

ORCA - Online Research @ Cardiff

This is an Open Access document downloaded from ORCA, Cardiff University's institutional repository:https://orca.cardiff.ac.uk/id/eprint/112691/

This is the author's version of a work that was submitted to / accepted for publication.

Citation for final published version:

Tangunan, Deborah N., Baumann, Karl-Heinz, Just, Janna, LeVay, Leah J., Barker, Stephen , Brentegani, Luna, De Vleeschouwer, David, Hall, Ian R. , Hemming, Sidney and Norris, Richard 2018. The last 1 million years of the extinct genus Discoaster: Plio–Pleistocene environment and productivity at Site U1476 (Mozambique Channel). Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology 505 , pp. 187-197. 10.1016/j.palaeo.2018.05.043

Publishers page: http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.palaeo.2018.05.043

Please note:

Changes made as a result of publishing processes such as copy-editing, formatting and page numbers may not be reflected in this version. For the definitive version of this publication, please refer to the published source. You are advised to consult the publisher's version if you wish to cite this paper.

This version is being made available in accordance with publisher policies. See http://orca.cf.ac.uk/policies.html for usage policies. Copyright and moral rights for publications made available in ORCA are retained by the copyright holders.



The last 1 million years of the extinct genus *Discoaster*: Plio– Pleistocene environment and productivity at Site U1476 (Mozambique Channel)

Deborah N. Tangunan^a, Karl-Heinz Baumann^{a,b}, Janna Just^b, Leah J. LeVay^c, Stephen Barker^d, Luna Brentegani^e, David De Vleeschouwer^a, Ian R. Hall^d, Sidney Hemming^f, Richard Norris^g and the Expedition 361 Shipboard Scientific Party¹⁰

^aUniversity of Bremen, MARUM - Center for Marine Environmental Sciences, 28359 Bremen, Germany; ^bUniversity of Bremen, Department of Geosciences, 28359 Bremen, Germany; ^cInternational Ocean Discovery Program, Texas A&M University, 1000 Discovery Drive College Station, TX 77845, USA; ^dSchool of Earth and Ocean Sciences, Cardiff University Main Building, Park Place Cardiff Wales CF10 3AT, United Kingdom; ^eEarth and Environmental Sciences, University of Technology Queensland Gardens Point Campus, Brisbane QLD 4000, Australia; ^fLamont-Doherty Earth Observatory, Columbia University, 61 Route 9W, Palisades NY 10964, USA; ^gScripps Institution of Oceanography, University of California, San Diego, 9500 Gilman Drive, La Jolla CA 92093-0244, USA; ¹⁰Please see supplementary materials

Corresponding author: tangunan@uni-bremen.de

Highlights

1. A more intensified water column mixing shown by low values of *Florisphaera profunda* index occurred at the Mozambique Channel from ~2.4 Ma, resulting in increased abundances of the upper photic zone flora indicative of nutrient-rich surface water conditions.

2. Discoasters declined with global cooling and associated enhancement of surface water productivity in the tropical Indian Ocean across the Plio-Pleistocene.

3. Ecological preference of the Plio-Pleistocene *Discoaster* species resembles that of *F. profunda*, i.e., warm and oligotrophic surface water conditions.

4. The 100-kyr and obliquity signatures suggest a NH driver of the observed variability, whereas variability at the rhythm of precession is interpreted as a tropical Pacific forcing.

1 The last 1 million years of the extinct genus *Discoaster*: Plio-2 Pleistocene environment and productivity at Site U1476 3 (Mozambique Channel)

4

Deborah N. Tangunan^a, Karl-Heinz Baumann^{a,b}, Janna Just^b, Leah J. LeVay^c, Stephen
 Barker^d, Luna Brentegani^e, David De Vleeschouwer^a, Ian R. Hall^d, Sidney Hemming^f, Richard
 Norris^g and the Expedition 361 Shipboard Scientific Party¹⁰

8

^aUniversity of Bremen, MARUM - Center for Marine Environmental Sciences, 28359 Bremen, 9 Germany; ^bUniversity of Bremen, Department of Geosciences, 28359 Bremen, Germany; 10 ^cInternational Ocean Discovery Program, Texas A&M University, 1000 Discovery Drive 11 College Station, TX 77845, USA; ^dSchool of Earth and Ocean Sciences, Cardiff University 12 Main Building, Park Place Cardiff Wales CF10 3AT, United Kingdom; *Earth and 13 Environmental Sciences, University of Technology Queensland Gardens Point Campus, 14 Brisbane QLD 4000, Australia; ^fLamont-Doherty Earth Observatory, Columbia University, 61 15 Route 9W, Palisades NY 10964, USA; ⁹Scripps Institution of Oceanography, University of 16 California, San Diego, 9500 Gilman Drive, La Jolla CA 92093-0244, USA; ¹⁰Please see 17 18 supplementary materials 19

20 **Corresponding author:** tangunan@uni-bremen.de

21

22 Abstract

A detailed paleoenvironment reconstruction from the Mozambique Channel, western 23 Indian Ocean, based on the calcareous nannoplankton assemblages was conducted for the 24 interval between 2.85 and 1.85 Myr. This study covers the period during which the successive 25 extinction of the last five species of discoasters occurred. New productivity data obtained from 26 27 the abundances of the Discoaster species (Discoaster brouweri, D. triradiatus, D. pentaradiatus, D. surculus, and D. tamalis) and other indicative calcareous nannoplankton 28 taxa showed abundance variations, which were at paced with the 100, 41, and 23 kyr 29 astronomical periodicities. A shift in the productivity and water-column stratification proxies 30 31 occurred at ~2.4 Ma, after the onset of the Northern Hemisphere glaciation. Here we propose 32 that the variability recorded at International Ocean Discovery Program Site U1476 reflects the interplay between forcing associated with warm tropical Pacific and cold southern ocean 33 influences. The former is shown by consistent occurrence of warm water taxa (Calcidiscus 34 leptoporus, Oolithotus spp., Rhabdosphaera clavigera, Syracosphaera spp., Umbellosphaera 35 spp.), typical of Indonesian Throughflow surface waters. On the other hand, the occurrence of 36 Coccolithus pelagicus indicates the influence of cold, nutrient-rich sub-Antarctic surface 37 waters. A more mixed water column initiated at ~2.4 Ma, and a consequent productivity 38 increase led to the gradual reduction of the Discoaster species, until their extinction at 1.91 39 Ma. This period was characterized by the low values of the Florisphaera profunda index and 40 high abundances of upper photic zone flora, indicative of nutrient-rich surface water 41

- 42 conditions. High productivity at the location during this period could have also been amplified
 43 by localized upwelling events driven by the Mozambigue Channel eddies.
- 44
- Keywords: calcareous nannofossils, nannoplankton, western Indian Ocean, Expedition 361
 46

47 **1 Introduction**

48 Major climatic variability during the middle part of the Pliocene was first proposed by Shackleton et al. (1984) to have triggered the onset of the Northern Hemisphere (NH) 49 glaciation. Numerous studies have corroborated this suggestion on the basis of 50 51 paleontological, sedimentological and geochemical records of long climate archives (e.g., 52 Ravelo et al., 2004; Clemens et al., 1996; Christensen et al., 2017). Much of the evidence for 53 this consensus derive from stable carbon and oxygen isotope (δ^{18} O and δ^{13} C) data measured 54 on planktonic and benthic foraminifera (e.g., Raymo et al., 1992; Clemens et al., 1996; Ravelo 55 et al., 2004), suggesting the significance of this phenomenon in the evolution of the Plio-Pleistocene climate. This extreme climatic variability was coupled with global-scale variations 56 in the sea surface temperature (SST) (Clemens et al., 1996) and associated changes in 57 58 nutrient availability, which could have created a complex oceanographic regime, which in turn 59 controlled plankton distribution in the photic layer. Previous studies suggested that during the late Pliocene (~3 to 2.5 Myr), a shift in marine productivity between the high latitudes and the 60 mid- to low latitudes occurred (e.g., Sarnthein and Fenner, 1988; Bolton et al., 2011). Low 61 values of biogenic silica, CaCO₃, organic carbon, and alkenone accumulation in marine 62 sediments from high latitude regions and high values in the mid- to low latitudes were 63 recorded, suggesting a more productive mid- to low latitude oceans during this time period. 64 These findings have important implications for Plio-Pleistocene climate since marine biological 65 productivity is a key component in the global biogeochemical cycles. Thus studies focusing 66 67 on the long-term trends in biological responses to climatic variations are essential in 68 understanding the interplay between the local atmospheric processes and ocean circulation 69 over several glacial/interglacial cycles, which is an essential prerequisite in modeling the 70 present and even future climate scenarios.

71

One of the major contributors to marine primary production, that also plays a key role in both the biological and carbonate pumps are calcareous nannoplankton (nannofossils), a group of single-celled, marine haptophyte algae. These organisms are one of the dominant calcifying plankton groups in the oceans (e.g., Friedinger and Winter, 1987; Westbroek et al., 1993) and within the fossil record, form a major part of its deep-sea sediments (e.g., Flores et al., 1999; Beaufort et al., 2001; Rogalla and Andruleit, 2005). Calcareous nannoplankton live in the photic layer where light intensity is strong enough to carry out photosynthesis and the
nutrient levels are suitable for its growth. The temporal and spatial distributions of calcareous
nannoplankton are controlled by latitude (light levels), ocean currents, and the ambient upper
ocean nutrient content, salinity, and temperature profiles of the underlying water masses
(Winter et al., 1994). They are sensitive to variations in water column characteristics
(stratification/mixing), making these organisms potentially ideal recorders of past
environmental conditions.

