

This is an Open Access document downloaded from ORCA, Cardiff University's institutional repository: <https://orca.cardiff.ac.uk/id/eprint/174067/>

This is the author's version of a work that was submitted to / accepted for publication.

Citation for final published version:

Hines, Sophia K. V., Charles, Christopher D., Starr, Aidan, Goldstein, Steven L., Hemming, Sidney R., Hall, Ian R. , Lathika, Nambiyathodi, Passacantando, Mollie and Bolge, Louise 2024. Revisiting the mid-Pleistocene transition ocean circulation crisis. *Science* 386 (6722) , pp. 681-686. 10.1126/science.adn4154

Publishers page: <https://doi.org/10.1126/science.adn4154>

Please note:

Changes made as a result of publishing processes such as copy-editing, formatting and page numbers may not be reflected in this version. For the definitive version of this publication, please refer to the published source. You are advised to consult the publisher's version if you wish to cite this paper.

This version is being made available in accordance with publisher policies. See <http://orca.cf.ac.uk/policies.html> for usage policies. Copyright and moral rights for publications made available in ORCA are retained by the copyright holders.



Revisiting the mid-Pleistocene transition ocean circulation crisis

Sophia K.V. Hines^{1*}, Christopher D. Charles², Aidan Starr^{3,4}, Steven L. Goldstein^{5,6}, Sidney R. Hemming^{5,6}, Ian R. Hall⁷, Nambiyathodi Lathika⁸, Mollie Passacantando⁹, Louise Bolge⁵

¹Department of Marine Chemistry & Geochemistry, Woods Hole Oceanographic Institution; Woods Hole, MA, USA.

*Corresponding author. Email: shines@whoi.edu

²Scripps Institution of Oceanography, La Jolla, CA, USA

³Department of Marine and Coastal Sciences, Rutgers University; New Brunswick, NJ, USA.

⁴ Department of Geography, University of Cambridge; Cambridge, UK.

⁵Lamont-Doherty Earth Observatory of Columbia University; Palisades, NY, USA.

⁶Department of Earth and Environmental Sciences, Columbia University; New York, NY, USA.

⁷School of Earth and Environmental Sciences, Cardiff University; Cardiff, Wales, UK.

⁸National Centre for Polar and Ocean Research, Ministry of Earth Sciences; Goa, India.

⁹Graduate School of Oceanography, University of Rhode Island; Narragansett, RI, USA.

Abstract: The mid-Pleistocene transition (MPT) [~ 1.25 – 0.85 million years ago (Ma)] marks a shift in the character of glacial-interglacial climate (1, 2). One prevailing hypothesis for the origin of the MPT is that glacial deep ocean circulation fundamentally changed, marked by a circulation “crisis” at ~ 0.90 Ma (marine isotope stages 24 to 22) (3). Using high-resolution paired neodymium, carbon, and oxygen isotope data from the South Atlantic Ocean (Cape Basin) across the MPT, we find no evidence of a substantial change in deep ocean circulation. Before and during the early MPT (~ 1.30 – 1.12 Ma), the glacial deep ocean variability closely resembled that of the most recent glacial cycle. The carbon storage facilitated by developing deep ocean stratification across the MPT required only modest circulation adjustments.

One-Sentence Summary: Modest ocean circulation adjustments drove glacial intensification one million years ago.

29 **Main Text:**

30 The ice age cycles characteristic of the Pleistocene were the well-known product of changes in
31 Earth's orbit around the Sun, which drives variations in the amount and location of solar
32 radiation reaching Earth's surface (4, 5). Yet there are several enduring mysteries surrounding
33 the evolution of ice age cycles. In the early Pleistocene, glacial-interglacial cycles occurred at a
34 period of ~41 thousand years (kyr), responding linearly to solar forcing (5). Over the mid-
35 Pleistocene transition (MPT), glacial-interglacial cycles lengthened to a period of ~100 kyr. They
36 developed more-intense glacial maxima, reflected by larger ice volumes and sawtooth shapes,
37 thereby responding nonlinearly to solar forcing. This transition in glacial periodicity has been
38 investigated extensively, but a definitive cause remains elusive (6).

