

This is an Open Access document downloaded from ORCA, Cardiff University's institutional repository:<https://orca.cardiff.ac.uk/id/eprint/158499/>

This is the author's version of a work that was submitted to / accepted for publication.

Citation for final published version:

Casanova Dias, Marisa, Kelson, Mark, Gordon-Smith, Katherine, Perry, Amy, Craddock, Nick, Jones, Lisa, Di Florio, Arianna and Jones, Ian 2023. Borderline personality traits are differently associated with postpartum psychosis and postpartum depression episodes in women with bipolar disorder. *Journal of Affective Disorders* 328, pp. 81-86. 10.1016/j.jad.2023.01.124

Publishers page: <http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.jad.2023.01.124>

Please note:

Changes made as a result of publishing processes such as copy-editing, formatting and page numbers may not be reflected in this version. For the definitive version of this publication, please refer to the published source. You are advised to consult the publisher's version if you wish to cite this paper.

This version is being made available in accordance with publisher policies. See <http://orca.cf.ac.uk/policies.html> for usage policies. Copyright and moral rights for publications made available in ORCA are retained by the copyright holders.



# **Borderline personality traits are differently associated with postpartum psychosis and postpartum depression episodes in women with bipolar disorder**

## **Authors**

Marisa Casanova Dias<sup>1,2</sup>, Mark Kelson<sup>3</sup>, Katherine Gordon-Smith<sup>4</sup>, Amy Perry<sup>4</sup>, Nick Craddock<sup>1</sup>, Lisa Jones<sup>4</sup>, Arianna Di Florio<sup>1</sup>, Ian Jones<sup>1</sup>

<sup>1</sup>National Centre for Mental Health, Cardiff University School of Medicine, Cardiff, UK

<sup>2</sup>Section of Women's Mental Health, King's College London, London, UK

<sup>3</sup>University of Exeter College of Engineering Mathematics and Physical Sciences, Exeter, UK

<sup>4</sup>University of Worcester, Department of Psychological Medicine, Worcester, UK

<sup>5</sup>University of Worcester, Department of Psychological Medicine, Worcester, UK

## **Corresponding author**

Marisa Casanova Dias

National Centre for Mental Health, Cardiff University,

Hadyn Ellis Building, Maindy Road

Cardiff, CF24 4HQ

UK

casanovadiasm@cardiff.ac.uk

## **Abstract**

**Background** Women with bipolar disorder have approximately 40%-50% chance of having a perinatal bipolar recurrence. Knowing the factors associated will be beneficial for the prediction and prevention of episodes. We aim to establish if borderline personality disorder traits, as measured by the BEST (Borderline Evaluation of Severity over Time) scale, are associated with perinatal psychiatric outcomes.

**Methods** We recruited women with bipolar disorder as part of the BDRN (Bipolar Disorder Research Network) study. Women were interviewed and we collected their demographic and clinical information. Participants subsequently completed the BEST questionnaire. We analysed the association of BEST scores with lifetime presence/absence of perinatal bipolar relapse and, employing multinomial logistic regression, with different subtypes of perinatal outcomes: postpartum psychosis; postpartum depression, and other episodes.

**Results** In our sample of 807, although there was no significant association between the BEST total score and perinatal episodes as a whole (adjustedOR 1.01 CI95%[0.99, 1.03],  $p=0.204$ ), we found significant differing associations with different subtypes of episodes. Women scoring highly on BEST were less likely to experience a postpartum psychotic episode (RRR 0.96 CI95%[0.94, 0.99],  $p=0.005$ ) but more likely to experience a non-psychotic depressive episode (RRR 1.03 CI95%[1.01, 1.05],  $p=0.007$ ) than no relapse.

**Limitations** This study is limited by its cross-sectional design and self-report nature of BEST.

**Conclusions** In women with bipolar disorder, borderline traits differentiate the risk of postpartum depression and postpartum psychosis, emphasise the importance of considering risk factors for these perinatal episodes separately, and may help individualise the risk for women in the perinatal period.

**Keywords:** Borderline personality traits, Bipolar Affective Disorders, Postpartum psychosis, Postpartum depression, Perinatal Psychiatry

1 **Introduction**

2 Perinatal episodes can have a major impact on women, their families and costs to  
3 society(Bauer et al., 2014): suicide is a leading cause of maternal death(Knight et al., 2019),  
4 illness can influence bonding with the baby and relationships can suffer(Stein et al., 2016).  
5 Therefore, being able to identify women at highest risk and working to prevent those illness  
6 episodes is a clinical, research and public health priority. Bipolar disorder affects 1-3% of the  
7 population(Merikangas et al., 2007) and for those women childbirth is a period of high risk  
8 with around of 40-50% experiencing a recurrence, which can be a manic or depressive  
9 episode, including in 20% a severe episode of postpartum psychosis(Di Florio et al., 2013;  
10 Jones et al., 2014; Wesseloo et al., 2016).

11

12 The literature suggests that co-morbid borderline personality disorder has an adverse  
13 impact on outcomes in those with bipolar disorder (e.g. suicidality and higher number of  
14 mood episodes)(Frías et al., 2016). Several factors have been studied and linked to the  
15 development of perinatal episodes in women with bipolar disorder(Jones et al., 2014) but  
16 personality disorder traits have not yet been a major focus of these studies, with only a few  
17 covering personality traits in general(Marks et al., 1992; Perry et al., 2019) and none dealing  
18 with borderline personality disorder traits specifically.

