only adjacent points), within a set of training data, 250

$$\mathbf{z}_{t}^{1} = [\mathbf{x}_{t}^{\mathbf{o}_{t}^{1}}, \mathbf{x}_{t-1}^{\mathbf{o}_{t}^{1}}, \dots, \mathbf{x}_{t-d}^{\mathbf{o}_{t-d}}],$$

$$\mathbf{z}_{t}^{2} = [\mathbf{x}_{t}^{\mathbf{o}_{t}^{2}}, \mathbf{x}_{t-1}^{\mathbf{o}_{t-1}^{2}}, \dots, \mathbf{x}_{t-d}^{\mathbf{o}_{t-d}^{2}}],$$

$$\vdots$$

$$\mathbf{z}_{t}^{N} = [\mathbf{x}_{t}^{\mathbf{o}_{t}^{N}}, \mathbf{x}_{t-1}^{\mathbf{o}_{t-1}^{N}}, \dots, \mathbf{x}_{t-d}^{\mathbf{o}_{t-d}^{N}}].$$
(24)

The known $\mathbf{z}_{t+1}^1, \mathbf{z}_{t+1}^2, \dots, \mathbf{z}_{t+1}^N$ (based on $\mathbf{x}_{t+1}^{\mathbf{o}1}, \mathbf{x}_{t+1}^{\mathbf{o}2}, \dots, \mathbf{x}_{t+1}^{\mathbf{o}N}$), are used in a local model to predict \mathbf{z}_{t+1} . The local model $\tilde{\mathbf{f}}$, which can be generated using a weighted average of the nearest neighbors (Hamilton et al., 2016; Lagergren et al., 2018) can be written as,

$$\mathbf{z}_{t+1} = \omega_1 \mathbf{z}_{t+1}^1 + \omega_2 \mathbf{z}_{t+1}^2 + \dots + \omega_N \mathbf{z}_{t+1}^N,$$
(25)

$$\omega_i = \frac{e^{-(d_i/\sigma)}}{\sum_{j=1}^N e^{-(d_j/\sigma)^2}},$$
(26)

where d_i is the distance of the j^{th} neighbour to \mathbf{z}_t and σ is a bandwidth parameter, which controls the contribution of each neighbor in the local model (here $\sigma = 2$). The above prediction is applied to estimate the delay coordinate vector at t + 1.

The process of building a local model for forecasting the delay-coordinate vector is repeated 257 for each sigma point in the ensemble. After $\tilde{\mathbf{f}}$ has been defined, the remainder of the AUKF 258 update scheme is implemented. Important to the Kalman-Takens method is the selection of d259 (the number of delays) and neighbors N. Here, we consider different values of N and d and 260 set them based on the filter performance, which is described in Section 4. The assumption of 261 using the model trajectory rather than observations for generating delay vectors allows us to 262 reconstruct the system representing various water storage compartments. The same assumption 263 is made by Lguensat et al. (2017), where trajectories of the system and not the physical model 264 is available. In fact, we hypothesize that the available model outcomes can be used for the 265 non-parametric sampling of the dynamics and updated by the GRACE TWS (as a summation 266 of all the water variables at each grid point). This means that one can essentially correct 267 state variables of the system, without having data for each individually, using the data-driven 268 framework. The application of this method can address some severe limitations in traditional 269 data assimilation such as large computational cost. 270

FIGURE 1

271 3.3. Synthetic experiment

A synthetic experiment is undertaken to assess the efficiency of the proposed data assimilation schemes in simulating physical processes. One important problem with hydrological models, and specifically W3RA, is their limitations in simulating anthropogenic impacts on the water cycle. For example, excessive groundwater extractions, which can largely affect sub-

surface water storages, are not modeled in W3RA and a successful data assimilation process 276 should be able to correct for this drawback by taking the advantage of additional observations. 277 Here, we choose to test both AUKF and Kalman-Takens filters to improve upon model simula-278 tions between 2003 and 2013 over Iran $(32.4279^{\circ}N, 53.6880^{\circ}E)$. The rationale behind choosing 279 Iran for this synthetic analysis, and not Australia, is that a remarkable water storage decline 280 is reported over this region, mainly due to anthropogenic impacts, which cannot be detected 281 by W3RA (see Khaki et al., 2018b). A major part of the negative water storage trend is due 282 to human impacts (see details in Forootan et al., 2017; Khaki et al., 2018b). Synthetic ob-283 servations are produced using the WaterGAP Global Hydrology Model (WGHM; Döll et al., 284 2003; Müller et al., 2014) monthly TWS outputs, which contain the anthropogenic impacts 285 (Khaki et al., 2018b), at two different spatial resolution of $1^{\circ} \times 1^{\circ}$ and $3^{\circ} \times 3^{\circ}$. This can help 286 to test whether data assimilation can account for human impacts on water storage and also 287 to investigate the effect of spatial resolution on the final results. WGHM TWS estimates are 288 assumed as our observations after rescaling into $1^{\circ} \times 1^{\circ}$ and $3^{\circ} \times 3^{\circ}$ and perturbing using Monte 289 Carlo sampling of multivariate normal distributions with the errors representing the GRACE 290 level 2's standard errors. The data assimilation is implemented using both filtering methods at 291 the aforementioned spatial scales. 292

293 3.4. Evaluation metrics

To evaluate the assimilation results against in-situ groundwater and soil moisture measurements, three metrics, (i) the Root-Mean-Squared Errors (RMSE), (ii) standard deviation (STD), and (iii) Nash-Sutcliffe coefficient (NSE) are used. Groundwater and soil moisture insitu measurements from various stations are spatially averaged to the location of the nearest model grid points and are compared with their respective estimates. To this end, using the variation time series of in-situ data and the results of assimilation techniques, RMSE, STD, and NSE are calculated by,

$$RMSE = \sqrt{\frac{1}{n} \sum_{i=1}^{n} (x_i - z_i)^2},$$
(27)

$$STD = \sqrt{\frac{1}{n} \sum_{i=1}^{n} (x_i - \bar{x})^2},$$
 (28)

$$NSE = 1 - \left[\frac{\sum_{i=1}^{n} (x_i - z_i)^2}{\sum_{i=1}^{n} (z_i - \bar{z})^2}\right],$$
(29)

where x_i is the predicted value (for *n* samples) and z_i represents the measured in-situ value. In Eqs. 27–29, \bar{x} and \bar{z} are the average of the predicted and measured values, respectively. Furthermore, to statistically assess the significance of the results, the student t-test is applied. The estimated t-value and the distribution at 0.05 significant level are used to calculate p-values.

305 4. Results

306 4.1. Synthetic experiment

The results of synthetic experiment, which is chosen to assess the capability of the two 307 data assimilation schemes in improving model's simulation of physical processes are presented in 308 this section. TWS variations from W3RA (open-loop; model integration without assimilation), 309 AUKF and Kalman-Takens filters (with N = 14 and d = 11, see Section 4.2 for details), as well 310 as synthetic observations, are displayed in Figure 2, where the time series represent spatially 311 averaged TWS variations over the entire Iran. The trend lines corresponding to each time series 312 are also depicted in the figure. As can be clearly seen, W3RA's open-loop run does not correctly 313 capture the negative trend in the TWS time series as visible in the observations. Assimilation 314 results, on the other hand, successfully reproduce the negative trend. Except for few cases, 315 e.g., 2009 and 2011, Kalman-Takens performs closely to AUKF. The assimilation trend lines 316 also show that the filtered results capture the existing trend of the observations. In addition to 317 the trends, there are larger correlations between AUKF (14% on average) and Kalman-Takens 318 (12% on average) with the observations compared to the open-loop results. An evaluation of the 319 assimilation results against the original WGHM TWS, i.e., before perturbation using GRACE 320 noises, are shown in Figure 3. 321

FIGURE 2

Figure 3 shows the scatter plot of the open-loop, AUKF, and Kalman-Takens TWS estimates against WGHM at the two spatial resolutions of $1^{\circ} \times 1^{\circ}$ and $3^{\circ} \times 3^{\circ}$ to assess the filters' performances at various spatial scales. Note that temporal assessment is also investigated in Section 4.2. It can be seen that at both spatial scales, there are larger agreements between the filtered results and WGHM. There are also smaller RMSEs after filtering, which suggests the capability of both methods to improve model simulations even in case of remarkable human impact. While every assimilation scenario leads to smaller RMSE than the open-loop run, the least RMSEs are achieved at $1^{\circ} \times 1^{\circ}$ resolution. This shows that assimilating TWS observations at a finer resolution can provide better estimates regardless of the filtering method. It can also be seen that both AUKF and Kalman-Takens provide comparable results at both spatial scales, leading to approximately 48% RMSE reduction. The filters' comparable results at $3^{\circ} \times 3^{\circ}$ spatial resolution suggests their similar performance for downscaling TWS observations into the $1^{\circ} \times 1^{\circ}$ W3RA resolution.