85

The Plio-Pleistocene is a significant time interval in calcareous nannoplankton 86 87 evolution history because of the recorded decrease in diversity during this time interval (Bown et al., 2004; Aubry, 2007). High frequency variability in glacial/interglacial temperatures 88 occurred during this interval, with the Pleistocene exhibiting greater variance compared to the 89 90 late Pliocene (Ravelo et al., 2004; Lisiecki and Raymo, 2005; De Vleeschouwer et al., 2017). 91 The gradual cooling during the transition from the warm Pliocene to the cold Pleistocene 92 (Ravelo et al., 2004) was proposed by Aubry (2007) to have driven the Pliocene 93 nannoplankton turnover and subsequent extinction events. The extinct genus Discoaster is 94 one of the nannoplankton groups that were affected by these extreme climatic fluctuations and 95 transition. Discoaster exhibited a fairly continuous evolutionary development from their first 96 occurrence in the late Paleocene (60 Ma) to the extinction of the last species toward the end 97 of the Gelasian stage (1.93 Ma). Previous studies have suggested that the inception of the NH glaciation during the Pliocene (Shackleton et al., 1984; Raymo et al., 1992; Clemens et 98 al., 1996) led to the successive disappearance of the Discoaster species (e.g., Backman and 99 Pestiaux, 1987; Chapman and Chepstow-Lusty, 1997). The successive extinction of species 100 belonging to this group until its complete demise from the geologic record thus reflects its 101 102 sensitivity to changes in environmental and oceanographic conditions. While these extinction events are widely documented (e.g., Bukry, 1971; Chepstow-Lusty et al., 1989; Chapman and 103 Chepstow-Lusty, 1997; Raffi et al., 2006; Browning et al., 2017), our knowledge of the 104 ecological preference of the *Discoaster* species and the environment that they lived in before 105 they disappeared is still limited (e.g., Bukry, 1971; Hag and Lohmann, 1976; Aubry, 1998; 106 Schueth and Bralower, 2015). For instance, the reported diachronous occurrences (Raffi et 107 108 al., 2006; Schueth and Bralower, 2015) of its member taxa in different ocean basins suggest that the Discoaster extinction cannot be explained by variations in SST alone (e.g., Chepstow-109 Lusty et al., 1989; Chapman and Chepstow-Lusty, 1997), but is likely a result of a combination 110 111 of complex environmental parameters (Schueth and Bralower, 2015). There is a general agreement that discoasters have an affinity for warm and oligotrophic water based on 112 assemblage analysis and geochemical evidence (Aubry, 1998; Minoletti et al., 2001; Bralower, 113 114 2002; Schueth and Bralower, 2015), although their depth habitat is still poorly understood. In 115 particular, oxygen isotope values of discoasters resembled the planktonic foraminifera 116 (Globorotalia menardii, Dentoglobigerina altispira, Globigerinoides obliguus) record, indicating 117 that they are shallow-dwelling (Minoletti et al., 2001), which is contrary to the findings in other literature that this group prefers the deep photic layer (e.g., Aubry, 1998; Bralower et al., 2002; 118 Schueth and Bralower, 2015). While this present study cannot completely solve the 119 controversy on their depth habitat, here we provide information on the past variations in 120 environmental and oceanographic conditions in the equatorial Indian Ocean during the Plio-121 Pleistocene transition that led to the extinction of this long-lived genus. 122

123

Here we investigated the temporal distribution of the last five species of this group (D. 124 tamalis, D. surculus, D. pentaradiatus, D. triradiatus, D. brouweri) in the westernmost Indian 125 Ocean using sediments from Site U1476 (Mozambique Channel) collected during the 126 127 International Ocean Discovery Program (IODP) Expedition 361 – Southern African Climates (Fig. 1) (Hall et al., 2017b) to reconstruct how the environment and productivity conditions 128 129 changed toward the end of this lineage. Site U1476 consists of a continuous Plio-Pleistocene 130 sequence of foraminifera-rich or foraminifera-bearing nannofossil ooze (Hall et al., 2017b) and 131 thus offers an exceptional opportunity for high-resolution paleoenvironment and productivity 132 reconstructions. Together with a detailed Plio-Pleistocene calcareous nannofossil 133 biostratigraphy at this site, we present here new records of productivity from the abundances of Discoaster species and compare our results with the downcore abundance record of the 134 extant taxon F. profunda, a widely used productivity proxy, and to other calcareous 135 nannoplankton taxa with established ecological preferences. 136

137

138 **2 Site U1476 and oceanographic setting**

Site U1476 lies on the Davie Ridge, a bathymetric high in the Mozambique Channel, 139 140 between the African continent and Madagascar. The site is located at the northern entrance of the Mozambique Channel (15°49.25'S; 41°46.12'E; Fig. 1) at a water depth of 2165 m (Hall 141 142 et al., 2017b). The study area is presently influenced by the seasonally reversing monsoon 143 winds (boreal summer and winter), induced by the migration of the Intertropical Convergence 144 Zone, with rainfall maxima during the boreal winter (Hastenrath et al., 1993). The sea surface currents in the western Indian Ocean are in turn driven by the monsoon and the semi-annual 145 146 inter-monsoon trade winds (Indian Ocean equatorial westerlies). The surface waters at Site U1476 are fed by the South Equatorial Current (SEC) that flows westward year-round across 147 the Indian Ocean, carrying warm and oligotrophic surface water of the Indonesian Throughflow 148 149 (ITF) (Schott et al., 2009; Fig. 1). To the east of Madagascar, the SEC splits into two boundary 150 currents flowing as the Northeast and Southeast Madagascar Currents (NEMC and SEMC),

respectively. The NEMC flows around the northern tip of Madagascar and merges with the Mozambique Channel throughflow, forming a set of anticyclonic eddies (Schott and McCreary, 2001; Schouten et al., 2003), affecting Site U1476. The southward flowing SEMC was suggested to have major implications in the Agulhas Current, the largest western boundary current that transports salt and heat into the South Atlantic (Lutjeharms, 2006).



157 40°

Figure 1: Location of IODP Site U1476 in the Mozambique Channel plotted on the 2010 average chlorophyll map, with the schematic illustration of surface water circulation: East African Coastal Current (EACC), Northeast and Southeast Madagascar Current (NEMC, SEMC); South Equatorial Current (SEC); and South Equatorial Countercurrent (SECC). Surface water circulation was redrawn from Beal et al. (2011). The chlorophyll map was generated using the Giovanni online data system developed and maintained by the NASA GES DISC (Acker and Leptoukh, 2007).

164

156

165 3 Material and methods

3.1 Sampling strategy and age model construction

167 Samples for this study were selected between 40 and 80 m depth on the stratigraphic 168 splice, covering the Plio-Pleistocene boundary (calcareous nannofossil biozones NN15 to 169 NN19; 2.85 to 1.85 Myr), focusing on the interval of the *Discoaster* extinction (Fig. 2). Using 170 the shipboard chronology (Hall et al., 2017b), samples were collected every ~15 cm, with a total of 269 samples and representing an average time resolution of ~5 kyr. The age model of 171 the investigated interval was established by refining the shipboard stratigraphy by timeseries 172 analysis and cyclostratigraphy applied on the x-ray fluorescence (XRF) Fe/Ca record of Site 173 U1476. The Fe/Ca data series was plotted against the shipboard age model, which was based 174 on a spline fit to the calcareous nannofossil datum events calibrated in Gradstein et al., (2012) 175 (Supplement Fig. S1A). The Fe/Ca record was interpolated to make sure that the timeseries 176 is equally spaced prior to performing the timeseries analysis to identify imprint of astronomical 177 climate forcing (Supplement Fig. S1B). 178

179

180 We then performed a cyclostratigraphic approach on the Fe/Ca timeseries and applied 181 a 50- to 35-kyr band-pass filter to capture an obliquity signal in the record (Supplement Fig. 182 S1C and S1D). The bandpass-filtered signal was then correlated and tuned to the La2010 astronomical solution (Laskar, 2011), using the minimum Fe/Ca values and assuming low 183 Fe/Ca during the glacial periods. Shipboard data generated from this site showed a distinct 184 glacial-interglacial pattern of the last 1 Myr (Hall et al., 2017b), resembling the Lisiecki and 185 Raymo (2004) benthic isotope curve. Moreover, the correlation was rather straightforward 186 since calcareous nannofossil assessment during the expedition showed abundant and well-187 preserved Plio-Pleistocene specimens, which provided a reliable basis for precise 188 chronological approximations of the datum events (Supplement Fig. S1E). Given the 189 190 obliquity-based tuning strategy, we estimated the uncertainty on the age model to be inferior to half of an obliquity cycle, i.e., <20 kyr. 191

192

The calibrated age model yielded sedimentation rates between ~2.6 to 3.3 cm/kyr. This estimate agrees well with the average sedimentation rate of ~2.5 cm/kyr at DSDP Site 242 (Simpson and Schlich, 1974), located ~5 km southeast of the study area, and with the shipboard estimate based on the combined planktonic foraminifera and calcareous nannofossil stratigraphy (2.3 to 3.5 cm/kyr; Hall et al., 2017b). A detailed list of the identified calcareous nannofossil biostratigraphic events encountered at Site U1476 can be found in **Supplement Table S1**.



