

Online Research @ Cardiff

This is an Open Access document downloaded from ORCA, Cardiff University's institutional repository: <https://orca.cardiff.ac.uk/id/eprint/156313/>

This is the author's version of a work that was submitted to / accepted for publication.

Citation for final published version:

Sapsford, Devin J. ORCID: <https://orcid.org/0000-0002-6763-7909>, Stewart, Douglas I., Sinnett, Dannielle E., Burke, Ian T., Cleall, Peter J. ORCID: <https://orcid.org/0000-0002-4005-5319>, Harbottle, Michael J. ORCID: <https://orcid.org/0000-0002-6443-5340>, Mayes, Will, Owen, Nia, Sardo, Ana Margarida and Weightman, Andrew ORCID: <https://orcid.org/0000-0002-6671-2209> 2023. Circular economy landfills for temporary storage and treatment of mineral-rich wastes. Waste and Resource Management 176 (2) , pp. 77-93. 10.1680/jwarm.22.00008 file

Publishers page: <http://dx.doi.org/10.1680/jwarm.22.00008>
<<http://dx.doi.org/10.1680/jwarm.22.00008>>

Please note:

Changes made as a result of publishing processes such as copy-editing, formatting and page numbers may not be reflected in this version. For the definitive version of this publication, please refer to the published source. You are advised to consult the publisher's version if you wish to cite this paper.

This version is being made available in accordance with publisher policies.

See

<http://orca.cf.ac.uk/policies.html> for usage policies. Copyright and moral rights for publications made available in ORCA are retained by the copyright holders.



1 **Circular economy landfills for temporary storage and treatment of mineral-**

2 **rich wastes**

3 Devin Sapsford, Doug Stewart, Danni Sinnett, Ian Burke, Peter Cleall, Michael Harbottle, Will Mayes, Nia
4 Owen, Ana Margarida Sardo, Andrew Weightman

5 Devin J. Sapsford – School of Engineering, Cardiff University, Cardiff, CF24 3AA, UK [ORCID: 0000-0002-6763-7909](https://orcid.org/0000-0002-6763-7909)
6 sapsforddj@cardiff.ac.uk

7 Douglas I. Stewart - School of Civil Engineering, University of Leeds, Leeds, LS2 9JT, UK - [ORCID: 0000-0001-5144-1234](https://orcid.org/0000-0001-5144-1234)
8 d.i.stewart@leeds.ac.uk

9 Dannielle E. Sinnett - Centre for Sustainable Planning and Environments, University of the West of England, Bristol BS3
10 1NQ, UK [ORCID: 0000-0003-4757-3597](https://orcid.org/0000-0003-4757-3597) danielle.sinnett@uwe.ac.uk

11 Ian T. Burke - School of Earth and Environment, University of Leeds, Leeds LS2 9JT, UK [ORCID: 0000-0002-0484-568X](https://orcid.org/0000-0002-0484-568X)
12 i.t.burke@leeds.ac.uk

13 Peter J Cleall - School of Engineering, Cardiff University, Cardiff, CF24 3AA, UK [ORCID: 0000-0002-4005-5319](https://orcid.org/0000-0002-4005-5319)
14 cleall@cardiff.ac.uk

15 Michael J Harbottle - School of Engineering, Cardiff University, Cardiff, CF24 3AA, UK [ORCID: 0000-0002-6443-5340](https://orcid.org/0000-0002-6443-5340)
16 harbottlem@cardiff.ac.uk

17 Will Mayes - Department of Geography, Geology and Environment, University of Hull, Hull HU6 7RX, UK [ORCID: 0000-](https://orcid.org/0000-0002-1864-9057)
18 [0002-1864-9057](https://orcid.org/0000-0002-1864-9057) w.mayes@hull.ac.uk

19 Nia Owen - School of Engineering, Cardiff University, Cardiff, CF24 3AA, UK [ORCID: 0000-0003-2532-8689](https://orcid.org/0000-0003-2532-8689)
20 owenn14@cardiff.ac.uk

21 Ana Margarida Sardo - Science Communication Unit, University of the West of England, Bristol BS3 1NQ, UK [ORCID:](https://orcid.org/0000-0002-3816-3396)
22 [0000-0002-3816-3396](https://orcid.org/0000-0002-3816-3396) margarida.sardo@uwe.ac.uk

23 Andrew Weightman School of Biosciences, Cardiff University, Cardiff, CF10 3AX Cardiff University, Cardiff, CF24 3AA,
24 UK: [ORCID: 0000-0002-6671-2209](https://orcid.org/0000-0002-6671-2209) weightman@cardiff.ac.uk

25 14th March, 2022

26 Word Count: 9,178

27

28 **List of Figures**

29 **Figure 1** Schematic diagram illustrating how hydraulic and geochemical gradients involved in natural
30 supergene ore-forming processes might be exploited in an ASPIRE resource recovery repository

31 **Figure 2** The standard waste hierarchy from Article 4 of the revised Waste Framework (Directive
32 2008/98/EC) (left) with the suggested replacement (right) for mineral-rich wastes which contain
33 leachable components. The ASPIRE repository concept is the proposed technological concept to
34 achieve this outcome. Importantly, the concept does not seek to displace sustainable behaviours higher
35 in the waste hierarchy but seeks to use temporary storage and treatment as a means to close materials
36 loops and prevent permanent loss of materials to landfill.

37 **Figure 3** Consumption of plant exudates by rhizosphere microorganisms: (a) Near total consumption
38 in an establish topsoil horizon (b) Incomplete consumption in revegetated waste allowing interaction of
39 exudates with underlying waste

40

41 **Abstract**

42 Many countries face serious strategic challenges with the future supply of both aggregates and critical
43 elements. Yet, at the same time, they must sustainably manage continued multimillion tonne annual
44 arisings of mineral-dominated wastes from mining and industry. In an antithesis of Circular Economy
45 principles, these wastes continue to be landfilled despite often comprising valuable components, such
46 as critical metals, soil macronutrients and mineral components which sequester atmospheric CO₂. In
47 this paper, the authors aim to introduce a new concept for value recovery from mineral-rich wastes
48 where materials are temporarily stored and cleaned in landfill-like repositories designed to be mined
49 later. The time in storage is utilised for remediating contaminated materials and separating and
50 concentrating valuable components. It is proposed that this could be achieved through engineering the
51 repository to accelerate “lithomimetic” processes, i.e. those mimicking natural supergene processes
52 responsible for the formation of secondary ores. This paper summarises the concept and justifications

53 and outlines fundamental aspects of how this new concept might be applied to the design of future
54 repositories. The proposed concept aims to end the current “linear” landfilling of mineral-rich wastes
55 in favour of reuse as aggregates and ores.

56 **Keywords:** Waste management & disposal; Waste valorisation; Sustainability; Remediation; Recycled
57 material; Leaching; Landfills; Industrial wastes; UNSDG 9; UNSDG 11; UNSDG 12, UNSDG 13

58 **1. Introduction**

59 The aim of this paper is to introduce and explain a new technology concept for the management and
60 recovery of resources from high-volume mineral-rich wastes. There are recognised strategic challenges
61 with the future supply of aggregates, critical minerals and elements (Hayes et al., 2018; Gunn et al.,
62 2008; World Bank, 2017; Bazilian, 2018; MPA, 2018; EU, 2020; Sovacool et al, 2020). At the same
63 time, individual nations must sustainably manage the multimillion tonne annual waste arisings from
64 various economic sectors. Mineral-rich wastes are typically composed of a diverse range of mineral-
65 dominated materials that include waste rock and tailings materials from mining, residues and slags from
66 metal production, combustion ashes (fossil fuel, biomass, municipal solid waste incineration (MSWI)),
67 construction and demolition wastes, and contaminated dredgings (inland and coastal). Krausmann et al
68 (2017) estimate that the global solid waste flow was 9.7 Pg/yr ($\pm 14\%$) for 2010, and that only 37% of
69 non-metallic minerals in end-of-life outflows from stocks were recycled. Recent mineral-rich waste
70 arisings statistics are not readily available but illustrative EU data (<https://ec.europa.eu/eurostat/>) reveal
71 some 1,537,090,000 t of mineral and solidified waste arisings in 2008 and 620,900,000 t of mining and
72 quarrying waste arisings in 2018. Although some of these materials do have accepted markets, these
73 are often limited to specific applications or the demand for the material may be small compared to
74 current (and projected increases in) production. Therefore, most of these materials are currently treated
75 as wastes, which continue to be disposed of in landfills or other engineered impoundments. This is
76 despite often containing valuable resources such as elevated concentrations of critical metals, soil
77 macronutrients and useful mineral components, some of which actively drawdown atmospheric CO₂
78 (Sapsford et al., 2017, 2019; Spooren et al., 2020; Antonkiewicz et al., 2020; Riley et al., 2020).

79 Although for many countries around the world, engineered sanitary landfill remains an aspiration for
80 solid waste management, other countries and supranational bodies such as the European Union are
81 looking towards ending reliance on landfill and are transitioning towards a circular economy (CE).
82 There are many definitions of CE and its precise meaning remains contested (see for example Kirchherr
83 et al, (2017); Korhonen et al (2018); Kalmykova et al (2019)), and critiqued (Corvellec et al., 2022).
84 However, the author’s usage here is in line with common themes (particularly in the EU framing of CE;
85 McDowall et al, 2017) that include (i) closing materials loops through recycling and increasing resource
86 and materials efficiency and (ii) “using cyclical materials flows, renewable energy sources and
87 cascading-type energy flows” (Korhonen et al; 2018). A key part of this (following the waste hierarchy)
88 involves reduction in waste production, reuse, and recycling. Thus, opportunities to recycle, or upcycle
89 wastes are actively sought.

90 Despite enormous arisings, mineral wastes do not commonly feature prominently in public-facing CE
91 discourse. For example, despite England’s “Our Waste, Our Resources” strategy focusing on the
92 development of CE and referencing the importance of tackling residual wastes and producer
93 responsibilities, many of the more tangible commitments relate to issues such as packaging, litter, fly-
94 tipping and residential recycling (HM Government, 2018). Another example is that extractive and
95 primary manufacturing industry wastes do not feature in the “butterfly diagram” used extensively in
96 communication of the CE principle (Ellen MacArthur Foundation, 2013). It is of note that mineral-rich
97 wastes are overlooked, considering the scale of production and the embodied carbon in such wastes
98 (Gomes et al., 2016; Zhai et al., 2021). This perhaps because in the popular imagination recycling of
99 post-consumer goods holds sway, whereas many pre-consumer wastes that result from the production
100 processes are ‘out of sight’ and therefore ‘out of mind’.

101 Pre-consumer wastes split into two broad groups, clean unmixed materials, such as cardboard packaging
102 and metal swarf, which are easy to separate and have very high recycling rates; and, highly mixed
103 materials, often requiring decontamination, which are difficult to process, and therefore, are currently
104 uneconomic to recycle despite containing valuable components. Within many industries there are
105 efforts to view wastes as “secondary” or alternative raw materials, in keeping with the industrial

106 symbiosis concept, where one industry's waste (or water/energy) serves as raw materials for the next
107 or others in a cluster (Chertow and Ehrenfeld, 2012). Despite this, mineral-rich wastes are typically still
108 landfilled and not used as secondary raw material. This can be attributed to three critical issues: (i) The
109 technical or environmental constraints related to deleterious leachable components (e.g. Luo et al,
110 2019); (ii) The large volume of arisings and their low economic value as secondary materials; (iii) High-
111 volume end-uses for the secondary material need to be (but are typically not) contemporaneous with
112 their production. Expounding the latter points, bulk materials, whose unit value is low can be described
113 as having a high "place value" (Shaw et al., 2013). This means that the financial and environmental
114 costs incurred by transportation restrict their use geographically. Thus, if local end-use demand is not
115 contemporaneous with waste production, storage becomes a solution to balance supply and demand.
116 As a result of these constraints, landfill is currently the typical destination for most mineral wastes.
117 Furthermore, there may be some reticence for use of secondary material where there may be (perceived
118 or actual) variation in composition and uncertainty over geotechnical or geochemical performance
119 leading to a preference for virgin materials (See Perkins et al (2021) and references therein).

