

Online Research @ Cardiff

This is an Open Access document downloaded from ORCA, Cardiff University's institutional repository: https://orca.cardiff.ac.uk/id/eprint/139893/

This is the author's version of a work that was submitted to / accepted for publication.

Citation for final published version:

Mannay, Dawn ORCID: https://orcid.org/0000-0002-7368-4111, Smith, Philip ORCID: https://orcid.org/0000-0002-3491-4519, Turney, Catherine, Jennings, Stephen and Davies, Peter 2022. 'Becoming more confident in being themselves': the value of cultural and creative engagement for young people in foster care. Qualitative Social Work 21 (3), pp. 485-503.

10.1177/14733250211009965 file

Publishers page: http://dx.doi.org/10.1177/14733250211009965 http://dx.doi.org/10.1177/14733250211009965>

Please note:

Changes made as a result of publishing processes such as copy-editing, formatting and page numbers may not be reflected in this version. For the definitive version of this publication, please refer to the published source. You are advised to consult the publisher's version if you wish to cite this paper.

This version is being made available in accordance with publisher policies.

http://orca.cf.ac.uk/policies.html for usage policies. Copyright and moral rights for publications made available in ORCA are retained by the copyright holders.



information services gwasanaethau gwybodaeth

Qualitative Social Work

'Becoming more confident in being themselves': the value of cultural and creative engagement for young people in foster care

Keywords Foster ca	
	re, Art, Young people, Education, Arts-based interventions,
	native education
transform futures, t care. This delivered were cone foster car study em work to e This prov arts-base they felt arts and o confidence that atter paper doe of plannir carers, in calls for i opportuni	evidence that engagement with the arts can engender lative effects on young people's views of themselves and their this can be particularly useful for children and young people in a paper draws on a case study of an arts-based programme in Wales, UK. Field observations of the arts-based sessions ducted, and the participant sample included young people in the (n=8), foster carers (n=7) and project facilitators (n=3). The ployed interviews, observations, reflexive diaries, and metaphor explore the subjective accounts of these different stakeholders. In insight into their experience of being involved with the diprogramme, the impacts of this involvement, and what steps could be taken to improve the model. The paper argues that cultural engagement can be transformative in improving the e and social connectedness of young people in foster care, but the often overlooked mundane, yet important, aspects and arts-based programmes, exploring the involvement of foster terpersonal relationships, and the provision of refreshments. It is not the provision of refreshments in developing carefully designed extracurricular ties for young people in care, where they can experience in more confident in being themselves'.

SCHOLARONE™ Manuscripts

Introduction

Cultural projects are increasingly being viewed by academics and policy makers as valuable assets in strengthening community engagement and facilitating grassroots expression (Crossick & Kaszynska, 2016; Welsh Government, 2016). Creativity has also become the 'new watchword in UK academic and policy circles' (Robinson *et al*, 2019), and the importance of creativity as part of young people's education has been recognised in the national curricula of member states of the European Union (Wyse & Ferrari, 2014).

The call for more emphasis on the arts has been recognised in the White Paper Our National Mission: A Transformational Curriculum, which sets out the detailed legislative proposals for Curriculum for Wales 2022. This prioritises the Expressive Arts Area of Learning and Experience, including the five disciplines of art, dance, drama, film and digital media, and music as the entitlement of all learners (Welsh Government, 2019). Nonetheless, it is important to consider learners who have restricted access to the arts (Andrews, 2014), and barriers to engaging with education, which can place them in a position of cultural disadvantage.

Care-experienced young people generally achieve poorer educational outcomes compared to their peers (Mannay *et al*, 2017a; O'Higgins *et al*, 2015; Sebba *et al*, 2015), with a gap of 43% between the GCSE (age 16 qualification level) attainment of care experienced students and the rest of their cohort in Wales (Macdonald, 2020). They can face significant educational disadvantages due to unstable and disruptive environments, time spent out of school, poor additional educational support, and a lack of understanding of their specific mental and emotional health needs (Harker *et al*, 2004). They are also at greater risk of developing mental health problems (Luke *et al*, 2014), and of experiencing instability related to placement moves (Cunningham & Diversi, 2012; Girling, 2019). Additionally, they are often labelled as 'failing' or 'supported' subjects and the low expectations of teachers, carers, and social workers can have unintended, yet deleterious, impacts on their educational

trajectories (Mannay *et al*, 2017a). It is important to acknowledge that negative comments from teachers and carers can sometimes serve as a key motivator for young people to succeed academically; but young people's awareness of low expectations for care leavers remain a key barrier (Brady & Gilligan, 2020).

The complex barriers and inequality in education outcomes faced by care-experienced young people suggest there needs to be more emphasis on how success is conceptualised and achieved (Rees & Munro, 2019). The study discussed in this paper focuses on a programme that aimed to engage fostered young people and their families with the arts, as a vehicle to engender confidence, belonging, and creativity, which could potentially contribute to further learning and personal development. This emphasis on the value of cultural and creative engagement necessitates an understanding of the literature in this area, which constitutes the focus of the next section.

Arts Interventions with Care-experienced Young People

Gilligan was one of the first authors to consider the potential benefits of cultural activities for young people in public care in Ireland and Scotland, noting that they played a 'critically important but relatively neglected or invisible role' within the care system (1999: 188).

Drawing on the accounts of foster carers, Gilligan emphasised that the support of key adults in providing young people with access to the arts can engender transformative effects on young people's views of themselves and their futures (Gilligan, 1999).