201

Figure 2: Age-depth relationships at Site U1476 showing the shipboard and refined occurrences of calcareous nannofossil index taxa and paleomagnetic boundaries. The five *Discoaster* datum events occurred between the late Gauss and Olduvai.

205

3.2 Calcareous nannofossil identification, abundance and

207 biostratigraphy

Slides for calcareous nannofossil analysis were prepared following the drop technique 208 of Bordiga et al. (2015). Quantitative analysis was performed with a Leica polarized light 209 microscope under 1000 x magnification. Abundances were determined by counting at least 210 300 species per sample. An additional 10 to 20 fields of view (FOV) were counted to document 211 uncommon and rare taxa. Minor reworking was observed, but when present, reworked 212 specimens were counted separately. In each sample, the entire slide was scanned after 213 214 counting to detect index taxa for refining the biostratigraphy. Supplementary smear slides were prepared for selected intervals to confirm biostratigraphic boundaries. Preservation of species 215

was assessed while counting using the criteria described in (Hall et al., 2017a). The zonation schemes of Martini (1971; Codes NN), Okada and Bukry (1980; Codes CN), and Backman et al. (2012; CNPL) were adopted for this study. We have initially followed the calcareous nannofossil datum events in Gradstein et al. (2012) for the preliminary age model (Hall et al., 2017b). The shipboard calcareous nannofossil biostratigraphy was then refined using the splice samples. The datum events were calibrated using the new astronomically-tuned age model and complemented by the paleomagnetic data (Supplement Table S2 and Fig. S2).

223

Species taxonomic identification was based on Perch-Nielsen (1985), Hine and 224 225 Weaver (1998), Young (1998) and the electronic guide to the biodiversity and taxonomy of nannoplankton (Nannotax 3; http://www.mikrotax.org/Nannotax3/). The 226 calcareous conversion of nannofossil counts into absolute number of nannofossils per gram of sediment 227 228 (N/g. sed.) was calculated using the equation: Nannofossil concentration = $(N^* A) / (f x n x W)$, where N = total nannofossil counts; A = area of the coverslip (mm^2) ; f = area of FOV (mm^2) ; n 229 230 = number of FOV counted; and W = weight of bulk dry sediment (g). Species diversity 231 (Shannon index; H) was calculated using the paleontological statistical software (PAST). The 232 Shannon index varies between 0 for populations with one species (low richness and 233 evenness) and high values for populations consisting of several taxa, each having few 234 individuals (high richness and evenness) (Hammer et al., 2009).

235

3.3 Indicative taxa for productivity and temperature

The genus Discoaster has been used as a warm water and low surface water 237 productivity proxy (Backman and Pestiaux, 1987). This group is known to have an affinity for 238 warm, oligotrophic and stratified water column conditions (Bukry, 1971; Hag and Lohmann, 239 1976; Aubry, 2007; Schueth and Bralower, 2015) and their extinction toward the end of the 240 Pliocene was thought to be due to the intensified NH glaciation (Chapman and Chepstow-241 Lusty, 1997). In addition, cyclic patterns in the records of the Pliocene Discoaster taxa have 242 been observed (e.g., Backman and Pestiaux, 1987; Chepstow-Lusty et al., 1989; Gibbs et al., 243 244 2004). Here we used the abundances of these species as both productivity and SST proxies. 245

The occurrence of *Coccolithus pelagicus* in the study site was also used as a SST proxy. This species is found in subarctic environments (Baumann et al., 2000) and is an indicator of cooler surface water (e.g., Marino et al., 2014). Parente et al. (2004) found this species together with high abundances of the planktonic foraminifera species *Neogloboquadrina pachyderma* (sinistral), another cold-water proxy, and interpreted their joint occurrence to be linked to the influx of subpolar waters off western Iberia during Heinrich events. This species also registered distinct glacial peaks during the mid-Pleistocene
transition in North Atlantic sediments (Marino et al., 2011).

254

Transfer functions based upon the abundance of the lower photic zone (LPZ)-dwelling 255 taxon F. profunda have been successfully used as proxies for past changes in the 256 nutricline/thermocline depths in Quaternary sediments (e.g., Molfino and McIntyre, 1990; 257 Ahagon et al., 1993; Flores et al., 1999), and for estimation of marine primary production 258 (Beaufort et al., 1997; Beaufort et al., 2001). For this study, the estimated primary productivity 259 (EPP) expressed in grams of carbon (g C/m²/yr) was calculated from the relative abundance 260 of this taxon using the formula: EPP = 617 - $[279 * \log (\% F. profunda + 3)]$. This equation, 261 however was calibrated by (Beaufort, 1996) using calcareous nannofossils from the Indian 262 Ocean core top samples and modern primary productivity generated from satellite chlorophyll 263 data by Antoine and Morel (1996). Here we use this formula by investigating Pliocene 264 sediments to test whether the EPP absolute values can be applied to ancient oceans with 265 266 different oceanography and biota compared to modern oceans. The EPP is used as a proxy 267 for primary productivity because in contrast to other taxa, F. profunda prefers to thrive in the deep photic zone (Molfino and McIntyre, 1990). Hence, high abundances of F. profunda 268 269 indicate deeper nutricline/thermocline and low abundances of this species suggest otherwise. 270 The ratio of this species to smaller forms of Gephyrocapsa and Reticulofenestra (< $3\mu m$), (F. 271 profunda index) was also used as water column stratification proxy (F. profunda index; Beaufort et al., 1997; Beaufort et al., 2001): F. profunda index = F. profunda / (F. profunda + 272 small Gephyrocapsa + small Reticulofenestra). Low values of F. profunda index suggest a 273 more mixed water column whereas values closer to 1 indicate a more stratified water column. 274 275

276 **4 Results**

277 **4.1 Extinction of** *Discoaster* **species in the Mozambique Channel**

Six Plio-Pleistocene nannofossil datum events (Backman et al., 2012; Gradstein et al., 278 2012) were recognized at Site U1476, differing by 10 to 90 kyr from the calibrated ages of 279 280 these events in the low and middle latitude regions in the three major oceans (South Atlantic, 281 Pacific and Indian Ocean), and the Mediterranean Sea region (Table 1). Taking into account U1476 age model uncertainty (± 20 kyr), some of these extinction events cannot be 282 distinguished in time and thus occurred simultaneously in different ocean basins. The last 283 occurrence of D. tamalis (2.81 Ma) occurred 10 kyr (2.80 Ma; Lourens et al., 2004) and 50 kyr 284 (2.76 Ma; Backman et al., 2012) earlier in the study area than the reported extinction of this 285 species in the three major oceans and the Mediterranean. All of the other Discoaster species 286 287 became extinct in the Mediterranean before disappearing in the Mozambique Channel. After

288 the last occurrence of *D. surculus* (2.53 Ma) and *D. pentaradiatus* (2.45 Ma) in the study area, 289 these two species became extinct in the South Atlantic 40 and 60 kyr later, respectively. The 290 base common occurrence of D. triradiatus (2.13 Ma) occurred 10 kyr later in the study area than in the South Atlantic (2.14 Ma; Lourens et al., 2004) and the equatorial North Atlantic 291 (2.14 Ma; Chapman and Chepstow-Lusty, 1997). This result is 20 kyr earlier than the recorded 292 293 acme of D. triradiatus at Site 709 in the equatorial Indian Ocean (2.11 Ma; Chapman and Chepstow-Lusty, 1997). Discoaster brouweri, the last Discoaster species, first went extinct in 294 the equatorial Pacific (2.06 Ma), followed by the Mediterranean (1.95 Ma; Lourens et al., 295 2004), the South Atlantic (1.93 Ma; Lourens et al., 2004), and finally the westernmost Indian 296 Ocean (1.91 Ma). The extinction of this species at Site 709 is occurred with the last occurrence 297 of D. triradiatus in this location (1.95 Ma; Chapman and Chepstow-Lusty, 1997). Considering 298 the uncertainty in our age model, the extinction of the final Discoaster species at Site U1476 299 300 is synchronous to the recorded extinction of this group in the major ocean basins.

301

Table 1: Comparative global occurrence/extinction of the Plio-Pleistocene *Discoaster* compiled in Backman et al. (2012) and Gradstein et al. (2012) with the astronomically tuned datum events from this study. Calcareous nannofossil zonation scheme by Martini (1971; NN), Okada and Bukry (1980; CN) and Backman et al. (2012; CNPL) are indicated. T = top occurrence, Bc = base common occurrence.