19

20 The aim of our study is to test whether borderline personality disorder traits, as assessed by  
21 the *Borderline Evaluation of Severity Over Time* (BEST) questionnaire are associated with  
22 lifetime perinatal mood episodes in women with bipolar disorder.

23

24

## 25 **Methods**

### 26 *Sample*

27 We recruited participants as part of a large, on-going programme of research investigating  
28 genetic and non-genetic determinants of mood disorders (Bipolar Disorder Research  
29 Network, BDRN; [www.bdrn.org](http://www.bdrn.org)). We recruited participants systematically through the UK  
30 National Health Service (NHS) and non-systematically via the BDRN website, via the media  
31 (television, radio, press, social media) and patient support groups (such as Bipolar UK and  
32 Action on Postpartum Psychosis). The research programme inclusion criteria required  
33 participants to be aged 18 years or over, UK White ethnicity due to a focus on genetic  
34 aetiology, able to provide written informed consent, meet DSM-IV criteria for bipolar  
35 disorder and for mood symptoms to have started before the age of 65 years. We excluded  
36 potential participants if they had only experienced affective illness as a result of alcohol or  
37 substance misuse, or secondary to medication or another medical illness.

38

39 We included in this study participants with a lifetime DSM-IV(American Psychiatric  
40 Association, 2013) diagnosis of Bipolar disorder (type I, type II, schizoaffective bipolar and  
41 NOS) and who were parous women.

42

43 Participants were assessed by team members either at a clinic, at their house, or via  
44 telephone or videocall. The assessment included an interview where demographic, clinical  
45 and pregnancy related information was collected, the administration of questionnaires and  
46 review of case notes where available. We used the Schedules for Clinical Assessment in  
47 Neuropsychiatry (SCAN)(Wing et al., 1990), a semi-structured interview which was  
48 administered by trained research psychiatrists or psychologists to assess clinical outcomes.

49 We made best-estimate main lifetime diagnosis according to DSM-IV(American Psychiatric  
50 Association, 2013) criteria and rated key clinical variables, such as age at onset of  
51 impairment and number of admissions. In cases of ambiguity, at least two members of the  
52 research team made the clinical and diagnostic ratings blinded to each other and consensus  
53 was agreed through discussion. For inter-rater reliability, mean kappa statistics were 0.85  
54 for DSM-IV diagnosis, 0.97 for perinatal mood episodes and between 0.81 and 0.99 for  
55 other key clinical categorical variables. Mean intra-class correlation coefficients were  
56 between 0.91 and 0.97 for key clinical continuous variables.(Perry et al., 2016)

57

#### 58 *Measuring borderline personality disorder traits*

59 We measured borderline personality disorder traits using *The Borderline Evaluation of*  
60 *Severity Over Time* (BEST) scale(Blum et al., 2002; Pfohl et al., 2009), which was sent to  
61 participants as a mail-out in 2013 as follow-up questionnaire. Participants were asked to  
62 rate the items thinking about the course of their life in general (i.e. not specifically about  
63 episodes of mood illness). The BEST scale is a 15-item self-rated questionnaire to assesses  
64 borderline personality disorder traits. It was originally developed to allow patients on a  
65 cognitive-behavioural systems-based group treatment to rate the degree of impairment  
66 from each of the nine borderline personality disorder criteria over the previous week.(Blum  
67 et al., 2002) Each item is rated in a scale from 1 to 5 (lowest to highest rating of severity). It  
68 originally consisted of 3 subscales (A, B and C) with each item rated in a five-point scale.  
69 Subscale C was about positive behaviours related to that treatment program and not  
70 relevant to our study. Therefore, in our study we used subscale A which measures thoughts  
71 and feelings (8 items, range 8-40) and subscale B which measures negative behaviours (4  
72 items, range 4-20) and the total scores of the version we used ranged from 12 to 60. We

73 used the BEST to measure the severity of such symptoms over lifetime, making an  
74 assumption on the temporal stability (trait rather than state) of the BEST and did not use cut  
75 offs as we were interested in the impact of traits on perinatal outcomes across the range of  
76 symptoms experienced rather than merely in those with a formal co-morbid diagnosis.  
77 At the time the BEST questionnaire was completed, participants' current mood state was  
78 also measured using the Beck Depression Inventory (BDI) (Beck et al., 1961) and the Altman  
79 Mania Scale (AMS)(Altman et al., 1997).

80

### 81 *Co-variates*

82 We selected potential confounders based on the literature and agreed with the research  
83 team: age at interview, age at onset of impairment of bipolar disorder, number of  
84 admissions, family history of postnatal mental illness, number of pregnancies, diagnosis  
85 subtype (bipolar type I, type II, schizoaffective bipolar and NOS) and current mood  
86 measured by the BDI (Beck et al., 1961) and AMS (Altman et al., 1997) scales).

87

### 88 *Lifetime perinatal psychiatric outcomes*

89 Our outcomes of interest were lifetime perinatal psychiatric outcomes. They were assessed  
90 during the interview and complemented by information from case notes where available.  
91 Mood and psychotic symptomatology of perinatal episodes was assessed using the SCAN.  
92 We were interested in the most severe postpartum episode experienced and took a lifetime  
93 approach: for each participant the most severe perinatal psychiatric episode was rated as  
94 the lifetime most impairing perinatal episode and considered as outcome i.e. if one  
95 participant had a postpartum psychotic episode in one pregnancy and a postpartum non-  
96 psychotic depressive episode in another pregnancy, the psychotic episode was rated.