FIGURE 3

335 4.2. Assessment with in-situ data

Independent groundwater and soil moisture in-situ measurements within the Murray-336 Darling Basin in Australia are used to evaluate the results. This is done by comparing the 337 AUKF and Kalman-Takens estimates of groundwater and soil moisture with those of the in-338 situ measurements. Note that further analysis is undertaken to assess the impacts of the filters 339 on non-assimilated variables and the results are provided in the supplementary material. Before 340 comparing AUKF and Kalman-Takens results against in-situ measurements, we investigate the 341 effect of various setups in the Kalman-Takens performance. Different scenarios are considered 342 regarding the number of neighbors N (i.e., 2-40) and also the number of delays d (i.e., 1-25). 343 To reach the best setup amongst these values, we compare the results of each scenario to the 344 in-situ groundwater measurements. Figure 4 shows the average absolute groundwater errors 345 resulting from each case. Increasing the number of neighbors can improve the approximation of 346 training data for a particular point to a certain extent (due to the existing spatial correlations). 347 However, selecting N too large can cause a rapid growth of errors, which is related to the effect 348 of over-smoothing the training step. This is different for delays d, where much larger errors 349 are present for smaller values that underestimate temporal variabilities in the data. From our 350 numerical investigations, it can be seen that applying the Kalman-Takens filter with N = 14351 and d = 11 provides the best result. It is worth mentioning that we use these setups of the 352 Kalman-Takens filter throughout this study. 353

FIGURE 4

The comparison between the open-loop run, AUKF, and Kalman-Takens results are depicted in Figure 5, which displays scatter plot of each filter's RMSE and STD calculated using

in-situ groundwater measurements. Three different temporal evaluations are considered to fur-356 ther investigate the effect of temporal downscaling on the results. The GRACE TWS data 357 (with approximately 30 days temporal scale) and associated errors are interpolated into a daily 358 and 5-daily samples (see also Tangdamrongsub et al., 2015; Khaki et al., 2017b) using the 359 spline interpolation between consecutive months. The assimilation is then undertaken on a 360 daily, 5-day, and monthly basis. Figure 5 indicates that both AUKF and Kalman-Takens filters 361 result in smaller RMSE and STD compared to the open-loop run for all the three temporal 362 scales. In the daily and to a lesser degree 5-day assimilation cases, AUKF performs slightly 363 better than the Kalman-Takens, with smaller RMSE and STD, which could be attributed to the 364 contribution of the model equations for spreading TWS information between different variables 365 after assimilation. Nevertheless, the performance of the non-parametric filter is satisfactory for 366 both cases and comparable to that of AUKF. Interestingly, the performances of the two filters 367 are even closer when assimilating monthly data. As a general result, this demonstrates that 368 temporal downscaling of GRACE TWS data is recommended for data assimilation purpose 369 regardless of the filtering method used. The average RMSE values for the 5-day assimilation 370 using AUKF and Kalman-Takens filters are 51.28 ($\sim 13\%$ smaller than daily and $\sim 7\%$ smaller 371 than monthly) and 53.61 ($\sim 16\%$ smaller than daily and $\sim 5\%$ smaller than monthly), respec-372 tively. Based on the above evaluation, it can be concluded that different temporal scales have 373 similar effects on both filters, where the AUKF and Kalman-Takens filters perform better for 374 the 5-day assimilation case. 375

FIGURE 5

More detailed statistics are provided in Table 1 to better compare the performances of the 376 implemented filters against in-situ groundwater measurements. The evaluation is undertaken 377 using RMSE and NSE metrics (see Section 3.4) based on the 5-day assimilation case. Note 378 that in this table, basin-scale results are provided in addition to the results of the grid-based 379 evaluation. Considering the coarse spatial resolution of W3RA and the fact that a number of 380 groundwater stations can be found in each grid cell, basin-averaged assessment is performed as 381 an alternative examination. The spatially averaged open-loop results and those from filters over 382 the Murray-Darling Basin are tested against basin-average groundwater time series. Results of 383 Table 1 confirm the behavior seen in Figure 5. While smaller RMSEs are obtained from AUKF 384

for both grid- and basin-based tests, the application of the Kalman-Takens method significantly 385 decreases groundwater RMSE values (30.22% on average). Also larger NSE values are obtained 386 by both filters compared to the open-loop run. These results prove a high capability of the 387 Kalman-Takens for improving state estimates, very close to the AUKF performance. Table 1 388 also indicates that the Kalman-Takens approach can be used as traditional data assimilation 389 to reduce noise in the final state variables, which are the results of solving complex inverse 390 problems, e.g., groundwater estimates are improved from GRACE-derived TWS. This is also 391 true for soil moisture estimates (cf. Table 2). 392

TABLE 1

We use different soil moisture layers from in-situ measurements including 0-8 cm (compared 393 to the model top soil moisture layer), 0-30 cm (compared to the summation of the model top 394 and shallow soil moisture layers), and 0-90 cm (compared to the summation of the model top, 395 shallow, and deep soil moisture layers) for evaluating the results. Note that considering the 396 difference between W3RA states (i.e., column water storage measured in mm) and the OzNet 397 measurements (i.e., volumetric soil moisture) and the fact that converting the model outputs 398 into volumetric units may introduce a bias (Renzullo et al., 2014), only NSE analysis is carried 399 out and the results are provided in Table 2. Similar improvements as for groundwater evaluation 400 are also found by comparing the filters estimates against OzNet soil moisture measurements 401 (Table 2). Larger NSE values are found from data assimilation filters for all three soil layers. 402 Average NSE from the Kalman-Takens method is 0.73, $\sim 12.3\%$ larger than the open-loop run, 403 and slightly smaller than AUKF results (0.74). Table 2 confirms that the capability of the 404 Kalman-Takens method for improving the soil moisture estimates similar to AUKF (13.7% on)405 average). The largest improvements for both filters are achieved in the root zone (0-90 cm)406 moisture layer. Table 2 suggests that AUKF better reflects the GRACE observations, especially 407 at this layer. This, however, does not necessarily lead to better approximations in the shallow 408 soil moisture layer, where the non-parametric approach shows higher improvements compared 409 to AUKF. 410

TABLE 2

411 4.3. Assessing the performance of AUKF and Kalman-Taken filters

Here, we compare the performances of the AUKF and Kalman-Takens filters from various 412 perspectives including increment applied, state covariance, computational efficiency, and water 413 storage forecasting. Figure 6 shows the increments implemented by each filtering technique 414 during the study period. We estimate average increment (i.e., ϵ discussed in Section 3.1) at 415 all grid points for AUKF and the Kalman-Takens approach. One can see how the filters deal 416 with the GRACE TWS observations in the update steps. Both methods decrease the increment 417 as assimilation proceeds forward in time. This is found to be smaller for the Kalman-Takens 418 method (see the trend lines in Figure 6) compared to AUKF. In fact, AUKF integrates the 419 ensemble members through the model \mathbf{f} , while the non-parametric approach uses the local 420 proxy $\hat{\mathbf{f}}$. Consequently, larger misfits between the Kalman-Takens method forecast estimates 421 and observations can be expected. Nevertheless, Figure 6 shows that the local proxy performs 422 comparably to \mathbf{f} in most of the time. In addition to increments, the difference between the 423 filter's forecasting also affects the estimated error covariances, especially forecast covariance 424 matrix (cf. Figure 7). 425

FIGURE 6

FIGURE 7

 P_f and P_a are calculated at assimilation steps for both filters. The average of the matrices' diagonal elements are displayed in Figure 7. Despite the filters different performances in Figure 6, both methods perform very similar in dealing with the error covariances. The distribution of scattered error points from the Kalman-Takens filter and the corresponding trend line largely matches that of AUKF, which demonstrate that the filters have comparable uncertainty estimates. This indicates the ability of the Kalman-Takens method, which not only improves the model states but is also competitive with the traditional data assimilation system.