39 One leading hypothesis to explain the MPT involves shifts in deep ocean circulation that resulted
40 from changes in the proportion of northern-sourced water (NSW) [the paleo equivalent of
41 modern North Atlantic Deep Water (NADW)] compared with southern-sourced water (SSW)
42 [the paleo equivalent of modern Antarctic Bottom Water (AABW)] in the deep ocean. Initial
43 support for such a shift came from authigenic neodymium (Nd) isotope measurements in a suite
44 of eastern South Atlantic sedimentary sequences: A state-change in the amplitude of glacial-
45 interglacial water mass variability was inferred after a missing interglacial Nd isotope shift
46 between marine isotope stage (MIS) 24 and MIS 22 (3). This interval also featured a “failed
47 termination” at the MIS 24–MIS 23 transition (TXI), the residual ice from which likely
48 contributed to the marked increase in global ice volume observed over the subsequent MIS 22
49 glacial [the “0.9 Ma event”; (7)]. Subsequent studies have suggested that the characteristic
50 pattern of Nd isotopic variability extended to the North Atlantic (8, 9) and may have been
51 connected with inferences of permanently elevated nutrient and dissolved carbon levels in the
52 deep ocean (10).

53 In this work, we use a new, highly resolved Nd isotope record co-registered with benthic stable
54 carbon and oxygen isotopic time series to demonstrate that the hypothesis of a circulation crisis
55 across this interval must be revised. We present an ~5-kyr-resolution ϵNd record across the MPT
56 [~1.3 to 0.75 million years (Ma)] and ~1-kyr-resolution stable benthic carbon and oxygen isotope
57 records for the past ~1.3 Ma from International Ocean Discovery Program (IODP) site U1479
58 (2615-m water depth, 35.059°S, 17.401°E) in the South Atlantic, Cape Basin. Site U1479 lies
59 within the main pathway of NADW export from the Atlantic Ocean to the modern Southern
60 Ocean; thus, it is ideally placed to record variability in NSW over the MPT (Fig. 1). We use
61 these three independent proxies of water mass properties to show that, although Northern
62 Hemisphere-driven changes in the production of NSW are often used to explain past water mass
63 variations, the Southern Ocean was likely more important for driving the observed changes in
64 MPT deep ocean water mass structure in the deep Atlantic. The Southern Ocean influence could
65 have occurred directly, through changes that helped set the density of SSW (11–15), and/or
66 indirectly, through processes that helped to define the density contrasts between NSW and SSW
67 (16, 17). This perspective highlights the importance of cooling on the Antarctic continent and its
68 adjacent ocean (18) in preconditioning the late Pleistocene ocean towards longer ice age intervals
69 with increased deep ocean carbon storage; these effects were not previously fully appreciated.

70 The authigenic Nd isotope composition of marine sediments (reported as ϵNd , the normalized
71 $^{143}\text{Nd}/^{144}\text{Nd}$ composition in parts per ten thousand, see Methods) is a proxy for deep ocean
72 circulation (19). Neodymium enters the ocean primarily by means of rivers, dust deposition, and
73 exchange with continental margin sediments, so the isotopic composition of seawater is set by
74 the isotopic composition of the surrounding continents, which vary as a function of their age and

75 composition. The oldest rocks surrounding the Atlantic basin with the most negative ϵNd values
76 are found in Canada and Greenland, and they imprint seawater in the North Atlantic Ocean with
77 isotopic values around -13 to -14 (20, 21). Conversely, the youngest rocks with the most
78 positive ϵNd values are found around the Pacific rim, and they imprint seawater in the Pacific
79 Ocean with isotopic values around -3 to -4 (22). Because Nd isotopes are not affected by
80 biology, ϵNd values of open ocean intermediate and deep waters at least to a first order behave
81 conservatively in many parts of the global oceans, reflecting water mass mixing between these
82 North Atlantic and Pacific Ocean endmembers (20, 23–25) (Fig. 1A). At a given location,
83 variations in ϵNd can potentially be complicated by temporal changes in the ϵNd value of the
84 endmembers, but on long timescales (100 kyr to 100 million years), data indicate stable secular
85 North Atlantic and Pacific end-member compositions (3). However, this may not be the case
86 over shorter millennial and orbital timescales, particularly for the North Atlantic endmember.
87 Neodymium isotope measurements over the last glacial cycle indicate much more variability in
88 the North Atlantic endmember (26, 27) compared with the Pacific endmember (28), possibly
89 driven by Laurentide ice sheet dynamics, which affect the flux of continental material (with very
90 negative ϵNd compositions) into the North Atlantic Ocean.