97 Women were grouped according to lifetime occurrence of perinatal psychiatric outcomes: 0  
98 = no relapse despite giving birth; 1 = Postpartum Psychosis (PPP) defined as postpartum  
99 mania / psychotic episode, which includes all psychotic and/or manic episodes occurring  
100 within 6 weeks of giving birth (PPP); 2 = postpartum non-psychotic depressive episode  
101 (PNPD) occurring within 6 weeks of giving birth; 3 = other perinatal episodes, which include  
102 those which do not meet criteria for categories mentioned above, such as hypomania or  
103 mood episode with onset during pregnancy or beyond six weeks (see Supplement Figure 1  
104 and Table 1).

105

106 We chose these categories based on the severity of episodes, and consistent with the  
107 approach we took in other studies (Di Florio et al., 2013). We were interested in episodes  
108 with onset within 6 weeks of childbirth as these are more likely to be triggered by childbirth  
109 and to be consistent with both ICD (within 6 weeks) and DSM (within 4 weeks) temporal  
110 definitions of the postpartum period.

111

### 112 *Analysis*

113 The data was analysed using Stata IC version 16 for Mac OS.

114 We tested the association between BEST scores and perinatal psychiatric outcomes in two  
115 main ways using logistic regression. Firstly, we tested the association between BEST scores  
116 and presence of perinatal relapse using binary logistic regression (relapse vs no relapse). We  
117 then conducted multinomial logistic regression analysis with the four perinatal psychiatric  
118 outcomes as outcome variable (PPP vs PNPD vs other perinatal episodes vs no relapse), and  
119 the BEST scores as main exposure variable.

120 BEST scores were calculated by adding the scores of each individual item and were used in  
121 the analysis as a continuous variable. In addition to the BEST total scores, we considered the  
122 two subscales of BEST (total score of each subscale) and scores (scale of 1 to 5) of some  
123 individual questions. As there is some overlap in the symptoms of borderline and bipolar  
124 disorders we conducted further analysis at the level of individual BEST items focusing only  
125 on those that represent symptoms of borderline personality disorder but not bipolar  
126 disorder: fear of abandonment, major shifts in opinion of others, feelings of emptiness and  
127 'going to extremes to keep someone from leaving you' (items 1,2,7 and 9).

128 We conducted a sensitivity analysis, splitting total BEST scores into quintiles (Supplement  
129 Figure 2) to explore the relationship and assist interpretation. We performed further  
130 sensitivity analysis including only those with bipolar subtype I as they are the ones likely to  
131 experience postpartum psychosis.(Di Florio et al., 2013)

132

133 Multinomial regression is an extension of logistic regression that is used when a categorical  
134 outcome variable has more than two values and predictor variables are continuous or  
135 categorical. Therefore, we used multinomial regression to predict which of the possible  
136 perinatal psychiatric outcomes a woman is likely to belong to, compared to a reference  
137 category (no relapse) and given certain other information (co-variates). We performed  
138 multinomial logistic regression, unadjusted (not presented) and then adjusting for the pre-  
139 specified potential confounders. We present the results as Relative Risk Ratios (RRR) for  
140 ease of interpretation. We did the standard model fitting checks to test for collinearity  
141 between the predicting variables and were able to include all pre-specified variables except  
142 BDI as it was significantly and highly correlated (0.6) with BEST total scores.

143 A complete case-analysis approach was employed for all analyses.

144

145 *Ethical approval*

146 The authors assert that all procedures contributing to this work comply with the ethical  
147 standards of the relevant national and institutional committees on human experimentation  
148 and with the Helsinki Declaration of 1975, as revised in 2008. All procedures involving  
149 human participants had NHS Health Research Authority (HRA) approval – Research Ethics  
150 Committee (REC) reference ((MREC/97/7/01) and local approvals in all participating NHS  
151 Trusts/Health Boards. Written informed consent was obtained from all participants.

152

153 **Results**

154 *Sample*

155 Eight hundred and seven women who met the inclusion criteria for the BDRN study, were  
156 parous and had completed the BEST questionnaire were included in the analysis (see  
157 Supplement flowchart Figure 1).

158 The mean age at interview was 50.3 years and the median number of pregnancies was 2.

159 The majority (66.0%) had a diagnosis of bipolar disorder type I (Table 1), because BDRN  
160 recruitment focused on more severe forms of bipolar disorder.

161

162 [Table 1 here]

163

164 *Association between BEST scores and overall perinatal recurrence*

165 We first looked at whether BEST scores were associated with the lifetime presence of  
166 perinatal recurrence in our sample, employing binary logistic regression and adjusting for  
167 the cofounders mentioned above. There was no significant association between the BEST

168 total score and presence of any perinatal episodes (aOR 1.01 CI95% [0.99, 1.03], p= 0.204).  
169 A sensitivity analysis with total BEST scores split in quintiles did not change the results.  
170 There was also no significant association between the score of BEST subscale A (aOR 1.05  
171 CI95% [0.99, 1.04], p= 0.230) or subscale B (aOR 1.03 CI95% [0.98, 1.09], p= 0.214) with  
172 overall perinatal recurrence.

