

This is an Open Access document downloaded from ORCA, Cardiff University's institutional repository:<https://orca.cardiff.ac.uk/id/eprint/139225/>

This is the author's version of a work that was submitted to / accepted for publication.

Citation for final published version:

James, Alison H. , Bennett, Clare Louise , Blanchard, Denise and Stanley, David 2021. Nursing and values-based leadership: a literature review. *Journal of Nursing Management* 29 (5) , pp. 916-930. 10.1111/jonm.13273

Publishers page: <http://dx.doi.org/10.1111/jonm.13273>

Please note:

Changes made as a result of publishing processes such as copy-editing, formatting and page numbers may not be reflected in this version. For the definitive version of this publication, please refer to the published source. You are advised to consult the publisher's version if you wish to cite this paper.

This version is being made available in accordance with publisher policies. See <http://orca.cf.ac.uk/policies.html> for usage policies. Copyright and moral rights for publications made available in ORCA are retained by the copyright holders.



## Tables

**Table 1: Article Profile: Values-Based Leadership**

No	Authors / Title	Year	Source	Volume	Country	Aim	Method
1	Barkhordari-Sharifabad, M., Ashktorab, T, & Atashzadeh-Shoorideh, F. Ethical Leadership outcomes in nursing: A qualitative study	2017	Nursing Ethics	Vol 25 (8) p. 1051 - 1063	Iran	To elaborate on the ethical leadership and its role in professional progress and growth of nurses in the light of work condition in health providing institutes.	Qualitative study
2	Bogeskov, B. O., Rasmussen, L.D. & Weinrich, E. Between meaning and duty- leaders' uses and missuses of ethical arguments in generating engagement.	2017	Journal of Nursing Management	25 p. 129 – 138.	Denmark	Motivating leaders who may feel values are challenged	Qualitative thematic analysis / interviews / focus groups /observations
3	Copeland, M.K. The emerging significance of values-based leadership: A literature review	2014	International Journal of Leadership Studies	Vol. 8 Iss. 2,	USA	examines the prevailing literature and research on the various constructs rooted in VBL	Lit Review
4	Denier, Y., Dhaene L.& Gastmans, C. 'You can give them wings to fly': a qualitative study on values-based leadership in health care	2019	BMC Medical Ethics	20: 35 1 – 17	Belgium	To investigate the way in which ethical values are present in the lived experiences and daily practice of health care management	Qualitative study (Grounded Theory Approach)
5	Duthie, K, Bond, K & Juzwishin, D. Improving leadership through values-based decisions	2014	Healthcare Management Forum	27:168–170	Canada	Discusses the recently developed an ethical leadership self-assessment tool to strengthen healthcare leaders' ability to explore the ethical dimensions of decision-making	Cases study
6	Faith, K.E. The role of values-based leadership in sustaining a culture of caring	2013	Healthcare Management Forum	26:6–10	Canada	Discusses risk to the significant shift in healthcare from its moral foundations	Case study
7	Graber D.R & Kilpatrick, A. O. Establishing values-based leadership and value systems in healthcare organisations	2008	JHHSA	Fall p. 179 – 197	USA	The importance of values for organisational culture	Lit Review
8	Morsiani, G., Bagnasco, A., & Sasso, L. How staff nurses perceive the impact of nurse managers' leadership styles in terms of job satisfaction: A mixed method study	2017	Journal of Nursing Management	25 119-128	Italy	Staff nurses' perceptions of leadership styles.	Mixed Methods

9	Shirazi, M., Emami, A., H., Mirmoosavi, S.J., Alavinia, S., M., Zamanian, H., Fatholiahbeigi, F., & Masiello, I. The effects of intervention based on supportive leadership behaviour on Iranian nursing leadership performance: A randomised controlled trial	2016	Journal of Nursing Management	24 400-408	Iran	Intervention exploring supportive leadership on nursing performance.	A randomised controlled trial
10	Westphal, J.A. Characteristics of nurse leaders in hospitals in the USA from 1992 to 2008.	2012	Journal of Nursing Management	20 928 - 937	USA	Characteristics of nurse leaders explored.	Non-experimental design