Again, drawing on the accounts of foster carers, as well as care assistants and social workers, Hopkins (2004) reported on 'The Friday Club', which provided opportunities for care-experienced young people to engage with cultural activities. The adults connected with the programme reflected that it created social networks with others and encouraged positive relationship-building. Comparable benefits were reported by Coholic *et al* (2012), who evaluated two holistic arts-based group programmes that facilitated a context in which young people were 'encouraged to build connections with peers experiencing similar challenges'

(Coholic *et al*, 2012: 354). In their self-reports, young people noted improved emotional regulation, self-awareness, and esteem, as well as coping strategies, cognitive skills, and confidence (Coholic *et al*, 2012).

The National Children's Bureau and Creativity, Culture and Education foundation commissioned the Office for Public Management to evaluate their arts and cultural programme with care-experienced children aged 7-11 across three locations in the UK. Data generated with children suggested post-programme developments in participants' confidence, self-esteem, and self-efficacy. However, this was contradicted by adult participants who felt that a proportion of children continued to exhibit low self-efficacy and self-belief. Nonetheless, there was evidence that the project strengthened relationships with care staff, foster families, and peers (OPM, 2013: 4). The evaluation documented factors that contributed to its effectiveness, including having a 'safe space' cultivated by skilled artists; the involvement of foster families; the importance of positive arts opportunities; a small group containing only those with care-experienced backgrounds; and multiple, varied arts activities (OPM, 2013).

Theatre-based work has also been used effectively with care-experienced young people. Salmon & Rickaby (2014) reviewed a programme designed to explore the lives of ten care-experienced young people through the development and performance of a play based on everyday life in care. Young people and carers reported that they enjoyed their time in the theatre setting, and that they had developed social networks, relationship-based skills and confidence. Correspondingly, Nsonwu *et al* (2015) explored the utility of drama as a creative therapy for young people about to transition out of the foster care system. Participants highlighted key benefits from taking part, including respect and recognition as an individual; reduced social isolation; peer bonding; and confidence in their ability to construct plans for the future.

More recently, Lougheed & Coholic (2018) reviewed an arts-based mindfulness programme with adolescents about to leave the care system, which incorporated painting, drawing, and music and took place once per week for 10 weeks. The authors noted inferentially that participants reported better emotion regulation and feelings of optimism, and feeling accepted in the group with their peers, which is vitally important for young people 'who are marginalised given their experiences of exclusion and discrimination' (Lougheed & Coholic, 2018: 170).

Despite the successes reported in these studies, there were concerns about the financial costs of arts provision, the capacity and willingness of carers to facilitate access to opportunities, and the associated sustainability of participation by care-experienced young people when funded programmes ended. Supporting young people's engagement was particularly problematic for those placed in residential units where workers changed regularly (Salmon & Rickaby, 2014). These issues reinforce differences between those in care and those who are not, but also between young people in different care settings.

Existing literature has evidenced benefits for care-experienced young people engaging with arts-based provision, but also acknowledged the barriers to participation for this marginalised group (see Peeran, 2016 for a more detailed review of the literature). However, evaluations of arts-based interventions with care-experienced young people have not always engaged with all key stakeholders or provided detail of the seemingly mundane yet importance practical aspects of these interventions. In response, this study drew on the perspectives of foster carers, facilitators, and care-experienced young people. Involving all stakeholders was necessary to gain a more nuanced understanding of this specific arts-based programme. We were interested not only in the benefits of arts-based engagement in itself, which has been documented in the previous literature; but in how engagement was achieved in routine practices involving the setting, interpersonal relationships, and the provision of refreshments.

Methodology – A Qualitative Case Study

The study aimed to undertake qualitative research with programme facilitators, careexperienced young people, and their foster families to provide an insight into their
experience of being involved with the arts-based programme, and their perspectives on what
could be done to improve the model and encourage engagement with the arts. The study
design aligned with some of the tenets of action research, which examines and evaluates an
issue of study to determine if and how changes can be implemented to improve processes,
procedures and programmes (Lewin, 1946; Howard & Eckhardt, 2005).

The research was conducted within the foundational project associated with a five-year Big Lottery funded Confidence in Care programme, led by The Fostering Network in Wales, and delivered in partnership with Action for Children, Barnardo's, and TACT. This arts-based programme was provided within the Wales Millennium Centre and delivered over 10 weeks between May and July 2018. The sessions generally ran for two hours on Sundays but the final session was extended to include a meal at a nearby restaurant, a theatre show, and a backstage tour.

Three artist facilitators from the Wales Millennium Centre designed and delivered the sessions with the support of two staff members from The Fostering Network in Wales and Action for Children who were experienced in working with young people in care. Each session began with a warm-up followed by a focus on a specific arts-based activity. In three of the sessions, the group was joined by external artists with one session featuring an expert on singing, one involving two practitioners from local theatre company, and one involving two performers from a national puppet based theatre production.

Ethical approval for the study was granted by Cardiff University's Social Sciences Research Ethics Committee. Participants were asked to provide written informed consent to take part in all stages of the research process. A risk assessment was conducted, and several steps were taken to help ensure the wellbeing of participants.

The research techniques included observations of the arts programme sessions, a group interview with foster carers; a group interview with arts programme facilitators; document analysis; and interviews with young people and their foster carers. The sessions included games, drawing, puppet making, singing, acting, plot development, character development, and writing up activities in a reflexive diary to collate evidence of engagement for a certificated Arts Award (see also Robinson *et al*, 2019) [1].