173

#### 174 *Association between BEST scores and subtypes of perinatal psychiatric outcomes*

175 Although we found no association between postpartum episodes as a whole and BEST  
176 scores, we then looked at the relationship of BEST scores with the different subtypes of  
177 perinatal psychiatric outcome groups (postpartum psychosis, postpartum depression and  
178 other perinatal episodes). We found that after controlling for potential confounders,  
179 women who had higher BEST total scores were significantly less likely to have a postpartum  
180 psychotic episode (RRR 0.96 CI 95%[0.94, 0.99] p=0.005) and significantly more likely to  
181 have a non-psychotic depressive episode within 6 weeks of childbirth (RRR 1.03 CI 95%  
182 [1.01, 1.05] p=0.007) or to have other perinatal episode (RRR 1.03 CI 95% [1.00, 1.05]  
183 p=0.021) than no relapse. Table 2 and Figure 1 show the Relative Risk Ratio (RRR),  
184 estimating the probability of women having any relapse relative to 'no relapse' (the most  
185 common perinatal psychiatric outcome), derived from the fully adjusted multinomial logistic  
186 regression model. For BEST subscale A (thoughts and feelings) and subscale B (negative  
187 behaviours), we observed exactly the same pattern of associations and same significant  
188 associations as BEST total score (See Table 2).

189

190 [Figure 1 here]

191 [Table 2 here]

192

193 In particular, those who scored on the highest quintile of BEST compared with those who  
194 scored on the lowest quintile had a significantly lower risk of PPP than no relapse (RRR 0.33  
195 CI 95% [0.12, 0.90, p=0.031], see Supplement Table 2. On the other hand, for those who  
196 never developed postpartum psychosis, but instead developed an episode of non-psychotic  
197 postpartum depression, the highest their BEST total score the more likely to develop  
198 postpartum depression. For those in the highest BEST quintile their RRR was 2.62 higher (CI  
199 95% [1.13, 6.09] p=0.025) than those on the lowest quintile, see Supplement Table 2.

200

201 Restricting analysis to those with a diagnosis of bipolar I does not change the findings of  
202 associations with BEST total scores. The same associations between BEST total scores and  
203 perinatal psychiatric outcomes are significant in all groups (see Supplement Table 3).

204

205 Figure 2 shows the predicted probabilities of the outcomes PPP and PNPd given BEST scores  
206 at intervals of 10. PPP probability decreases with increasing BEST scores whilst PNPd  
207 increases.

208

209 [Figure 2 here]

210

211 A further sensitivity analysis where 'other perinatal episodes' were considered together  
212 with no relapse showed the same pattern of association: those who had higher BEST total  
213 scores were significantly less likely to have a postpartum psychotic episode RRR 0.95 (CI  
214 95% [0.93, 0.97] p=0.001) and more likely to have a PNPd RRR 1.02 (CI 95% [1.00, 1.03]  
215 p=0.083) compared to no relapse, although the latter is not significant. If we exclude people

216 with those ‘other perinatal episodes’ from the analysis the same pattern of association  
217 remains, both significantly – RRR 0.97 (CI 95% [0.94, 0.99] p=0.010) for PPP and RRR 1.03 (CI  
218 95% [1.01, 1.05] p=0.006) for PNPd.

219

#### 220 *Analysis of individual traits measured by BEST*

221 We found the same pattern of results of the main analysis. All these traits were negatively  
222 associated with PPP and positively associated with PNPd, with the majority p=<0.05 (See  
223 table 2).

224

225

#### 226 **Discussion**

227 This is the first time, to our knowledge that borderline personality disorder traits have been  
228 assessed in women with a diagnosis of bipolar disorder and in relation to psychiatric  
229 outcomes following childbirth.

230 We found that there was no significant association between BEST scores and having a  
231 perinatal recurrence when all perinatal episodes were considered together. Interestingly,  
232 however, when we distinguished between different types of perinatal psychiatric episodes,  
233 namely postpartum psychosis and postpartum depression, we were able to find significant  
234 and relevant associations in opposite directions. Women with higher BEST scores were  
235 significantly less likely to have experienced an episode of postpartum psychosis (RRR 0.96  
236 CI95% [0.94, 0.99], p=0.005) but significantly more likely to have experienced an episode of  
237 non-psychotic postpartum depression (RRR 1.03 CI95% [1.01, 1.05] p=0.007) than no  
238 relapse.

239

240 *Possible explanations for these findings*

241 Given the overlap in symptoms between bipolar disorder and borderline personality

242 disorder and the difficulty often in distinguishing clinically between these

243 diagnoses(Zimmerman and Morgan, 2013), one explanation of our results could be that

244 those with the highest BEST scores are misdiagnosed as bipolar disorder and should more

245 appropriately be labelled under the personality disorder rubric(Saunders et al., 2015). As

246 not representing 'true' bipolar disorder, they may therefore be less likely to develop PPP.

247 We are confident however, that all participants meet diagnostic criteria for bipolar disorder,

248 as the diagnostic process was robust including a detailed SCAN interview and case note

249 review. There can be however co-morbidity between the two. The interview for this cohort,

250 which is a cohort of people with a diagnosis of bipolar disorder, does not formally assess for

251 a diagnosis of borderline personality disorder and therefore we don't know how many also

252 had a diagnosis of borderline personality disorder. That our findings are not merely the

253 result of misdiagnosis or co-morbidity is supported by another two lines of evidence. First,

254 although co-morbidity and diagnostic overlap with borderline personality disorder are more

255 of an issue in bipolar II than bipolar I, with approximately 10% of bipolar I and 20% of

256 bipolar II patients also diagnosed with borderline personality disorder(Zimmerman and

257 Morgan, 2013), we find exactly the same pattern of results when limiting the analyses to

258 women with bipolar I. Therefore it cannot be explained by the high co-morbidity of bipolar

259 **II.**

260 Second, the findings are not driven solely by very high scores that would represent those

261 women with a potential categorical diagnosis of borderline personality disorder, but rather

262 there is a relationship with perinatal outcomes across the spectrum of BEST score as shown  
263 by the predicted probabilities analysis.