91 Circulation variability across the MPT compared to the last glacial cycle

92 Our ϵNd data from site U1479 (Fig. 2) show clear glacial-interglacial cycles that mimic benthic
93 $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ and $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ variability (fig. S2). Previous studies have suggested substantial shifts in deep
94 ocean circulation across the MPT, recorded at nearby Ocean Drilling Program (ODP) sites 1088,
95 1090, and 1267 (3, 10), and such shifts should also be reflected in the ϵNd composition of site
96 U1479. However, comparing our data and a published ϵNd record over the last 155 ka from the
97 same site (29) reveals a notably similar amplitude of glacial-interglacial ϵNd variability between
98 the last glacial cycle and the MPT. Glacial ϵNd values before 1.12 Ma are statistically
99 indistinguishable from glacial values for the past 155 kyr ($P = 0.3818$ at the 99% significance
100 level). Nd isotope data from the last glacial cycle at site U1479 (29) have demonstrated the
101 suitability of this location for deep ocean circulation reconstructions (Supplemental Text) and
102 provide a valuable framework for comparison because more is known about ocean circulation
103 over the last glacial cycle than during the MPT.

104 Neodymium isotope values for the Holocene and the last interglacial, MIS 5e, (median value of
105 -10 with a 25 to 75 percentile range of -9.8 to -10.5) are very similar to interglacial values
106 across the MPT interval (median of -10.6 with a 25 to 75 percentile range of -10.3 to -11 ; Fig.
107 2c). ϵNd values for the Last Glacial Maximum (LGM) and MIS 6 (median of -8.6 with a 25 to
108 75 percentile range of -8.3 to -8.7) are similar to glacial values between 1.30 and 0.70 Ma
109 (median of -9.1 with a 25 to 75 percentile range of -8.8 to -10.1). During the mid-MPT,
110 between ~ 1.12 to 0.95 Ma, there is reduced ϵNd variability and a shift toward more negative ϵNd
111 values (median of -10.9 with a 25 to 75 percentile range of -10.3 to -11.1) for both glacial and
112 interglacial periods. This interval ends with a notably positive glacial ϵNd signature of -8.1
113 during MIS 24 (~ 0.92 Ma) and an intermediate ϵNd signature of -9.6 at MIS 23 (~ 0.90 Ma). To
114 determine whether water mass shifts or endmember changes drive the Nd variability recorded at
115 Site U1479, independent information about the ϵNd value of the North Atlantic endmember is
116 needed. Although a comprehensive deconvolution of endmember changes and water mass
117 mixing is not possible at present because of the resolution of existing data from the North
118 Atlantic (Supplementary Text and fig. S5), we argue that endmember variability is unlikely to be

119 the primary control of the ϵNd signal at site U1479 given the strong co-variation of ϵNd with
120 $\delta^{13}\text{C}$, another deep ocean circulation proxy (Fig. 3 and fig. S2).

121 The prevailing MPT circulation hypothesis (3) is based on two key interpretations of existing
122 data: (i) an unprecedented weakening in NSW production between MIS 24 and MIS 22 and (ii)
123 an increase in glacial-interglacial water mass variability across the MPT. Our new data from site
124 U1479 do not support either of these interpretations. First, given its $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ composition and the
125 ϵNd values that are characteristic of an intermediate climate state (fig. S2), MIS 23 should not be
126 regarded as a full interglacial; nevertheless, there is a well-resolved ϵNd peak at ~ 0.90 Ma at site
127 U1479 that confirms substantial NSW influence in the South Atlantic during MIS 23 (Fig. 2B).
128 Second, the U1479 record shows no evidence for a state change in the amplitude of deep ocean
129 circulation tracers before and after the MPT: Although it is true that the ϵNd record is less
130 variable in the ~ 1.05 to 0.94 Ma interval than over subsequent ice age cycles, the preceding
131 interval (~ 1.25 to 1.05 Ma) was characterized by cycles in ϵNd and $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ that were equally as
132 strong as post-MPT counterparts.