Two researchers participated in the sessions, which enabled a period of familiarisation to build rapport with foster carers and young people prior to the interviews. Both researchers entered the sessions as full participants, getting involved in activities rather than simply observing from the side-lines. This enabled an ethnographic approach based on first-hand observations and reflections (Hammersley & Atkinson, 2007). Fieldnotes were written after each session as reflexive accounts of the activities, social relations and interactions. These were drawn on to finalise the interview themes and later to contextualise the data.

Foster carers were made aware of the program via networks and organisations related to foster care. Eight young people were involved in the arts programme, seven were in foster care and one was the biological daughter of one of the foster carers. All the young people were female, white, resident in Wales, and aged between 12 -15 years old. The demographical distribution did not reflect those invited to participate as the call went out to foster care networks. The inability to engage male participants could be related to wider gendered norms around legitimate participation in feminised subjects (Invinson & Murphy, 2003), while the lack of ethnicity in this small sample aligns with the population demographics in Wales (Welsh Government, 2020).

The arts programme comprised contributions from several arts practitioners and a group interview was conducted with the three main facilitators primarily involved with the sessions.

The eight young people resided in five different foster homes and five foster parents were

involved in the group interview. Seven foster carers later joined young people in their individual interview sessions [2].

Group interviews were guided by an interview schedule but the format was flexible, allowing participants to raise other points that they felt were important. The group interview for foster carers was held half-way through the programme. This was facilitated by the two researchers who had attended the arts programme sessions because relationships had been developed between the foster carers and researchers within these activities. The foster carers' interview enabled a space for both shared understandings and differences in opinion and it lasted for 1:04 hours and generated 11,546 words of transcribed data.

The interview with the three artist facilitators was conducted at the end of the project. The researchers involved in the session observations were concerned that preconceptions about the arts programme could have a deadening effect on the data generated if they undertook this interview (see Mannay, 2010). While they were not foster carers, or young people, their role had overlapped with the facilitators in supporting aspects of the programme delivery. Accordingly, a different member of the research team worked with the facilitators to fight familiarity (Delamont & Atkinson, 1995; Morriss, 2016). The researcher's lack of familiarity with the programme meant that the facilitators were less likely to leave out important insights due to assumed shared knowledge. Participants were asked in advance of the interview to consider how they could use metaphors to express changes they had observed in the young people during the project. Metaphor work has been used successfully in previous studies (Shinebourne & Smith, 2010), and this approach encouraged participants to take time to reflect on this question. The interview lasted for 1 hour and generated 13,202 words of transcribed data.

Young people wrote up elements of the activities and their experience of participating in a reflexive diary to collate evidence of engagement for a certificated Arts Award. These diaries were used to extend the data generated with young people in the post-arts programme

interviews with all the young people and their foster carers. Interviews were conducted by researchers who had attended the arts sessions to facilitate a level of rapport and trust. Young people's reflexive diaries were used as a focal point in the interviews to reduce the need for prolonged periods of eye contact between the researcher and the young people, which can often leave participants feeling uncomfortable and pressured into providing a response (Corbett, 1998). Conducting the interviews in this way offered something different to more formal interviews experienced by young people in care. This was important as those within the care system are likely to associate formal interviews with negative experiences, which often include difficult conversations about their lives (Mannay *et al.*, 2017b). The interviews generated over five hours of conversation and 55,184 transcribed words.

Inductive thematic analysis was facilitated by hand, allowing codes, categories and themes to be generated from the empirical data produced with the participants (Braun & Clarke, 2006) and the reflexive diaries and fieldnotes were considered in the analysis to clarify and extend the associated interview transcripts. Data production and analysis were conducted concurrently, with emergent themes being explored in future interviews. Accounts emphasising reasons for engaging, favourable aspects of the programme and suggestions for improvement were further explored across the data set as a whole; and connections were made with previous literature in the field. The data was initially analysed by the researcher who had conducted the interview and then explored further by the principal investigator, where the principal investigator conducted the initial analysis this was then re-examined by another member of the research team. Participants' accounts covered a range of themes including education, relationships, identity, and well-being. However, the findings presented here focus on participants' subjective experiences of engaging with and taking part in the arts-based programme.

Facilitating Engagement: The Role of Foster Carers

Young people can access arts provision autonomously, but carers often play a key role in supporting engagement. Resonating with previous studies (Gilligan, 1999; Gibson & Edwards, 2015, 2016; Salmon & Rickaby, 2014; OPM, 2013), foster carers' accounts emphasised their central role in involving young people in extracurricular activities, and in encouraging them to attend the Confidence in Care project at the Wales Millennium Centre.

I had sort of said to her you know it's exciting; it looks as if it's going to be fun ...

There's been a few blips where they've said actually, I don't want to go. And I've sort of said you know we've come this far; we've still got [War Horse Play] at the end and look at all this that's going to help with schoolwork with Drama [Foster Carer]

The foster carers in this study were part of wider networks and organisations related to foster care, which is how they were invited to the project. They actively developed strategies to encourage their foster children to take part, and provided practical and emotional support including facilitating enrolment, travelling with young people to the sessions, and encouraging reflection and discussion about the programme. Accordingly, they can be situated as 'engaged' foster carers (Mannay *et al*, 2017a); however, this raises questions about how to involve young people if they do not have the support of an 'engaged' foster carer (see also Salmon & Rickaby, 2014).