120 The deportment of value (cf. "deportment" of metals in ore) is an important consideration for value
121 recovery from wastes (Sapsford et al., 2019). The valuable target component(s) are either those that can
122 be separated from the bulk material (direct recovery e.g. by leaching), or the residual bulk material,
123 after removal of contaminants that prevent reuse (indirect recovery), or a combination of both (see
124 Sapsford et al., 2017). There exists a very large body of research on hydrometallurgical,
125 biohydrometallurgical and pyrometallurgical processes for extraction of valuable resource from
126 mineral-rich industrial and mining wastes (see for example reviews by Jadhav and Hocheng, 2012;
127 Sethurajan et al, 2018; Gunarathne et al, 2022). However, the sustainability (using the definition based
128 on maintenance of genuine wealth, Arrow et al., (2004)) and economic viability of many of these
129 processes requires careful consideration. To remove these metals, which are present at low
130 concentrations, has consequences for increased energy demand, commensurate carbon footprint and
131 economic cost over and above that for element recovery from primary ores (Sapsford et al, 2019). The
132 energy demand and environmental cost of element recovery for low concentration ores (and by

133 extension of the same logic, wastes) is high. This can be illustrated by the example of platinum, where
134 extraction from very low concentration primary ores is common and the embodied energy exceeds 100
135 GJ kg⁻¹ and embodied carbon is 10,000 kg kg⁻¹ (Gutowski et al., 2013). Thus, when considering direct
136 and indirect value recovery from mineral-rich wastes, the energy required for the separation, be it of
137 resource from residue, or contaminant from secondary raw material, needs to be from renewable sources
138 to be sustainable.

139

140 **2. ASPIRE: A new concept for temporary storage and treatment of waste**

141 The authors propose a step-change in waste repository design for mineral-rich wastes, with a change in
142 focus from solely environmental and health protection to one where environmental protection and
143 resource recovery are designed in. The concept involves Accelerated Supergene Processes In
144 Repository Engineering (ASPIRE) and the authors refer to waste repositories following this paradigm
145 as “ASPIRE repositories”. Supergene processes are natural lithospheric weathering and pedogenetic
146 processes involving downward percolation of meteoric water (i.e., derived from precipitation) and metal
147 leaching from unsaturated metalliferous rock (Lelong et al., 1976) often enhanced by organic derived
148 acids and ligands. Metals are then deposited as an enriched metalliferous secondary ore below the
149 groundwater level during the transition to more chemically reducing conditions (Figure 1(a)).

150 The ASPIRE concept is a “nature-based solution” (Song et al., 2019), which involves mimicking these
151 naturally occurring lithospheric mechanisms, such “lithomimicry” aims to achieve the same effect but
152 with waste materials (Figure 1(b)). Interestingly, supergene alteration has been noted to occur in wastes
153 such as mine tailings and smelter residues (Dill, 2015). Furthermore, the authors propose expanding the
154 supergene concept to include other value propositions including phosphate recovery, carbon
155 sequestration and the decontamination of the waste matrix. Because natural supergene processes can
156 take millennia, there is a requirement to engineer the processes to accelerate them to anthropogenically
157 relevant timescales. This will require innovative biogeochemical engineering such that processes

158 remove potential contaminants/resources from the bulk material matrix (leaving a cleaned residue) and
159 concentrate them within an anthropogenic ore zone over a prolonged period of waste storage.

160 ASPIRE repositories would be designed to significantly accelerate the ore-formation from the
161 geological timescales of natural supergene process to the order of years in the engineered system.
162 Critically, being a fully lined waste repository system, the external environment remains protected.
163 Inspired by research observations of revegetated industrial wastes (Bray et al., 2018), the ASPIRE
164 concept could also intersect with phytoremediation, phytocapping and phytomining concepts. Here,
165 environmental leaching agents (“lixiviants” in hydrometallurgical parlance) generated from plant roots
166 (which produce low molecular weight compounds that act as ligands for metals) accelerate mobilisation
167 of metals. Solar and self-powered electrokinetic and electrochemical phenomena are proposed for
168 acceleration of solubilisation and transport, followed by biogeochemical trapping of metals/elements,
169 potentially as new ores. Whilst it is impossible to “short-change” fundamental thermodynamics which
170 dictate the minimum energy requirement of separation of species from a parent material, it should be
171 possible to provide that energy in a sustainable way from the solar energy incident on the storage site
172 (insolation flux), directly via photovoltaic power systems or indirectly via photosynthesis (and the
173 environmental exergy cascade), albeit sacrificing the process intensity by prolonging the timeframe for
174 the process.

175 The central tenet of the ASPIRE concept is that the “time in storage” is used for material
176 cleaning/resource concentration. This has the dual benefits of facilitating future resource recovery and
177 defines the service-life for the barrier system. The dormant waste undergoes processes to (i) concentrate
178 valuable components (e.g. critical metals, phosphate) as an anthropogenic ore to facilitate their future
179 recovery, and (ii) concurrently decontaminate residual mineral material so as to make it available as a
180 bank of material to drawdown for “soft” end-uses in agriculture, forestry, greenspace, landscaping,
181 habitat creation (Song et al., 2019) and/or as a cement/concrete additive or replacement aggregate. As
182 such, the ASPIRE concept seeks to reconceptualise waste repositories as “temporary storage systems”
183 or “resource banks”. This could involve regional ASPIRE repositories as hubs which import a range of
184 mineral-rich wastes arising in the region, in the UK context potentially contributing to the Managed

185 Aggregate Supply System. Alternatively, smaller site-specific repositories could be developed.
186 Importantly, the idea is not necessarily to displace any existing sustainable recycling activities for
187 mineral-rich wastes but to provide a practicable CE solution for materials that would otherwise go to
188 conventional landfill for lack of any other viable means to recover value. The authors suggest that this
189 concept thus fits into a modified waste hierarchy as shown in Fig 2.

190

191 **3. The Case for Temporary Storage and *in situ* treatment**

192 **3.1 Existing concepts of temporary storage and ‘End of Waste’**

193 Temporary storage for MSW landfill has been proposed such that stored waste undergoes processes to
194 accelerate the “stabilisation” of the waste, to facilitate recovery of materials from the landfill mass or
195 the use of the land (Jones et al., 2013). The accelerated stabilisation is achieved either via active aeration
196 to promote the breakdown of organics (Ritzkowski and Stegmann, 2012), or the recirculation of landfill
197 leachate to accelerate anaerobic process and methane production (Reinhart and Al-Yousfi, 1996;
198 Warith, 2002), ultimately allowing a compressed timeline for land restoration or the recovery of
199 materials from the landfill mass. Temporary or ‘interim’ storage of municipal solid waste (MSW) has
200 been undertaken in Germany, in response to lack of a receiving market. Several million tonnes of
201 Mechanical Biological Treatment (MBT) sorted waste was stored in interim landfills (Wagner and
202 Bilitewski, 2009). Temporary storage has also been mooted for e-wastes (Kahhat and Kavazanjian,
203 2010). Despite these examples, the practice of temporary storage has not taken hold more widely.
204 Functioning markets for recyclates are important so that there is contemporaneous demand for
205 materials. Yet even these relatively high-value recyclates are susceptible to market disruption. In 2017,
206 China banned the import of most plastic waste, this resulted in a sharp reduction in global plastic waste
207 trade flow (Wen et al., 2021). The fact that market volatility is commonplace in markets for relatively
208 high-value recycled resources emphasises the challenges of recycling low-value, high-volume and
209 contaminated mineral-wastes and why they are currently landfilled.

210 There has been some success in England and Wales in utilising secondary materials, this is also
211 encouraged by a levy on virgin aggregates. “End of waste” (EoW) criteria have been developed for
212 some mineral-rich wastes to facilitate reuse: notably, quality protocols developed in England and Wales
213 by the Environment Agency and the Waste and Resources Action Programme (WRAP) for steel slag
214 and pulverised fuel (coal) ash, furnace bottom ash, as well as a Code of Practice developed by MIBAAA
215 (Manufacturers of IBA Aggregates Association in conjunction with the Environment Agency) for
216 incinerator (MSWI) bottom ash. These approaches are framed around Article 6 (1) of the European
217 Waste Framework Directive (2008/98/EC) which sets out end of waste status, and the conditions that if
218 met enable waste which has been recycled or recovered to cease to be classed as waste. The substance
219 or object must meet the following conditions: (i) It is to be used for specific purposes (ii) Market/
220 demand exists (iii) Achieves the technical requirements for the specific purposes and meets existing
221 standards and legislation applicable to products (iv) Its use will not lead to adverse environmental or
222 human health impacts. Thus, the materials referred to above need to demonstrate compliance with the
223 quality protocol framework, as well as an appropriate standard such as BS EN 12620, Aggregates for
224 concrete, and associated testing. In addition, markets may well be restricted, for example the Quality
225 Protocol for PFA allows its use in bound or grout applications only.

226 Despite these examples, many mineral-rich wastes from mining and industry are still largely overlooked
227 and thus poorly integrated into current CE strategies and developing policy (Cisternas et al., 2022).
228 There is a lack of practicable, economically viable and sustainable technologies for returning these
229 resources to the CE and the temporal and geographical dislocation between production and end-use
230 (Cisternas et al., 2022). Providing a solution to the temporal dislocation is a key advantage of the
231 ASPIRE concept, that once the material is cleaned, it stays in hibernation until end-user market arises.
232 There are historical examples that demonstrate over a decadal scale, materials often thought as valueless
233 waste later become highly valued resources, for example due to advances in recovery technologies,
234 decreases in ore-grade or increase in value of specific components which were previously non-
235 economic. For example, the re-mining of Pb/Zn spoil in 1970s / 80s in the northern Pennines (UK) for

236 fluorspar and Ba minerals, driven by demand for F in chemical industries and Ba for oil drilling fluids
237 (Dunham, 1985).

238 It is noteworthy that temporary storage and treatment as a concept is conceptually similar to the
239 “cluster” approach developed in the UK to facilitate the remediation of contaminated soils where a
240 number of sites are in close proximity. The sites share a “hub” for the central decontamination /
241 treatment of contaminated soils (CL:AIRE, 2021). This is similar to the concept proposed here, albeit
242 these remediation hub timescales are shorter, the relative intensification of remediation is economically
243 viable because of the value of land redevelopment.

244 **3.2 Future generations and conventional landfill**

245 Landfill remains the destination for wastes that cannot be combusted, composted or separated into
246 recyclates for which there is a current market value. Landfill philosophy has evolved from “dilute and
247 disperse” to a “store and contain” containment strategy, with the waste environmentally isolated by use
248 of engineered top and bottom liners (e.g. Cisternas et al., 2022). Allen (2001) critiques containment
249 strategies, raising concerns over the durability of liner systems and problems with clay liners.
250 Landfilling simply postpones the release of contaminants, as for future generations it is not a question
251 of “if” but simply “when” the containment systems for landfilled industrial wastes succumb to natural
252 degradation. This then leads to important questions about intergenerational equity for management of
253 wastes. Put simply, should the current generation be burdening future generations with pollution issues
254 from current waste production? This appears contrary to the sustainability agenda and UN sustainable
255 development goals (United Nations, 2015).

256 Whilst accepting that many of the drivers for diversion of mineral-rich wastes to landfill remain, the
257 authors contend that a sustainable and ethical philosophy would be “store, contain, clean and
258 concentrate” to allow future recovery. It is notable that future recovery of residues from the repositories
259 would likely be in the context of a decarbonised economy, thus future exploitation will likely be of low
260 carbon intensity.