434 4.3.1. Filters efficiency

426

Computational complexity is important for data assimilation methods, especially when
dealing with a high dimensional system, such as in hydrological studies. Therefore, a good data
assimilation filter requires balancing between processes undertaken to achieve accurate estimates
and computational efficiency. While the Kalman-Takens filter's capability for improving state

estimates have already been demonstrated (cf. Sections 4.1 and 4.2), its potential for decreasing 439 the computational cost is examined here. This is done by comparing the computation time of the 440 AUKF and Kalman-Takens filtering methods from various perspectives including forecasting, 441 analysis steps, and filtering over the entire study period. Importantly, the following computation 442 time estimates have been obtained using identical hardware. In the forecast step, the average 443 computation time (for 794 grid points within Australia) is considerably lower for the Kalman-444 Takens filter, e.g., 6.12 second against 8.57 second for AUKF. This is due to the fact that the 445 Kalman-Takens filter exploits the proxy model (\tilde{f}) , which is based on a local approximation and 446 requires much less computation than a physics-based model. The average computational time 447 at the analysis steps is 5.74 second for the Kalman-Takens filter and 7.83 seconds for AUKF. 448 Considering that both methods are using similar analysis filtering, this difference is due to the 449 local scheme (based on d delays and N neighbor points) in the Kalman-Takens method. The 450 values of delays d and neighbors N determine the number of local points used in the analysis 451 and accordingly the size of the underlying vectors and matrices. AUKF, on the other hand, 452 solves for all grid points altogether, which requires a larger amount of memory and time. In 453 general, it is found that the Kalman-Takens is considerably less computationally demanding, 454 i.e., ~ 8 times faster for the entire experiment period, compared to the AUKF implementation 455 for assimilating all observations into the system states. 456

457 4.3.2. Water storage update

In this section, we analyze the spatio-temporal increments derived by assimilating the 458 GRACE TWS observations and explore their effects on the states. Figure 8 presents the average 459 TWS time series after applying each filter, open-loop, and GRACE observations over Australia. 460 Both filters largely decrease the misfits between the model states and the GRACE observations, 461 which is expected since GRACE is used as a constraint. AUKF, however, has a larger impact 462 on the states, especially where a significant TWS variation exists (e.g., 2006 and 2011–2012). 463 The Kalman-Takens method, on the other hand, shows a smoother time series. Based on these 464 results, we find that the Kalman-Takens approach is able to efficiently integrate observations 465 into the model and correct missing trends as well as amplitudes and phases. Nevertheless, one 466 can conclude that this method might not be able to efficiently extract spontaneous or high rate 467 seasonal effects unless the training data has these variabilities/dynamics. 468

FIGURE 8

The correlation between the estimated TWS time series from the open-loop model run 469 and the filters' estimates at each grid point within Australia and those of the GRACE TWS 470 are presented in Figure 9. The filters largely increase the correlation between model derived 471 TWS and those of GRACE. The largest correlations (with 0.92 average) is obtained by AUKF 472 suggesting that this method better reflects the GRACE TWS into the states. The average 473 correlation between TWS of the Kalman-Takens and GRACE is 0.89 (0.03 less than AUKF). 474 and when compared to only 0.52 obtained from the open-loop estimates, the efficiency of the 475 method becomes visible. Correlations of the open-loop TWS and GRACE are smaller over the 476 mountainous area along the East coast compared to other parts of the country. This is due to 477 difficulties of modeling hydrology in complex terrain areas (mountains). On the other hand, 478 both assimilation methods show good performances by increased correlations with GRACE 479 data. Over large parts of Australia, the performances of the Kalman-Takens filter and AUKF 480 are found to be similar in terms of correlations with the GRACE TWS. 481

FIGURE 9

To further assess the capability of the filtering approaches for improving the model simu-482 lations, we test their ability in correcting the model variables for extreme and poorly known 483 hydrological phenomena. To this end, the filters' TWS results are monitored between 2003 484 and 2012 over the Murray-Darling Basin. As shown by Schumacher et al. (2018), a long-term 485 drought period (2001–2009), known as Millennium Drought (e.g., Ummenhofer et al., 2009; 486 LeBlanc et al., 2012; van Dijk et al., 2013), has remarkably affected TWS variations in the 487 basin. This negative TWS trend has then been followed by an above average precipitation, 488 mainly caused by El Niño Southern Oscillation (ENSO; see, e.g., Boening et al., 2012; Forootan 489 et al., 2016) for the period of 2010–2012. Here, we investigate the capability of the open-loop, 490 AUKF, and Kalman-Takens TWS estimates to capture these two extreme events. Figure 10 491 plots the average TWS time series of the above methods, as well as GRACE-derived TWS over 492 the Murray-Darling Basin. As can be seen, while both Millennium drought (red shaded area) 493 and ENSO effect (blue shaded area) are reflected in GRACE TWS time series, the open-loop 494 run is unable to capture them, especially the drought effects. AUKF and the Kalman-Takens 495

filter, on the other hand, successfully depict the negative trend between 2003 and 2010, followed by a positive anomaly after 2010. Except for few points such as 2004, 2007, and late 2009, the Kalman-Takens method presents a similar performance as AUKF in incorporating GRACE TWS data with states and reflecting extreme hydrological events.

FIGURE 10

500 5. Conclusions

The present study investigates the ability of the Kalman-Takens approach to reconstruct 501 the nonlinear dynamics of a hydrological model. This is done to update observable state vari-502 ables based on new observations when a physics-based model is not available. This implies that 503 contrary to a standard data assimilation, the Kalman-Takens filter does not affect non-observed 504 variables (e.g., water discharge in our case). In this work, we introduce a new setup for the 505 Kalman-Takens filter to reconstruct additional states (e.g., soil moisture and groundwater) us-506 ing the Gravity Recovery And Climate Experiment (GRACE) terrestrial water storage (TWS). 507 The Kalman-Takens results are compared with a parametric forecasting approach of an adaptive 508 unscented Kalman filtering (AUKF) as well as against in-situ groundwater and soil moisture 509 measurements. The results prove a high capability of the Kalman-Takens for improving state 510 estimates, largely comparable to the AUKF performance and as such, both provide efficient 511 methods for assimilating GRACE TWS data. Results indicate that smaller RMSE (46.96 mm) 512 and higher NSE (0.82) values are obtained from the application of the Kalman-Takens method 513 in comparison to the open-loop run (69.40 mm RMSE and 0.58 NSE). Although AUKF per-514 forms slightly better in some cases, e.g., $\sim 3\%$ higher improvement for groundwater estimates, 515 which is expected since AUKF takes advantage of the full knowledge of the model while the 516 non-parametric filter uses only the short noisy training data set from which to learn the dy-517 namics, in all cases considered, the Kalman-Takens results are generally very close to those 518 of AUKF. The data-driven approach also increases the NSE values between the estimated soil 519 moisture variations and the OzNet in-situ measurements for all soil layers (11.83% on average) 520 as compared to AUKF (13.77% on average). The proposed approach also reduces estimation 52 complexities by using the local proxy model. The Kalman-Takens filter performs more efficient 522 $(\sim 8 \text{ times faster})$ in terms of computational cost, which is very important to deal with a grow-523 ing amount of data sets in high dimensional systems. This contribution, to the best of the 524

⁵²⁵ authors' knowledge, is the first effort in using the data-driven approach in hydrological studies
⁵²⁶ with complex state observation transition systems. Further research should be undertaken to
⁵²⁷ investigate the Kalman-Takens filter in different hydrological applications and also to explore
⁵²⁸ its capability in dealing with multiple satellite products.