264

265

266 Further support for the validity of the relationship between borderline traits and perinatal  
267 episodes comes from the analysis focussing on symptoms which are particularly  
268 characteristic of borderline personality disorder and do not overlap with those of mood  
269 disorders. These symptoms include fear of abandonment, major shifts in opinion of others,  
270 feelings of emptiness and going to extremes to keep someone from leaving you. We found  
271 these individual symptoms were associated with higher risk of non-psychotic postpartum  
272 episodes of depression and with lower risk of PPP.

273

#### 274 *Implications*

275 Our findings have implications for the study of perinatal episodes and add to the data  
276 supporting the need to stratify perinatal episodes by type.(Florio et al., 2018) No association  
277 was found for perinatal episodes when taken as a whole but interesting differences  
278 emerged when postpartum psychosis was differentiated from postpartum depression.  
279 Studies examining risk of perinatal episodes in bipolar women must therefore differentiate  
280 between these individual outcomes.

281

282 Our results may also help us understand potential different aetiologies of perinatal episodes  
283 with personality factors playing a role in increasing risk of non-psychotic postpartum  
284 depression but a reduced risk of a postpartum psychotic episode. Episodes of postpartum  
285 psychosis occurred in a more homogeneous bipolar group i.e. women with a bipolar



286 diagnosis with low levels of borderline specific symptoms. This adds to evidence from our  
287 previous study which demonstrated that personality traits usually associated with bipolar  
288 disorder, such as higher levels of neuroticism, impulsivity and schizotypy, were not  
289 associated with risk of severe postpartum episodes, over and above their impact on the  
290 underlying mood disorder(Perry et al., 2019). An older study(Marks et al., 1992) with a small  
291 sample found that higher levels of neuroticism were associated with non-psychotic  
292 postpartum mood episodes, but not psychosis, among women with a history of mood  
293 disorders (n=26 with bipolar disorder or schizoaffective disorder) and in those with no such  
294 history. The reasons for the associations found remain unexplained and further work is  
295 needed to understand those.

296

297 Finally, the findings are relevant clinically to support discussion about risk with women and  
298 their families. Considering personality traits dimensionally appears to be more helpful than  
299 a simple categorical diagnosis of personality disorder and can help individualise the risk of  
300 perinatal recurrence. In addition, many women with a label of borderline personality  
301 disorder have a history of developmental trauma and may be better conceptualised as  
302 complex Post Traumatic Stress Disorder (PTSD)(Watts, 2019). It is possible that the link  
303 between borderline traits and non-psychotic postpartum episodes may be related to the  
304 anticipation of childbirth reactivating childhood traumas.(Zanarini and Frankenburg, 1997)  
305 Our results therefore, act as a reminder of considering screening women for history of  
306 trauma in the assessment of perinatal risk in bipolar women.

307

308 *Limitations*

309 This study is limited by its cross-sectional design. However, the questionnaire is designed to  
310 measure personality traits, which should be constant throughout one's life and we adjusted  
311 for their age at interview. It is also possible some women became pregnant and had further  
312 postpartum episodes after our interview, which could change their outcome category if they  
313 had a PPP. However, at the time of interview the majority of women were already passed  
314 their reproductive years and we included age at interview, number of pregnancies and  
315 measures of severity as confounders in the analysis. The cross-sectional and retrospective  
316 design also means that some information may not be reliable, such as the use of medication  
317 which we were not able to take into consideration in this analysis. This is also a highly  
318 educated sample that may not be representative of the general population.

319

320 Another limitation is that the BEST scale is self-report and was not designed to address  
321 borderline traits in people specifically with bipolar disorder and the questionnaire asks  
322 about overlapping symptoms. Therefore, our interpretation should be based on the content  
323 of the scale i.e. presence and severity of borderline personality disorder symptoms and this  
324 is also why we performed further analysis on non-overlapping symptoms as discussed  
325 above. Although the BEST may not be ideal, in this study we have asked participants to  
326 consider the symptoms over their lifetime, therefore assessing borderline personality  
327 disorder traits rather than symptoms limited to a restricted period. The scale has now  
328 already been successfully employed in the bipolar population(Saunders et al., 2020) which  
329 reassures us of its applicability. This is a cohort of women with bipolar disorder and we do  
330 not have information about the onset of symptoms of borderline personality disorder.

331 Further work might address this limitation.

332

333 In summary, this study adds to other evidence from our cohort that suggest different risk  
334 factors are associated with PPP and PNP in bipolar women.(Perry et al., 2020, 2016)  
335 Knowing that someone has borderline personality disorder traits might help identify those  
336 who are less likely to develop postpartum psychosis and more likely to have a non-psychotic  
337 depressive episode, helping to individualise a women's risk of relapse. It also has  
338 implications for research into perinatal episodes and stresses the need to stratify analysis of  
339 perinatal recurrence by type of episode.