261 It is interesting to consider temporary landfilling of waste in the context of a CE. A critical component
262 of a move to a CE is increased resource efficiency via the provision of a service-based economy. The
263 current landfill paradigm is a linear model, often with associated ownership/license surrender by the
264 operator. Where used, facility gate fees cover operational costs but neither the original waste producer
265 nor the landfill operator is paying (post-permit surrender) for the ultimate environmental impact of the
266 waste (i.e. these long-term impacts remain market externalities). Applying the ASPIRE concept changes
267 the landfill operator's function to the provision of a storage and remediation service, and the production
268 of secondary raw materials which will ultimately be removed from site, thus removing the long-term
269 environmental hazard.

270

271 **3.3 Alignment with current waste legislation**

272 To achieve a CE, it is essential to re-use and recycle materials from waste for future use in new
273 buildings, infrastructure, products etc, and to keep these in productive use as long as is feasible. Thus,
274 the treatment of waste materials to facilitate this is vital to deliver a CE. The Waste (England and Wales)
275 Regulations 2011 introduced a duty for waste importers, producers, waste carriers and waste
276 management facilities to “take all measures available to it as are reasonable in the circumstances” to
277 apply the waste hierarchy when transferring waste: (i) Prevention (ii) Preparation for re-use (iii)
278 Recycling (iv) Recovery (v) Disposal. The crux of this is the term “reasonable”, which ultimately means
279 that aspects such as technical, economic and environmental aspects are considered in order to make a
280 judgement. Despite this legislation, landfill remains a commonly used option for mineral-rich wastes.

281 Whilst temporary storage and treatment may not be feasible for all landfilled wastes, the authors suggest
282 that it would be a practicable and sustainable solution for the many mineral-rich materials amenable to
283 processing via leaching. Because the ASPIRE concept involves waste materials being reprocessed into
284 products (clean residue and anthropogenic ore) it is in essence a recycling technology. However, the
285 confounding issues of the long-term storage and processing whilst stored in a “landfill-like” repository
286 will likely lead to challenge of its status as recycling technology in the eyes of the waste regulations.

287 At minimum, an ASPIRE repository could be viewed as providing a technology option at the base of
288 the waste hierarchy, replacing conventional landfill – and this may be a more regulatory acceptable
289 approach for early adoption of the technology. The Environment Act 2021 provides some potential
290 opportunities for the ASPIRE concept to gain acceptance in the UK. First, it confers power to the
291 Government to set regulations on producer responsibilities, including waste prevention and reduction.
292 It also enables regulations related to the re-use and recovery of materials.

293

294 **4. Potential candidate materials for ASPIRE repositories**

295 *4.1 Combustion Ashes*

296 Alkaline combustion ashes, bottom ash and fly ash/Air Pollution Control Residue (APCr) from
297 Biomass, MSWI, sewage sludge, co-firing of biomass/coal will be important wastes in the UK and
298 internationally for the conceivable future. By 2050, global arisings of biomass ash will be of the order
299 of 480 Mtpa (Vassilev et al., 2013). Furthermore, the UK's Sixth Carbon Budget (CCC, 2020)
300 highlights the important role of Bioenergy with Carbon Capture and Storage (BECCS) as one of the
301 key technology options for the UK in limiting the contribution to catastrophic global warming. BECCS
302 has been estimated to have a CO₂ removal potential of 20-70 MtCO₂ pa (Smith et al., 2016) and further
303 removal through carbonation of the ash arisings e.g., through enhanced terrestrial weathering. Biomass
304 ashes comprise major elements O, Cl, Si, Ca, K, P, Al, Mg, Fe, S, Na, Ti, Mn and are notably enriched
305 compared to coal ash in trace elements in Ag, Au, B, Be, Cd, Cr, Cu, Mn, Ni, Rb, Se, Zn (Vassilev et
306 al., 2013; Zhai et al., 2020). Heavy metals and readily soluble metal chlorides are the most recurrent
307 contaminants preventing ash reuse in many of its principal potential applications e.g. soil amendment
308 in silvi/agriculture and admixture in cements and mortars. Statistical analysis of numerous database
309 records shows that compositionally there are four main types of virgin biomass ash: hard wood ash,
310 softwood ash, and grass (straw) and non-grass type agricultural residues. Interestingly, wood ashes
311 have slightly higher trace metals, whereas agricultural residue ashes have notably higher levels of
312 persistent organic pollutants (POPs) (Zhai et al., 2021). Thus, the ASPIRE concept could offer a

313 practicable management/decontamination option for ash arisings from projected biomass combustion
314 and future BECCS with potential for further CO₂ mitigation through ash weathering, ash reuse as a
315 cement admixture and nutrient recycling to agri/silviculture whilst also recovering critical elements and
316 minerals.

317 There is also a clear trajectory for growth in MSWI ash arisings. Bottom ash is readily recyclable, but
318 market limitations mean that its reuse is restricted to prescribed applications, whilst MSWI fly ash/APCr
319 is considered hazardous which prevents recycling. Due to POP content, some 5% of MSWI APCr
320 requires further treatment before it can be disposed of to hazardous waste landfill. UK Energy from
321 Waste capacity was projected to be 15.4 Mtpa by 2020 (Tolvik, 2017), with estimated bottom ash and
322 APCr arisings of 3.1 Mtpa and 0.5 Mtpa respectively. MSWI ash can be enriched in Ca, Cl, K, Mg, N,
323 Na, P, Ti, trace elements Ag, Cd, Cr, Cu, Ho, I, Mn, Pb, Pr, Re, Sb, Sm, Sn, Zn (Lima et al., 2008; Tang
324 et al., 2015; Tang and Steenari., 2016; Zhai et al., 2021), the trace element compositions will be
325 susceptible to changes in waste composition.

326

327 *4.2 Dredgings*

328 The EU annually produces around 200 - 250 Mt of marine and 50-60 Mt of freshwater dredgings per
329 year, of which up to 5-10 % and <30%, for marine and fresh water respectively, are sent to “confined
330 disposal” (Mink et al., 2006). Example arisings from around the coast of England were 40 Mt of wet
331 sediment (Bolam et al., 2006). For inland UK contaminated dredgings data are sparse but the amounts
332 are likely in the range of hundreds of thousands of tonnes per annum. As with ash, the heavy metal
333 content of dredgings often prevents their reuse in applications such as bank protection, habitat creation
334 and conditioning agricultural land (Renalla, 2021). ASPIRE repositories could offer the practicable
335 means to create habitats and green corridors close to damaged waterways while also providing a means
336 to return metals that have escaped into rivers and bound up with sediment to the CE and bioremediating
337 any associated organic contaminants.

338

339 *4.3 Alkaline Industrial Wastes*

340 Industrial processes produce a very wide variety of different wastes, many of which are readily
341 recyclable. However, several classes of mineral-dominated residues are produced during metal
342 production that lead to high-volume, low-value materials that are uneconomic to recycle and commonly
343 disposed of in land-based repositories. These include, steelmaking and metallurgical slags, bauxite
344 processing residues, Solvay process wastes from the manufacture of soda ash, and chromite ore
345 processing residues. In terms of global production, steelmaking slags and bauxite residues are
346 particularly important and have rapidly increasing rates of production (170-250 Mtpa and 120 Mtpa
347 respectively (Power et al., 2011)). These residues are often the product of high temperature processes
348 that involve additions of alkali materials during extraction. Therefore, the resultant by-products are rich
349 in alkaline mineral components (e.g. CaO, NaOH, Ca and Na – silicates) that readily hydrate and
350 dissolve to produce a highly alkaline leachates (Gomes et al, 2016).

351 After uses for the bulk residues can be limited by a range of factors which include (i) extreme alkalinity
352 and mobility of potentially hazardous metal(loid)s at high pH (e.g. As, Cr, V: Burke et al., 2012; Hobson
353 et al., 2017), (ii) stability issues where weathering of residues can lead to expansion and limit aggregate
354 after uses, (iii) the potential classification of some residues such as bauxite processing residue as
355 Technologically Enhanced Naturally Occurring Radioactive Materials (TENORM) which can limit
356 after uses in construction (e.g. Somlai et al., 2008). As such, virgin materials are often preferred over
357 bulk reuse of alkaline residues given the additional costs associated with mitigating potential issues.

358 There is growing research in value recovery from alkaline industrial residues ranging from bulk material
359 reuse to critical metal recovery and carbon capture (e.g. Gomes et al., 2016; Ujaczki et al., 2017; Pullin
360 et al, 2019; Pan et al, 2020). However, relatively low fluxes of dilute valuable components (e.g. V)
361 occurring in leachates with mixed contaminants makes separation and recovery challenging (e.g. Gomes
362 et al., 2017). As such, there are few examples of large-scale critical raw material recovery from alkaline
363 industrial wastes.

364 The ASPIRE concept brings a range of opportunities to overcome some of these current technical
365 constraints. The extended timescales on which ASPIRE is based provides scope for the gradual
366 leaching and accumulation of critical metals in enrichment zones that would be better candidates for
367 recovery than current technologies (e.g. Gomes et al., 2020). The decontamination of bulk material by
368 these leaching processes could produce more stable and less hazardous materials that could open up
369 more avenues for large scale reuse as aggregate (e.g. slags), in land reclamation or in ceramics / building
370 materials (e.g. bauxite residue). Alkaline wastes also have the potential to sequester atmospheric CO₂ -
371 See Section 8 below.

372

373 *4.4 Mine wastes*

374 Globally, arisings of mine wastes (including overburden, tailings and a range of related residues) likely
375 run to hundreds of billions of tonnes (Kinnunen and Kaksonen, 2019), for example there are an
376 estimated 39 billion tonnes of mine tailings in Chile alone at 0.2 wt.% Cu (Dold, 2020). Mine wastes
377 are deposited in a range of settings from uncontrolled storage in the landscape to highly engineered
378 impoundments, depending on their age and the environmental legislation relevant in the geographic
379 jurisdiction. Mine wastes deposited to land in an uncontrolled manner cause a substantial pollution
380 legacy through acid rock drainage and metal-leaching (e.g. Wolkersdorfer and Bowell, 2004), and
381 migration of fines (e.g. Fuge et al., 1989). Impoundments can pose risks through dust and failure of
382 dams (Dold, 2020). In the UK, an estimated 73 – 195 Mt of mine wastes were produced from the
383 historical working of lead, copper and tin, and cover an estimated 1960 – 4400 hectares of land
384 (Palumbo-Roe and Colman., 2010). The indicative estimated cost, over a 10-year life cycle, to
385 remediate solely the water-related environmental problems due to diffuse pollution caused by non-coal
386 mine wastes in England and Wales was estimated at £35 Million (Jarvis et al., 2012).

387 There is considerable interest in recovery of resources from mine wastes, and they are one of the more
388 obvious targets for sourcing of metals, particularly as ore grade continue to decrease and/or aggregate
389 resources decrease. Despite this, there has been very limited explicit adoption of the concept of the

390 circular economy amongst large-scale mining firms (Upadhyay et al., 2021). Large bottlenecks for
391 tailings valorisation identified by Kinnunen and Kaksonen (2019) include the low concentration and
392 mass of recoverable elements for economical processing, missing value chains, regulatory barriers, and
393 environmental risks of reprocessing. Applying the ASPIRE repository concept for future mine wastes
394 and tailings could address many of these concerns and at minimum a better option than the “do nothing”
395 option of continued landfilling.

396

397 *4.5 Temporary Storage as a Remediation Strategy for Legacy Wastes*

398 Where “polluter pays” legislation (see Stenis and Hogland, 2002) is in place then there is a compelling
399 case (from the perspective of environmental justice) for legacy mineral-rich wastes to be managed by
400 the generator. However, many legacy mineral-rich wastes remain where the waste generator has no
401 liability (due to lack of action-forcing legislation at the time), or no longer exist. In the UK, such legacy
402 wastes and orphan sites become the responsibility of local authorities and/or central government. The
403 ASPIRE concept could offer a potentially lower cost alternative to conventional site remediation, which
404 often leads to secondary landfilling of heavily contaminated materials in any case. In a sense, this would
405 be a revisitation of the “dig and dump” approach to site remediation that was common in the UK but
406 has become less common due to landfill tax (Hodson, 2010), with the critical difference that the “dump”
407 is into a temporary storage repository where the waste is remediated to allow future recovery.