529 6. Acknowledgement

We would like to thank Tyrus Berry and Timothy Sauer for their valuable help 530 in this study. M. Khaki is grateful for the research grant of Curtin International Post-531 graduate Research Scholarships (CIPRS)/ORD Scholarship provided by Curtin Univer-532 sity (Australia). F. Hamilton is supported by National Science Foundation grant No. 533 RTG/DMS-1246991. This work is a TIGeR publication. The GRACE data are ac-534 quired from the ITSG-Grace2014 gravity field model (Mayer-Gürr et al., 2014). In-situ 535 groundwater and soil moisture measurements are obtained from the New South Wales Gov-536 ernment (NSW; http://waterinfo.nsw.gov.au/pinneena/gw.shtml) and the OzNet network 537 (http://www.oznet.org.au/), respectively. Meteorological forcing data are provided by Prince-538 ton University (http://hydrology.princeton.edu). Other data used in this study can be found 539 at DOI: 10.6084/m9.figshare.5942548. A more detailed discussion of the results can be found 540 in the supporting information (Huffman et al., 2007; Mu et al., 2011). 541

542 **References**

- Alsdorf, D.E., Rodriguez, E., Lettenmaier, D.P., (2007). Measuring surface water from space,
 Rev. Geophys., 45, RG2002, http://dx.doi.org/10.1029/2006RG000197.
- Andreadis, K.M., Clark, E.A., Lettenmaier, D.P., Alsdorf, D.E., (2007). Prospects for river discharge and depth estimation through assimilation of swathaltimetry into a raster-based hydrodynamics model. Geophysical Research Letters 34: http://dx.doi.org/10.1029/2007GL02972.
- Arnold, H., Moroz, I., Palmer, T., (2013). Stochastic Parametrizations and Model Uncertainty
 in the Lorenz '96 System, Phil. Trans. R. Soc. A 371, 20110479.
- Awwad, H.M., Valds, J.B., Restrepo, P.J., (1994). Streamflow forecasting for Han River basin,
- Korea. J. Water Resour. Plann. Manage., 120, 651673.

- Bennett, A.F., (2002); Inverse Modeling of the Ocean and Atmosphere, 234 pp., Cambridge
 Univ. Press, New York.
- Berry, T., Sauer, T., (2013). Adaptive ensemble Kalman filtering of non-linear, Tellus A: Dynamic Meteorology and Oceanography, Volume 65, Issue 1, Article: 20331,
 http://dx.doi.org/10.3402/tellusa.v65i0.20331.
- Berry, T., Harlim, J., (2016). Variable Bandwidth Diffusion Kernels, Appl. Comput. Harmon.
 Anal., 40, 68.
- ⁵⁵⁹ Boening, C., Willis, J.K., Landerer, F.W., Nerem, R.S., Fasullo, J., (2012). The
 ⁵⁶⁰ 2011 La Nia: so strong, the oceans fell. Geophys. Res. Lett. 39, L19602.
 ⁵⁶¹ http://dx.doi.org/10.1029/2012GL053055.
- BoM, (2010). Australian Rainfall Patterns During El Nio Events. Bureau of Meteorology. Ac cessed at http://www.bom.gov.au/climate/enso/ninocomp.shtml.
- Botterill, L.C., (2003). Uncertain Climate: The Recent History of Drought Policy in Australia. Australian Journal of Politics & History, 49: 6174, http://dx.doi.org/10.1111/14678497.00281.
- Bras, R.L., Restrepo-Posada, P., (1980). Real time automatic parameter calibration in conceptual runoff forecasting models. Proc. Third Int. Symp. on Stochastic Hydraulics, 6170.
- Brocca, L., Melone, F., Moramarco, T., Wagner, W., Naeimi, V., Bartalis, Z., Hasenauer, S.,
 (2010). Improving runoff prediction through the assimilation of the ASCAT soil moisture
 product, Hydrol. Earth Syst. Sci., 14, 18811893, http://dx.doi.org/10.5194/hess-14-18812010.
- ⁵⁷³ Calvet, J.-C., Noilhan, J., Bessemoulin, P., (1998). Retrieving root-zone soil moisture from sur⁵⁷⁴ face soil moisture of temperature estimates: A feasibility study based on field measurements.
 ⁵⁷⁵ J. Appl. Meteor., 37, 371386.
- ⁵⁷⁶ Cheng, M.K., Tapley, B.D., (2004). Variations in the Earth's oblateness during
 ⁵⁷⁷ the past 28 years. Journal of Geophysical Research, Solid Earth, 109, B09402.
 ⁵⁷⁸ http://dx.doi.org/10.1029/2004JB003028.

22

- ⁵⁷⁹ Chiew, F.H.S., Stewardson, M.J., McMahon, T.A., (1993). Comparison of six rainfall-runoff
 ⁵⁸⁰ modelling approaches, J. Hydrol., 147, 136.
- ⁵⁸¹ Christiansen, L., Krogh, P.E., Bauer-Gottwein, P., Andersen, O.B., Leirio, S., Binning, P.J.,
 ⁵⁸² Rosbjerg, D., (2007). Local to regional hydrological model calibration for the Okavango
 ⁵⁸³ River Basin from In-situ and space borne gravity observations. Proceedings of 2nd Space for
 ⁵⁸⁴ Hydrology Workshop, Geneva, Switzerland, 12-14.
- ⁵⁸⁵ Coumou, D., Rahmstorf, S., (2012). A decade of weather extremes Nat. Clim. Change, 2 (7),
 ⁵⁸⁶ pp. 16.
- ⁵⁸⁷ CSIRO, BoM, (2014). State of the Climate 2014. CSIRO and Bureau of Meteorology, Melbourne.
- CSIRO, BoM, (2015). Climate change in Australia: Projections for Australia's NRM regions.
 Technical Report, 216pp.
- ⁵⁹⁰ De Lannoy, G., Pauwels, V.R.N., Houser, P.R., Verhoest, N.E.C., Gish, T., (2007). Repre ⁵⁹¹ sentativeness of point soil moisture observations, upscaling and assimilation. IUGG General
 ⁵⁹² Assembly, Perugia Italy, Session HS2004, July 2-13.
- ⁵⁹³ De Lannoy, G.J.M., Reichle, R.H., Houser, P.R., Pauwels, V.R.N., Verhoes, N.E.C., (2007).
 ⁵⁹⁴ Correcting for forecast bias in soil moisture assimilation with the ensemble Kalman filter.
 ⁵⁹⁵ Water Resour. Res. 43, W09410, http://dx.doi.org/10.1029/2006WR00544.
- ⁵⁹⁶ De Lannoy, G.J.M., Houser, P.R., Pauwels, V.R.N., Verhoest, N.E., (2009). Assessment of model
 ⁵⁹⁷ uncertainty for soil moisture through ensemble verification. J. Geophys. Res. 111, D10101,
 ⁵⁹⁸ http://dx.doi.org/10.1029/2005JD006367
- ⁵⁹⁹ De Lannoy, G.J.M., de Rosnay, P., Reichle, R.H., (2015). Soil Moisture Data Assimilation. In:
- Duan Q., Pappenberger F., Thielen J., Wood A., Cloke H., Schaake J. (eds) Handbook of Hydrometeorological Ensemble Forecasting. Springer, Berlin, Heidelberg.
- DFAT (Department of Foreign Affairs and Trade) (2014). DFAT Annual Report, DFAT, Can berra.
- Döll, P., Kaspar, F., Lehner, B., (2003). A global hydrological model for deriving water availability indicators: model tuning and validation, J. Hydrol., 270, 105134.