The motivations for foster carers bringing young people were embedded in the belief that their involvement could potentially generate wider benefits.

She lacks social skills... so anything that involves group participation I'll try and get her involved in... So that's why I put her name forward [Foster Carer]

We are all concerned about their education, their maths and their English and things but let's get the social skills first... I would put every penny I had to try and just get her out and about, out and about and learn from other people [Foster Carer]

It's more about self-confidence and self-esteem [Foster Carer]

She's so vulnerable so I think the more that we can bring them to things like this to try them... she's always with me and [partner] so she's not having the opportunities then to build up those social skills [Foster Carer]

Whilst foster carers did not speak extensively about art or creativity, there was a tacit recognition that being involved in arts activities with other young people potentially improves young people's confidence, self-esteem, and social competencies. In this way, their expectations aligned with the findings from previous research (Coholic *et al*, 2012; OPM, 2013), and the Welsh Government's (2019: 13) position that Expressive Arts learners will develop 'self-confidence, self-esteem, independence, communication skills, and social and cultural awareness'. The extent to which these expectations were met will be examined next.

'Breaking Free': Reflections on the Value of Engagement

Facilitators acknowledged that the programme supported young people in building the skills in drama, music, character development, and design, which they had been tasked to enable. However, resonating with the accounts of foster carers, facilitators' recollections placed more importance on the development of 'soft skills', which could potentially support young people in their everyday lives beyond the programme. These included 'confidence', 'being able to collaborate with each other', 'making friends', 'having fun' and 'becoming more confident in being themselves'.

Reflecting on the project's contribution to developing these soft skills, the facilitators emphasised the central role of routines and familiarity - there was a consistent staff presence, sessions took place in the same building each week, and followed the same basic structure. The flexibility of the arts programme meant that the facilitators could avoid the recreation of 'schooled subjects' and 'schooled docility' (Gallacher & Gallagher, 2008: 506) and they reported that developing supportive non-hierarchical relationships and emotional connections within the group helped the young people to feel secure. As in Thomson *et al's*

(2019: 247) study with teachers, the facilitators could also be positioned as 'arts brokers', as they 'embodied what it means to be culturally engaged' and situated creativity as integral to everyday life, actively communicating this centrality to young people.

All the facilitators noted the development of skills, experience, confidence, and social networks, but also what they interpreted as transformative forms of self-development (Gilligan, 1999). In observing the sessions, the researchers also noted how young people shifted from being reticent or reluctant, to embracing the activities and involving themselves in the group. One facilitator used the metaphor task to communicate this process of change.

[Initially] they were like walking really slowly and like can't really see where they're going, all like grey, green kind of muddy colours. And then week by week there would be like less crustaceans on them like stuff like coral would be coming off of them and they could like move a little bit like swifter or more kind of, everything got easier. And then with like all these bits coming off you would see their normal, like their natural colours and it would like by the end, they're kind of like you know neon colours and like shiny and bright and they kind of like glisten in the water. And like the words that kind of stuck out for me is like individuality, like personality like shining through ... like you could see like their true colours, the person that they really wanted to be able to show but are so kind of stuck together by all of these crustaceans, it's almost like they're like breaking free [Facilitator]

Resonating with this metaphor of 'breaking free', increased confidence was also noted by foster carers and young people.

Like confidence for like most of them has changed. Like they were quite shy at the beginning, then their confidence grew [Foster Carer]

I think it could bring them out of their shell and then you could, as a foster carer you could pick up ideas on what was done in the sessions to make someone carry on with it at home and everything [Foster Carer]

The references here about change and 'bring[ing] them out of their shell' again speak to the transformative potential of the arts programme. The foster carer's comment about taking ideas and activities from the context also indicates that the programme could engender some form of sustainability, which will be returned to later in the paper. Young people all reported aspects of positive change.

I was surprised how quickly I fitted in because when I don't feel comfortable where I am I won't eat and I don't think [Foster Carer] realised the first time because she was like oh [you] pizza. I love pizza but if I don't want to be there, I will not eat. But I noticed on the second one I started to feel okay [Young Person]

I learnt how to overcome challenges and to have fun. Learnt how to be confident around others [Young Person (reflexive diary)]

When we first started the session I was really scared to talk to anyone but when I started talking to them more and often, I got used to it [Young Person]

These comments, along with other data in the interviews and observational fieldnotes, suggest that the programme engendered space where young people felt socially and emotionally safe and supported. One young person noted their surprise at fitting in and being comfortable so quickly, which could relate to how the programme was configured. In addition to the attention paid by facilitators to building consistency, routine and non-hierarchical relationships, it is worth noting some additional contributory aspects.

In the initial sessions foster carers joined in for the preliminary activities, then left the session space but stayed in or close to the venue. This progressed to them bringing young people but not joining the session activities. Drawing on developmental discourses, we suggest that this feature of the programme provided a reliable 'secure base' which encouraged participants to safely explore the wider world (Bowlby, 1988; Schofield & Beek, 2005). The presence of foster carers was noted in some young people's accounts, for example 'Like I felt more comfortable with [Foster Carer] there, with the adults'; and young people also noted

how the gradual withdraw of foster carers from being full participants to being on the periphery was also a conducive to them establishing more independence, and wider relational support systems. This easing in process resonates with earlier research that has emphasised the importance of foster carers both promoting trust in availability and autonomy to provide children with a secure base (Schofield & Beek, 2005).