408 Multi-dimensional value refers to the value as expressed by the range of measurable benefits and
409 impacts in the environmental, economic, social and technical domains (Iacovidou et al, 2017). Many
410 legacy sites in the UK, for example mine sites, display multi-dimensional value. For example, important
411 landscape and cultural designations, sites of special scientific interest and/or host rare and valued
412 species of flora and fauna. This contrasts with the negative value associated with sites that cause
413 environmental pollution (Crane et al, 2017; Sinnett, 2019). It is important to note that an ASPIRE
414 repository could feasibly be constructed *at* a legacy site, with some, or all, of the valuable aspects of

415 the legacy site (which tend to be associated with the upper surface) retained or recreated in the repository
416 cover.

417

418 **5. Accelerating supergene processes: Lithomimicry and Biogeochemical** 419 **Engineering**

420

421 **5.1 Storage time**

422 The requisite duration of the storage of wastes within an ASPIRE repository is an open question but
423 one that dictates the necessary intensity/acceleration of the *in situ* supergene processes. Conceptually,
424 it is possible to envisage (i) shorter-term storage duration and processing of a few years (the system
425 resembling a contaminated land remediation project) (ii) medium term storage and treatment over one
426 to a few decades, through to (iii) long-term intergenerational storage and treatment on a timescale of
427 several decades to a century. It is envisaged that the *in situ* processes could be engineered to correspond
428 to the likely time in storage.

429

430 **5.2 Upper surface and leaching zone**

431 The primary hazards to humans and other vertebrates from industrial residues tend to result either from
432 direct contact with the residue, ingestion or inhalation of dusts, or ingestion of rainwater run-off
433 (Nathanail and Earl, 2001; Stange and Langdon, 2016). All these hazards can be significantly reduced
434 if vegetative cover is established on the residue surface, as plant growth will buffer the chemistry of the
435 surface layer and minimise dusts and suspended solids in runoff. When revegetation occurs naturally
436 at a site that is initially devoid of life (e.g. after deposition of volcanic ash) the process of initial
437 colonisation by pioneer species, and their subsequent replacement by a wider range of less hardy
438 species, is called primary succession (Breeze, 1973; Gemmel, 1972; Bradshaw, 2000; Wong, 2003;
439 Phillips and Courtney, 2022). Without intervention this process, which involves the slow build-up of

440 plant accessible nutrients with successive cycles of plant and microbial growth and decay, typically
441 takes decades and centuries to produce verdant vegetative cover (Ash et al., 1994; Lee and Greenwood,
442 1976; Bradshaw, 2000; Santini and Fey, 2013). However, many industrial residue disposal sites could
443 be transitioned from providing little benefit for people or nature to delivering multiple benefits, or
444 ecosystem services, in few years if this natural process is accelerated.

445

446 Revegetation and the potential for accelerated ecological succession has been demonstrated on acidic
447 coal mine (Wali, 1999; Fernandez-Caliani et al., 2021) and metalliferous mine wastes (O'Neill et al.,
448 1998; Bagatto and Shorthouse, 1999; Wong, 2003; Walker et al, 2004), circumneutral metalliferous
449 mine wastes (Shu et al, 2002; Yang et al, 1997; Sarathchandra et al, 2022; Peñalver-Alcalá et al, 2021),
450 and on alkaline wastes (Breeze, 1973; Courtney et al., 2009; Fellet et al., 2011; Lee and Greenwood,
451 1976; Ash et al., 1994). Interventions at industrial residue disposal sites that can accelerate the
452 succession process include conditioning treatments (to provide nutrients, create soil-like structure and
453 buffer extreme pH values) and seeding of plant mixtures (Ash et al., 1994; Courtney et al., 2009;
454 Kumpeine et al., 2008). Grass species appear to be good pioneer species, as species from calcareous
455 grassland appear readily established on alkaline wastes and species from acidic heathland on acidic
456 wastes (Ash et al., 1994), but early establishment of nitrogen fixing species (such as legumes) is
457 important for accelerated succession (Phillips and Courtney, 2022). Over the last 20 years Courtney and
458 co-workers have investigated the revegetation of bauxite processing residue (red mud); a very alkaline,
459 abiotic waste (Courtney and Timpson., 2004, 2005; Courtney et al., 2009; Courtney and Harrington.,
460 2012; Courtney et al., 2014). Their approach has been to augment the surface layer of the residue with
461 various combinations of sand-sized material to improve drainage, gypsum to buffer high pH, and
462 organic matter to provide a suitable substrate for plant growth, and they have shown that vegetative
463 cover can be established from seed and sustained for more than 20 years. A subsequent investigation
464 has shown that plant roots become established mainly in the amended surface layer, but vegetative cover
465 resulted in a pH reduction >2 pH units and a five-fold reduction in sodicity (compared with an untreated
466 and therefore largely unvegetated control plot) that extended to more than 3x the initial treatment depth

467 (Bray et al., 2017). Such beneficial effects from bio-rehabilitation have also been reported elsewhere
468 (Santini et al., 2015; Zhu et al., 2016; Sarathchandra et al., 2022).

469 Plants can alter the chemistry of any residue upon which they are grown through the chemicals they
470 secrete through their roots. These include CO₂ from respiration in roots; ions transported across the
471 soil-root interface during nutrient uptake, extrusion of H⁺ by plant cells during energy metabolism, and
472 secretion of various organic species (termed “root exudates”) (Hinsinger et al., 2003). Plants can secrete
473 a broad array of organic compounds into the rhizosphere, and while the flux is quantitatively quite
474 modest (Guo et al., 2010; Hinsinger et al., 2013), it represents 5% to 21% of the carbon
475 photosynthetically fixed by the plants (Helal and Sauerbeck, 1989; Marschner, 1995). Some root
476 exudates are produced in response to specific plant stresses, but the majority (including sugars, amino
477 acids, and organic acids) are believed to be passively lost from the root (Canarini et al., 2019). Organic
478 acids and phenolics released by plants (including those released to combat excessive aluminium in
479 acidic soils (Li et al., 2009; Mora-Marcias et al., 2017) and siderophores to that allow Fe uptake in
480 neutral to alkaline soils (Schenkeveld et al., 2014; Grillet and Schmidt, 2017), can mobilise toxic metal
481 contaminants by chelation or complexation. In healthy soil systems most plant exudates are consumed
482 by rhizosphere-dwelling microbes (resulting in production of CO₂), but in industrial residues, with a
483 thin, poorly established rhizosphere, plant exudates can migrate deeper into the deposit (Bray et al.
484 2018), see Fig 3.

485

486 **5.2 Capture Zone**

487 There are already many existing and developing technologies for the trapping of metals and other
488 contaminant species from water into a solid matrix that have variously been developed for treatment of
489 contaminated water (e.g. groundwater, municipal solid waste landfill leachate, mine water, highways
490 and urban runoff) and there are many parallels with the continuing development of such “passive”
491 technologies. These include permeable reactive barriers (PRBs), constructed wetlands, sustainable
492 drainage systems (SuDS), swales and bioswales (for examples see Scherer et al., 2000; Pat-Espadas et

493 al., 2018; Woods-Ballard et al., 2007 and Ekka et al., 2021 respectively). The mechanisms of trapping
494 variously involve biogeochemical process within the matrix that induce metal sequestration from
495 solution. These typically rely on changes in redox or pH, utilise precipitation by the common ion effect
496 or in situ sulphide production from microbial sulphate reduction, sorption, chelation or coprecipitation
497 (Sapsford et al., 2019). Less well understood are passive systems for removing metal and metalloid
498 oxyanions prevalent in alkaline wastes e.g. V, Al and As in bauxite processing residue (Burke, 2013).
499 For Cr(VI) reductive precipitation is important, for V(V) pH reduction by carbonation and sorption to
500 Fe-(oxy)hydroxides is key, whereas for As oxidation of As(III) to As(V) and then sorption to Fe-
501 (oxy)hydroxides is important (Ding et al., 2015; Hobson et al., 2018). In these cases, pH reduction and
502 carbonation are key mechanisms for metal capture. Additives such as gypsum and organic matter can
503 reduce the pH value (the former by promoting carbonation, the latter by dissolution of soluble humics)
504 and organic matter can capture metals directly by complexation or indirectly by supporting bioreduction
505 by microorganisms. Such mechanism should be effective in a trapping zone as they have been
506 demonstrated to reverse the mobility of elements including V in bauxite residues (Bray, 2018).

507 An underlying aim of the design and operation should be a significant concentration of the target metal
508 (or other species) compared to the leached residue. In achieving this, key challenges for capture zone
509 engineering include (i) maintenance of the long-term effectiveness of the biogeochemical removal
510 mechanisms (ii) maintenance and/or control of hydraulic conductivity (See below) (iii) concentration
511 achievable in the capture zone.

512

513 **6. Hydraulic and Geotechnical Considerations**

514 Many landfills (or in-ground impoundments) of wastes rely to some extent on isolation, preventing or
515 minimising the mobilisation of contaminants and their leakage into the surrounding environment. With
516 the ASPIRE concept of *in situ* processing during temporary storage, however, complete isolation is no
517 longer desirable as external environmental processes are required to be brought to bear on the waste
518 mass to enable no/low input processing. The most important of these is likely to be controlled hydraulic

519 flow into the waste repository. As a result, the repository design moves from a containment facility to
520 something more akin to a funnel-and-gate permeable reactive barrier, where water/lixiviant flow is
521 encouraged (or at least controlled) to pass through the waste mass prior to treatment of the resulting
522 liquor. This conceptual change leads to implications for both the hydraulic and geotechnical design of
523 in-ground temporary waste storage.

524

525 **6.1 Hydraulic processes in temporary storage**

526 Hydraulic flow is likely to be the major driver of waste processing under natural processes, permitting
527 the mobilisation and transport of both lixiviants and resource. Flow must enter the waste and travel
528 through the entirety of the mass to reach the region where mobilised species are deposited. It is therefore
529 vital to encourage water to flow through the waste mass – optimisation of this flow is dependent on-site
530 conditions, but general issues may be considered here. There are two major environmental sources of
531 water ingress, from rainfall / run-on (more transient) or groundwater (more consistent and predictable),
532 which could be extracted adjacent to, and introduced into the repository.

533 A second major issue is the volume and rate of flow – the optimal volume/rate will be determined by
534 properties of the waste mass including hydraulic conductivity, as well as the rate of resource deposition
535 and thus the minimum residence time in the capture zone. Mineral-rich wastes of interest in temporary
536 storage schemes have a wide range of potential hydraulic conductivities, for example municipal solid
537 waste incineration bottom ash is relatively coarse, with sand-like hydraulic conductivity (5×10^{-6} m/s (de
538 Windt et al., 2011)) whilst finer fly ashes may vary from 10^{-7} to 10^{-10} m/s (Zabielska-Adamska, 2020).
539 Depending on the storage duration, rainwater alone may not provide sufficient water to fully mobilise
540 resource even on the long timescales considered here and where it does, the transient nature of rainfall
541 will potentially lead to periods of desaturation which in turn causes preferential flow and thus reduced
542 resource mobilisation. To overcome this, water retention in ponding schemes may be used to attenuate
543 flow transience, buffering water ingress by collection prior to gradual, more continuous release into the

544 waste. Alternatively, fluid exiting the storage facility may be collected and recirculated *via* autonomous
545 systems, for example powered by solar energy.