- ⁶⁰⁶ Dreano, D., Mallick, B., Hoteit, I., (2015). Filtering remotely sensed chlorophyll concentrations
- ⁶⁰⁷ in the Red Sea using a spacetime covariance model and a Kalman filter, Spatial Statistics,
- ⁶⁰⁸ Volume 13, Pages 1-20, ISSN 2211-6753, http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.spasta.2015.04.002.
- Entekhabi, D., Nakamura, H., Njoku, E.G., (1994). Solving the inverse problem for soil moisture and temperature profiles by sequential assimilation of multifrequency remotely senses
 observations. IEEE Trans. Geosci. Remote Sens., 32, 438448.
- Eicker, A., Schumacher, M., Kusche, J., Dll, P., Mller-Schmied, H., (2014). Calibration/data
 assimilation approach for integrating GRACE data into the WaterGAP global hydrology
 model (WGHM) using an ensemble Kalman filter: first results, SurvGeophys, 35(6):12851309.
 http://dx.doi.org/10.1007/s10712-014-9309-8.
- Elbern, H., Schmidt, H., (2001). Ozone episode analysis by fourdimensional variational chemistry data assimilation, J. Geophys. Res., 106, 35693590.
- Famiglietti, J.S., Ryu, D., Berg, A.A., Rodell, M., Jackson, T.J., (2008). Field observations of soil moisture variability across scales, Water Resour. Res., 44, W01423,
 http://dx.doi.org/10.1029/2006WR005804.
- Forootan, E., Khandu, Awange, J., Schumacher, M., Anyah, R., van Dijk, A., Kusche, J.,
 (2016). Quantifying the impacts of ENSO and IOD on rain gauge and remotely sensed
 precipitation products over Australia. Remote Sensing of Environment,172, Pages 50-66,
 http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.rse.2015.10.027.
- Forootan, E., Safari, A., Mostafaie, A., Schumacher, M., Delavar, M., Awange, J., (2017).
 Large-Scale Total Water Storage and Water Flux Changes over the Arid and Semiarid Parts
 of the Middle East from GRACE and Reanalysis Products. Surveys in Geophysics 38(3), pp.
 591-615, http://dx.doi.org/10.1007/s10712-016-9403-1.
- Girotto, M., De Lannoy, G.J.M,. Reichle, R.H., Rodell, M., (2016). Assimilation of gridded
 terrestrial water storage observations from GRACE into a land surface model, Water Resour.
 Res., 52, 41644183, http://dx.doi.org/10.1002/2015WR018417.
- Girotto, M., De Lannoy, G.J.M., Reichle, R.H., Rodell, M., Draper, C., Bhanja, S.N.,
 Mukherjee, A., (2017). Benefits and pitfalls of GRACE data assimilation: A case

- study of terrestrial water storage depletion in India, Geophys. Res. Lett., 44, 41074115,
 http://dx.doi.org/10.1002/2017GL072994.
- Giustarini, L., Matgen, P., Hostache, R., Montanari, M., Plaza, D., Pauwels, V.R.N., De Lan-
- noy, G.J.M., De Keyser, R., Pfister, L., Hoffmann, L., Savenije, H.H.G., (2011). Assimilating
- 638 SAR-derived water level data into a hydraulic model: a case study, Hydrol. Earth Syst. Sci.,
- ⁶³⁹ 15, 23492365, http://dx.doi.org/10.5194/hess-15-2349-2011.
- Hamilton, F., Berry, T., Sauer, T., (2015), Pred icting Chaotic Time Series with a Partial
 Model, Phys. Rev. E 92, 010902.
- Hamilton, F., Berry, T., Sauer, T., (2016). Ensemble Kalman Filtering without a Model, Phys.
 Rev. X 6, 011021, Vol. 6, Iss. 1, http://dx.doi.org/10.1103/PhysRevX.6.011021.
- Hamilton, F., Berry, T., Sauer, T., (2017). Kalman-Takens filtering in the presence of dynamical
 noise, *To appear, Eur. Phys. J: ST*.
- Harris, I.C., (2008). Climatic Research Unit (CRU) time-series datasets of variations in
 climate with variations in other phenomena. NCAS British Atmospheric Data Centre, date of citation, University of East Anglia Climatic Research Unit; Jones, P.D.,
 http://catalogue.ceda.ac.uk/uuid/3f8944800cc48e1cbc29a5ee12d8542d.
- ⁶⁵⁰ Hersbach, H., Stoffelen, A., De Haan, S., (2007). An Improved C-Band Scatterometer Ocean
- Geophysical Model Function: CMOD5, J. Geophys. Res. Oceans 112, C03006.
- Hoteit, I., Pham, D.T., Blum, J., (2002). A simplified reducedorder kalman filtering and application to altimetric data assimilation in tropical Pacific. J. Mar. Syst., 36, 101127.
- 654 Hoteit, I., Luo, X., Pham, D.T., (2012). Particle Kalman Filtering: A Nonlinear Bayesian
- ⁶⁵⁵ Framework for Ensemble Kalman Filters, Monthly Weather Review, 140:2, 528-542.
- ⁶⁵⁶ Huang, S., Kumar, R., Flrke, M., Yang T., Hundecha, Y., Kraft, P., Gao, C., Gelfan, A., Liersch,
- 657 S., Lobanova, A., Strauch, M., Ogtrop, F.V., Reinhardt, J., Haberlandt, U., Krysanova, V.,
- (2016). Evaluation of an ensemble of regional hydrological models in 12 large-scale river basins
- worldwide. Clim Chang. http://dx.doi.org/10.1007/s10584-016-1841-8.
- 660 Huffman, G.J., Adler, R.F., Bolvin, D.T., Gu, G., Nelkin, E.J., Bowman, K.P., Hong, Y.,
- 661 Stocker, E.F., Wolff, D.B., (2007). The TRMM Multi-satellite Precipitation Analysis: Quasi-

- Global, Multi-Year, Combined-Sensor Precipitation Estimates at Fine Scale. J. Hydrometeor.,
 8(1), 38-55.
- Huntington, T.G., (2006). Evidence for intensification of the global water cycle: Review and
 synthesis, J. Hydrol., 319(14), 8395, http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.jhydrol.2005.07.003.
- Irmak, A., Kamble, B., (2009). Evapotranspiration data assimilation with genetic algorithms
 and SWAP model for on-demand irrigation. Irrigation Science, 28(1): 101112.
- Julier, S.J., Uhlmann, J.K., (1997). A New Extension of the Kalman Filter to Nonlinear Systems. In Proc. of AeroSense: The 11th Int. Symp. on Aerospace/Defence Sensing, Simulation
 and Controls.
- Julier, S., Uhlmann, J., Durrant-Whyte, H.F., (2000). A new method for the nonlinear trans-
- formation of means and covariances in filters and estimators, IEEE Trans. Automat. Control
 45, 477-482.
- Julier, S.J. and Uhlmann, J.K., (2004). Unscented filtering and nonlinear estimation, Proc. IEEE 92, 401-422.
- Kalnay, E., (2003). Atmospheric modelling, data assimilation and predictability, Cambridge University Press. pp. xxii 341. ISBNs 0 521 79179 0, 0 521 79629 6,
 http://dx.doi.org/10.1256/00359000360683511.
- Kiem, A.S., Johnson, F., Westra, S., van Dijk, A., Evans, J.P., O'Donnell, A., Rouillard, A., Barr, C., Tyler, J., Thyer, M., Jakob, D., Woldemeskel, F., Sivakumar,
 B., Mehrotra, R., (2016). Natural hazards in Australia: droughts. Clim. Change.
 http://dx.doi.org/10.1007/s10584-016-1798-7.
- Khaki, M., Hoteit, I., Kuhn, M., Awange, J., Forootan, E., van Dijk, A.I.J.M., Schumacher,
 M., Pattiaratchi, C., (2017a). Assessing sequential data assimilation techniques for integrating
 GRACE data into a hydrological model, Advances in Water Resources, Volume 107, Pages
 301-316, ISSN 0309-1708, http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.advwatres.2017.07.001.
- Khaki, M., Schumacher, M., J., Forootan, Kuhn, M., Awange, E., van Dijk, A.I.J.M., (2017b).
- Accounting for Spatial Correlation Errors in the Assimilation of GRACE into Hydrological
- Models through localization, Advances in Water Resources, Available online 1 August 2017,
- ⁶⁹⁰ ISSN 0309-1708, https://doi.org/10.1016/j.advwatres.2017.07.024.