**Table 2: Article Profile: Authentic Leadership**

No	Authors / Title	Year	Source	Volume	Country	Aim	Method
1	Alilyyani, B., Wong, C. & Cummings Antecedents, mediators, and outcomes of authentic leadership in healthcare: A systematic review	2018	International Journal of Nursing Studies	83 34-64	Canada	examine the antecedents, mediators and outcomes associated with authentic leadership in healthcare.	Lit Review / Systematic Review
2	Alkharabsheh, O.H. & Alias R.B The Mediating Effect of Organisation Culture on the Relationship between Authentic Leadership and Turnover Intention in Jordanian Public Hospitals	2018	Journal of Economic & Management Perspectives,	Vol 12, Issue 3, P. 19-35.	Jordan	This study primarily aims to investigate the relationship between authentic leadership and turnover intention in the context of Jordanian public hospitals; it is also to evaluate the mediating effect of organisation culture on such a relationship.	Quantitative method through a survey questionnaire.
3	Baek, H., Han, K. & Ryu, E. Authentic leadership, job satisfaction and organizational commitment: The moderating effect of nurse tenure	2019	Journal of Nursing management	27 1655- 1663	South Korea	To examine the associations between unit managers' authentic leadership with job satisfaction and organizational commitment and to investigate whether nurse tenure has a moderating effect on these associations.	Cross-sectional secondary analysis using survey data from 1,118 staff nurses.
4	Bamford, M., Wong, C.A. & Laschinger H The influence of authentic leadership and areas of worklife on work engagement of registered nurses	2013	Journal of Nursing management	21 529-540	Canada	To examine the relationships among nurses perceptions of nurse managers authentic leadership, nurses_ overall person–job match in the six areas of worklife	A secondary analysis of data collected from a non-experimental, predictive design survey of a random

						and their work engagement.	sample of 280 registered nurses working in acute care hospital.
5	Dirik, H. & Intepeler, S.S. The influence of authentic leadership on safety climate in nursing	2017	Journal of Nursing management	25 392-401	Turkey	This study analysed nurses' perceptions of authentic leadership and safety climate and examined the contribution of authentic leadership to the safety climate.	Questionnaire
6	Fallatah, F. & Laschinger, H. K. The influence of authentic leadership and supportive professional practice environments on new graduate nurse job satisfaction.	2016	Journal of Research in Nursing	21 (2) 125-136	Canada	test a theoretical model linking authentic leadership to new graduate nurses' job satisfaction	secondary analysis of data
7	Giallonardo,, Wong, C.A. & Iwasiw, C.L. Authentic Leadership of preceptor's predictor of a new graduate nurse's work engagement and job satisfaction.	2010	Journal of Nursing Management	18(8) 993-1003	Canada	examine the relationships between new graduate nurses' perceptions of preceptor authentic leadership, work engagement and job satisfaction	A predictive non-experimental survey design
8	Laschinger, H.K., Wong, C.A. & Grau, A.L. Authentic Leadership empowerment and burnout a comparison in new graduates and experienced nurses.	2013	Journal of Nursing Management	21(3) 541-552	Canada	Structural empowerment, exhaustion and cynicism of nurse graduates	Secondary analysis
9	Laschinger H K S, Borgogni L, Consiglio C, Read E The effects of authentic leadership, six areas of worklife, and occupational coping self-efficacy on new graduate nurses' burnout and mental health: A cross-sectional study	2015	International Journal of Nursing Studies	52 1080-1089	Canada	Tested a model linking authentic leadership, areas of worklife, occupational coping self-efficacy, burnout, and mental health among new graduate nurses	Cross Sectional design
10	Lee, H-F., Chiang, H-Y. & Kuo, H-T Relationship between authentic leadership and nurse's intent to leave: the mediating role of work environment and burnout.	2019	Journal of Nursing Management	27(1) 52-65	Taiwan	Intent to leave and Burnout	Cross sectional design
11	Long, T. Effect of Authentic Leadership on newly qualified nurses: a scoping review	2020	Nursing Management	doi: 10.7748/nm.2020.e1901	UK	A scoping review of the effect of authentic leadership on newly qualified nurses	Lit Review