133 The importance of high-resolution sampling

134 The differences between these insights from U1479 and the interpretations from prior records
135 likely stem from sampling resolution and length of record considered. For example, lower
136 sampling resolution of previous reconstructions (3, 10) would have missed the relatively brief
137 interval of low ϵNd during MIS 23, leading to the inappropriately generalized interpretation of a
138 substantial reduction in NSW production. Furthermore, the interpretation that the amplitude of
139 glacial-interglacial circulation variability changed across the MPT was also based on shorter
140 and/or lower-resolution ϵNd records (3, 8, 10). Our reconstruction from site U1479 comprises
141 co-registered stable isotope and ϵNd data, and therefore, we can observe explicitly that $\delta^{18}\text{O}$
142 maxima and minima did not always correspond with ϵNd and $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ maxima and minima (fig.
143 S4). This inexact correlation precludes an accurate assessment of glacial-interglacial circulation
144 variability if ϵNd variability is defined strictly on the basis of $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ values. A corollary is that
145 data aliasing is a substantial concern when complete glacial-interglacial cycles are not measured
146 at a resolution that captures the full variability. Finally, any pre- and post-MPT comparisons that
147 focus exclusively on the interval immediately surrounding 0.9 Ma will yield a biased
148 perspective. The explanations for reduced variability during the 1.05 to 0.94 Ma interval in
149 U1479 are not yet obvious but could involve localized sampling resolution issues (Fig. S5) as
150 well as possible shifts in the Nd isotopic value of the NSW end-member (Fig. 2B and fig. S3) (8,
151 9).

152 In any case, the perspective from U1479 bears on a number of aspects of MPT climate
153 variability. Although the range of reconstructed atmospheric pCO_2 before the MPT is large and
154 uncertain, the preponderance of evidence suggests a reduction in glacial pCO_2 across the MPT
155 (30–34). This evidence is consistent with apparent trends in deep ocean carbon storage (10) and
156 deep ocean nutrient and dissolved inorganic carbon concentrations, both of which increased
157 during ice ages through the MPT (Fig. 3C and D, and fig. S9). Such characteristic trends in
158 carbon cycling have commonly been attributed to a substantial reorganization of deep ocean
159 circulation. However, because the site U1479 record shows that glacial-interglacial circulation
160 variability in the early MPT closely resembled the variability observed during the last glacial
161 cycle, the U1479 results might paradoxically appear to indicate a decoupling of deep circulation
162 and ocean carbon storage: Although changes in biological export can increase carbon removal
163 from the atmosphere and storage in the deep ocean (35), efficient carbon storage on long

164 timescales almost certainly requires changes in physical ocean circulation to prevent the return of
165 this respired carbon to the upper ocean and atmosphere (36–40).