## References

- Altman, E.G., Hedeker, D., Peterson, J.L., Davis, J.M., 1997. The Altman Self-Rating Mania Scale. *Biol. Psychiatry* 42, 948–955. [https://doi.org/10.1016/S0006-3223\(96\)00548-3](https://doi.org/10.1016/S0006-3223(96)00548-3)
- American Psychiatric Association, 2013. *Diagnostic and Statistical Manual of Mental Disorders*. American Psychiatric Association. <https://doi.org/10.1176/appi.books.9780890425596>
- Bauer, A., Parsonage, M., Knapp, M., Lemmi, V., Adelaja, B., Hogg, S., 2014. The costs of perinatal mental health problems, LSE & Centre for Mental Health. Centre for Mental Health and London School of Economics.
- Beck, A.T., Ward, C.H., Mendelson, M., Mock, J., Erbaugh, J., 1961. An Inventory for Measuring Depression. *Arch. Gen. Psychiatry* 4, 561–571.
- Blum, N., Pfohl, B., John, D.S., Monahan, P., Black, D.W., 2002. STEPPS: A Cognitive-Behavioral Systems-Based Group Treatment for Outpatients With Borderline Personality Disorder-A Preliminary Report. <https://doi.org/10.1053/comp.2002.33497>
- Di Florio, A., Forty, L., Gordon-Smith, K., Heron, J., Jones, L., Craddock, N., Jones, I., 2013. Perinatal episodes across the mood disorder spectrum. *JAMA psychiatry* 70, 168–75. <https://doi.org/10.1001/jamapsychiatry.2013.279>
- Florio, A. Di, Gordon-Smith, K., Forty, L., Kosorok, M.R., Fraser, C., Perry, A., Bethell, A., Craddock, N., Jones, L., Jones Background, I., 2018. Stratification of the risk of bipolar disorder recurrences in pregnancy and postpartum. *Br. J. Psychiatry* 213, 542–547.
- Frías, Á., Baltasar, I., Birmaher, B., 2016. Comorbidity between bipolar disorder and borderline personality disorder: Prevalence, explanatory theories, and clinical impact. *J. Affect. Disord.* <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jad.2016.05.048>

- Jones, I., Chandra, P.S., Dazzan, P., Howard, L.M., 2014. Bipolar disorder, affective psychosis, and schizophrenia in pregnancy and the post-partum period. *Lancet* 384, 1789–1799. [https://doi.org/10.1016/S0140-6736\(14\)61278-2](https://doi.org/10.1016/S0140-6736(14)61278-2)
- Knight, M., Bunch, K., Tuffnell, D., Shakespeare, J., Kotnis, R., Kenyon, S., Kurinczuk, J.J., (Eds.), MBRRACE-UK, on behalf of, 2019. *Saving Lives, Improving Mothers' Care - Lessons learned to inform maternity care from the UK and Ireland Confidential Enquiries into Maternal Deaths and Morbidity 2015-17*. Oxford: National Perinatal Epidemiology Unit, University of Oxford.
- Marks, M.N., Wieck, A., Checkley, S.A., Kumar, R., 1992. Contribution of psychological and social factors to psychotic and non-psychotic relapse after childbirth in women with previous histories of affective disorder. *J. Affect. Disord.* 24, 253–263. [https://doi.org/10.1016/0165-0327\(92\)90110-R](https://doi.org/10.1016/0165-0327(92)90110-R)
- Merikangas, K.R., Akiskal, H.S., Angst, J., Greenberg, P.E., Hirschfeld, R.M.A., Petukhova, M., Kessler, R.C., 2007. Lifetime and 12-month prevalence of bipolar spectrum disorder in the national comorbidity survey replication. *Arch. Gen. Psychiatry* 64, 543–552. <https://doi.org/10.1001/archpsyc.64.5.543>
- Perry, A., Gordon-Smith, K., Di Florio, A., Forty, L., Craddock, N., Jones, L., Jones, I., 2016. Adverse childhood life events and postpartum psychosis in bipolar disorder. *J. Affect. Disord.* 205, 69–72. <https://doi.org/http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.jad.2016.06.061>
- Perry, A., Gordon-Smith, K., Di Florio, A., Fraser, C., Craddock, N., Jones, L., Jones, I., 2020. Adverse childhood experiences and postpartum depression in bipolar disorder. *J. Affect. Disord.* 263, 661–666. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jad.2019.11.042>
- Perry, A., Gordon-Smith, K., Webb, I., Fone, E., Di Florio, A., Craddock, N., Jones, I., Jones, L., 2019. Postpartum psychosis in bipolar disorder: no evidence of association with