- Khaki, M., Ait-El-Fquih, B., Hoteit, I., Forootan, E., Awange, J., Kuhn, M., (2017c). A twoupdate ensemble Kalman filter for land hydrological data assimilation with an uncertain
 constraint, In Journal of Hydrology, Volume 555, 2017, Pages 447-462, ISSN 0022-1694,
 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jhydrol.2017.10.032.
- Khaki, M., Forootan, E., Kuhn, M., Awange, J., Papa, F., Shum, C.K., (2018a). A Study of
 Bangladesh's Sub-surface Water Storages Using Satellite Products and Data Assimilation
 Scheme, accepted in Advances in Water Resources.
- Khaki, M., Forootan, E., Kuhn, M., Awange, J., van Dijk, A.I.J.M., Schumacher, M., Sharifi,
 M.A., (2018b). Determining Water Storage Depletion within Iran by Assimilating GRACE
- data into the W3RA Hydrological Model, Advances in Water Resources, 114:1-18,
- Khaki, M., Forootan, E., Kuhn, M., Awange, J., Longuevergne, L., Wada, W., (2018c). Efficient Basin Scale Filtering of GRACE Satellite Products, In Remote Sensing of Environment, Volume 204, Pages 76-93, ISSN 0034-4257, https://doi.org/10.1016/j.rse.2017.10.040.
 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.advwatres.2018.02.008.
- Kumar, S.V., Reichle, R.H., Koster, R.D., Crow, W.T., Peters-Lidard, C.D., (2009). Role of
 subsurface physics in the assimilation of surface soil moisture observations. J. Hydromet. 10
 (6), 15341547. http://dx.doi.org/10.1175/2009JHM1134.1.
- Kumar, S.V., Peters-Lidard, C.D., Santanello, J.A., Reichle, R.H., Draper, C.S., Koster,
 R.D., Nearing, G., Jasinski, M.F., (2015). Evaluating the utility of satellite soil moisture retrievals over irrigated areas and the ability of land data assimilation methods to
 correct for unmodeled processes, Hydrology and Earth System Sciences, 19, 4463-4478,
 http://dx.doi.org/10.5194/hess-19-4463-2015.
- Kumar, S., Zaitchik, B., Peters-Lidard, C., Rodell, M., Reichle, R., Li, B., Jasinski, M.,
 Mocko, D., (2016). Assimilation of Gridded GRACE Terrestrial Water Storage Estimates
 in the North American Land Data Assimilation System. J. Hydrometeor., 17, 19511972,
 http://dx.doi.org/10.1175/JHM-D-15-0157.1.
- Kusche, J., Schmidt R., Petrovic, S., Rietbroek, R., (2009). Decorrelated GRACE time-variable
 gravity solutions by GFZ and their validation using a hydrological model, Journal of Geodesy,
 DOI 10.1007/s00190-009-0308-3.

- ⁷²⁰ Lahoz, W.A., Geer, A.J., Bekki, S., Bormann, N., Ceccherini, S., Elbern, H., Errera, Q., Eskes,
- H.J., Fonteyn, D., Jackson, D.R., Khattatov, B., (2007). The Assimilation of Envisat data
 (ASSET) project, Atmos. Chem. Phys., 7, 1773 1796.
- Lagergren, J., Reeder, A., Hamilton, F., Smith, R.C., Flores, K.B., (2018). Forecasting and
 Uncertainty Quantification Using a Hybrid of Mechanistic and Non-mechanistic Models for
 an Age-Structured Population Model, Bull Math Biol, https://doi.org/10.1007/s11538-0180421-7.
- Botterill, L.C., Fisher, M., (2012). Beyond Drought: People, Policy and Perspectives, CSIRO
 Publishing, Melbourne, DAFF (Department of Agriculture, Fisheries and Forestry), Drought
 and Natural Disaster Declaration: 12 September. Queensland Government. Accessed at
 https://www.longpaddock.qld.gov.au/queenslanddroughtmonitor/queenslanddroughtreport/.
- LeBlanc, M., Tweed, S., Van Dijk, A., Timbal, B., (2012). A review of historic and future
 hydrological changes in the Murray Darling Basin. Global Planetary Change (8081): 226246.
- Lee, H., Seo, D.-J., Koren, V., (2011). Assimilation of streamflow and in situ soil moisture data into operational distributed hydrologic models: Effects of uncertainties in
 the data and initial model soil moisture states, Adv. Water Resour., 34(12), 15971615,
 http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.advwatres.2011.08.012.
- Lguensat, R., Tandeo, P., Ailliot, P., Pulido, M., Fablet, R., (2017). The Analog Data Assimilation. Mon. Wea. Rev., https://doi.org/10.1175/MWR-D-16-0441.1.
- Li, Y., Ryu, D., Western, A.W., Wang, Q.J., (2015). Assimilation of stream discharge for flood
 forecasting: Updating a semidistributed model with an integrated data assimilation scheme,
 Water Resour. Res., 51, 32383258, http://dx.doi.org/10.1002/2014WR016667.
- ⁷⁴² Lievens, H., Kumar, S., Al Bitar, A., De Lannoy, G.J.M., Drusch, M., Dumedah, G., Hendricks
- Franssen, H.J., Kerr, Y.H., Martens, B., Pan, M., Roundy, J.K., Vereecken, H., Walker, J.P.,
- Wood, E.F., Verhoest, N.E.C., Pauwels, V.R.N., (2015). SMOS soil moisture assimilation for
- ⁷⁴⁵ improved hydrologic simulation in the Murray Darling Basin, Australia, Remote Sensing of
- ⁷⁴⁶ Environment, 168(10), 146162.
- 747 Madsen, H., Skotner, C., (2005). Adaptive state-updating in real-time river flow forecastingA
- combined filtering and error forecasting procedure. J. Hydrol., 308, 302312.

- ⁷⁴⁹ Mayer-Gürr, T., Zehentner, N., Klinger, B., Kvas, A., (2014). ITSG-Grace2014: a new GRACE
- gravity field release computed in Graz. in: GRACE Science Team Meeting (GSTM), Potsdam am: 29.09.2014.
- ⁷⁵² McMillan, H.K., Hreinsson, E., Clark, M.P., Singh, S.K., Zammit, C., Uddstrom, M.J., (2013).
- 753 Operational hydrological data assimilation with the recursive ensemble Kalman filter, Hydrol.
- ⁷⁵⁴ Earth Syst. Sci., 17(1), 2138, http://dx.doi.org/10.5194/hess-17-21-2013.
- Mehra, R., (1970). On the identification of variances and adaptive Kalman filtering. IEEE
 Trans. Auto. Cont. 15, 175-184.
- ⁷⁵⁷ Mehra, R., (1972). Approaches to adaptive filtering. IEEE Trans. Auto. Cont. 17, 693-698.
- ⁷⁵⁸ Mercer, D., Christesen, L., Buston, M., (2007). Squandering the futureClimate change, policy
- ⁷⁵⁹ failure and the water crisis in Australia. Futures 39: 272287.
- Montaldo, N., Albertson, J.D., Mancini, M., Kiely, G., (2001). Robust simulation of root zone
 soil moisture with assimilation of surface soil moisture data. Water Resour. Res., 37, 28892900.
- Mu, Q., Zhao, M., Running, S.W., (2011). Improvements to a MODIS Global Terrestrial Evap otranspiration Algorithm. Remote Sensing of Environment 115: 1781-1800.
- 764 Müller Schmied, H., S. Eisner, D. Franz, M. Wattenbach, F. Portmann, M. Flrke, Dll, P.,
- (2014). Sensitivity of simulated global-scale freshwater fluxes and storages to input data,
 hydrological model structure, human water use and calibration, Hydrol. Earth. Syst. Sci., 18,
 35113538, http://dx.doi.org/10.5194/hess-18-3511-2014.
- Neal, J., Schumann, G., Bates, P., Buytaert, W., Matgen, P., Pappenberger, F., (2009). A data
 assimilation approach to discharge estimation from space, Hydrol. Process., 23, 36413649.
- Nicolai-Shaw, N., Hirschi, M., Mittelbach, H., Seneviratne, S.I., (2015). Spatial representative-
- ness of soil moisture using in situ, remote sensing, and land reanalysis data, J. Geophys. Res.
- 772 Atmos., 120, 99559964, http://dx.doi.org/10.1002/2015JD023305.
- Orlowsky, B., Seneviratne, S.I., (2014). On the spatial representativeness of temporal dynamics at European weather stations, Int. J. Climatol., 34(10), 31543160,
 http://dx.doi.org/10.1002/joc.3903.