		CALIBRATED AGES (Ma)						
CALCAREOUS NANNOFOSSIL DATUM EVENT	BIOZONE	GTS 2012 scaling	South Atlantic	Equatorial Pacific	Mediterranean	Reference	<mark>Backman et al.</mark> (2012)	western Indian Ocean (THIS STUDY) <mark>Error ± 20 kyr</mark>
	NN19/18, CN13a/12d.							
T D. brouweri	CNPL 7/6	1.93	1.93	2.06	1.95	1	1.93	1.91
T D. triradiatus	CN12d	1.95			1.95	2		1.93
Bc D. triradiatus	CNPL 6	2.14	2.14		2.22	1	2.16	2.13
	NN18/17, CN12d/12c,							
T D. pentaradiatus	CNPL 6/5	2.39	2.39		2.51	1	2.39	2.45
	NN17/16, CN12c/12b,							
T D. surculus	CNPL 5	2.49	2.49	2.52	2.54	1	2.53	2.53
	NN16, CN12b/12a,							
T D. tamalis	CNPL 5/4	2.80	2.80		2.80	1	2.76	2.81

¹Lourens et al., 2004; ²Berggren et al. (1995); Rio et al. (1990); Backman and Pestiaux
 (1987)

4.2 Nannofossil assemblage composition, preservation and diversity

A total of 35 species and species groups comprising tropical to subtropical taxa and 312 cold water species were identified. The Plio-Pleistocene assemblage is generally well-313 preserved, with all the species identifiable at the species level. The assemblage at Site U1476 314 is dominated by Reticulofenestra species (13 to 63%) and F. profunda (2 to 59%), with 315 alternating dominance in the record (Fig. 3A). This is followed by Gephyrocapsa spp. (up to 316 24%), Discoasters spp. (up to 17%), and Pseudoemiliania lacunosa (up to 15%). Other 317 318 species that made significant contribution to the total assemblage are *Helicosphaera* spp., Oolithotus spp., Umbilicosphaera spp. and Rhabdosphaera clavigera. 319

320

Total calcareous nannofossil absolute concentrations show highly variable patterns 321 322 through the studied time interval, with total concentrations ranging from 1700×10^9 to 7300×10^9 323 10⁹ N/g sed. (Fig. 3B). The Plio-Pleistocene transition (2.58 Ma) is characterized by a reduction in both the total nannofossil concentration and species diversity (Fig. 3B and 3C). 324 The Pliocene record displays a good correspondence between the total concentrations and 325 the species diversity. From 2.31 to 2.17 Myr, consistently low total nannofossil concentrations 326 327 accompanied by increased diversity occur. Total nannofossils stay at relatively similar level 328 after the Plio-Pleistocene transition while species diversity immediately recovered.

329

330 **4.3 Variations in Discoaster abundance**

Discoaster tamalis and D. asymmetricus show the lowest concentrations, with 331 maximum abundances of only up to 110 x 10⁹ N/g sed. and 50x 10⁹ N/g sed., respectively 332 333 (Fig. 4A and 4B). Discoaster surculus displays a relatively constant abundance from 2.85 to 2.6 Myr, gradually increases at the beginning of MIS 103 and registers a maximum 334 concentration during this stage (290 x 10⁹ N/g sed.) (Fig. 4C). Its abundance then 335 progressively decreases until it completely disappears from the record at 2.53 Ma. The pattern 336 of D. pentaradiatus matches D. surculus showing the highest concentrations during the 337 interglacial stages G11 (430 x 10⁹ N/g sed.) and MIS 103 (390 x 10⁹ N/g sed.) (Fig. 4D). This 338 species is the most abundant species in the investigated time interval. After 2.45 Ma, when 339 the extinction of *D. pentaradiatus* occurred, only two members of this genus are left. Reworked 340 specimens of this species were, however, noted above its recorded extinction (Fig. 4D). 341 Discoaster triradiatus has a base common occurrence placed at 2.13 Ma. Maxima in 342 abundance of this species are recorded at MIS 81 (95 x 10⁹ N/g sed.), MIS 78 (150 x 10⁹ N/g 343 344 sed.) and MIS 74 (130 x 10⁹ N/g sed.) (Fig. 4E). The second most abundant species in the record is *D. brouweri*, with highly variable abundance throughout the record (Fig. 4F). Lower 345 concentrations of this species are recorded until 2.58 Ma, when total Discoaster abundance 346

is shared with other *Discoaster* taxa (*D. pentaradiatus*, *D. surculus*, *D. asymmetricus*, and *D. tamalis*). After the extinction of *D. surculus*, *D. brouweri* dominates the *Discoaster*assemblage. All of these species show declining trends toward their respective demise from
the Site U1476 record.

351



Figure 3: Calcareous nannofossils at Site U1476: (A) stack plot of all species; (B) total absolute nannofossil concentration per gram (g) of sediment; (C) Shannon diversity index (H). Glacial stages are marked by gray bars. Solid lines are calculated 5-point running average of the raw data (gray background lines) and used to highlight general patterns.



Figure 4: Absolute concentrations of the Plio-Pleistocene *Discoaster* species: (A) *D. tamalis*; (B) *D. asymmetricus*; (C) *D. surculus*; (D) *D. pentaradiatus*; (E) *D. triradiatus*; and (F) *D. brouweri*. All concentrations are expressed in number of nannofossils x 10⁹/gram of sediment. Glacial stages are marked by gray bars.

364 **5 Discussion**

365 5.1 *Discoaster* extinction and paleoenvironment during the Plio 366 Pleistocene

367 The successive extinctions of Discoaster species during the Plio-Pleistocene offers a 368 well-established sequence of biostratigraphic events (Bukry, 1971; Backman and Pestiaux, 1987), including our record from Site U1476. Efforts on the refinement of these datum events 369 have progressed over the years, including astronomical calibration (e.g., Raffi et al., 2006; 370 Backman et al., 2012; Agnini et al., 2017). While the Pliocene nannofossil chronology is rather 371 less studied on a global scale compared to the Miocene or Pleistocene intervals (Raffi et al., 372 2006), the Plio-Pleistocene Discoaster extinction event is widely documented. Despite the 373 reported uncertainties in using the individual datum due to diachronous first and last 374 occurrences of its member taxa between major oceans, there is still a general consensus that 375 this group disappeared from the record during the transition from the warm Pliocene to the 376 377 cold Pleistocene.

378

At Site U1476, a general reduction in the *Discoaster* abundance from 2.85 to 1.85 Myr 379 is observed until it completely vanishes from the record at 1.91 Ma (Fig. 5). This record 380 381 displays an opposite abundance pattern with the upper photic zone (UPZ) flora with preference 382 for high nutrient environment, which shows an increasing abundance toward 1.85 Ma (Fig. 383 5D). This indicates the affinity of discoasters to low productivity regime, and hinting the possibility of this group to have inhabited the deep photic layer. The preference of this group 384 to oligotrophic environment was also shown in a study by Minoletti et al. (2001), where the 385 δ^{13} C values analyzed from the *Discoaster* fraction resemble the planktonic foraminifera record. 386 387 Previous studies suggested that some Discoaster species prefer the LPZ, a behavior similar to F. profunda (e.g., Aubry, 1998; Bralower, 2002). A recent study by Schueth and Bralower 388 (2015) confirmed this using an ecological ordination technique, where the authors suggested 389 that D. brouweri and D. pentaradiatus favored a warm and stratified regime, with a deep 390 nutricline. Geochemical evidence supports the first two proposed ecology of this group; 391 however, the similarity of the discoaster δ^{18} O values to the surface water dwelling planktonic 392 foraminifera record also indicates that they thrived in the upper photic layer (Minoletti et al., 393 2001). While the depth habitat of this extinct group is still controversial, our results show that 394 discoasters inhabited warm, stratified and oligotrophic condition. And whether they thrived in 395 the UPZ or the LPZ, if these organisms were adapted to a low nutrient regime, having a more 396 vigorously mixed water column would be a detriment to the group even if it was abundant in 397 398 the surface waters. The discoasters could have also been outcompeted by the UPZ flora,

- which are mostly dominated by the small reticulofenestrids, a group of opportunistic taxa that
 are abundant in nutrient-rich environment (Flores et al., 1995).
- 401

402 A distinct shift starting at ~2.4 Ma is observed in both the Discoaster and the UPZ 403 records, after the transition from the Pliocene to the Pleistocene. The increase in abundance 404 of the eutrophic UPZ flora suggests nutrient enhancement in the photic layer, which is in 405 agreement with the F. profunda index indicating less stratified water column conditions from ~2.4 to 1.85 Myr (Fig. 5B). More intensified water column mixing could have shoaled the 406 nutricline leading to increase in the abundances of the UPZ flora. This shift at ~2.4 Ma 407 occurred after the onset of the Northern Hemisphere glaciation (Haug et al., 1999), and is 408 coincident with the beginning of the Arid interval (Fig. 5), when the fully constituted tropical 409 Indian Ocean circulation has developed (Christensen et al., 2017). Comparison with the 410 411 productivity record of the North Atlantic (ODP Site 982; Bolton et al., 2011) reveals a reverse 412 pattern at ~2.4 Ma, signifying a more enhanced wind-driven upwelling zones and upwelling productivity in the in the low- to mid-latitudes during this period (Sarnthein and Fenner, 1999) 413 (Fig. 5E). On the other hand, a reduction in the *Discoaster* abundance is observed during 414 415 some of the extreme Early Pleistocene glacial stages, such as MIS 96, 82, 78, and 72. This 416 pattern was also recorded in the three major ocean basins (Chapman and Chepstow-Lusty, 417 1997), indicating that the global changes in the surface water conditions driven by the glacial/interglacial cycles and the intensity of the NH glaciation, have controlled the abundance 418 419 and distribution of this particular group. 420

The EPP values calculated from the relative abundance of F. profunda, however do 421 not show a clear pattern as the other proxies discussed above (Fig. 5E). A relatively stable 422 pattern is observed in the EPP throughout the studied time period although higher amplitude 423 424 fluctuations can be observed starting at ~2.25 Ma. This shows that the EPP formula, calibrated using modern samples is not an effective measure of productivity in ancient sediments. 425 Nevertheless, the reduction in water column stratification shown by the F. profunda index and 426 the increasing abundance of the eutrophic UPZ species indicates that gradual cooling coupled 427 with the shallowing of the nutricline/thermocline (Ravelo et al., 2004; Lawrence et al., 2013), 428 429 resulted in the progressive decline and subsequent demise of the discoasters (Chapman and Chepstow-Lusty, 1997; Schueth and Bralower, 2015). 430



Figure 5: Site U1476 coccolithophore productivity and stratification records with major climatic and 433 434 oceanographic events during the Pliocene-Pleistocene transition: (A) orbital obliquity sequence 435 (Berger, 1992); (B) Florisphaera profunda index; (C) relative abundance of Discoaster spp.; (D) upper photic zone (UPZ) flora comprising small Gephyrocapsa and small Reticulofenestra; (E) estimated 436 primary productivity (EPP) calculated from the relative abundance of F. profunda; and (F) C37 alkenones 437 438 from ODP 982 (Bolton et al., 2011). Glacial stages are marked by gray bars. Atmospheric and oceanographic events at major periods of the Neogene global climate are indicated by blue horizontal 439 440 bars. Solid lines are calculated 3-point running average of the raw data (gray background lines) and 441 used to highlight general patterns.