- personality traits, cognitive style or affective temperaments. *BMC Psychiatry* 19, 395.  
<https://doi.org/10.1186/s12888-019-2392-0>
- Pfohl, B., Blum, N., St John, D., McCormick, B., Allen, J., Black, D.W., 2009. Reliability and validity of the borderline evaluation of severity over time (BEST): a self-rated scale to measure severity and change in persons with borderline personality disorder. *J. Personal. Disord.* 23, 281–293. <https://doi.org/10.1521/pedi.2009.23.3.281>
- Saunders, K.E.A., Bilderbeck, A.C., Price, J., Goodwin, G.M., 2015. Distinguishing bipolar disorder from borderline personality disorder: A study of current clinical practice. *Eur. Psychiatry* 30, 965–974. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.eurpsy.2015.09.007>
- Saunders, K.E.A., Jones, T., Perry, A., Florio, A., Craddock, N., Jones, I., Gordon-Smith, K., Jones, L., 2020. The influence of borderline personality traits on clinical outcomes in bipolar disorder. *Bipolar Disord.* 00, 1–8. <https://doi.org/10.1111/bdi.12978>
- Stein, A., Pearson, R.M., Goodman, S.H., Rapa, E., Rahman, A., McCallum, M., Howard, L.M., Pariante, C.M., 2016. Effects of perinatal mental disorders on the fetus and child. *Lancet* 384, 1800–1819. [https://doi.org/10.1016/S0140-6736\(14\)61277-0](https://doi.org/10.1016/S0140-6736(14)61277-0)
- Watts, J., 2019. Problems with the ICD-11 classification of personality disorder. *The Lancet Psychiatry* 6, 461–463. [https://doi.org/10.1016/S2215-0366\(19\)30127-0](https://doi.org/10.1016/S2215-0366(19)30127-0)
- Wesseloo, R., Kamperman, A.M., Munk-Olsen, T., Pop, V.J.M., Kushner, S.A., Bergink, V., R., W., A.M., K., T., M.-O., V.J.M., P., S.A., K., V., B., 2016. Risk of postpartum relapse in bipolar disorder and postpartum psychosis: A systematic review and meta-analysis. *Am. J. Psychiatry* 173, 117–127. <https://doi.org/10.1176/appi.ajp.2015.15010124>
- Wing, J.K., Babor, T., Brugha, T., Burke, J., Cooper, J.E., Giel, R., Jablenski, A., Regier, D., Sartorius, N., Jablenski A, S.N.H.R.P.H., Robins LN, W.J.W.H.H.J.B.T.B.J.F.A.J.A.P.R.R.D.S.N.T.L., Wing JK, C.J.S.N., JK, W., Wing JK,

B.J.C.J.G.P.I.A., Cooper JE, K.R.G.B.S.L.C.J.S.R., Organization, W.H., Organization, W.H.,  
Kendell RE, E.B.C.J.S.N.D.M., Luria RE, B.R., Luria RE, B.R., Luria RE, G.R., Luria RE,  
M.P., Wing JK, S.E., Organization, W.H., A, P., Scharfetter C, M.H.W.J., Wing JK,  
N.J.V.C.M.S.A., A, J., Sartorius N, J.A.K.A.E.G.A.M.C.J.D.R., JK, W., Cooper JE,  
C.J.B.G.H.T.G.A., Sturt E, B.P.H.J.T.C., Wing JK, N.J.M.S.L.J., Bebbington P,  
H.J.T.C.S.E.W.J., Bebbington PE, S.E.K.N., Brown GW, H.T., Henderson AS,  
D.J.P.B.D.S.R.A.S., Hodiamont P, P.N.S.N., Hurry J, B.P.T.C., Mavreas V, B.P., Mavreas  
VG, B.A.M.A.R.F.L.G., Okasha A, A.A., Rodgers SB, M.S., Orley JH, W.J., Vazquez-  
Barquero JL, D.-M.J.P.C.Q.R.L.L.M., Wing JK, M.S.L.J.N.J., Tress KH, B.C.B.J.L.G.L.J.,  
McGuffin P, K.R.A.J., Dean C, S.P.S.S., Surtees P, D.C.I.J.K.N.M.P.S.S., Cooper JE, M.S.,  
Gillis LS, E.R.B.-A.O.T.A., Wig NN, M.D.S.R., F, O., Swartz L, B.-A.O.T.A., J, C., Logsdail  
BJ, T.B., A, P., Brewin CR, W.J.M.S.B.T.M.B., Brewin CR, W.J.M.S.B.T.M.B.L.A., Brugha  
TS, W.J.B.C.M.B.M.S.L.A.M.J., Farmer AE, K.R.M.P.B.P., H-U, W., Jablensky A, S.R.T.T.,  
Organization, W.H., Wing L, G.J., 1990. SCAN. Arch. Gen. Psychiatry 47, 589.

<https://doi.org/10.1001/archpsyc.1990.01810180089012>

Zanarini, M.C., Frankenburg, F.R., 1997. Pathways to the development of borderline  
personality disorder. *J. Pers. Disord.* 11, 93–104.

<https://doi.org/10.1521/pedi.1997.11.1.93>

Zimmerman, M., Morgan, T.A., 2013. Problematic boundaries in the diagnosis of bipolar  
disorder: The interface with borderline personality disorder. *Curr. Psychiatry Rep.* 15.

<https://doi.org/10.1007/s11920-013-0422-z>

Table 1. Clinical and demographic information at the time of interview (total sample n=807) and distribution of BEST scores

|   | <b>Mean/Median*</b> | <b>s.d./IQR*</b> | <b>Min</b> | <b>Max</b>  |
|---|---------------------|------------------|------------|-------------|
| Age at interview/years (n=807)                | 50.3                | 10.8             | 21         | 80          |
| Number of pregnancies* (n=775)                | 2                   | 1-10             | 1          | 15          |
| Age of onset of impairment*/years<br>(n=770)  | 21                  | 7-55             | 6          | 60          |
| Number of admissions* (n=786)                 | 2                   | 0-24             | 0          | 35          |
| BDI (n=793)                                   | 15.3                | 12.2             | 0          | 59          |
| AMS* (n=802)                                  | 3                   | 0-16             | 0          | 20          |
| Highest Education ** (n=766)                  |                     |                  |            |             |
| Higher  |                     |                  |            | 316 (41.2%) |
| No-higher                                     |                     |                  |            | 450 (58.8%) |
| Highest Occupation** (n=764)                  |                     |                  |            |             |
| Professional                                  |                     |                  |            | 394 (51.6%) |
| Non-professional                              |                     |                  |            | 360 (47.1%) |
| Never worked                                  |                     |                  |            | 10 (1.3%)   |
| Type of recruitment** (n=785)                 |                     |                  |            |             |
| Systematic                                    |                     |                  |            | 216 (27.5%) |
| Non-systematic                                |                     |                  |            | 569 (72.5%) |
| Ever married or lived as married**<br>(n=787) |                     |                  |            |             |
| No  |                     |                  |            | 25 (3.2%)   |
| Yes   |                     |                  |            | 762 (96.8%) |