166 Evolution of deep ocean stratification across the MPT

167 The clue to resolving this seeming paradox comes from the LGM water mass geometry. High-
168 resolution benthic $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ and Nd isotope data from the Cape Basin over the last glacial cycle
169 demonstrate that geochemical gradients, indicative of increased density stratification, can
170 develop between the mid-depth (~2500 m) and abyssal (>4000 m) ocean despite a relatively
171 strong signature of NSW at site U1479 (29) (Supplementary Text). The vertical ϵNd profile
172 indicates that the depth of the NSW maximum did not shoal substantially (by <500 m) at the
173 LGM. However, there was still a strengthening of the ϵNd gradient between the mid-depth and
174 abyssal ocean driven by the shoaling of the boundary between NSW and SSW, with much less
175 NSW in the deepest part of the Atlantic Ocean. The long-term evolution of deep density
176 stratification over the past ~1.5 Ma can be more directly assessed using benthic oxygen isotope
177 data from the Cape Basin because the $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ composition of carbonates is a function of
178 temperature and the $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ composition of seawater, which itself is a function of salinity, and
179 seawater density is controlled by temperature and salinity (Fig. 3A). Combining benthic $\delta^{18}\text{O}$
180 data from U1479 with published data from nearby site U1475 (2669-m water depth) (16) and
181 comparing this with data from ODP site 1090 (3702 m water depth) (41) (Fig. 1) clearly shows
182 that the vertical glacial $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ gradients decreased over the MPT, continuing a trend that extends
183 from the early Pleistocene and Pliocene (42). The vertical benthic $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ difference was ~0.22 per
184 mil (‰) in the early Pleistocene (>1.25 Ma), decreased slightly to ~0.2‰ during the MPT (1.25
185 to 0.85 Ma), then dropped to >0.1‰ in the Late Pleistocene (<0.85 Ma) (Fig. 3A and E). The
186 convergence of benthic $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ data from the combined U1475 and U1479 record with site 1090
187 was primarily driven by an increase in the benthic $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ recorded at sites U1475 and U1479. This
188 could be explained by a rise in the density of NSW (driven by either a cooling and/or salinity
189 increase) or an expansion of SSW such that this water mass reached the depth of sites U1475 and
190 U1479. Although some reconstructions indicate NSW cooling over this interval (43, 44), an
191 expansion of SSW and shoaling of the boundary between NSW and SSW is the likely
192 explanation because it would provide a more extensive deep ocean reservoir for carbon storage,
193 which increases at this time (Fig. 3D) (10). If, instead, the density of NSW increased, the result
194 would be a reduction in the density contrast between NSW and SSW, reducing stratification and
195 inhibiting carbon storage. Therefore, we favor an explanation where the isotopic convergence is
196 driven by SSW expansion and a shoaling of the boundary of NSW and SSW, also characteristic
197 of increased density stratification between NSW and SSW (Fig. 4B).

198 The evolution of vertical oxygen isotope gradients in the Cape Basin is also consistent with
199 benthic $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ gradients from across the Atlantic Ocean (fig. S8). As glacial deep ocean
200 stratification between NSW and SSW develops in the Cape Basin during the MIS 24–MIS 22
201 interval, ~0.90 Ma, the lateral $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ gradient between site U1479 and site U1385 on the Iberian
202 Margin (45) in the mid-latitude North Atlantic decreases. At the same time, the $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ gradient
203 between site U1385 and the higher-latitude North Atlantic sites 980/1, 982, 983, and 984 (46)
204 increases. This observation also favors an expansion of SSW and an increase in mid-depth
205 density stratification rather than an increase in the density of NSW. If the density of NSW
206 increased, this water mass would reach both the high-latitude and mid-latitude North Atlantic
207 sites, potentially placing them all on the same density surface and making it difficult to sustain a
208 $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ gradient between these regions because ocean tracers (i.e., benthic $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ values) mix easily

209 along density surfaces. Therefore, as density stratification develops in the South Atlantic
210 (characterized by a convergence of benthic $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ records at site 1090 and sites U1475 and
211 U1479), it also affects the entire Atlantic basin and increases the volume of deep water available
212 to store carbon during glacials (47). Physically, the only way to do this is through changes in the
213 Southern Ocean, which effectively controls the density structure of the deep Atlantic Ocean (11,
214 12).

215 The data presented in this work highlight the power of the deep ocean to sequester CO_2 without
216 substantial changes in circulation geometry. This sequestration could be achieved partially
217 through increases in biological productivity, possibly driven by increased iron fertilization in the
218 Southern Ocean (48), but changes in ocean stratification apparently played an important role. We
219 suggest that the Southern Ocean was the ultimate driver of deep ocean evolution across the MPT.
220 The Southern Ocean is the central dynamical control of deep ocean stratification, primarily
221 through changes in sea ice production (11, 12, 49). Deep ocean stratification changes, which
222 occurred at the end of the MPT and are characterized by the expansion of SSW, are best
223 explained as a byproduct of cooling (18) and the expansion of Antarctic ice sheets (50–51).
224 Density contrasts between NSW and SSW would also be accentuated by increased iceberg
225 production around Antarctica, through freshwater associated with iceberg melt at the northern
226 edge of the Southern Ocean (16) (Fig. S9). This perspective on a threshold interval of
227 Pleistocene ice age cycling bears on the evolution of future climate under anthropogenic forcing.
228 Much of the focus when it comes to future climate change is on Atlantic meridional overturning
229 circulation perturbations driven by heat and freshwater fluxes to the North Atlantic. Yet, as the
230 MPT interval suggests, the capacity of the deep ocean to store carbon for long time scales might
231 be much more strongly linked to changes in the Southern Ocean.