- 442
- 443
- 444

445 **5.2 Productivity fluctuations from indicative taxa**

The downcore variations in individual nannoplankton species show differences in abundance 446 patterns, with some species showing a clear trend with the implied isotope stages (Fig. 6). 447 The variations in abundance of temperature and productivity indicator species suggest that a 448 combination of environmental parameters, and not only SST, controlled the coccolithophore 449 productivity at Site U1476 during the Plio-Pleistocene (Fig. 6). Despite of the scattered 450 occurrences of C. pelagicus in the record, this species shows peak abundances during the 451 glacial intervals, especially during the Early Pleistocene, which signifies the preference of this 452 species to cold water conditions (Fig. 6A). Relatively stable abundances of the eutrophic UPZ 453 group are recorded for the Pliocene sequence, and registers a major change after the 454 transition to the Pleistocene (~2.4 Ma), where it reaches a minimum and progressively 455 456 increases thereafter. The increased abundances of the eutrophic UPZ-dwelling taxa (Fig. 6C), 457 indicates enriched nutrient supply in the upper photic layer (Okada, 2000). The interval from ~2.4 to 1.85 Myr is characterized by higher surface water productivity conditions, as is also 458 shown by the increased abundances of C. leptoporus, another taxon with affinity for high-459 460 nutrient environments (e.g., Giraudeau, 1992; Winter et al., 1994) (Fig. 6B). While this species 461 is also typified for warm conditions (Winter and Martin, 1990; Flores et al., 1999; Baumann and Freitag, 2004), its contrasting pattern with the warm water taxa (Fig. 6F), especially 462 starting at ~2.2 Ma, shows that the abundances of C. leptoporus are not a consequence of 463 changing SST but rather of nutrient availability in the water column. Despite the low 464 abundances of the accessory taxa Oolithotus spp., Rhabdosphaera clavigera, Syracosphaera 465 spp., and Umbellosphaera spp., the cumulative abundance of these species used as a warm 466 water proxy shows distinct and regular variations in the record. The high abundances of the 467 tropical species, such as F. profunda, and C. leptoporus coupled with the consistent 468 occurrences of the warm water taxa (Oolithotus spp, Rhabdosphaera clavigera, 469 470 Syracosphaera spp., and Umbellosphaera spp.) reflect prevalence of warm tropical conditions 471 in the study area.



Figure 6: Absolute concentrations of selected calcareous nannofossil taxa: (A) Coccolithus pelagicus;
(B) Calcidiscus leptoporus; (C) small Gephyrocapsa + small Reticulofenestra; (D) Florisphaera
profunda; (E) total Discoaster spp.; (F) warm water taxa comprising Oolithotus spp., Rhabdosphaera
clavigera, Syracosphaera spp., and Umbellosphaera spp. All concentrations are expressed in number
of nannofossils x 10⁹/gram of sediment. Glacial stages are marked by gray bars.

483 **5.3 Response of calcareous nannoplankton to astronomical forcing**

Calcareous nannoplankton abundances visually exhibit cyclic variations (Fig. 5 and 6). 484 which is confirmed by spectral analysis (Fig. 7). Spectral analysis performed on the 485 nannofossil record demonstrates variations in paleoproductivity related to glacial/interglacial 486 variability (100 kyr), obliguity (41 kyr) and precession (23 and 19 kyr). The nannofossil warm 487 water taxa group, estimated primary productivity, and F. profunda index also show variations 488 at the sub-precession and precession band (19 and 23 kyr). This strongly suggests that 489 productivity in the Mozambigue Channel is modulated by both the high latitude and the tropical 490 Pacific forcings. The 100-kyr and obliguity signatures suggest a NH driver of the observed 491 492 variability, whereas variability at the rhythm of precession is interpreted as a tropical Pacific forcing. The 23 kyr cyclicity in the calcareous nannofossil record from this site was also 493 494 observed in the equatorial Indian Ocean, which was linked to a combination of both the boreal 495 monsoon and the El Niño Southern Oscillation (ENSO)-like dynamics (Beaufort et al., 2001). 496





Figure 7: Spectral power versus frequency plots of calcareous nannoplankton record and magnetic susceptibility: (A) total *Discoaster* species; (B) total nannofossils; (C) estimated primary productivity calculated from relative abundance of *Florisphaera profunda*; (D) warm water taxa (*Oolithotus* spp., *Rhabdosphaera clavigera*, and *Syracosphaera* spp.); (E) *F. profunda* index; (F) magnetic susceptibility.
Colored lines indicate the 90%, 95%, and 99% confidence intervals (CI).

503

504

506 **5.4 Implications for the Agulhas Current**

We suggest that the long-term record of paleoproductivity at Site U1476 is driven by 507 both atmospheric and oceanographic processes, which influenced variations in the 508 nutricline/thermocline dynamics and nutrient availability in the water column. The present day 509 510 oceanography of the western Indian Ocean has been suggested to be linked to the Pacific Ocean climate variability (Schouten et al., 2003) and also holds true for Quaternary climate 511 archives (Kuhnert et al., 2014; Tangunan et al., 2017). The abundance of the LPZ-dwelling 512 513 species F. profunda is an effective proxy for the nutricline/thermocline depth in Quaternary sediments and has proven useful for late Neogene sequences (Okada, 2000), as well as for 514 515 interpreting Indo-Pacific teleconnections over the past 300 kyr (Tangunan et al., 2017). The regular occurrence of warm water taxa reflects tropical Pacific influence in our study area. This 516 517 shows that the transport of warm and oligotrophic surface water of the ITF via the SEC across 518 the Indian Ocean was a persistent feature of the last 2.85 Myr, which could be linked to the development of the Agulhas Current downstream, and subsequent leakage into the South 519 520 Atlantic (Biastoch et al., 2009).

521

522 A possible influence of southern sourced waters at Site U1476 is shown by the 523 increase in the abundance of C. pelagicus. This species was not encountered in late Quaternary sediments of the equatorial Indian Ocean (Tangunan et al., 2017) but was found 524 in the subtropical region of the Indian Ocean (e.g., Flores et al., 1999), which could be 525 attributed to the influence of nutrient-rich SASW during the glacial periods, with the northward 526 527 migration of the subtropical front (STF). However, the STF did not migrate northward beyond 33°S during the glacial periods (Bard and Rickaby, 2009) and did not reach our study site in 528 the Mozambique Channel. This region has been described by Ternon et al. (2014) as one of 529 530 the most turbulent areas in the world oceans. Enhanced surface water productivity and cooler 531 water conditions resulting in the occurrences of these species could therefore also be due to 532 a localized upwelling event, hence intensified water column mixing driven by the mesoscale 533 anticyclonic eddies in the channel (Schouten et al., 2003).

534

535 6 Conclusions

536 The Plio-Pleistocene paleoenvironment reconstruction over the last 1 Myr prior to the 537 *Discoaster* extinction at Site U1476, using calcareous nannoplankton assemblage proxies 538 showed that:

539

5401. Global extreme climatic shift during the Plio-Pleistocene transition played a key role in541the nutricline and thermocline depths, and thus the nutrient availability at the

- 542 Mozambique Channel. Both temperature and nutrient availability are critical 543 parameters in calcareous nannoplankton productivity at the location.
- 544

549

- 545 2. Calcareous nannoplankton taxa exhibit periodic variability at pace with the
 546 astronomical parameters. The 100-kyr and obliquity signatures suggest a NH driver of
 547 the observed variability, whereas variability at the rhythm of precession is interpreted
 548 as a tropical Pacific forcing.
- 550 3. Discoasters at Site U1476 declined with global cooling across the Plio-Pleistocene, which resulted in reduced water column stratification and consequent shallowing of the 551 nutricline/thermocline, hence high surface water productivity. We propose that the 552 gradual decline and successive extinction of this group is due to a more mixed water 553 column and consequent increase in productivity at the location, as shown by the low 554 values of the F. profunda index and high abundances of UPZ flora, indicative of 555 intensified water column mixing and nutrient-rich surface water conditions, 556 respectively. 557
- 559 4. The transport of warm and oligotrophic surface water of the ITF via the SEC across 560 the Indian Ocean was a persistent feature of the last 2.85 Myr, observed from the 561 consistent occurrences of warm water taxa. A possible influence of the southern 562 sourced sub-Antarctic surface waters into the site exists as shown by the increase in 563 abundance of *C. pelagicus*, a species that is adapted to cold and high-nutrient 564 environments.
- 565