Another salient feature was that the young people were all in foster care [3]. It has been argued that having a project group consisting of both those with experience of the care system and those without can be beneficial for relationship-building and preventing the occurrence of stigmatisation (Salmon & Rickaby, 2014). However, other arts projects have noted the benefits of groups consisting exclusively of care-experienced individuals (OPM, 2013) and wider work with young people has suggested that mixed groups intensify social difference and mark young people out as 'looked after' (see Mannay *et al*, 2017a). In this study, foster carers contended that having a dedicated space for care-experienced young people to come together was advantageous;

I think they accept doing something like this because they know they're all in the same situation. When you take them to activities I think that's why [foster daughter] hasn't got friends because she goes [other activities], she's been going for years but there's no connection because obviously they're all so different to her so I think when she comes here she feels that much more confidence because she knows that everyone that's here is in care [Foster Carer]

Emond (2012) has documented care experienced young people's awareness of their care status and their strategies to manage this identity within school peer cultures. Similarly, previous studies with children in foster care have noted the difficulties of disclosing care status, the value of having friendships with others who are in care, and the importance of providing opportunities that bring fostered young people together to socialise (Rogers 2017). Friendship serves as a protective factor for care experienced young people (Ulset, 2016),

and arguably the configuration of this arts-based programme meant that identity management was less problematic because children shared the same care status, making interactions with new peers less challenging.

Young people did not explicitly cite having a dedicated space for care-experienced young people as a valuable aspect of the programme. However, the foster carers' accounts and the field observations indicated that this was central to the forging of new friendships, which was cited by the young people as key to their enjoyment of the programme:

When we went it was like, yes, get in! Because it's nice to meet new friends and hang around with them as well [Young Person]

I made friends yeah, but only one person I made contact with outside [Young Person]

I think it's just like fun activities, you socialise, you make new friends, and it feels like we're in one big family, that's what I think it is [Young Person]

The metaphor of 'one big family' aligned with the field observations, which noted the supportive atmosphere that characterised the group and their interactional practices. Additionally, the informal, less-hierarchical and relaxed environments created by the facilitators, and activities that required participants and facilitators to work collectively and collaboratively, were reported as engendering a space that was more conducive to friendship development. This was important as foster carers and young people discussed difficulties around making friends in school and other activity based groups, and the comment about maintaining contact suggests that some friendships endured beyond the programme. Art sessions have been previously reported as spaces where students felt they 'belonged' and could find like-minded others (Thompson *et al.*, 2018). Consequently, the value of arts practice in itself should not be overlooked.

Foster carers also built supportive networks with each other during the programme, emphasising the fundamental importance of trusting relationships (Ruch *et al*, 2017) for adults as well as young people;

I like meeting other foster carers and I especially like meeting them from other areas.

See how things differ and how things are done differently [Foster Carer]

It's always nice [to meet other foster carers]. It's nice to hear everyone's stories

[Foster Carer]

And hear the stories and offer support [Foster Carer]

To ask what I should do, because I've been awake all night worrying about it [Foster Carer]

Foster carers discussed the possibility of self-organising to continue meeting after the project had finished, but also suggested that if a similar project ran in the future, the carers' meetings could be more formally incorporated into the programme by providing a dedicated space for them to spend time together while the sessions were taking place. As with young people, in schools and extra-curricular activities foster carers are often seen as or perceive themselves as 'different' from other parents, and the programme offered them an opportunity to share knowledge and experience, and provide mutual support. This related benefit was not highlighted in the previous studies reviewed but it could be built on in future programmes to maximise the value of arts-based provision.

Suggestions for Future Programmes

Overall, the programme was evaluated positively but there were some practical issues, which are discussed in more detail in the project report recommendations (see Mannay *et al*, 2018). For example, the lead facilitator received specialist training but suggested that in future programmes preparation to work with care-experienced young people should take place earlier in the process, before the sessions were designed, and that it should be

available for all facilitators. As noted, foster carers proposed a dedicated space for foster carers to network, and there were also points raised about foster siblings. One of the families involved has a foster child and biological child of the same age, and although the programme was marketed as an opportunity for young people in foster care, they were both offered a place. However, if future programmes do not have this flexibility it could act as a barrier to engagement.

There was also the contentious issue of food provision. As reported in earlier studies (Rees, 2019), there was recognition that the provision of food could be useful in terms of bonding and bringing the group together. However, facilitators commented that sometimes food became a distraction. Foster carers were concerned that the project did not take into account the young people's difficult relationships with food, which they attributed to past experiences of neglect, deprivation or uncertainty around access to food. They suggested that clearer boundaries and routines around food were needed, such as the types of food, how much was provided and when it was made available.

Young people did not have the same view. Overall, they were happy with the programme, commenting 'There's nothing I would do differently' and 'I don't want to change anything ... Nothing to change'. However, where there were suggestions for improvement recorded in the reflexive diaries, these were about bringing pizza back after this was replaced with a healthier alternative, 'Next time I would change the food to pizza', 'Pizza at the end of the session ... Next time PIZZA'. Similar sentiments were expressed in the interview discussions.

We had pizza. That was the best thing ... Because it's free Domino's pizza. If you go into the place and they say right here's an orange, you don't like it's an orange but if someone they give you like Dominos pizza then you're going to go, oh now that's good innit? ... No, no one got fed up of the pizza it was because they [foster carers]

wanted something more healthy... Who wants something more healthy? [Young Person]

The centrality of food in foster carers' and young people's accounts suggests that it would be useful for future programmes to consider catering. There needs to be a balance between health concerns and the preferences of young people, and further reporting and evaluation could build expertise and evidence in this under-researched area. Another concern raised was in relation to the project ending, and facilitators questioned how this could be negotiated.