12	Malila N, Lunkka N, Suhonen M Authentic leadership in healthcare: a scoping review	2017	Leadership in Health Services	Vol. 31 No. 1, 2018 pp. 129-14	Finland	Review of Authentic Leadership	Scoping Review
13	Mortiner, A. V. Vlerick, P. & Clays E. Authentic Leadership and thriving among nurses the mediating role of empathy.	2016	Journal of Nurse management	24(3) 357 – 365	Belgium	AL, thriving and role of empathy	Cross sectional design
14	Read, E.A. & Laschinger, H.K. S. The influence of authentic leadership and empowerment on nurse's relational social capital mental health and job satisfaction over the first year of practice.	2015	Journal of Advanced Nu8rsing	71(7) 1611-1623	Canada	theoretical model testing the effects of authentic leadership, of new graduate nurses	Longitudinal survey
15	Regan, S., Laschinger, H.K.S.& Wong, C.A. The influence of empowerment, authentic leadership and professional practice environments on nurses perceived inter-professional collaboration.	2016	Journal of Nursing Management	24 54-61	Canada	Empowerment, AL	Longitudinal survey
16	Shirey M.R. Authentic Leadership, Organizational Culture, and Healthy Work Environments	2009	Critical Care Nurs Q	32 (3) 189-198	USA	nurse manager stress, coping strategies health outcomes decision-making processes	Qual descriptive
17	Wong, C.A & Cummings, G.G. The Influence of Authentic Leadership behaviours on Trust and work outcomes of health care staff	2009	JOURNAL OF LEADERSHIP STUDIES,	Volume 3, Number 2, p. 6 – 23	Canada	Authentic leadership and trust	Quantitative survey
18	Wong, C.A. & Laschinger, H.K.S. Authentic Leadership performance and job satisfaction the mediating role of empowerment.	2012	Journal of Advanced Nursing	69(4) 947-959	Canada	Test a model linking authentic leadership of managers with nurses' perceptions of structural empowerment, performance, and job satisfaction.	A non-experimental, predictive survey
19	Wong, C.A. & Laschinger, H.K.S. & Cummings, G.G Authentic Leadership and nurses voice behaviour and perceptions of care quality	2010	Journal of Nursing Management	18(8) 889-900	Canada	test a theoretical model linking authentic leadership with staff nurses trust in their manager, work engagement, voice behaviour and perceived unit care quality.	Non-experimental, predictive survey design
20	Wong, C.A & M. Giallonardo, L. Authentic Leadership and nurse-assessed adverse patient outcomes	2013	Journal of Nursing management	21(5) 740-752	Canada	test a model examining relationships among authentic leadership, nurses' trust in their	Secondary analysis of data collected in a cross-sectional

						manager, areas of work life and nurse-assessed adverse patient outcomes	survey of 280 (48% response rate) registered nurses
--	--	--	--	--	--	---	---

**Table 3: Article Profile 2: Servant Leadership**

No	Authors / Title	Year	Source	Vol /Issue	Country	Aim	Method
1.	Garber, J.S. Madigan, E.A. & Fitzpatrick JJ. Attitudes towards collaboration and servant leadership among nurses, physicians and residents.	2009	Journal of Interprofessional Care	23(4) 331-340	USA	To identify registered nurse, physician and resident attitudes towards collaboration and servant leadership and whether there is a relationship between collaboration and servant leadership within each group.	Survey
2.	Gunnarsdóttir, S. Is servant leadership useful for sustainable Nordic Health care?	2014	Nordic Journal of Nursing Research and Clinical Studies	34(2) 53-55	Iceland	To explore the attitudes of Nordic healthcare staff towards servant leadership and to investigate whether there was a link between elements of servant leadership and enhanced staff outcomes.	Survey
3.	Hanse, J.J., Harlin, U, Jarebrant, C Ulin, K & Winkel, J The impact of servant leadership dimensions on leader-member exchange among health care professionals.	2016	Journal of Nursing Management	24(2) 228-234	Sweden	To investigate the impact of servant leadership on leader–member exchange among healthcare professionals.	Survey
4.	Jenkins, M. & Stewart, A.C. The importance of a servant leader orientation.	2010	Health Care Management Review	35(1) 46-54	USA	To test three hypotheses: There will be a positive relationship between a manager’s commitment to serve, as described by servant leadership, and nurse job satisfaction. There will be a significant positive relationship between a manager’s use of role inversion behaviours and nurse job satisfaction. When the manager’s commitment to serve and role inversion behaviours are both high, servant leader orientation of the manager will be high and will be associated with high employee job satisfaction.	Survey