558

566 Acknowledgments

This research used samples and data provided by the International Ocean Discovery 567 Program (IODP). We are thankful for much support from the crew of the R/V JOIDES 568 Resolution, IODP staff, and Expedition 361 shipboard science party. This work is part of the 569 project Ocean and Climate 2: Land-ocean interaction and climate variability in low latitudes 570 funded thru the German Science Foundation (DFG) Research Center/Cluster of Excellence 571 "The Ocean in the Earth System" MARUM. This manuscript benefited from the editorial 572 573 handling of Thierry Correge, and Jeremy Young and an anonymous reviewer who provided critical and constructive comments and suggestions. Data will be archived in the PANGAEA 574 database (www.pangaea.de). 575

- 576
- 577
- 578

579 **References**

- Acker, J.G. & Leptoukh, G. 2007. Online analysis enhances use of NASA earth science data.
 Eos, Transactions American Geophysical Union, 88(2): 14-17.
- Agnini, C., Monechi, S. & Raffi, I. 2017. Calcareous nannofossil biostratigraphy: historical background and application in Cenozoic chronostratigraphy. *Lethaia*, 50(3): 447-463.
- Ahagon, N., Tanaka, Y. & Ujiie, H. 1993. Florisphaera profunda, a possible nannoplankton
 indicator of late Quaternary changes in sea-water turbidity at the northwestern margin
 of the Pacific, *Marine Micropaleontology*: 255-273.
- Antoine, D. & Morel, A. 1996. Oceanic primary production: 1. Adaptation of a spectral light photosynthesis model in view of application to satellite chlorophyll observations, *Global Biogeochemical Cycles*: 43-55.
- Aubry, M.-P. 1998. Early Paleogene calcareous nannoplankton evolution: a tale of climatic
 amelioration. Late Paleocene-Early Eocene climatic and biotic events in the marine
 and terrestrial records. Columbia University Press, New York: 158-203.
- Aubry, M.-P. 2007. A major Pliocene coccolithophore turnover: Change in morphological strategy in the photic zone. *Geological Society of America Special Papers*, 424: 25-51.
- Backman, J. & Pestiaux, P. 1987. Pliocene Discoaster abundance variations, Deep Sea
 Drilling Project Site 606: Biochronology and palaeoenvironmental implications. *Ruddiman, W.E., Kidd, R.B., Thomas, E., et al., Initial Reports of the Deep Sea Drilling Project*, 94: 903-909.
- 599 Bard, E. & Rickaby, R.E. 2009. Migration of the subtropical front as a modulator of glacial 600 climate, *Nature*: 380-383.
- Baumann, K.H., Andruleit, H.A. & Samtleben, C. 2000. Coccolithophores in the Nordic Seas:
 comparison of living communities with surface sediment assemblages. *Deep-Sea Research Part Ii-Topical Studies in Oceanography*, 47(9-11): 1743-1772.
- Baumann, K.H. & Freitag, T. 2004. Pleistocene fluctuations in the northern Benguela Current
 system as revealed by coccolith assemblages, *Mar Micropaleontol*: 195-215.
- Beal, L.M., Ruijter, W.P.M.D., Biastoch, A., Zahn, R. & 136, S.W.I.W.G. 2011. On the role of
 the Agulhas system in ocean circulation and climate. *Nature*, 472: 429-436.
- 608 Beaufort, L. 1996. Dynamics of the monsoon in the equatorial Indian Ocean over the last 609 260,000 years, *Quaternary International*: 13-18.
- Beaufort, L., De Garidel-Thoron, T., Mix, A.C. & Pisias, N.G. 2001. ENSO-like forcing on
 oceanic primary production during the Late Pleistocene, *Science*. American
 Association for the Advancement of Science: 2440-2444.
- Beaufort, L., Lancelot, Y., Camberlin, P.C., O., Vincent, E., Bassinot, F.C. & Labeyrie, L. 1997.
 Insolation cycles as a major control of equatorial Indian Ocean primary production,
 Science: 1451-1454.
- 616 Berger, A. 1992. Orbital variations and insolation database. *IGBP PAGES/World Data Center-*617 *A for Paleoclimatology Data Contribution Series*, 92(007).
- Berggren, W. A., Hilgen, F. J., Langereis, C. G., Kent, D. V., Obradovich, J. D., Raffi, I.,
 Raymo, M.E. & Shackleton, N. J. 1995. Late Neogene chronology: new perspectives
 in high-resolution stratigraphy. *Geological Society of America Bulletin*, *107*(11), 12721287.
- Biastoch, A., Böning, C.W., Schwarzkopf, F.U. & Lutjeharms, J. 2009. Increase in Agulhas
 leakage due to poleward shift of Southern Hemisphere westerlies. *Nature*, 462(7272):
 495-498.
- Bolton, C. T., Lawrence, K. T., Gibbs, S. J., Wilson, P. A., & Herbert, T. D. 2011. Biotic and
 geochemical evidence for a global latitudinal shift in ocean biogeochemistry and export
 productivity during the late Pliocene. *Earth and Planetary Science Letters*, *308*(1), 200210.
- Bordiga, M., Bartol, M. & Henderiks, J. 2015. Absolute nannofossil abundance estimates:
 Quantifying the pros and cons of different techniques. *Revue de micropaléontologie*, 58(3): 155-165.

- Bown, P.R., Lees, J.A. & Young, J.R. 2004. Calcareous nannoplankton evolution and diversity
 through time, *Coccolithophores*. Springer: 481-508.
- Bralower, T.J. 2002. Evidence of surface water oligotrophy during the Paleocene-Eocene
 thermal maximum: Nannofossil assemblage data from Ocean Drilling Program Site
 636 690, Maud Rise, Weddell Sea. *Paleoceanography*, 17(2).
- Browning, E., Bergen, J., Blair, S., Boesiger, T. & E. de Kaenel. 2017. Late Miocene to Late
 Pliocene taxonomy and stratigraphy of the genus *Discoaster* in the circum North
 Atlantic Basin: Gulf of Mexico and ODP Leg 154. *Journal of Nannoplankton Research*,
 37(2-3), 189-214.
- Bukry, D. 1971. Discoaster evolutionary trends. *Micropaleontology*: 43-52.
- Chapman, M.R. & Chepstow-Lusty, A.J. 1997. Late Pliocene climatic change and the global
 extinction of the discoasters: an independent assessment using oxygen isotope
 records. *Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology*, 134(1): 109-125.
- Chepstow-Lusty, A., Backman, J. & Shackleton, N.J. 1989. Comparison of upper Pliocene
 Discoaster abundance variations from North Atlantic Sites 552, 607, 658, 659 and 662:
 further evidence for marine plankton responding to orbital forcing, *Ruddiman, W.F.,*Sarnthein, M., et al., Proceedings of the ODP, Science Results: 121-141.
- Christensen, B.A., Renema, W., Henderiks, J., De Vleeschouwer, D., Groeneveld, J.,
 Castañeda, I.S., Reuning, L., Bogus, K., Auer, G., Ishiwa, T. & McHugh, C.M. 2017.
 Indonesian Throughflow drove Australian climate from humid Pliocene to arid
 Pleistocene. *Geophysical Research Letters*. 44(13), 6914–6925.
- 653 Clemens, S.C., Murray, D.W. & Prell, W.L. 1996. Nonstationary phase of the Plio-Pleistocene 654 Asian monsoon. *Science*, 274(5289): 943.
- Demenocal, P. B. 1995. Plio-Pleistocene African climate. Science, 53-59.
- De Vleeschouwer, D., Vahlenkamp, M., Crucifix, M., & Pälike, H. 2017. Alternating Southern
 and Northern Hemisphere climate response to astronomical forcing during the past 35
 my. *Geology*, *45*(4), 375-378.
- Flores, J.A., Sierro, F.J. & Raffi, I., 1995. Evolution of the calcareous nannofossil assemblage
 as a response to the paleoceanographic changes in the eastern equatorial Pacific
 Ocean from 4 to 2 Ma (Leg 138, Sites 849 and 852). In Proceedings of the ODP,
 Science Results, 138:163-176. Ocean Drill. Prog College Station, TX.
- Flores, J.A., Gersonde, R. & Sierro, F.J. 1999. Pleistocene fluctuations in the Agulhas Current
 Retroflection based on the calcareous plankton record, *Marine Micropaleontology*: 1 22.
- Friedinger, P.J. & Winter, A. 1987. Distribution of modern coccolithophore assemblages in the
 southwest Indian Ocean off southern Africa. *Journal of Micropalaeontology*, 6(1): 49 56.
- Gibbs, S., Shackleton, N. & Young, J. 2004. Orbitally forced climate signals in mid-Pliocene
 nannofossil assemblages. *Marine Micropaleontology*, 51(1-2): 39-56.
- 671 Giraudeau, J. 1992. Distribution of Recent nannofossils beneath the Benguela System -672 Southwest African continental margin, *Marine Geology*: 219-237.
- Gradstein, F.M., Ogg, G. & Schmitz, M. 2012. *The Geologic Time Scale 2012*, 117. Elsevier:
 674 6 pp.
- Hall, I.R., Hemming, S.R. & Levay, L.J. 2016. Expedition 361 Preliminary Report: South
 African Climates (Agulhas LGM Density Profile). International Ocean Discovery
 Program.
- Hall, I.R., Hemming, S.R., Levay, L.J., Barker, S., Berke, M.A., Brentegani, L., Caley, T., 678 Cartagena-Sierra, A., Charles, C.D., Coenen, J.J., Crespin, J.G., Franzese, A.M., 679 Gruetzner, J., Han, X., Hines, S.K.V., Jimenez Espejo, F.J., Just, J., Koutsodendris, 680 A., Kubota, K., Lathika, N., Norris, R.D., Periera Dos Santos, T., Robinson, R., 681 Rolinson, J.M., Simon, M., Tangunan, D., Van Der Lubbe, J.J.L., Yamane, M. & Zhang, 682 H. 2017a. Expedition 361 methods. In: I. R. Hall, Hemming, S.R., LeVay, L.J., and the 683 Expedition 361 Scientists (Ed.), South African Climates (Agulhas LGM Density Profile). 684 685 International Ocean Discovery Program.