232 **References**

- 233 1. L. E. Lisiecki, M. E. Raymo, A Pliocene-Pleistocene stack of 57 globally distributed benthic
234 $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ records. *Paleoceanography* **20** (2005).
- 235 2. P. U. Clark, D. Archer, D. Pollard, J. D. Blum, J. A. Rial, The middle Pleistocene transition:
236 characteristics, mechanisms, and implications for long-term changes in atmospheric pCO_2 .
237 *Quaternary Science Reviews* (2006).
- 238 3. L. D. Pena, S. L. Goldstein, Thermohaline circulation crisis and impacts during the mid-
239 Pleistocene transition. *Science* **345**, 318–322 (2014).
- 240 4. M. Milanković, *Kanon Der Erdbestrahlung Und Seine Anwendung Auf Das Eiszeitenproblem*
241 (Royal Serbian Academy, 1941) *Royal Serbian Academy*.
- 242 5. J. Imbrie, E. A. Boyle, S. C. Clemens, A. Duffy, W. R. Howard, G. Kukla, J. Kutzbach, D. G.
243 Martinson, A. McIntyre, A. C. Mix, B. Molfino, J. J. Morley, L. C. Peterson, N. G. Pisias, W.
244 L. Prell, M. E. Raymo, N. J. Shackleton, J. R. Toggweiler, On the Structure and Origin of
245 Major Glaciation Cycles. *Paleoceanography* **7**, 701–738 (1992).
- 246 6. E. Legrain, F. Parrenin, E. Capron, A gradual change is more likely to have caused the Mid-
247 Pleistocene Transition than an abrupt event. *Commun. Earth Environ.* **4**, 90 (2023).

- 248 7. P. C. Tzedakis, M. Crucifix, T. Mitsui, E. W. Wolff, A simple rule to determine which
249 insolation cycles lead to interglacials. *Nature* **542**, 427–432 (2017).
- 250 8. J. Kim, S. L. Goldstein, L. D. Pena, M. Jaume-Seguí, K. P. Knudson, M. Yehudai, L. Bolge,
251 North Atlantic Deep Water during Pleistocene interglacials and glacials. *Quaternary Sci Rev*
252 **269**, 107146 (2021).
- 253 9. M. Yehudai, J. Kim, L. D. Pena, M. Jaume-Seguí, K. P. Knudson, L. Bolge, A. Malinverno, T.
254 Bickert, S. L. Goldstein, Evidence for a Northern Hemispheric trigger of the 100,000-y
255 glacial cyclicity. *Proc National Acad Sci* **118**, e2020260118 (2021).
- 256 10. J. R. Farmer, B. Hönisch, L. L. Haynes, D. Kroon, S. Jung, H. L. Ford, M. E. Raymo, M.
257 Jaume-Seguí, D. B. Bell, S. L. Goldstein, L. D. Pena, M. Yehudai, J. Kim, Deep Atlantic
258 Ocean carbon storage and the rise of 100,000-year glacial cycles. *Nature Geoscience*, 1–9
259 (2019).
- 260 11. M. Nikurashin, G. Vallis, A Theory of Deep Stratification and Overturning Circulation in the
261 Ocean. *Journal of Physical Oceanography* **41**, 485–502 (2011).
- 262 12. C. L. Wolfe, P. Cessi, What Sets the Strength of the Middepth Stratification and Overturning
263 Circulation in Eddy Ocean Models? *Journal of Physical Oceanography* **40**, 1520–1538
264 (2010).
- 265 13. J. Marshall, K. Speer, Closure of the meridional overturning circulation through Southern
266 Ocean upwelling. *Nature Geoscience* **5**, 1–10 (2012).
- 267 14. R. Ferrari, M. F. Jansen, J. F. Adkins, A. Burke, A. L. Stewart, A. F. Thompson, Antarctic
268 sea ice control on ocean circulation in present and glacial climates. *PNAS* **111**, 8753–8758
269 (2014).
- 270 15. A. Marzocchi, M. F. Jansen, Connecting Antarctic sea ice to deep-ocean circulation in
271 modern and glacial climate simulations. *Geophysical Research Letters* **44**, 6286–6295
272 (2017).
- 273 16. A. Starr, I. R. Hall, S. Barker, T. Rackow, X. Zhang, S. R. Hemming, H. J. L. van der Lubbe,
274 G. Knorr, M. A. Berke, G. R. Bigg, A. Cartagena-Sierra, F. J. Jimenez-Espejo, X. Gong, J.
275 Gruetzner, N. Lathika, L. J. LeVay, R. S. Robinson, M. Ziegler, Expedition 361 Scientists,
276 Antarctic icebergs reorganize ocean circulation during Pleistocene glacials. *Nature*, 1–16
277 (2021).
- 278 17. F. J. C. Peeters, R. Acheson, G.-J. A. Brummer, W. P. M. de Ruijter, R. R. Schneider, G. M.
279 Ganssen, E. Ufkes, D. Kroon, Vigorous exchange between the Indian and Atlantic oceans at
280 the end of the past five glacial periods. *Nature* **430**, 661–665 (2004).
- 281 18. P. U. Clark, J. D. Shakun, Y. Rosenthal, P. Köhler, P. J. Bartlein, Global and regional
282 temperature change over the past 4.5 million years. *Science* **383**, 884–890 (2024).