5.	Jooste, K.& Jordaan, E. Student nurses' perceptions of the nurse manager as a servant leader.	2012	Africa Journal of Nursing and Midwifery	14(1) 76-88	South Africa	To explore third- and fourth-year student nurses' perceptions of nurse managers as servant leaders at primary healthcare clinics.	Survey
6.	Mostafa, A.M.S. & El-Motalib, E.A.A. Servant leadership, leader-member exchange and proactive behaviour in the public health sector	2019	Public Personnel Management	48(3) 309-324	Egypt	To investigate the relationship between servant leadership and proactive behaviours amongst public hospital nurses.	Survey
7.	Neill, M., Hayward, K. S., & Peterson, T. Students' perceptions of the interprofessional team in practice through the application of servant leadership principles	2007	Journal of Interprofessional Care	21(4) 425 – 432	USA	To measure health and care students' perceptions of interprofessional practice following a collaborative learning experience which applied servant leadership principles as a framework in team interaction and the delivery of services.	Pre-test post-test
8.	Sturm, B.A. Principles of servant-leadership in community health nursing: management issues and behaviours discovered in ethnographic research.	2009	Home Health Care Management and Practice	21(2) 82-89	USA	To provide evidence-based examples of servant-leadership.	Secondary analysis of ethnographic research data

**Table 4: Article Profile: Congruent Leadership**

No	Authors	Year	Source	Volume	Country	Aim	Method
1.	Johansson, G., Sandahl, C. & Andershed, B. Authentic and Congruent Leadership providing excellent work environment in Palliative care.	2011	Leadership in Health Services	24 2 135-149	Sweden	Comparing the effectiveness of Congruent and Authentic leadership in palliative care	Qualitative Data Analysis / Survey / Interviews
2	Stanley, D. In command of care: Clinical Nurse Leadership explored	2006a	Journal of Research in Nursing	11 1 20-39	UK	Exploration of clinical leadership	Survey / Mixed Methods
3.	Stanley, D. In command of care: Towards a theory of congruent leadership	2006b	Journal of Research in Nursing	11 2 132- 144	UK	Exploration of clinical leadership in light of congruent leadership theory	Survey / Mixed Methods
4.	Stanley, D. Recognising and Defining Clinical Leaders	2006c	British Journal of Nursing	15(2) 108-111	UK	Definition of Clinical Leadership	Literature Review / Discussion
5.	Stanley, D. Congruent Leadership: Values in Action	2008	Journal of Nursing Management	16 519-524	Australia	To discuss the significance of an appropriate leadership theory in order to	Literature Review / Discussion.

						develop an understanding of clinical leadership.	
6.	Stanley, D. Clinical Leadership Characteristic confirmed	2014	Journal of Research in Nursing	19 2 118-128	Australia	The definition and exploration of clinical leadership characteristics.	Qualitative Data Analysis
7.	Stanley, D. Congruent Leadership Defined	2017	JOJ Nurse Health care	3 3 1-2	Australia	Explores the definition of Congruent Leadership	Literature Review / Discussion
8	Stanley, D. Clinical Leadership and nursing explored: A literature review	2018	Journal of Clinical Nursing	27  1730 – 1743	Australia	Exploration of clinical leadership	Literature Review / Discussion
9	Ungerleider, J.D. & Ungerleider R.M. Improved quality and outcomes through congruent leadership, teamwork and life choices.	2011	Progress in Paediatric Cardiology	32 2 75-83	USA	Improving practice through congruent leadership	Literature Review / Discussion
10	Coventry, T. Russell, K.P. The Clinical nurse educator as a congruent leader: A Mixed Method Study.	2020	Journal of Nursing Education and Practice	11(1) 8-18	Australia	An analysis of the leadership style of clinical nurse educators	Mixed Methods study



**Table 5: Themes identified within the literature for each theory**

<b>Authentic Leadership</b>	<b>Servant Leadership</b>	<b>Congruent Leadership</b>	<b>Values-Based Leadership</b>
Patient outcomes and safety	Leader-Member Exchange	Providing high Quality Nursing Care and Improving Outcomes	Key values are dominant
Work environment and Job satisfaction	Job satisfaction / enhanced staff outcomes	Clinical leader characteristics and key values ( <b>trust, honesty and approachability</b> ) are dominant	Ethical decision making is key
Interprofessional working and shared decision making	Collaboration / <b>Trust</b> / Enhanced Professional Practice	Grass roots leadership is encouraged	'Voice' is given to key values <b>and 'trust' is enhanced</b>
Wellbeing of Staff / Diminishing Burnout	Enhanced client Outcomes		Greater 'citizenship' behaviours in leaders and followers
<p>The thematic analysis of data within each paper was conducted, by each researcher dealing with the four leadership theories individually. Each research then validated the codes, categories and themes identified for the literature of each of the leadership theories.</p>			
<p><b>Combined Themes:</b></p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Work Environment and Job Satisfaction</li> <li>2. Staff wellbeing and Burnout</li> <li>3. Trust and Voice</li> <li>4. Interprofessional working and collaboration</li> <li>5. Patient outcomes</li> </ol>			