What happens to them now... It feels like, it feels like something has ended and that makes me nervous about like what happens to them now. Where does what they've learnt go? So like follow-up for me is something that is maybe missing like you know it's you know the bond that we have created, built, with them and with each other like this can't be the end now ... Yeah, it's just the kind of, that after-care [Facilitator]

The facilitators made amendments to the project to address this abrupt ending and consider 'after-care' by offering an 'add-on' session to finish any remaining work on the Arts Award and to mark the end of the project and the young people's achievements. Facilitators suggested that in future years this could be extended in two ways. Firstly, by acknowledging young people's achievements with a 'graduation' celebration, and secondly by inviting them to return in future iterations of the arts programme and speak to the next generation of participants. Foster carers also noted that the short-term nature of this project would leave the young people feeling 'miserable' and 'miss[ing] it'. They discussed the possibility of self-organising a meeting during the summer but agreed that this may prove difficult due to their geographical spread, and that the lack of structured follow-up would mean the young people felt the loss of the weekly sessions. The intensity of loss may be accentuated for care experienced young people as they will have experienced more transient relationships with

caregivers in relation to initial separation from their home of origin, and other placement moves with the care system (Girling, 2019).

Concluding thoughts

Despite some minor, yet important, areas for improvement, such as the timing of training for facilitators, project endings, and the provision of catering, overall, the arts-based programme was viewed positively by young people, facilitators and foster carers. This supports the earlier literature considered, which suggested that arts-based methods are effective tools for engaging care-experienced young people (Coholic *et al*, 2012; Hopkins, 2004; OPM, 2013; Salmon & Rickaby, 2014). The reported benefits for young people included improved confidence, self-esteem, and creative and social skills. Both young people and foster carers were able to establish peer networks, and some of these relationships endured beyond the programme. Additionally, two of the eight young people went on to join a drama-based activity supported by the Wales Millennium Centre, which was open to all young people, and foster carers discussed drawing on session activities at home. This suggests that the programme acted as a springboard for further involvement with the arts for some participants.

The success of the programme raises questions around how this form of provision can be offered to a wider range of care-experienced young people. The Fostering Network in Wales facilitated further sessions as part of Confidence in Care, which were informed by this research. Similarly, the Wales Millennium Centre have drawn on this study to explore how they can better engage young people in care and care leavers in their future programming and provision. However, there is an argument that opportunities for arts-based engagement need to be considered at a national and international level (Wyness & Lang, 2016). In Wales, the Welsh Government (2019) are invested in the Expressive Arts Area of Learning and Experience as the entitlement of all learners. This is yet to be implemented and evaluated; but school based provision may not be an adequate solution for all care-

experienced young people. Many young people in care have difficult relationships with schools, characterised by transitory placements and educational pathways (Girling, 2019), and face barriers to engaging with in-school sports opportunities (Quarmby *et al*, 2019) and with accessing after-school extra-curricular activities (Woodhouse, 2018). Additionally, they are overrepresented in Pupil Referral Units, which can only deliver a restricted curriculum that may be unable to support this renewed emphasis on art and culture (Smith, 2019).

Young people, foster carers and facilitators positioned the programme as a safe space, with one participant describing it as 'one big family'. The low numbers of young people, expertise of the staff, involvement of foster carers, and provision focussed on those with experience of care could not be mirrored in a school setting. The opportunity to build peer relationships without the need to manage identities and negotiate the stigma of 'in care' status seemed to be an important factor of the programme, and the need to invest in social spaces for care experienced young people has been advocated for in previous studies (Rogers, 2017; Mannay *et al*, 2015). For this form of provision to be extended it would need significant investment from governments, the third sector and individual arts-based organisations.

Internationally, care-experienced young people face complex barriers and inequality in outcomes. As such this paper calls for practitioners such as social workers, teachers, and independent reviewing officers to actively signpost arts-based, and other extracurricular opportunities to young people. This may be particularly pertinent for young people in residential care or other settings where they do not have the individualised support of foster carers. Engagement with the arts can be transformational (Thomson *et al*, 2018), but the ways in which programmes are designed to best support the needs of care-experienced young people also needs to be considered. With careful planning and effective resourcing, there is a potential for care-experienced young people 'becoming more confident in being themselves' and 'breaking free' from the marginalisation that often characterises their wider educational and social trajectories.

<u>Acknowledgements</u>

The authors would like to acknowledge the Wales Millennium Centre, for awarding the funding for this research project. We would like to mention Sarah Roberts, Marc Jaffrey and Elan Isaac for their guidance and support. The Fostering Network staff involved in supporting this research were Elizabeth Bryan, Programme Manager and Clare Sage, Programme Officer. We also worked with Maria Boffey, Head of Operations, Charlotte Wooders, Programme Officer, and Colin Turner, Director of The Fostering Network in Wales.

The authors extend thanks to individuals and organisations from the creative industries that were involved and to Martine Palmer from Action for Children who supported the project activities. Administrative support and project guidance was provided by CASCADE:

Children's Social Care Research and Development Centre. Asma Khan provided transcription services. Finally, the authors would like to thank the young people, foster carers and facilitators who took part in the research activities, without which this study would not have been possible.

References

Andrews, K. (2014) Culture and poverty: harnessing the power of arts, culture and heritage to promote social justice in Wales, Cardiff: Welsh Government.