- Packard, N.H., Crutchfield, J.P., Farmer, J.D., Shaw, R.S., (1980). Geometry from a Time
 Series, Phys. Rev. Lett. 45, 712.
- Palmer, T.N., (2001). A Nonlinear Dynamical Perspective on Model Error: A Proposal for
 Non-Local Stochastic-Dynamic Parametrization in Weather and Climate Prediction Models,
 O. L.D. M.t., J. G. (2001). A Nonlinear Dynamical Perspective on Model Error: A Proposal for
- 780 Q. J. R. Meteorol. Soc. 127, 279.
- Pipunic, C., Walker, P., Western, A., (2008). Assimilation of remotely sensed data for improved
 latent and sensible heat flux prediction: A comparative synthetic study. Remote Sensing of
 Environment, 112(4): 12951305.
- Rasmussen, J., Madsen, H., Jensen, K.H., and Refsgaard, J.C., (2015). Data assimilation in
 integrated hydrological modeling using ensemble Kalman filtering: evaluating the effect of
 ensemble size and localization on filter performance, Hydrol. Earth Syst. Sci., 19, 2999-3013,
 https://doi.org/10.5194/hess-19-2999-2015.
- Reager, J.T., Thomas, A.C., Sproles, E.A., Rodell, M., Beaudoing, H.K., Li, B., Famiglietti,
 J.S., (2015). Assimilation of GRACE Terrestrial Water Storage Observations into a Land
 Surface Model for the Assessment of Regional Flood Potential. Remote Sens. 2015, 7, 1466314679.
- Reichle, R.H., McLaughlin, D.B., Entekhabi, D., (2002). Hydrologic Data Assimilation with
 the Ensemble Kalman Filter. Mon. Wea. Rev. 130, 103114, http://dx.doi.org/10.1175/15200493(2002)130j0103:HDAWTE;2.0.CO;2.
- Reichle, R.H., Koster, R.D., (2005). Global Assimilation of Satellite Surface Soil Moisture
 Retrievals into the NASA Catchment Land Surface Model, Geophys. Res. Lett. 32, L02404.
- Renzullo, L.J., Van Dijk, A.I.J.M., Perraud, J.M., Collins, D., Henderson, B., Jin, H., Smith,
 A.B., McJannet, D.L., (2014). Continental satellite soil moisture data assimilation improves root-zone moisture analysis for water resources assessment. J. Hydrol., 519, 27472762.
 http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.jhydrol.2014.08.008.
- Rodell, M., Chen, J., Kato, H., Famiglietti, J.S., Nigro, J., Wilson, C.R., (2007). Estimating
 groundwater storage changes in the Mississippi River basin (USA) using GRACE, Hydrogeol.
 J., 15, 159166.

- ⁸⁰⁴ Sauer, T., Yorke, J., Casdagli, M., (1991). Embedology, J. Stat. Phys. 65, 579.
- Sauer, T., (2004). Reconstruction of Shared Nonlinear Dynamics in a Network, Phys. Rev. Lett.
 93, 198701.
- Schumacher, M., Kusche, J., Dll, P., (2016). A systematic impact assessment of GRACE
 error correlation on data assimilation in hydrological models, Journal of Geodesy,
 http://dx.doi.org/10.1007/s00190-016-0892-y.
- Schumacher, M., Forootan, E., van Dijk, A.I.J.M., Mller Schmied, H., Crosbie, R.S., Kusche,
 J., Dll, P., (2018). Improving drought simulations within the Murray-Darling Basin by
 combined calibration/assimilation of GRACE data into the WaterGAP Global Hydrology
 Model, In Remote Sensing of Environment, Volume 204, Pages 212-228, ISSN 0034-4257,
 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.rse.2017.10.029.
- Schunk, R.W., Scherliess, L., Sojka, J.J., Thompson, D.C., (2004). USU global ionospheric data
- assimilation models, Atmospheric and Environmental Remote Sensing Data Processing and
- Utilization: an End-to-End System Perspective, (ed. H.-L. A. Huang and H. J. Bloom), Proc.

of SPIE, 5548, http://dx.doi.org/10.1117/12.562448, 327-336.

- Schuurmans, M., Troch A., Veldhuizen, A., et al., (2003). Assimilation of remotely sensed latent
 heat flux in a distributed hydrological model. Advances in Water Resources, 26(2): 151159.
- Seo, D.J., Koren, V., Cajina, N., (2003). Real-time variational assimilation of hydrologic and hy-
- drometeorological data into operational hydrologic forecasting. J. Hydrometeorol., 4, 627641.
- Seoane, L., Ramillien, G., Frappart, F., Leblanc, M., (2013). Regional GRACE-based estimates
 of water mass variations over Australia: validation and interpretation, Hydrol. Earth Syst.
 Sci., 17, 4925-4939, http://dx.doi.org/10.5194/hess-17-4925-2013.
- Sheffield, J., Goteti, G., Wood, E. F., (2006). Development of a 50-yearhigh-resolution global
 dataset of meteorological forcings for land surfacemodeling, J. Clim., 19(13), 30883111.
- Simon, D., (2006). Optimal state estimation: Kalman, H_{∞} , and nonlinear approaches, John Wiley and Sons.
- ⁸³⁰ Smith, P.J., Dance, S.L., Nichols, N.K., (2011). A hybrid data assimilation scheme ⁸³¹ for model parameter estimation: Application to morphodynamic modelling, Comput-

- ers and Fluids, Volume 46, Issue 1, July 2011, Pages 436-441, ISSN 0045-7930, http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.compfluid.2011.01.010.
- Song, Q., He, Y., (2009). Adaptive unscented Kalman filter for estimation of modelling errors for
 helicopter, IEEE International Conference on Robotics and Biomimetics (ROBIO), Guilin,
 2009, pp. 2463-2467, http://dx.doi.org/10.1109/ROBIO.2009.5420406.
- ⁸³⁷ Swenson, S., Chambers, D., Wahr, J., (2008). Estimating geocentervariations from a combi-
- nation of GRACE and ocean model output. Journal of Geophysical research, 113, B08410,
 http://dx.doi.org/10.1029/2007JB005338.
- Takens, F., (1981). Dynamical Systems and Turbulence, Warwick 1980, Lect. Notes Math. 898,
 366.
- Tandeo, P., Coauthors, (2015). Combining analog method and ensemble data assimilation:
 application to the lorenz-63 chaotic system. Machine Learning and Data Mining Approaches
 to Climate Science, Springer, 312.
- Tangdamrongsub, N., Steele-Dunne, S.C., Gunter, B.C., Ditmar, P.G., and Weerts, A.H.,
 (2015). Data assimilation of GRACE terrestrial water storage estimates into a regional
 hydrological model of the Rhine River basin, Hydrol. Earth Syst. Sci., 19, 2079-2100,
 http://dx.doi.org/10.5194/hess-19-2079-2015.
- Tardif, R., Hakim, G.J., Snyder, C., (2015). Coupled atmosphereocean data assimilation experiments with a low-order model and CMIP5 model data, Clim Dyn 45: 1415.
 https://doi.org/10.1007/s00382-014-2390-3.
- Terejanu, G.A., (2009). Unscented Kalman filter tutorial, Workshop on Large-Scale Quantification of Uncertainty, Sandia National Laboratories, pp. 16.
- Thomas, A.C., Reager, J.T., Famiglietti, J.S., Rodell, M., (2014). A GRACE-based water
 storage deficit approach for hydrological drought characterization. Geophys. Res. Lett. 41,
 15371545.
- Tian, S., Tregoning, P., Renzullo, L.J., van Dijk, A.I.J.M., Walker, J.P., Pauwels, V.R.N.,
- Allgever, S., (2017). Improved water balance component estimates through joint assimila-
- tion of GRACE water storage and SMOS soil moisture retrievals, Water Resour. Res., 53,
- http://dx.doi.org/10.1002/2016WR019641.