|  |      |      |    |             |
|--|------|------|----|-------------|
| DSM Diagnosis** (n=807)                                    |      |      |    |             |
| BP type I  |      |      |    | 533 (66.1%) |
| BP type II   |      |      |    | 230 (28.5%) |
| SA BP  |      |      |    | 18 (2.2%)   |
| BP NOS   |      |      |    | 26 (3.2%)   |
| Family history of postnatal psychiatry episodes ** (n=608) |      |      |    |             |
| No   |      |      |    | 534 (87.8%) |
| Yes  |      |      |    | 74 (12.2%)  |
| BEST total score   | 31.0 | 12.9 | 12 | 60          |
| BEST subscale A  | 21.9 | 9.0  | 8  | 40          |
| BEST subscale B  | 9.1  | 4.4  | 4  | 20          |

*s.d., standard deviation; IQR, Interquartile range; BDI, Beck Depression Inventory; AMS, Altman Mania Scale*

*\*Medians and upper/lower quartiles presented instead of means and s.d. because of skewed data*

*\*\*n, %*

Table 2. Fully adjusted relative risk ratio estimates (RRR) from multinomial logistic regression models for associations of BEST total score, BEST subscales, and BEST questions 1, 2, 7 and 9 with perinatal psychiatric relapse (against no relapse as the referent group) (N=555).

|  | Type of relapse | RRR<br>(compared to no relapse) | S.E.  | P-value | [95% Conf. Interval] |       |
|--|-----------------|---------------------------------|-------|---------|----------------------|-------|
| <b>BEST total</b>                                  | <b>PPP</b>      | 0.963                           | 0.013 | 0.005*  | 0.939                | 0.989 |
|  | <b>PNPD</b>     | 1.030                           | 0.011 | 0.007*  | 1.008                | 1.052 |
|  | <b>other</b>    | 1.026                           | 0.011 | 0.021*  | 1.004                | 1.048 |
| <b>BEST subscale A<br/>(Thoughts and Feelings)</b> | <b>PPP</b>      | 0.952                           | 0.017 | 0.007*  | 0.919                | 0.987 |
|  | <b>PNPD</b>     | 1.042                           | 0.016 | 0.008*  | 1.010                | 1.074 |
|  | <b>other</b>    | 1.036                           | 0.016 | 0.025*  | 1.004                | 1.068 |
| <b>BEST subscale B<br/>(Negative Behaviours)</b>   | <b>PPP</b>      | 0.908                           | 0.035 | 0.012*  | 0.842                | 0.979 |
|  | <b>PNPD</b>     | 1.079                           | 0.033 | 0.013*  | 1.016                | 1.146 |
|  | <b>other</b>    | 1.069                           | 0.033 | 0.033*  | 1.005                | 1.136 |
| <b>Q1 – Fear of abandonment</b>                    | <b>PPP</b>      | 0.772                           | 0.079 | 0.012*  | 0.632                | 0.944 |
|  | <b>PNPD</b>     | 1.101                           | 0.095 | 0.267   | 0.929                | 1.305 |
|  | <b>other</b>    | 1.121                           | 0.099 | 0.196   | 0.943                | 1.333 |
| <b>Q2 – Major shifts in opinion about others</b>   | <b>PPP</b>      | 0.777                           | 0.082 | 0.017*  | 0.632                | 0.956 |
|  | <b>PNPD</b>     | 1.295                           | 0.118 | 0.005*  | 1.083                | 1.549 |
|  | <b>other</b>    | 1.158                           | 0.107 | 0.113   | 0.966                | 1.387 |
| <b>Q7 – Feelings of emptiness</b>                  | <b>PPP</b>      | 0.824                           | 0.083 | 0.055   | 0.677                | 1.004 |
|  | <b>PNPD</b>     | 1.202                           | 0.113 | 0.050   | 0.999                | 1.445 |

|  |              |       |       |        |       |       |
|--|--------------|-------|-------|--------|-------|-------|
|  | <b>other</b> | 1.229 | 0.117 | 0.030* | 1.020 | 1.481 |
| <b>Q9 – going to extremes to keep someone from leaving you</b> | <b>PPP</b>   | 0.838 | 0.106 | 0.162  | 0.654 | 1.074 |
|  | <b>PNPD</b>  | 1.108 | 0.111 | 0.304  | 0.911 | 1.349 |
|  | <b>other</b> | 1.170 | 0.118 | 0.118  | 0.961 | 1.426 |

*Adjusted for age at interview, age at onset of impairment of bipolar disorder, number of admissions, family history of postnatal mental illness, number of pregnancies, diagnosis subtype (bipolar type I, type II, schizoaffective bipolar and NOS) and current mood (AMS scale).*