- 283 19. S. Goldstein, S. R. Hemming, Long-lived isotopic tracers in oceanography,
284 paleoceanography, and ice-sheet dynamics. *Treatise on geochemistry* (2003).
- 285 20. M. Lambelet, T. van de Flierdt, K. Crocket, M. Rehkämper, K. Kreissig, B. Coles, M. J. A.
286 Rijkenberg, L. J. A. Gerringa, H. J. W. de Baar, R. Steinfeldt, Neodymium isotopic
287 composition and concentration in the western North Atlantic Ocean: Results from the
288 GEOTRACES GA02 section. *Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta* **177**, 1–29 (2016).
- 289 21. S. Robinson, R. Ivanovic, T. van de Flierdt, C. L. Blanchet, K. Tachikawa, E. E. Martin, C.
290 P. Cook, T. Williams, L. Gregoire, Y. Plancherel, C. Jeandel, T. Arsouze, Global continental
291 and marine detrital ϵNd : An updated compilation for use in understanding marine Nd
292 cycling. *Chem Geol* **567**, 120119 (2021).
- 293 22. Y. Wu, “Investigating the Applications of Neodymium Isotopic Compositions and Rare
294 Earth Elements as Water Mass Tracers in the South Atlantic and North Pacific,” thesis,
295 Columbia University (2019).
- 296 23. E. Garcia-Solsona, C. Jeandel, M. Labatut, F. Lacan, D. Vance, V. Chavagnac, C. Pradoux,
297 Rare earth elements and Nd isotopes tracing water mass mixing and particle-seawater
298 interactions in the SE Atlantic. *Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta* **125**, 351–372 (2014).
- 299 24. P. Rahlf, E. Hathorne, G. Laukert, M. Gutjahr, S. Weldeab, M. Frank, Tracing water mass
300 mixing and continental inputs in the southeastern Atlantic Ocean with dissolved neodymium
301 isotopes. *Earth and Planetary Science Letters*, 115944–13 (2019).
- 302 25. Y. Wu, L. D. Pena, R. F. Anderson, A. E. Hartman, L. L. Bolge, C. Basak, J. Kim, M. J. A.
303 Rijkenberg, H. J. W. de Baar, S. L. Goldstein, Assessing neodymium isotopes as an ocean
304 circulation tracer in the Southwest Atlantic. *Earth and Planetary Science Letters* **599** (2022).
- 305 26. N. Zhao, D. W. Oppo, K.-F. Huang, J. N. W. Howe, J. Blusztajn, L. D. Keigwin, Glacial-
306 interglacial Nd isotope variability of North Atlantic Deep Water modulated by North
307 American ice sheet. *Nature Communications*, 1–10 (2019).
- 308 27. F. Pöppelmeier, M. Gutjahr, P. Blaser, H. Schulz, F. Sufke, J. Lippold, Stable Atlantic Deep
309 Water Mass Sourcing on Glacial-Interglacial Timescales. *Geophys Res Lett* **48** (2021).
- 310 28. R. Hu, A. M. Piotrowski, Neodymium isotope evidence for glacial-interglacial variability of
311 deepwater transit time in the Pacific Ocean. *Nature Communications* **9**, 4709 (2018).
- 312 29. S. K. V. Hines, L. Bolge, S. L. Goldstein, C. D. Charles, I. R. Hall, S. R. Hemming, Little
313 change in ice age water mass structure from Cape Basin benthic neodymium and carbon
314 isotopes. *Paleoceanography and Paleoclimatology*, doi: 10.1029/2021pa004281 (2021).
- 315 30. B. Hönisch, N. G. Hemming, D. Archer, M. Siddall, J. F. McManus, Atmospheric Carbon
316 Dioxide Concentration Across the Mid-Pleistocene Transition. *Science* **324**, 1551–1554
317 (2009).