546 Flow in porous media, including mineral wastes, is impacted by preferential flow – certain paths through
547 the pore space offer less resistance to flow and so the majority of advective flow takes these paths
548 (Clothier et al., 2008) leaving the majority of the medium (the matrix) untouched. Causes may include
549 heterogeneities at a range of scales such as strata with varying hydraulic conductivity, pore sizes of
550 differing diameter or unsaturated pores where flow cannot occur. Such preferential flow leads to only a
551 proportion of the waste being treated by flushing / leaching, while decontamination of the remaining
552 waste is governed by the rate of contaminant diffusion to preferential flow paths from the matrix. Soil
553 flushing (or “pump and treat”) of contaminated land is affected by this process and sometimes results
554 in active pumping continuing for decades to achieve the remediation objectives (Guo et al., 2019).
555 Without some kind of engineered system preferential flow will occur and will limit recovery from the
556 waste mass, so it is appropriate to question whether there exist autonomous natural processes that can
557 be engineered to alter fluid flow and/or diffusion. For example, this can, to an extent, be managed by
558 pumping techniques such as pulsed flushing where flow is intermittent to give time for diffusion within
559 the matrix (Cote et al., 2000); this doesn’t significantly affect the overall remedial time but it does
560 reduce the active flushing time. Similar processes may be helpful in the case of temporary storage where
561 treatment time is not a significant issue, but diffusion alone is unlikely to be wholly effective in moving
562 resource, particularly when that resource may be bound tightly in mineral wastes and thus unavailable
563 to the pore fluid. More active technologies to enhance availability and diffusion, such as electrokinetics,
564 have been successfully employed to alter the mobility and availability of resources bound in mineral
565 wastes (Peppicelli *et al.*, 2018), though the challenge to engineer natural processes to autonomously
566 enhance resource availability remains.

567 Over time, the hydraulic behaviour of all aspects of a repository may alter, and the repository system
568 needs to be able to adapt to this. The whole waste body will undergo self-weight compaction to a degree
569 and pattern determined partly by compaction during placement and the rate at which self-weight
570 develops. With repositories that develop over time with the deposition of new waste, the process of

571 compaction and thus alteration of hydraulic flow in the original deposits will be a continuous process.
572 The surface ecosystem will be dynamic with the growth of established plants and potentially
573 successional growth of new plant species, potentially with new root architectures and behaviour which
574 could alter water infiltration, evapotranspiration and so on. Continued leaching may lead to erosional
575 processes, particle breakdown and aggregation, and clogging in the leach zone, whilst calcium-rich
576 wastes such as certain fly ashes may be susceptible to cementation with calcium carbonate (Zabielska-
577 Adamska, 2020), blocking the pore space and changing flow patterns and causing or preventing any
578 continued waste compaction. The capture zone is by definition an active biogeochemical zone with
579 deposition changing the pore structure and likely reducing the hydraulic conductivity, with challenges
580 then for hydraulic flow throughout the system.

581

582 **6.2 Geotechnical factors relevant to temporary storage**

583 The geotechnical stability of in- or on-ground waste repositories will be dependent on their site-specific
584 design, their profile and the surrounding ground conditions. The desire to have fully saturated wastes
585 (to maximise resource recovery and avoid preferential flow) is problematic for sloped surfaces. It is
586 likely that repository design will require non-sloping or modest-sloping surfaces as steeper slopes would
587 be susceptible to slip failure in the presence of large pore pressures, as well as seepage problems in a
588 similar manner to earth dams (Meyer et al., 1994), leading to failure mechanisms such as piping, heave
589 and internal erosion (as noted above). This may be exacerbated with enhanced water flow and pore
590 pressures should measures such as surface ponding and/or recirculation be employed. Settlement and
591 consolidation of the emplaced waste masses will also be impacted by variations in the development of
592 pore pressures, alongside factors such as internal erosion and changes on the structure of the waste
593 materials. These processes will require consideration to ensure flow systems and any installed rigid
594 infrastructure remain functional and to avoid adverse features such as differential surface settlement
595 occurring. Geotechnical liners employed to encapsulate the waste body will require redesign from
596 typical systems employed in traditional landfill. The inclusion of drainage layers should be avoided to
597 prevent preferential flow of influent water (rain or ground) around rather than through the waste. The

598 saturation of the waste without drainage, however, has the potential to create significant hydraulic
599 gradients across the liner which may lead to localised liner failure.

600

601 **7. Delivery of ecosystem services**

602 In the proposed ASPIRE repository concept the upper surface can be vegetated to provide root exudates
603 that enhance leaching and drive capture zone biogeochemistry. In addition, the opportunity for
604 vegetated upper surface provides opportunities for considerable added value through the delivery of
605 ecosystems services. Restored landfills deliver a range of ecosystem services, or benefits to people,
606 following conversion to ‘soft’ land uses, including agriculture, forestry, amenity and nature
607 conservation (Li et al., 2019; Zalesny et al., 2020). There is an opportunity to tailor the design and
608 species selection to provide the necessary lixivants as well as delivering ecosystem services. Using the
609 framework provided by Common International Classification of Ecosystem Services (CICES) V5.1
610 (Haines-Young and Potschin, 2018) it is possible to explore the opportunity to provide ecosystem
611 services in ASPIRE landfills. The CICES focuses on regulation and maintenance (e.g. mediation of
612 wastes, flood risk management, pollination), cultural (e.g. experiential and physical use, education) and
613 provisioning services (e.g. cultivated plants, energy generation, mineral resources), which are
614 underpinned by ‘supporting’ conditions (e.g. primary production; Haines-Young and Potschin, 2018).

615

616 **7.1 Regulation and maintenance services**

617 Regulation and maintenance services include management of flood risk, temperature, and air, water and
618 soil quality, as well as pollination. It is well known that restored landfills can deliver positive outcomes
619 for nature conservation (MacGregor et al., 2022; Tarrant et al., 2012; Rahman et al., 2013). The sector
620 is already accustomed to designing restoration strategies for recreation (see below) and nature
621 conservation end uses, providing a variety of habitat types and amenities. For example, providing a
622 nutrient-poor soil and allowing natural colonisation of plants to facilitate the development of semi-

623 natural grasslands to provide for pollinators (Rahman et al., 2013). With ASPIRE repositories there
624 would also be a need to ensure that selected species also generated sufficient exudates/lixivants.

625 New requirements for biodiversity net gain, introduced in the UK as part of the Environment Act 2021
626 create an opportunity to deliver biodiversity as an integral part of the system as well as the restoration
627 phase. For example, current landfills, or those planned for habitats of low distinctiveness, such as
628 quarries, or improved grassland, could be restored to provide mosaic habitats of medium or high
629 distinctiveness, including native flower-rich grasslands, to provide pollination services, open grassland,
630 mixed broadleaved woodland and ponds and wetlands (Natural England, 2021). Furthermore,
631 revegetation of landfills can provide many of the services of urban greenspaces, including improved air
632 quality, and reduced temperature and flood risk (Harwell et al., 2021; Li et al., 2019; Pereira et al.,
633 2018). As well as providing water storage, including wetlands and ponds will also allow the
634 recirculation of clean water contributing to the regulation of water pollution (Benyamine et al., 2004).

635

636 **7.2 Provisioning services**

637 In addition to cleaned residue, and a concentration of potentially valuable elements in the anthropogenic
638 ore zone, there are equally important potential applications for the upper surface of the ASPIRE
639 repository (as with other landfills) to provide food and energy. The establishment of agriculture and
640 forestry on restored landfills is a common end use and selecting species that can be used in food or
641 timber production whilst providing the necessary lixivants could ensure ASPIRE repositories are also
642 able to contribute provisioning services. Landfills are also increasingly being used for energy
643 generation, through solar farms (Szabó et al., 2017) or biomass crops (Cervelli et al., 2020; Zalesny et
644 al., 2020) and there is also potential here for added value from ASPIRE repositories. This approach can
645 also achieve biodiversity benefits (Cervilli et al., 2020), and in the case of some energy crops, spaces
646 for recreation use for example through the creation of community woodlands. For example, the energy
647 crop miscanthus can provide a habitat for farmland birds (Bright et al., 2013) and the brown hare, whose
648 population is declining in areas of intensive agriculture (Petrovan et al., 2017). Creating solar farms on

649 landfills, particularly, can overcome some of the tensions with using agricultural land for this purpose
650 (Szabó et al., 2017). As a new concept, an ASPIRE landfill will be well placed to take advantage of the
651 latest developments in other fields, such as the dual use of land for cultivation and solar farms (Toledo
652 and Scognamiglio, 2021). These ‘agrovoltaic’ systems employ a range of technologies to ensure that
653 crop production and energy generation can work in unison, for example, by using vertical photovoltaic
654 (PV) panels, or elevating the panels several metres about the ground, allowing for vegetation growth
655 beneath (Toledo and Scognamiglio, 2021). Depending on the configuration and species selection this
656 approach can increase crop yields and improve the efficiency of the PVs (Toledo and Scognamiglio,
657 2021). There may also therefore be the potential to combine energy crops, such as miscanthus, with
658 solar farms to increase the energy generation from ASPIRE repositories.

659

660 **7.3 Cultural services**

661 Many landfills have been restored to high quality greenspaces, often close to where people live,
662 providing space for rest, relaxation, physical activity and contact with nature (Li et al., 2019). These
663 activities provide cultural ecosystem services including health and wellbeing benefits such as improved
664 mental health, physical activity (Li et al., 2019).

665

666 **8 Carbon Capture**

667 Any soil surface has the potential for capturing carbon through the biological colonisation and
668 development of the regolith. Thus, an ASPIRE repository, which deliberately includes a vegetated upper
669 surface would achieve carbon capture. Moreover, many mineral-rich wastes contain components which
670 will either directly react with CO₂ or will lead to capture of CO₂ as bicarbonate via mineral weathering.
671 The carbonation mechanism is particularly relevant to alkaline wastes, whereby soluble oxide and
672 silicate minerals react with CO₂ and form carbonate minerals (Renforth, 2019). Recent studies have
673 suggested that legacy iron and steel wastes have a carbon capture potential of up to 80 million tonnes

674 in the UK (e.g. Riley et al., 2020, and section 4.3), whilst global estimates suggest between 5-12% of
675 global CO₂ emissions could be mitigated through carbonation with alkaline residues (Renforth, 2019).
676 The sequestration process in these wastes is currently limited in disposal settings by low rates of
677 atmospheric CO₂ ingress into heaps and surface armouring of wastes by secondary deposits (e.g. Pullin
678 et al., 2019). An ASPIRE repository could accelerate carbonation rates in a controlled manner through
679 managed weathering of shallow piles (to encourage contact with atmosphere) and accelerated flushing
680 of residues (to minimise surface armouring and accelerate weathering rates). The deliberate engineering
681 of the surface to encourage downward percolation of water and root exudates may transport organic
682 materials into the waste repository where biological mineralisation should further enhance rates of
683 mineral weathering and carbonation. Interestingly, there may well be significant financial incentives
684 associated with this atmospheric CO₂ sequestration (e.g. in operating an auditable negative emissions
685 system: Renforth, 2019) which could assist with long-term management of ASPIRE repositories.

686

687 **9 Technology Barriers and Risks**

688 There are foreseeable barriers to the further development of the ASPIRE repository concept, including
689 both the technical engineering challenges and public or stakeholder perceptions. There could potentially
690 be enhanced risks of contaminant escape due to increased water movement, potential for the
691 development of hydraulic heads on liners and presence of agents that enhance contaminant
692 concentration and mobilisation. However, existing containment engineering for landfills and heap
693 leaching facilities (common in the mining industry) should find application in adequately mitigating
694 this risk. Furthermore, landfill monitoring technology is well established, and environmental
695 monitoring technologies continue to develop apace.