Bowlby, J. (1988) Developmental psychiatry comes of age, *American Journal of Psychiatry*, 145(1): 1-10.

Brady, E. & Gilligan, R. (2020) The role of agency in shaping the educational journeys of care-experienced adults: insights from a life course study of education and care, *Children and Society*, 34(2): 121-135.

Braun, V. & Clarke, V. (2006) Using thematic analysis in psychology, *Qualitative Research in Psychology*, 3(2): 77–101.

British Educational Research Association (2018) *Ethical guidelines for educational research*, London: British Educational Research Association.

Coholic, D., Fraser, M., Robinson, B. & Lougheed, S. (2012) Promoting resilience within child protection: the suitability of arts-based and experiential group programs for children in care, *Social Work with Groups*, 35(4): 345-361.

Corbett, J. (1998) 'Voice' in emancipatory research: imaginative listening, in: P. Clough & L. Barton (Eds) *Articulating with difficulty: research voices in inclusive education*, London: Paul Chapman.

Crossick, G. & Kaszynska, P. (2016) *Understanding the value of arts and culture: the AHRC cultural value project*, Swindon: Arts and Humanities Research Council.

Cunningham, M.J. & Diversi, M. (2012) Aging out: Youths' perspectives on foster care and the transition to independence, *Qualitative Social Work*, 12(5): 587-602.

Delamont, S. & Atkinson, P. (1995) *Fighting familiarity: essays on education and ethnography*, Cresskill, NJ: Hampton Press.

Emond, R. (2014) Longing to belong: Children in residential care and their experiences of peer relationships at school and in the children's home, *Child & Family Social Work*, 19 (2): 194-202.

Gallacher, L. & Gallagher, M. (2008) Methodological immaturity in childhood research? Thinking through participatory methods, *Childhood*, 5(4): 499–516.

Gibson, L. & Edwards, D. (2015) *Valuing participation: the cultural and everyday activities of young people in care*, Leicester: University of Leicester.

Gilligan, R. (1999) Enhancing the resilience of children and young people in public care by mentoring their talents and interests, *Children and Family Social Work*, 4: 187-196.

Girling, R. (2018) Yet another change: The experience of movement for children and young people looked after, in: D. Mannay, A. Rees & L. Roberts (Eds) *Children and young people 'looked after'? Education, intervention and the everyday culture of care in Wales*, Cardiff: University of Wales Press.

Hammersley, M. & Atkinson P. (2007) *Ethnography: Principles in practice* (3rd ed.), London: Taylor and Francis.

Harker, R., Dobel-Ober, D, Berridge, D & Sinclair, R. (2004) *Taking care of education: An evaluation of the education of looked after children,* London: National Children's Bureau.

Hopkins, G. (2004) *That Friday feeling*. Community care [online]. Available at: https://www.communitycare.co.uk/2004/06/25/that-friday-feeling/ [Accessed: 15 November 2020].

Howard, J. K. & Eckhardt, S. A. (2005) Why action research? The leadership role of the library media specialist, *Library Media Connection*, 24(2): 32–34.

Ivinson, G. &. Murphy, P. (2003) Boys don't write romance: the construction of knowledge and social gender identities in English classrooms, *Pedagogy, Culture & Society*, 11(1): 89-111.

Lewin, K. (1946) Action research and minority problems', *Journal of Social Issues*, 2(4): 34–46.

Lougheed, S. & Coholic, D. (2018) Arts-based mindfulness group work with youth aging out of foster care, *Social Work with Groups*, 41(1-2): 165-178.

Luke, N., Sinclair, I., Woolgar, M. & Sebba, J. (2014) What works in preventing and treating poor mental health in looked after children? London: NSPCC Impact and Evidence Series.

Macdonald, A. (2020) *An integrated approach to improving educational outcomes for looked after children in Wales*, Cardiff: Welsh Government.

Mannay, D. (2010) Making the familiar strange: Can visual research methods render the familiar setting more perceptible? *Qualitative Research*, 10(1): 91-111.

Mannay, D., Staples, E., Hallett, S., Roberts, L., Rees, A., Evans, R. & Andrews, D. (2015) Understanding the educational experiences and opinions, attainment, achievement and aspirations of looked after children in Wales, Cardiff: Welsh Government.

Mannay, D., Evans, R., Staples, E., Hallett, S., Roberts, L., Rees, A. & Andrews, D. (2017a) The consequences of being labelled 'looked-after': Exploring the educational experiences of looked-after children and young people in Wales, *British Educational Research Journal*, 43(4): 683-699.

Mannay, D., Staples, E. & Edwards, V. (2017b) Visual methodologies, sand and psychoanalysis: employing creative participatory techniques to explore the educational experiences of mature students and children in care, *Visual Studies*, 32(4): 345-358.

Mannay, D., Smith, P., Jennings, S., Turney, C. & Davies, P. (2018) *The value of cultural and creative engagement: Understanding the experiences and opinions of care-experienced young people and foster carers in Wales*. Cardiff: Wales Millennium Centre.

Morriss, L. (2016) Dirty secrets and being 'strange': using ethnomethodology to fight familiarity, *Qualitative Research*, 16(5): 526-540.

Nsonwu, M., Dennison, S. & Long, J. (2015) Foster care chronicles: Use of the arts for teens aging out of the foster care system, *Journal of Creativity in Mental Health*, 10(1): 18-33.