- Hall, I.R., Hemming, S.R., Levay, L.J., Barker, S., Berke, M.A., Brentegani, L., Caley, T., 686 Cartagena-Sierra, A., Charles, C.D., Coenen, J.J., Crespin, J.G., Franzese, A.M., 687 Gruetzner, J., Han, X., Hines, S.K.V., Jimenez Espejo, F.J., Just, J., Koutsodendris, 688 A., Kubota, K., Lathika, N., Norris, R.D., Periera Dos Santos, T., Robinson, R., 689 Rolinson, J.M., Simon, M., Tangunan, D., Van Der Lubbe, J.J.L., Yamane, M. & Zhang, 690 H. 2017b. Site U1476. In: I. R. Hall, Hemming, S.R., LeVay, L.J., and the Expedition 691 361 Scientists (Ed.), South African Climates (Agulhas LGM Density Profile). 692 International Ocean Discovery Program. 693
- Hammer, Ø., Harper, D. & Ryan, P. 2009. PAST-PAlaeontological STatistics, ver. 1.89,
 University of Oslo, Oslo: 1-31.
- Haq, B.U. & Lohmann, G. 1976. Early Cenozoic calcareous nannoplankton biogeography of
 the Atlantic Ocean. *Marine Micropaleontology*, 1: 119-194.
- Hastenrath, S., Nicklis, A. & Greischar, L. 1993. Atmospheric-hydrospheric mechanisms of
 climate anomalies in the western equatorial Indian Ocean. *Journal of Geophysical Research*, 98(C11): 20219.
- Haug, G. H., D. M. Sigman, R. Tiedemann, T. F. Pedersen & Sarntheink, M. 1999. Onset of
 permanent stratification in the subarctic Pacific Ocean, *Nature*, 401(6755), 21–24.
- Hine, N. & Weaver, P.P.E. 1998. Quaternary. *Calcareous nannofossil biostratigraphy*, 266 283.
- Kuhnert, H., Kuhlmann, H., Mohtadi, M., Meggers, H., Baumann, K.H. & Patzold, J. 2014.
 Holocene tropical western Indian Ocean sea surface temperatures in covariation with climatic changes in the Indonesian region, *Paleoceanography*: 423-437.
- Lawrence, K.T., Sigman, D., Herbert, T.D., Riihimaki, C., Bolton, C., Martinez-Garcia, A.,
 Rosell-Mele, A. & Haug, G. 2013. Time-transgressive North Atlantic productivity
 changes upon Northern Hemisphere glaciation. *Paleoceanography*, 28(4): 740-751.
- Lisiecki, L.E. & Raymo, M.E. 2005. A Pliocene-Pleistocene stack of 57 globally distributed
 benthic δ18O records. *Paleoceanography*, 20(1): n/a-n/a.
- Lourens, L., Hilgen, F., Shackleton, N.J., Laskar, J., and Wilson, D., 2004. The Neogene period. In Gradstein, F.M., Ogg, J.G., and Smith, A. (Eds.), A Geologic Time Scale 2004: Cambridge, United Kingdom (Cambridge University Press), 409–440.
- Lutjeharms, J. 2006. The agulhas current. *African Journal of Marine Science*, 28(3-4): 729-717 732.
- Marino, M., Maiorano, P. & Flower, B.P. 2011. Calcareous nannofossil changes during the Mid-Pleistocene Revolution: Paleoecologic and paleoceanographic evidence from North Atlantic Site 980/981. *Palaeogeography Palaeoclimatology Palaeoecology*, 306(1-2): 58-69.
- Marino, M., Maiorano, P., Tarantino, F., Voelker, A., Capotondi, L., Girone, A., Lirer, F., Flores,
 J.-A. & Naafs, B.D.A. 2014. Coccolithophores as proxy of seawater changes at orbital to-millennial scale during middle Pleistocene Marine Isotope Stages 14-9 in North
 Atlantic core MD01-2446. *Paleoceanography*, 29(6): 518-532.
- Martini, E. 1971. Standard Tertiary and Quaternary calcareous nannoplankton zonation,
 Proceedings of the Second Planktonic Conference, Roma 1970. Tecnoscienza: 739 728 785.
- Minoletti, F., Gardin, S., Nicot, E., Renard, M. and Spezzaferri, S., 2001. Mise au point d'un
 protocole experimental de separation granulometrique d'assemblages de
 nannofossiles calcaires; applications paleoecologiques et geochimiques, *Bulletin de la* Société géologique de France, 172(4): 437-446.
- Molfino, B. & Mcintyre, A. 1990. Precessional forcing of nutricline dynamics in the equatorial atlantic, *Science*. American Association for the Advancement of Science: 766-769.
- Okada, H. 2000. 33. Neogene and Quaternary calcareous nannofossils from the Blake Ridge,
 Sites 994, 995, AND 9971, *Proceedings of the Ocean Drilling Program. Scientific results*. Ocean Drilling Program: 331-341.
- Okada, H. & Bukry, D. 1980. Supplementary modification and introduction of code numbers
 to the low-latitude coccolith biostratigraphic zonation (Bukry, 1973; 1975). *Marine Micropaleontology*, 5: 321-325.

- Parente, A., Cachao, M., Baumann, K.H., De Abreu, L. & Ferreira, J. 2004. Morphometry of
 Coccolithus pelagicus s.I. (Coccolithophore, Haptophyta) from offshore Portugal,
 during the last 200 ka. *Micropaleontology*, 50: 107-120.
- 744 Perch-Nielsen, K. 1985. Cenozoic calcareous nannofossils. *Plankton stratigraphy*, 427-554.
- Raffi, I., Backman, J., Fornaciari, E., Pälike, H., Rio, D., Lourens, L. & Hilgen, F. 2006. A review
 of calcareous nannofossil astrobiochronology encompassing the past 25 million years.
 Quaternary Science Reviews, 25(23): 3113-3137.
- Ravelo, A.C., Andreasen, D.H., Mitchell, L., Lyle, A.O. & Wara, M.W. 2004. Regional climate
 shifts caused by gradual global cooling in the Pliocene epoch. *Nature*, 429(6989): 263.
- Raymo, M., Hodell, D. & Jansen, E. 1992. Response of deep ocean circulation to initiation of
 Northern Hemisphere glaciation (3–2 Ma). *Paleoceanography*, 7(5): 645-672.
- Rio, D., Raffi, I., & Villa, G. (1990). Pliocene-Pleistocene calcareous nannofossil distribution
 patterns in the Western Mediterranean. In *Proceedings of the Ocean Drilling Program, Scientific Results* (Vol. 107, pp. 513-533). College Station, TX: Ocean Drilling
 Program.
- Rogalla, U. & Andruleit, H. 2005. Precessional forcing of coccolithophore assemblages in the
 northern Arabian Sea: Implications for monsoonal dynamics during the last 200,000
 years, *Marine Geology*: 31-48.
- Sarnthein, M., & Fenner, J. 1988. Global Wind-Induced Change of Deep-Sea Sediment
 Budgets, New Ocean Production and CO \$ _2 \$ Reservoirs ca. 3.3-2.35 Ma
 BP. *Philosophical Transactions of the Royal Society of London B: Biological Sciences*, *318*(1191), 487-504.
- Schott, F.A. & Mccreary, J.P. 2001. The monsoon circulation of the Indian Ocean, *Progress in Oceanography*. Progress in Oceanography: 1-123.
- Schott, F.A., Xie, S.P. & Mccreary, J.P. 2009. Indian Ocean circulation and climate variability,
 Rev Geophys.
- Schouten, M.W., De Ruijter, W.P.M., Van Leeuwen, P.J. & Ridderinkhof, H. 2003. Eddies and
 variability in the Mozambique Channel, *Deep-Sea Research Part Ii-Topical Studies in Oceanography*: 1987-2003.
- Schueth, J.D. & Bralower, T.J. 2015. The relationship between environmental change and the
 extinction of the nannoplankton Discoaster in the early Pleistocene.
 Paleoceanography, 30(7): 863-876.
- Shackleton, N.J., Backman, J., Zimmerman, H.T., Kent, D.V., Hall, M., Roberts, D.G.,
 Schnitker, D., Baldauf, J., Desprairies, A. & Homrighausen, R. 1984. Oxygen isotope
 calibration of the onset of ice-rafting and history of glaciation in the North Atlantic
 region. *Nature*, 307(5952): 620-623.
- Simpson, E. & Schlich, R. 1974. Initial reports of the Deep Sea Drilling Project, vol. 25.
 Washington, DC: US Government Printing Office.
- Stolz, K., Baumann, K.-H. & Mersmeyer, H. 2015. Extant coccolithophores from the western
 equatorial Indian Ocean off Tanzania and coccolith distribution in surface sediments,
 Micropaleontology: 473-488.
- Tangunan, D., Baumann, K.-H., Pätzold, J., Henrich, R., Kucera, M., De Pol-Holz, R. &
 Groeneveld, J. 2017. Insolation forcing of coccolithophore productivity in the western
 tropical Indian Ocean over the last two glacial-interglacial cycles. *Paleoceanography*.
- Ternon, J.F., Bach, P., Barlow, R., Huggett, J., Jaquemet, S., Marsac, F., Menard, F., Penven,
 P., Pontier, M. & Roberts, M.J. 2014. The Mozambique Channel: From physics to
 upper trophic levels. *Deep Sea Research Part II: Tropical Studies in Oceanography*,
 100: 9.
- Tiedemann, R., Sarnthein, M., & Shackleton, N. J. 1994. Astronomic timescale for the Pliocene
 Atlantic δ18O and dust flux records of Ocean Drilling Program Site
 659. Paleoceanography, 9(4), 619-638.
- Westbroek, P., Brown, C. W., van Bleijswijk, J., Brownlee, C., Brummer, G. J., Conte, M.,
 Egge, J., Fernandez, E., Jordan, R., Knappertsbusch, M. & Stefels, J. (1993). A model
 system approach to biological climate forcing. The example of Emiliania
 huxleyi. *Global and Planetary Change*, 8(1-2), 27-46.