696 There are risks and barriers associated with public perceptions of the technology, similar to those
697 experienced during the remediation of contaminated sites and mining operations. For example, they
698 include concerns that there will be adverse impacts on the environment from the release of pollutants
699 and the time taken for resource extraction (Song et al., 2019; Tayebi-Khorami et al., 2019). There may

700 also be a lack of trust from local communities that operators are mitigating risks effectivity or acting in
701 their interests (Tayebi-Khorami et al., 2019; Sinnett and Sardo, 2020). Operators may also be resistant
702 to a new technology and any associated liabilities (Tayebi-Khorami et al., 2019; Song et al., 2019), and
703 uncertain that a market exists for the product generated by ASPIRE repositories (Tayebi-Khorami et
704 al., 2019) or the ownership of these products. Currently, there are also regulatory risks to adoption of
705 the ASPIRE concept as there is with an authentic shift towards a CE model for mining waste
706 management (Tayebi-Khorami et al., 2019; Cisterna et al., 2022), the proposed long timescales may
707 make it difficult to foresee future changes in environmental regulations that might impact on operation
708 or recovery. Furthermore, there may also be increased cost implications for the operators in terms of
709 long-term monitoring, which may result in additional running costs compared with a traditional landfill.

710

711 **10. Conclusions**

712 There are many reasons why mineral-rich wastes are currently landfilled. However, it is self-evident
713 that environmental containment offered by a landfill will eventually succumb to environmental
714 processes, potentially allowing pollution to escape to burden future generations. Thus, in a very real
715 sense, landfilled waste becomes “someone else’s problem”, removed in time, rather than
716 geographically, from the producer. Therefore, landfill cannot be considered as an intergenerationally
717 equitable waste management option. Temporary storage is an important concept that has been
718 considered but not adopted for MSW but may be more applicable for mineral-dominated wastes from
719 mining and industry. The case for temporary storage is more compelling, due to the disconnect between
720 potential end-users for residues and the waste production. The reuse of mineral-rich wastes is also often
721 limited because of the presence of leachable contaminants. Separating contaminants from clean residue
722 or concentrating valuable components from a waste where they are dispersed requires energy. The
723 ASPIRE concept looks to extend the concept of temporary storage to include in-built biogeochemical
724 engineering and the solar insolation flux to utilise the time in storage for the separation and
725 concentration of contaminants (or resources). Furthermore, there are clear opportunities for adding

726 value through ecosystem services and carbon capture. There are several important engineering and
727 legislative hurdles that remain to be solved. Importantly, recycling materials within ASPIRE
728 repositories is not intended to displace any existing economically viable and sustainable recycling
729 technologies for mineral-rich wastes. However, the concept could provide a potentially practicable
730 Circular Economy solution for materials that would otherwise go to conventional landfill, thus at
731 minimum replacing/displacing landfill with temporary storage and treatment for recycling at the base
732 of the waste hierarchy.

733

734 **Acknowledgements**

735 The work was financially supported by the Engineering and Physical Sciences Research
736 Council (grant numbers: EP/T03100X/1, EP/T031166/1, EP/T031018/1).

737

738 **References**

- 739 Allen A (2001) Containment landfills: the myth of sustainability, *Engineering geology* **60(1-4)**:3-19
- 740 Antonkiewicz J, Popławska A, Kołodziej B et al. (2020) Application of ash and municipal sewage
741 sludge as macronutrient sources in sustainable plant biomass production. *Journal of environmental*
742 *management* **264**: 110450.
- 743 Arrow K, Dasgupta P, Goulder L et al. (2004) Are we consuming too much? *Journal of Economic*
744 *Perspectives* **18(3)**:147-72
- 745 Ash HJ, Gemmell RP, Bradshaw AD (1994). The Introduction of Native Plant Species on Industrial
746 Waste Heaps: A Test of Immigration and Other Factors Affecting Primary Succession. *Journal of*
747 *Applied Ecology* **31(1)**: 74-84

748 Bagatto G, Shorthouse J (1999) Biotic and abiotic characteristics of ecosystems on acid metalliferous
749 mine tailings near Sudbury, Ontario, *Canadian Journal of Botany* **74**:410–425.

750 Bazilian, MD (2018) The mineral foundation of the energy transition. *The Extractive Industries and*
751 *Society* **5(1)**: 93-97

752 Benyamine M, Bäckström M, Sandén P (2004) Multi-objective environmental management in
753 constructed wetlands. *Environmental monitoring and assessment* **90(1)**:171-85

754 Bolam SG, Rees HL, Somerfield P et al. (2006). Ecological consequences of dredged material disposal
755 in the marine environment: a holistic assessment of activities around the England and Wales coastline.
756 *Marine Pollution Bulletin* **52(4)**: 415-426.

757 Bradshaw (2000). *The Use of Natural Processes in Reclamation—Advantages and Difficulties.*
758 *Landscape and Urban Planning* **51**: 89-100.

759 Bray AW, Stewart DI, Courtney R et al. (2017). Sustained Bauxite Residue Rehabilitation with Gypsum
760 and Organic Matter 16 years after Initial Treatment. *Environmental Science and Technology* **52**:
761 152–161, doi: 10.1021/acs.est.7b03568

762 Breeze VG (1973). Land Reclamation and River Pollution Problems in the Croal Valley Caused by
763 Waste from Chromate Manufacture. *Journal of Applied Ecology* **10(2)**: 513-525

764 Bright JA, Anderson GQA, Mcarthur T et al. (2013) Bird use of establishment-stage *Miscanthus*
765 biomass crops during the breeding season in England. *Bird Study* **60(3)**: 357-369, doi:
766 10.1080/00063657.2013.790876.

767 Burke IT, Mayes WM, Peacock CL et al. (2012) Speciation of arsenic, chromium, and vanadium in red
768 mud samples from the Ajka spill site, Hungary. *Environmental Science & Technology* **46(6)**: 3085-
769 3092

770 Burke IT, Peacock CL, Lockwood CL et al. (2013). Behaviour of aluminium, arsenic and vanadium
771 during the neutralisation of red mud leachate by HCl, gypsum, or seawater. *Environmental Science and*
772 *Technology* **47**: 6527-6535.

773 Canarini A, Kaiser C, Merchant A et al. (2019) Root exudation of primary metabolites: mechanisms
774 and their roles in plant responses to environmental stimuli. *Frontiers in Plant Science* **157**

775 CCC (2020) <https://www.theccc.org.uk/publication/sixth-carbon-budget/>

776 Cervelli E, Scotto di Pertea E, Pindozi, S (2020) Energy crops in marginal areas: Scenario-based
777 assessment through ecosystem services, as support to sustainable development. *Ecological Indicators*
778 **113**: 106180

779 Chertow M, Ehrenfeld J (2012) Organizing self-organizing systems: Toward a theory of industrial
780 symbiosis. *Journal of industrial ecology* **16(1)**: 13-27

781 Cisternas LA, Ordóñez JI, Jeldres RI, Serna-Guerrero R (2022) Toward the implementation of circular
782 economy strategies: An overview of the current situation in mineral processing. *Mineral Processing and*
783 *Extractive Metallurgy Review* **43(6)**: 775-797

784 CL:AIRE [https://www.claire.co.uk/projects-and-initiatives/dow-cop/28-framework-and-](https://www.claire.co.uk/projects-and-initiatives/dow-cop/28-framework-and-guidance/110-cluster-guide)
785 [guidance/110-cluster-guide](https://www.claire.co.uk/projects-and-initiatives/dow-cop/28-framework-and-guidance/110-cluster-guide)

786 Clothier BE; Green SR; Deurer, M (2008). Preferential flow and transport in soil: progress and
787 prognosis. *European Journal of Soil Science* **59**: 2-13

788 Corvellec H, Stowell AF, Johansson N (2022). Critiques of the circular economy. *Journal of Industrial*
789 *Ecology*. **26(2)**: 421-32.

790

791 Cote CM, Bristow KL, Ross PJ (2000). Increasing the efficiency of solute leaching: impacts of flow
792 interruption with drainage of the “preferential flow paths”. *Journal of Contaminant Hydrology* **43**: 191-
793 209.

794 Courtney RG, Feeney E, O’Grady A (2014) An ecological assessment of rehabilitated bauxite residue,
795 *Ecological Engineering* **73**: 373–379

796 Courtney RG, Harrington T (2012) Growth and nutrition of *Holcus lanatus* in bauxite residue
797 amended with combinations of spent mushroom compost and gypsum, *Land Degradation and*
798 *Development* **23**: 144–149

799 Courtney R, Mullen G, Harrington T (2009) An Evaluation of Revegetation Success on Bauxite
800 Residue, *Restoration Ecology* **17**: 350-358. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1526-100X.2008.00375.x>

801 Courtney RG, Timpson JP (2004) Nutrient status of vegetation grown in alkaline bauxite processing
802 residue amended with gypsum and thermally dried sewage sludge - A two year field study. *Plant Soil*
803 **266**: 187–194

804 Courtney RG, Timpson JP (2005) Reclamation of Fine Fraction Bauxite Processing Residue (Red Mud)
805 Amended with Coarse Fraction Residue and Gypsum, *Water Air Soil Pollution* **164**: 91–102

806 Crane RA, Sinnott DE, Cleall PJ, Sapsford DJ (2017). Physicochemical composition of wastes and co-
807 located environmental designations at legacy mine sites in the South West of England and Wales:
808 implications for their resource potential. *Resources, Conservation and Recycling* **123**: 117-134

809 De Windt L, Dabo D, Lidelöw S, Lagerkvist A (2011) MSWI bottom ash used as basement at two pilot-
810 scale roads: Comparison of leachate chemistry and reactive transport modeling, *Waste Management*
811 **31(2)**: 267-280, <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.wasman.2010.06.002>

812 Dill HG (2015) Supergene alteration of ore deposits: from nature to humans. *Elements* **11(5)**: pp.311-
813 316

814 Ding W, Stewart DI, Humphreys PN, Rout SP, Burke IT (2016) Role of an organic carbon-rich soil and
815 Fe (III) reduction in reducing the toxicity and environmental mobility of chromium (VI) at a COPR
816 disposal site, *Science of the Total Environment*, **541**:1191-9

817 Dold B (2020) Sourcing of critical elements and industrial minerals from mine waste—The final
818 evolutionary step back to sustainability of humankind? *Journal of Geochemical Exploration* 106638

819 Dunham KC (1985) *Geology of the northern Pennine orefield: Stainmore to Craven (Vol. 102)*. HM
820 Stationery Office.

821 Ekka SA, Rujner H, Leonhardt G et al. (2021) Next generation swale design for stormwater runoff
822 treatment: A comprehensive approach. *Journal of Environmental Management* **279**: 111756.

823 Ellen MacArthur Foundation (2013) Towards the Circular Economy, Economic and business rationale
824 for an accelerated transition. Available at: <https://ellenmacarthurfoundation.org/>

825 EU(2020)
826 <https://ec.europa.eu/docsroom/documents/42883/attachments/1/translations/en/renditions/native>

827 Fellet G, Marchiol L, Delle Vedove G, Peressotti A (2011) Application of biochar on mine tailings:
828 effects and perspectives for land reclamation, *Chemosphere* **83**: 1262–1267

829 Fernandez-Caliani JC, Giraldez MI, Waken WH, Del Río ZM, Cordoba F (2021) Soil quality changes
830 in an Iberian pyrite mine site 15 years after land reclamation, *Catena* **206**: 105538

831 Fuge R, Paveley CF and Holdham MT (1989) Heavy metal contamination in the Tanat Valley, North
832 Wales. *Environmental geochemistry and health* **11(3)**: 127-135

833 Gemmell RP (1972). Use of Waste Materials for Revegetation of Chromate Smelter Waste. *Nature* **240**:
834 569-571

835 Gomes HI, Jones A, Rogerson M, Burke IT, Mayes WM (2016). Vanadium removal and recovery from
836 bauxite residue leachates by ion exchange. *Environmental Science and Pollution Research* **23(22)**:
837 23034-23042

838 Gomes HI, Mayes WM, Rogerson M, Stewart DI, Burke IT (2016) Alkaline residues and the
839 environment: A review of impacts, management practices and opportunities. *Journal of Cleaner*
840 *Production* **112 (4)**: 3571-3582 doi: 10.1016/j.jclepro.2015.09.111

841 Grillet L, Schmidt W (2017) The multiple facets of root iron reduction. *Journal of Experimental*
842 *Botany* **68(18)**:5021-7

843 Gunarathne V, Rajapaksha AU, Vithanage M et al (2022) Hydrometallurgical processes for heavy
844 metals recovery from industrial sludges. *Critical Reviews in Environmental Science and*
845 *Technology* **52(6)**:1022-1062

846 Gunn G, Bate R, Jackson NC et al. (2008) Managing aggregates supply in England: a review of the
847 current system and future options. British Geological Survey Open Report, OR/08/042. 104pp.