Office for Public Management. (2013) Evaluation of CCE/NCB arts and cultural activities project with looked after children: Summary report to Creativity, Culture and Education, London: OPM.

O'Higgins, A., Sebba, J. & Luke, N. (2015) What is the relationship between being in care and the educational outcomes of children? An international systematic review, University of Oxford: Rees Centre, Research in Fostering and Education.

Peeran, U. (2016) An investigation into the impact of arts and cultural education on children looked after, London: Coram.

Plüddemann, A., Aronson, J.K, Onakpoya, I., Heneghan, C. & Mahtani, K.R. (2018) Redefining rapid reviews: a flexible framework for restricted systematic reviews, *BMJ Evidence Based Medicine*, 23 (6): 201-203.

Quarmby, T., Sandford, R. & Elliot, E. (2019) 'I actually used to like PE, but not now': understanding care-experienced young people's (dis)engagement with physical education, *Sport, Education and Society*, 24(7): 714-726.

Rees, A. (2019) The daily lived experience of foster care, in: D. Mannay, A. Rees & L. Roberts (Eds) *Children and young people 'looked after'? Education, intervention and the everyday culture of care in Wales*, Cardiff: University of Wales Press.

Rees, P. & Munro, A. (2019) Promoting the education of children in care: Reflections of children and carers who have experienced 'success', in: D. Mannay, A. Rees & L. Roberts (Eds) *Children and young people 'looked after'? Education, intervention and the everyday culture of care in Wales*, Cardiff: University of Wales Press.

Robinson, Y., Paraskevopouloub, A. & Hollingworth, S. (2019) Developing 'active citizens': Arts Award, creativity and impact, *British Educational Research Journal* DOI: 10.1002/berj.3558.

Rogers, J. (2017) 'Different' and 'devalued': managing the stigma of foster care with the benefit of peer support, *British Journal of Social Work*, 47 (4), pp. 1078-1093.

Ruch, G., Winter, K., Cree, V., Hallett, S., Morrison, F. & Hadfield, M. (2017) Making meaningful connections: using insights from social pedagogy in statutory child and family social work practice, *Child and Family Social Work*, 22: 1015–1023.

Salmon, D. & Rickaby, C. (2014) City of one: a qualitative study examining the participation of young people in care in a theatre and music initiative, *Children and Society*, 28: 30-41.

Sebba, J., Berridge, D., Luke, N., Fletcher, J., Bell, K., Strand, S., Thomas, S., Sinclaire, I. & O'Higgins, A. (2015) *The educational progress of looked after children in England: linking care and educational data*, University of Bristol: Oxford Rees Centre for Research in Fostering and Education.

Schofield, G. & Beek, M. (2005) Providing a secure base: parenting children in long-term foster family care, *Attach Hum Dev*, 7(1): 3-25.

Shinebourne, P. & Smith, J.A. (2010) The communicative power of metaphors: An analysis and interpretation of metaphors in accounts of the experience of addiction, *Psychology and Psychotherapy: Theory, Research and Practice*, 83(1): 59-73.

Smith, P. (2019) A view from a pupil referral unit: using participatory methods with young people in an education setting, in: D. Mannay, A. Rees & L. Roberts (Eds) *Children and young people 'looked after'? Education, intervention and the everyday culture of care in Wales*, Cardiff: University of Wales Press.

Thomson, P., Hall, C., Earl, L. & Geppert, C. (2018) Subject choice as everyday accommodation/resistance: why students in England (still) choose the arts, *Critical Studies in Education* DOI: 10.1080/17508487.2018.1525754

Thomson, P., Hall, C., Earl, L. & Geppert, C. (2019) The pedagogical logics of arts-rich schools: a Bourdieusian analysis, *British Journal of Sociology of Education*, 40(2): 239-253.

Ulset, G. (2016) Vennskap - perspektiver og tilnærminger blant ungdom i barneverninstitusjon. *Tidsskriftet Norges Barnevern*, 93 (2).

Welsh Government. (2016) Light springs through the dark: a vision for culture in Wales. Cardiff: Welsh Government.

Welsh Government. (2019) *Draft statutory guidance – area of learning and experiences – expressive arts*, Cardiff: Welsh Government.

Welsh Government. (2020) Local Labour Force Survey/Annual Population Survey: Ethnicity by Welsh local authority. https://statswales.gov.wales/Catalogue/Equality-and-
Diversity/Ethnicity/ethnicity-by-area-ethnicgroup.

Woodhouse, C. (2018) Exploring the physical education and school sport experiences of looked-after children and young people, PhD thesis, Loughborough University, Loughborough.

Wyness, M. & Lang, P. (2016) The social and emotional dimensions of schooling: A case study in challenging the 'barriers to learning', *British Educational Research Journal*, 42(6): 1041-1055.

Wyse, D. & Ferrari, A. (2014) Creativity and education: comparing the national curricula of the states of the European Union and the United Kingdom, *British Educational Research Journal*, 41(1): 30-47.

Notes

Arts Award facilitates young people to develop arts and leadership talents. In this
programme the Arts Award was offered at an introductory level and young people
recorded their reflections about the activities they participated in within a diary, which

- was used to evidence their learning to receive the award certificate. For further information see: http://www.artsaward.org.uk/site/?id=64
- Foster carers were involved in the interviews with young people as a condition of the approval for the study required by Cardiff University's Social Sciences Research Ethics Committee.
- One young person was the biological child of a foster carer and foster sibling of a young person in her parent's care.