- Ummenhofer, C.C., England, M.H., McIntosh, P.C., Meyers, G.A., Pook, M.J., Risbey, J.S., 861
- Sen Gupta, A., Taschetto, A.S., (2009). What causes southeast Australia's worst droughts? 862 Geophys. Res. Lett. 36, L04706. http://dx.doi.org/10.1029/2008GL036801. 863
- Van der Merwe, R., (2004). Sigma-Point Kalman Filters for probability inference in dynamic 864 state-space models, PhD Thesis, Oregon Health and Science University. 865
- van Dijk, A.I.J.M., (2010). The Australian Water Resources Assessment System: Technical 866
- Report 3, Landscape model (version 0.5) Technical Description, CSIRO: Water for a Healthy
- Country National Research Flagship. 868

867

- van Dijk, A.I.J.M., Renzullo, L.J., and Rodell, M., (2011). Use of Gravity Recovery and 869 Climate Experiment terrestrial water storage retrievals to evaluate model estimates by 870 the Australian water resources assessment system, Water Resour. Res., 47, W11524, 871 http://dx.doi.org/10.1029/2011WR010714. 872
- van Dijk, A.I.J.M., Pea-Arancibia, J.L., Wood, E.F., Sheffield, J., Beck, H.E., (2013). Global 873 analysis of seasonal streamflow predictability using an ensemble prediction system and 874 observations from 6192 small catchments worldwide, Water Resour. Res., 49, 27292746, 875 http://dx.doi.org/10.1002/wrcr.20251. 876
- van Dijk, A.I.J.M., Renzullo, L.J., Wada, Y., Tregoning, P., (2014). A global water cycle reanal-877 vsis (20032012) merging satellite gravimetry and altimetry observations with a hydrological 878 multi-model ensemble. Hydrol Earth Syst Sci 18:29552973. http://dx.doi.org/10.5194/hess-879 18-2955-2014. 880
- Vrugt, J.A., Diks, C.G., Gupta, H.V., Bouten, W., Verstraten, J.M., (2005). Im-881 proved treatment of uncertainty in hydrologic modeling: Combining the strengths 882 of global optimization and data assimilation. Water Resour. Res, 41, W01017, 883 http://dx.doi.org/10.1029/2004WR003059. 884
- Gupta, H.V., Nuallain, B.O., (2006). Real-time data assimilation J.A., Vrugt, 885 for operational ensemble streamflow forecasting, J. Hydrometeorol., 7(3), 548565, 886 http://dx.doi.org/10.1175/JHM504.1. 887
- Vrugt, J.A., ter Braak, C.J.F., Diks, C.G.H., Schoups, G., (2013). Advancing hydrologic 888 data assimilation using particle Markov chain Monte Carlo simulation: theory, concepts 889

- and applications, Advances in Water Resources, Anniversary Issue 35 Years, 51, 457-478,
 http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.advwatres.2012.04.002.
- Wahr, J.M., Molenaar, M., Bryan, F., (1998). Time variability of the Earth's gravity field:
 hydrological and oceanic effects and their possible detection using GRACE. J Geophys Res
 108(B12):3020530229, http://dx.doi.org/10.1029/98JB02844.
- Wan, E., van der Merwe, R., (2000). The unscented Kalman filter for nonlinear estimation, Proceedings of the IEEE 2000 Adaptive Systems for Signal Processing, Communications, and Control Symposium (Cat. No.00EX373), Lake Louise, Alta., 2000, pp. 153-158,
 http://dx.doi.org/10.1109/ASSPCC.2000.882463.
- ⁸⁹⁹ Wan, E., van der Merwe, R., (2001). The Unscented Kalman Filter. Wiley Publishing.
- Weerts, A.H., El Serafy, G.Y.H., (2006). Particle filtering and ensemble Kalman filtering for
 state updating with hydrological conceptual rainfall-runoff models. Water Resour. Res., 42,
 W09403, http://10.1029/2005WR004093.
- Wooldridge, S.A., Kalma, J.D., (2001). Regional-scale hydrological modelling using multipleparameter landscape zones and a quasi-distributed water balance model. Hydrological Earth
 System Sciences. 5: 59-74.
- ⁹⁰⁶ Yin, J., Zhan, C., Gu, H., et al., (2014). A case study of evapotranspiration data assimilation
- based bon hydrological model. Advances in Earth Science, 29(9): 10751084.
- Young, P.C., (2002). Advances in real-time flood forecasting. Philos. Trans. Roy. Soc. London,
 360, 14331450.
- 210 Zaitchik, B.F., Rodell, M., Reichle, R.H., (2008). Assimilation of GRACE terrestrial water stor-
- age data into a land surface model: results for the Mississippi River Basin. J Hydrometeorol
 9(3):535548, http://dx.doi.org/10.1175/2007JHM951.1.
- ⁹¹³ Zhang, Y., Bocquet, M., Mallet, V., Seigneur, C., and Baklanov, A., (2012). Real-time air
 ⁹¹⁴ quality forecasting, Part I: History, techniques, and current status, Atmos. Environ., 60,
 ⁹¹⁵ 632655.
- ⁹¹⁶ Zhao, Y., Deng, X., Zhang, S., Liu, Z., Liu, C., Vecchi, G., Han, G., Wu, X., (2017). Impact of

- an observational time window on coupled data assimilation: simulation with a simple climate
- ⁹¹⁸ model, Nonlin. Processes Geophys., 24, 681-694, https://doi.org/10.5194/npg-24-681-2017.


Figure 1: A schematic illustration of the data integration process implemented for this study.



Figure 2: Average TWS variation time series over Iran from AUKF, Kalman-Takens, open-loop run, and WGHM with corresponding trend lines.



Figure 3: Scatter plots of open-loop, AUKF, and Kalman-Takens TWS estimates with respect to WGHM TWS at the two spatial resolution of $1^{\circ} \times 1^{\circ}$ and $3^{\circ} \times 3^{\circ}$. The presented average RMSE values for each method is calculated based on the original WGHM TWS (before perturbation using GRACE errors). In each sub-figure reference (dashed) and fitted (solid) lines are illustrated.



Figure 4: Estimated average errors from different scenarios considered based on the number of neighbors N and delays d. The best estimates are achieved by applying the Kalman-Takens method using N = 14 and d = 11.



Figure 5: Average groundwater RMSE and STD of from the Kalman-Takens filter, AUKF, and open-loop run computed using groundwater in-situ measurement. The results are presented for assimilation with three different temporal scales (i.e., daily, 5-day, and monthly).



Figure 6: An average TWS increment time series of AUKF and the Kalman-Takens filter on state vectors during the process. Both methods decrease the increment as assimilation proceeds forward in time.



Figure 7: An average estimated covariance matrices of P_f and P_a corresponding to 95% confidence level (dashed lines) at each filtering step using the implemented filters.



Figure 8: Spatially averaged TWS time series of filters' estimates, GRACE TWS observations, and open-loop run within Australia.



Figure 9: Spatial correlations maps between GRACE TWS and open-loop run (a), AUKF estimates (b), and the Kalman-Takens filter (c).



Figure 10: Average TWS variations from the data assimilation filters, open-loop run, and GRACE TWS. The red shaded area shows the Millennium Drought and blue shaded area represent a strong ENSO effect.

Table 1: Summary of statistical values derived from the implemented methods using the groundwater in-situ measurements. The reduction of the RMSE value of the AUKF and Kalman-Takens filters are calculated in relation to the RMSE of the open-loop run.

	Grio	l-based e	valuation	Basin scale evaluation		
Metric	Open-loop	AUKF	Kalman-Takens	Open-loop	AUKF	Kalman-Takens
RMSE (mm)	74.57	51.28	53.61	69.40	45.16	46.96
NSE	0.51	0.77	0.75	0.58	0.82	0.81
RMSE reduction $(\%)$	_	31.23	28.11	_	34.93	32.33

Table 2: Summary of NSE values estimated using state estimates derived from implemented methods and the soil moisture in-situ measurements at different layers. The improvements (in %) are calculated based on the increased correlation by applying the methods with respect to the open-loop run.

	Method	0-8 cm	0-30 cm	0-90 cm
	Open-loop	0.59	0.64	0.72
	AUKF	0.63	0.71	0.89
	Kalman-Takens	0.61	0.73	0.85
Improvements (%)	AUKF	6.77	10.94	23.61
	Kalman-Takens	3.39	14.06	18.05