848 Guo Z, Brusseau ML, Fogg GE (2019) Determining the long-term operational performance of pump
849 and treat and the possibility of closure for a large TCE plume, *Journal of Hazardous Materials* **365**:796-
850 803, <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jhazmat.2018.11.057>

851 Guo LQ, Shi DC, Wang DL (2010) The key physiological response to alkali stress by the alkali-
852 resistant halophyte *Puccinellia tenuiflora* is the accumulation of large quantities of organic acids and
853 into the rhizosphere, *Journal of Agronomy and Crop Science*, **196(2)**:123-35

854 Gutowski TG, Sahni S, Allwood JM, Ashby MF, Worrell E (2013) The energy required to produce
855 materials: constraints on energy-intensity improvements, parameters of demand. *Philosophical*
856 *Transactions of the Royal Society A: Mathematical, Physical and Engineering Sciences* **371(1986)**:
857 20120003

858 Haines-Young R, Potschin-Young M (2018) Revision of the common international classification for
859 ecosystem services (CICES V5. 1): a policy brief. *One Ecosystem* **(6)3**: 27108

860 Harwell MC, Jackson C, Kravitz M et al. (2021) Ecosystem services consideration in the remediation
861 process for contaminated sites, *Journal of Environmental Management* **285**: 112102

862 Hayes SM, McCullough EA (2018) Critical minerals: A review of elemental trends in comprehensive
863 criticality studies. *Resources Policy* **59**: 192-199.

864 Helal H M and Sauerbeck D (1989) Carbon turnover in the rhizosphere, *Journal of Plant Nutrition and*
865 *Soil Science* **152**: 211-216

866 Her Majesty's Government (2018) *Our Waste, Our Resources: A strategy for England*. Resources and
867 waste strategy for England - GOV.UK (www.gov.uk)

868 Hinsinger P, Plassard C, Tang C, Jaillard B (2003) Origins of root-mediated pH changes in the
869 rhizosphere and their responses to environmental constraints: a review. *Plant and soil*, **248(1)**:43-59

870 Hobson AJ, Stewart DI, Bray AW et al. (2018). Behaviour and fate of vanadium during the aerobic
871 neutralisation of hyperalkaline slag leachate. *Science of the total environment* **643**:1191-9

872 Hodson ME (2010) The need for sustainable soil remediation. *Elements* **6(6)**: 363-368

873 Iacovidou E, Velis CA, Purnell P et al. (2017) Metrics for optimising the multi-dimensional value of
874 resources recovered from waste in a circular economy: A critical review. *Journal of Cleaner Production*
875 **166**: 910-938

876 Jadhav UU, Hocheng H (2012) A review of recovery of metals from industrial waste. *Journal of*
877 *Achievements in Materials and Manufacturing Engineering* **54(2)**: 159-167

878 Jarvis AP, Mayes WM, Coulon P et al. (2012). Prioritisation of abandoned noncoal mine impacts on
879 the environment. SC030136/R2
880 [https://assets.publishing.service.gov.uk/government/uploads/system/uploads/attachment_data/file/290](https://assets.publishing.service.gov.uk/government/uploads/system/uploads/attachment_data/file/290866/scho1111bubx-e-e.pdf)
881 [866/scho1111bubx-e-e.pdf](https://assets.publishing.service.gov.uk/government/uploads/system/uploads/attachment_data/file/290866/scho1111bubx-e-e.pdf)

882 Jones PT, Geysen D, Tielemans Y et al. (2013) Enhanced Landfill Mining in view of multiple resource
883 recovery: a critical review. *Journal of Cleaner Production* **55**: 45-55

884 Kalmykova Y, Sadagopan M, Rosado L (2018) Circular economy—From review of theories and
885 practices to development of implementation tools. *Resources Conservation and Recycling* **135**: 190–
886 201

887 Kahhat RF and Kavazanjian E (2010) Preliminary feasibility study on the use of mono-disposal landfills
888 for e-waste as temporary storage for future mining. In *Proceedings of the 2010 IEEE International*
889 *Symposium on Sustainable Systems and Technology* pp. 1-5. IEEE.

890 Kinnunen PHM and Kaksonen AH (2019) Towards circular economy in mining: Opportunities and
891 bottlenecks for tailings valorization. *Journal of cleaner production* **228**: 153-160.

892 Korhonen J, Nuur C, Feldmann A, Birkie SE (2018) Circular economy as an essentially contested
893 concept. *Journal of cleaner production* **175**: 544-552

894 Krausmann F, Wiedenhofer D, Lauk C et al. (2017) Global socioeconomic material stocks rise 23-
895 fold over the 20th century and require half of annual resource use. *Proceedings of the National*
896 *Academy of Sciences* **114(8)**: 1880-1885

897 Kumpiene J, Lagerkvist A, Maurice C (2008) Stabilization of As, Cr, Cu, Pb and Zn in soil using
898 amendments – A review, *Waste Management* **28**: 215–225

899 Lee JA, Greenwood B (1976) The colonization by plants of calcareous wastes from the salt and alkali
900 industry in Cheshire, England. *Biological Conservation* **10**:131–150

901 Lelong F, Tardy Y, Grandin G , Trescases JJ, Boulangé B (1976) Pedogenesis, chemical weathering
902 and processes of formation of some supergene ore deposits. In *Supergene and Surficial Ore Deposits;*
903 *Texture and Fabrics* **3**: 93-173

904 Li X, Bardos P, Cundy A, Harder MK et al. (2019) Using a conceptual site model for assessing the
905 sustainability of brownfield regeneration for a soft reuse: A case study of Port Sunlight River Park
906 (U.K.), *Science of The Total Environment* **652**: 810-821

907 Li XF, Zuo FH, Ling GZ, Li YY, Yu YX, Yang PQ, Tang XL(2009) Secretion of citrate from roots in
908 response to aluminum and low phosphorus stresses in *Stylosanthes*, *Plant and Soil* **325(1)**: 219-29

909 Lima AT, Ottosen LM, Pedersen AJ, Ribeiro AB (2008) Characterization of fly ash from bio and
910 municipal waste. *Biomass and bioenergy* **32(3)**: 277-282

911 Luo H, Cheng Y, He D, Yang EH (2019) Review of leaching behavior of municipal solid waste
912 incineration (MSWI) ash. *Science of the total environment* **668**: 90-103

913 MacGregor CJ, Bunting MJ, Deutz P et al. (2022) Brownfield sites promote biodiversity at a landscape
914 scale. *Science of the Total Environment* **804**: 150162

915 Marschner H (1995) *Mineral Nutrition of Higher Plants*, Ed 2, Academic Press, London

916 Meyer W, Schuster RL, Sabol MA (1994) Potential for seepage erosion of landslide dam. *Journal of*
917 *Geotechnical Engineering* **120(7)**:1211-29

918 McDowall W, Geng Y, Huang B et al. (2017) Circular economy policies in China and Europe. *Journal*
919 *of Industrial Ecology* **21(3)**: 651-661

920 Mink F, Dirks W, Van Raalte G, De Vlieger H, Russel M (2006) *Terra et Aqua* **104** [https://www.iadc-](https://www.iadc-dredging.com/wp-content/uploads/2017/02/article-impact-of-european-union-environmental-law-on-dredging-104-1.pdf)
921 [dredging.com/wp-content/uploads/2017/02/article-impact-of-european-union-environmental-law-on-](https://www.iadc-dredging.com/wp-content/uploads/2017/02/article-impact-of-european-union-environmental-law-on-dredging-104-1.pdf)
922 [dredging-104-1.pdf](https://www.iadc-dredging.com/wp-content/uploads/2017/02/article-impact-of-european-union-environmental-law-on-dredging-104-1.pdf)

923 Mora-Macías J, Ojeda-Rivera JO, Gutiérrez-Alanís D et al. (2017) Malate-dependent Fe accumulation
924 is a critical checkpoint in the root developmental response to low phosphate. *Proceedings of the*
925 *National Academy of Sciences*. **114(17)**:3563-72

926 MPA (2017)
927 [https://www.ukmineralsforum.org.uk/downloads/Agenda_2a_MPA_Long_term_aggreates_demand_s](https://www.ukmineralsforum.org.uk/downloads/Agenda_2a_MPA_Long_term_aggreates_demand_supply_scenarios.pdf)
928 [upply_scenarios.pdf](https://www.ukmineralsforum.org.uk/downloads/Agenda_2a_MPA_Long_term_aggreates_demand_supply_scenarios.pdf)

929

930 Nathanail CP, Earl N (2001) *Human Health Risk Assessment: Guideline Values and Magic Numbers*.
931 *In: Assessment and Reclamation of Contaminated Land* (Eds; R. E. Hester, R. M. Harrison). Thomas
932 Telford.

933 Natural England (2021) *Biodiversity Metric 3.0*.
934 <http://www.nepubprod.appspot.com/publication/6049804846366720>.

935 O'Neill C, Gray NF, Williams M (1998) Evaluation of the rehabilitation procedure of a pyritic mine
936 tailings pond in Avoca, Southeast Ireland. *Land Degradation and Development* **9**:67–79

937 Palumbo-Roe B and Colman T (2010) *The nature of waste associated with closed mines in England and*
938 *Wales*. British Geological Survey, Keyworth, Nottingham 88 p.
939 <http://nora.nerc.ac.uk/10083/1/OR10014.pdf>

940 Pan SY, Chen YH, Fan LS et al. (2020) CO₂ mineralization and utilization by alkaline solid wastes for
941 potential carbon reduction. *Nature Sustainability* **3(5)**: 399-405

942 Pat-Espadas AM, Loredo Portales R, Amabilis-Sosa LE, Gómez G and Vidal G (2018) Review of
943 constructed wetlands for acid mine drainage treatment, *Water* **10(11)**: 1685.

944 Peñalver-Alcalá AJ, Álvarez-Rogel S, Peixoto I et al. (2021). The relationships between functional
945 and physicochemical soil parameters in metal(loid) mine tailings from Mediterranean semiarid areas
946 support the value of spontaneous vegetation colonization for phytomanagement. *Ecological*
947 *Engineering* **168**: 106293

948 Peppicelli C, Cleall PJ, Sapsford DJ, Harbottle MJ (2018) Changes in metal speciation and mobility
949 during electrokinetic treatment of industrial wastes: Implications for remediation and resource recovery,
950 *Science of The Total Environment* **624**: 1488-1503, <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.scitotenv.2017.12.132>.