- Winter, A., Jordan, R.W. & Roth, P.H. 1994. Biogeography of living coccolithophores in ocean
 waters. *In*: A. Winter & W. G. Siesser (Eds.), *Coccolithophores*. Cambridge University
 Press: 37.
- 799 Winter, A. & Martin, K. 1990. Late Quaternary history of the Agulhas Current, 800 *Paleoceanography*: 479-486.
- 801 Young, J.R. 1998. Neogene. Calcareous nannofossil biostratigraphy, 225-265.

1 Supplementary materials for "The last 1 million years of the extinct genus

2 Discoaster: Plio–Pleistocene environment and productivity at Site U1476

3 (Mozambique Channel)"

4

Deborah N. Tangunan^a, Karl-Heinz Baumann^{a,b}, Janna Just^b, Leah J. LeVay^c, Stephen
 Barker^d, Luna Brentegani^e, David De Vleeschouwer^a, Ian R. Hall^d, Sidney Hemming^f, Richard
 Norris^g and the Expedition 361 Shipboard Scientific Party¹⁰

8

9 **This PDF file includes:**

10	•	Expedition 361 Shipboard Scientific Party
11	•	Supplementary information for the age model construction.
12		• Fig. S1. Application of bandpass filter and astronomical calibration of the Site
13		U1476 XRF Fe/Ca data series.
14		• Fig. S2. Inclination of shipboard core-half measurements for Site U1476 holes
15		A, D and E.
16		• Table S1. Calcareous nannofossil biostratigraphic events recorded at Site
17		U1476 with the astronomically calibrated occurrences of the index taxa.
18		 Table S2. Paleomagnetic boundaries at Site U1476.
19		5
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		
26		
27		
28		
29		
30		
31		
32		
33		
34		
35		
36		
37		
38		
39		
40		
41		
42		
43		
44		
45		

Expedition 361 Shipboard Scientific Party

Melissa A. Berke^h, Thibaut Caleyⁱ, Alejandra Cartagena-Sierra^h, Christopher D. Charles^g,
Jason J. Coenen^j, Julien G. Crespinⁱ, Allison M. Franzese^k, Jens Gruetzner^l, Xibin Han^m,
Sophia K.V. Hinesⁿ, Francisco J. Jimenez Espejo^o, Andreas Koutsodendris^p, Kaoru Kubota^q,
Nambiyathodi Lathika^r, Thiago Pereira dos Santos^s, Rebecca Robinson^t, John M. Rolison^u,
Margit H. Simon^v, Jeroen J.L. van der Lubbew, Masako Yamane^x, and Hucai Zhang^y.

^hDepartment of Civil Engineering & Geological Sciences, University of Notre Dame, 156 Fitzpatrick Hall, Notre Dame IN 46556, USA; EPOC, UMR CNRS 5805, University of Bordeaux, Allee Geoffroy Saint Hilaire, Pessac 33615, France; ^jDepartment of Geology, Northern Illinois University, 235 N. Sacramento Street, Unit F, Sycamore IL 60178, USA; ^kNatural Sciences Department, School of Earth and Environmental Sciences, Hostos Community College, 500 Grand Concourse, Bronx NY 10451, USA; Alfred-Wegener-Institut for Polar and Marine Research, Am Alten Hafen 26, Bremerhaven 27568 Germany; "Second Institute of Oceanography, Key Laboratory of Submarine Science, 36 Baochubeilu, Hangzhou City, P.R. China; "Division of Geological and Planetary Sciences, California Institute of Technology, 1200 E. California Boulevard, MC 131-24, Pasadena CA 91125, USA; oInstitute of Biogeosciences, Japan Agency for Marine-Earth Science and Technology (JAMSTEC), Natsushima-cho 2-15, Yokosuka 237-0061, Japan; PInstitute of Earth Sciences, University of Heidelberg, Im Neuenheimer Feld 234, Heidelberg 69120; ^qAtmosphere and Ocean Research Institute, University of Tokyo, 5-1-5 Kashiwano-ha, Kashiwashi Chiba 277-8564, Japan: 'Ice Core Laboratory, National Centre for Antarctic and Ocean Research, Head Land Sada, Vasco da Gama Goa 403804, India; ^sInstitute for Geosciences, Universidade Federal Fluminense, Rio de Janeiro 24020, Brazil; 'Graduate School of Oceanography, University of Rhode Island, South Ferry Road, Narragansett RI 02882, USA; "Chemistry Department, University of Otago, PO Box 56, Dunedin 9054, New Zealand; ^vUni Research Climate and Bjerknes Centre for Climate Research, Allégt. 55, 5007 Bergen, Norway; "Department of Sedimentology, University Amsterdam, Netherlands; ^xDepartment of Biogeochemistry, JAMSTEC, 2-15 Natsushima-cho, Yokosuka, Kanagawa 237-0061, Japan; ^yLab of Plateau Lake Ecology and Global Change, Yunnan Normal University, 1 Yuhua District, Kunming Chengong 650500, P.R. China.

93 Supplementary information for the age model construction

94

The Site U1476 Plio-Pleistocene (2.85 to 1.85 Myr) age model was established based on the combined calcareous nannofossil biostratigraphy, magnetostratigraphy and cyclostratigraphy.

97



98

Figure S1: Application of bandpass filter and tuning of the Site U1476 XRF Fe/Ca data series to La2010 astronomical solution by Laskar, (2011): A) Fe/Ca record plotted against the shipboard stratigraphy; B) power spectra of the Fe/Ca data to determine orbital imprint in the record; C) band passed 41-kyr obliquity signal filtered in the Fe/Ca data; D) visual comparison of the Fe/Ca data series and the filtered obliquity signal; and E) Site U1476 Fe/Ca filtered obliquity signal plotted with the La2010 obliquity solution.

105

Table S1: Calcareous nannofossil biostratigraphic events recorded at Site U1476 with the astronomically calibrated occurrences of the index taxa in the
 Mozambique Channel, western Indian Ocean.

	Age (Ma) Gradstein et al., 2012)	SHIPBOARD		CALIBRATED: Splice			
Calcareous nannofossil event		Hole-Core-Section- interval	CCSF (m)	Hole-Core-Section- interval	CCSF (m)	Age (Ma) THIS STUDY	
T C. macintyrei	1.60	U1476A-5H2-75 cm	36.63				
B <i>Gephyrocapsa</i> (>4µm)	1.73	U1476A-5H2-75 cm	41.13				
T D. brouweri	1.93	U1476A-6H2-75 cm	46.06	U1476D-6H5-81 cm	45.29	1.91	
T D. triradiatus	1.95	U1476A-6H2-75 cm	46.06	U1476D-6H5-141 cm	45.89	1.93	
Bc D. triradiatus	2.14	U1476A-6H6-60 cm	51.91	U1476E-6H3-147 cm	51.08	2.13	
T D. pentaradiatus	2.39	U1476A-7H6-75 cm	61.64	U1476A-7H5-108 cm	60.97	2.45	
T D. surculus	2.49	U1476A-8H1-75 cm	64.31	U1476D-8H4-125 cm	63.42	2.53	
T D. tamalis	2.80	U1476A-8H6-75 cm	71.81	U1476D-9H4-6 cm	72.72	2.81	
T Sphenolithus spp.	3.54	U1476A-11H6-75 cm	103.13				

Boundary	Age (Ma) GPTS 2012	Hole-Core-Section- interval	CCSF (m)	Hole-Core-Section- interval	CCSF (m)	Age (Ma) THIS STUDY
B Jaramillo	1.07	U1476D-4H5-68 cm	26.49*	U1476E-3H6-67 cm	26.24	
T Olduvai	1.78	U1476D-6H2-64 cm	40.62	U1476E-5H2-110 cm	39.89*	
B Olduvai	1.95	U1476D-4H6-67 cm	46.65	U1476E-5H7-39 cm	46.28*	1.94
T Gauss	2.58	U1476D-8H7-34 cm	67.01	U1476E-*H2-107 cm	67.56*	2.66

Table S2: Paleomagnetic boundaries at Site U1476. The most reliable paleomagnetic boundaries are marked by an asterisk.

Figure S2: Inclination of shipboard core-half measurements after 15 or 20 mT alternating field demagnetization (Hall et al. 2017b) for a) Hole A, b) Hole D and c) Hole E. As the paleomagnetic data from U1476 carry a strong coring overprint, in particular at the top of each core, data from the first sections of the cores are not shown. The depth of paleomagnetic polarity boundaries were defined by joint consideration of data from all holes.