951 Pereira P, Bogunovic I, Muñoz-Rojas M, Brevik EC (2018) Soil ecosystem services, sustainability,
952 valuation and management. *Current Opinion in Environmental Science & Health* **5**: 7-13

953 Perkins L, Royal AC, Jefferson I, Hills CD (2021) The use of recycled and secondary aggregates to
954 achieve a circular economy within geotechnical engineering. *Geotechnics* **1(2)**: 416-438

955 Petrovan SO, Dixie J, Yapp E, Wheeler PM (2017) Bioenergy crops and farmland biodiversity: benefits
956 and limitations are scale-dependant for a declining mammal, the brown hare. *European Journal of*
957 *Wildlife Research* **63(3)**:1-8

958 Phillips R, Courtney R (2022). Long term field trials demonstrate sustainable nutrient supply and uptake
959 in rehabilitated bauxite residue, *Science of the Total Environment* **804**: 150134

960 Power G, Gräfe M, Klauber C (2011) Bauxite residue issues: I. Current management, disposal and
961 storage practices. *Hydrometallurgy* **108(1-2)**: 33-45

962 Pullin H, Bray AW, Burke IT et al. (2019) Atmospheric carbon capture performance of legacy iron and
963 steel waste. *Environmental science & technology* **53(16)**:9502-11

964 Pullin H, Bray AW, Burke IT et al. (2019) Atmospheric carbon capture performance of legacy iron and
965 steel waste. *Environmental science & technology* **53(16)**: 9502-9511

966 Rahman ML, Tarrant, S., McCollin, D. and Ollerton, J. (2013) Plant community composition and
967 attributes reveal conservation implications for newly created grassland on capped landfill sites. *Journal*
968 *for Nature Conservation* **21**: 198-205.

969 Reinhart DR and Basel Al-Yousfi A (1996) The impact of leachate recirculation on municipal solid
970 waste landfill operating characteristics. *Waste Management & Research* **14(4)**: 337-346.

971 Renella G (2021) Recycling and Reuse of Sediments in Agriculture: Where Is the Problem?.
972 *Sustainability* **13(4)**: 1648.

973 Renforth P (2019) The negative emission potential of alkaline materials. *Nature communications* **10(1)**:
974 1-8

975 Riley AL, MacDonald JM, Burke IT et al. (2020) Legacy iron and steel wastes in the UK: Extent,
976 resource potential, and management futures. *Journal of Geochemical Exploration* **219**: 106630.

977 Ritzkowski M and Stegmann R (2012) Landfill aeration worldwide: concepts, indications and findings.
978 *Waste Management* **32(7)**: 1411-1419

979 Santini TC, Fey MV (2013) Spontaneous vegetation encroachment upon bauxite residue (red mud) as
980 an indicator and facilitator of in situ remediation processes, *Environ. Sci. Technol.* **47**: 12089–12096.

981 Santini TC, Kerr JL, Warren LA (2015) Microbially-driven strategies for bioremediation of bauxite
982 residue, *Journal of Hazardous Materials* **293**: 131–157

983 Sapsford DJ, Crane RA and Sinnott D (2019) An exploration of key concepts in application of in situ
984 processes for recovery of resources from high-volume industrial and mine wastes. In *Resource*
985 *Recovery from Wastes: Towards a Circular Economy* (pp. 141-167). Royal Society of Chemistry.

986 Sapsford DJ, Cleall PJ and Harbottle MJ (2017) In situ resource recovery from waste repositories:
987 exploring the potential for mobilization and capture of metals from Anthropogenic ores. *Journal of*
988 *Sustainable Metallurgy* **3(2)**: 375-392

989 Sarathchandra SS, Rengel Z, Solaiman ZM (2022) Remediation of heavy metal-contaminated iron ore
990 tailings by applying compost and growing perennial ryegrass (*Lolium perenne* L.), *Chemosphere* **288**:
991 132573

992 Schenkeveld WD, Oburger E, Gruber B et al (2014) Metal mobilization from soils by
993 phytosiderophores—experiment and equilibrium modeling. *Plant and soil* **383(1)**:59-71

994 Scherer MM, Richter S, Valentine RL, Alvarez PJ (2000) Chemistry and microbiology of permeable
995 reactive barriers for in situ groundwater clean up, *Critical reviews in microbiology* **26(4)**: 221-264

996 Sethurajan M, van Hullebusch ED, Nancharaiah YV(2018) Biotechnology in the management and
997 resource recovery from metal bearing solid wastes: Recent advances. *Journal of environmental*
998 *management* **211**: 138-153

999 Shu WS, Xia HP, Zhang ZQ, Lan CY, Wong MH (2002) Use of Vetiver and Three Other Grasses for
1000 Revegetation of Pb/Zn Mine Tailings: Field Experiment, *International Journal of Phytoremediation*
1001 **4(1)**: 47-57, doi: 10.1080/15226510208500072

1002 Shaw RA, Petavratzi E, Bloodworth AJ (2013) Resource recovery from mine waste. In *Waste as a*
1003 *Resource* (Hester RE and Harrison RM eds). Royal Society of Chemistry. Royal Society of Chemistry:
1004 Cambridge, UK, vol. 37, pp. 44-65

1005 Sinnett D (2019) Going to waste? The potential impacts on nature conservation and cultural heritage
1006 from resource recovery on former mineral extraction sites in England and Wales. *Journal of*
1007 *Environmental Planning and Management* **62(7)**: 1227-1248

1008 Sinnett D, Sardo AM (2020) Former metal mining landscapes in England and Wales: Five perspectives
1009 from local residents. *Landscape and Urban Planning* **193**: 103685

1010 Smith P, Haszeldine, RS and Smith SM (2016) Preliminary assessment of the potential for, and
1011 limitations to, terrestrial negative emission technologies in the UK. *Environmental Science: Processes
1012 & Impacts* **18(11)**: 1400-1405.

1013 Somlai J, Jobbagy V, Kovacs J, Tarján S, Kovács T (2008) Radiological aspects of the usability of red
1014 mud as building material additive. *Journal of hazardous Materials* **150(3)**: 541-545

1015 Song Y, Kirkwood N, Maksimović C et al. (2019) Nature based solutions for contaminated land
1016 remediation and brownfield redevelopment in cities: A review. *Science of The Total Environment* **663**:
1017 568-579

1018 Sovacool BK, Ali SH, Bazilian M et al. (2020) Sustainable minerals and metals for a low-carbon future.
1019 *Science* **367(6473)**: 30-33

1020 Spooren J, Binnemans K, Björkmalm J et al. (2020) Near-zero-waste processing of low-grade, complex
1021 primary ores and secondary raw materials in Europe: technology development trends. *Resources,
1022 Conservation and Recycling* **1(160)**: 104919

1023 Strange J, Langdon N, Large A (2016). *Contaminated Land Guidance*. Thomas Telford

1024 Stenis J, Hogland W (2002) The polluter-pays principle and its environmental consequences for
1025 industrial waste management. *Environment, development and sustainability* **4(4)**: 361-369

1026 Szabó S, Bódis K, Kougias I et al. (2017) A methodology for maximizing the benefits of solar landfills
1027 on closed sites. *Renewable and Sustainable Energy Reviews* **76**: 1291-1300

1028 Tang P, Florea M, Spiesz P, Brouwers H (2015) Characteristics and application potential of municipal
1029 solid waste incineration (MSWI) bottom ashes from two waste-to-energy plants. *Construction and
1030 Building Materials* **83**: 77-94

1031 Tang J, Steenari BM (2016) Leaching optimization of municipal solid waste incineration ash for
1032 resource recovery: A case study of Cu, Zn, Pb and Cd. *Waste Management* **48**:315-22

1033 Tarrant S, Ollerton J, Rahman ML, Tarrant J, McCollin D (2012) Grassland restoration on landfill sites
1034 in the East Midlands, United Kingdom: A evaluation of floral resources and pollinating insects.
1035 Restoration Ecology **21**: 560-568

1036 Tayebi-Khorami M, Edraki M, Corder G, Golev A (2019) Re-Thinking Mining Waste through an
1037 Integrative Approach Led by Circular Economy Aspirations. Minerals **9(5)**: 286

1038 Toledo C and Scognamiglio A (2021) Agrivoltaic systems design and assessment: A critical review,
1039 and a descriptive model towards a sustainable landscape vision (Three-Dimensional Agrivoltaic
1040 Patterns) Sustainability **13**: 6871.

1041 Tolvik (2017) <https://www.tolvik.com/published-reports/view/uk-dedicated-biomass-statistics-2017-2/>

1042 Toledo C; Scognamiglio A (2021) Agrivoltaic Systems Design and Assessment: A Critical Review, and
1043 a Descriptive Model towards a Sustainable Landscape Vision (Three-Dimensional Agrivoltaic
1044 Patterns). Sustainability **13**: 6871

1045 Ujaczki É, Zimmermann YS, Gasser CA et al. (2017) Red mud as secondary source for critical raw
1046 materials–extraction study. Journal of Chemical Technology & Biotechnology **92(11)**: 2835-2844
1047 <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.resourpol.2018.06.015>

1048 United Nations (2015) Transforming our world: the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development:
1049 <https://sdgs.un.org/2030agenda>

1050 Upadhyay A, Laing T, Kumar V, Dora M (2021) Exploring barriers and drivers to the implementation
1051 of circular economy practices in the mining industry, Resources Policy **72**: 102037

1052 Vassilev SV, Baxter D, Andersen LK, Vassileva CG (2013) An overview of the composition and
1053 application of biomass ash, Part 1. Phase–mineral and chemical composition and classification, Fuel
1054 **105**:40-76.

1055 Wagner J and Bilitewski B (2009) The temporary storage of municipal solid waste–Recommendations
1056 for a safe operation of interim storage facilities, Waste Management **29(5)**: 1693-1701

1057 Wali MK (1999). Ecological succession and the rehabilitation of disturbed terrestrial ecosystems. *Plant*
1058 *and Soil* **213(1/2)**: 195-220

1059 Walker DJ, Clemente R, Pilar Bernal M (2004). Contrasting effects of manure and compost on soil
1060 pH, heavy metal availability and growth of *Chenopodium album* L. in a soil contaminated by pyritic
1061 mine waste, *Chemosphere* **57**, 215–224

1062 Warith M (2002) Bioreactor landfills: experimental and field results, *Waste Management* **22(1)**: 7-17

1063 Wen Z, Xie Y, Chen M and Dinga CD (2021) China's plastic import ban increases prospects of
1064 environmental impact mitigation of plastic waste trade flow worldwide. *Nature communications*, **12(1)**:
1065 1-9

1066 Wolkersdorfer C, Bowell R (2004) Contemporary reviews of mine water studies in Europe, *Mine Water*
1067 *and the Environment***23(4)**:161

1068 Wong MH. 2003. Ecological restoration of mine degraded soils with emphasis on metal contaminated
1069 soils. *Chemosphere* **50**: 775–780

1070 Woods-Ballard B, Kellagher R, Martin P et al. (2007). *The SUDS manual* (Vol. 697). London: Ciria.

1071 Yang ZY, Yuan JG, Xin GR, Chang HT, Wong MH (1997) Germination, growth and nodulation of
1072 *Sesbania rostrata* grown in Pb/Zn mine tailings. *Environmental Management* **21**: 617–622

1073 World Bank Group (2017) *The growing role of minerals and metals for a low carbon future*. World
1074 Bank.

1075 Zabielska-Adamska K (2020) Hydraulic conductivity of fly ash as a barrier material: some problems in
1076 determination. *Environ Earth Sci* **79(321)** <https://doi.org/10.1007/s12665-020-09070-8>

1077 Zalesny Jr. R, Zhu JY, Headlee, WL et al. (2020) Ecosystem services, physiology, and biofuels
1078 recalcitrance of poplars grown for landfill phytoremediation, *Plants* **9(10)**: 1357.

1079 Zhai J, Burke IT, Mayes WM, Stewart DI (2020). New insights into biomass combustion ash
1080 categorisation: a phylogenetic analysis, *Fuel* **1(287)**:119469

1081 Zhai J, Burke IT, Stewart DI (2021) Beneficial management of biomass combustion ashes. Renewable
1082 and Sustainable Energy Reviews **151**: 111555. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.rser.2021.111555>

1083 Zhai J, Burke IT, Stewart DI (2022) Potential reuse options for biomass combustion ash as affected by
1084 the persistent organic pollutants (POPs) content, Journal of Hazardous Materials Advances **1(5)**:
1085 100038.

1086 Zhu F, Li X, Xue S, Hartley W, Wu C, Han F (2016) Natural plant colonization improves the physical
1087 condition of bauxite residue over time. Environmental Science and Pollution Research **23(22)**:22897-
1088 905

1089

1090