- 318 31. T. B. Chalk, M. P. Hain, G. L. Foster, E. J. Rohling, P. F. Sexton, M. P. S. Badger, S. G.
319 Cherry, A. P. Hasenfratz, G. H. Haug, S. L. Jaccard, A. Martínez-García, H. Pälike, R. D.
320 Pancost, P. A. Wilson, Causes of ice age intensification across the Mid-Pleistocene
321 Transition. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences* **114**, 13114–13119 (2017).
- 322 32. Y. Yan, M. L. Bender, E. J. Brook, H. M. Clifford, P. C. Kemeny, A. V. Kurbatov, S.
323 Mackay, P. A. Mayewski, J. Ng, J. P. Severinghaus, J. A. Higgins, Two-million-year-old
324 snapshots of atmospheric gases from Antarctic ice. *Nature*, 1–19 (2019).
- 325 33. J. A. Higgins, A. V. Kurbatov, N. E. Spaulding, E. Brook, D. S. Introne, L. M. Chimiak, Y.
326 Yan, P. A. Mayewski, M. L. Bender, Atmospheric composition 1 million years ago from blue
327 ice in the Allan Hills, Antarctica. *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci.* **112**, 6887–6891 (2015).
- 328 34. M. Yamamoto, S. C. Clemens, O. Seki, Y. Tsuchiya, Y. Huang, R. O’ishi, A. Abe-Ouchi,
329 Increased interglacial atmospheric CO₂ levels followed the mid-Pleistocene Transition. *Nat*
330 *Geosci* **15**, 307–313 (2022).
- 331 35. D. M. Sigman, M. P. Hain, G. H. Haug, The polar ocean and glacial cycles in atmospheric
332 CO₂ concentration. *Nature* **466**, 47–55 (2010).
- 333 36. F. Knox, M. B. McElroy, Changes in atmospheric CO₂: Influence of the marine biota at high
334 latitude. *Journal of Geophysical Research* **89**, 4629 (1984).
- 335 37. U. Siegenthaler, T. Wenk, Rapid atmospheric CO₂ variations and ocean circulation. *Nature*
336 **308**, 624–626 (1984).
- 337 38. J. L. Sarmiento, J. R. Toggweiler, A new model for the role of the oceans in determining
338 atmospheric pCO₂. *Nature* **308**, 621–624 (1984).
- 339 39. J. R. Toggweiler, J. L. Russell, S. R. Carson, Midlatitude westerlies, atmospheric CO₂, and
340 climate change during the ice ages. *Paleoceanography* **21** (2006).
- 341 40. A. M. D. Boer, A. McC. Hogg, Control of the glacial carbon budget by topographically
342 induced mixing. *Geophys. Res. Lett.* **41**, 4277–4284 (2014).
- 343 41. D. A. Hodell, K. A. Venz, C. D. Charles, U. S. Ninnemann, Pleistocene vertical carbon
344 isotope and carbonate gradients in the South Atlantic sector of the Southern Ocean. *Geochem*
345 *Geophys Geosystems* **4** (2003).
- 346 42. M. O. Patterson, R. McKay, T. Naish, H. C. Bostock, R. Dunbar, C. Ohneiser, S. C.
347 Woodard, G. Wilson, R. Caballero-Gill, A Southwest Pacific Perspective on Long-Term
348 Global Trends in Pliocene-Pleistocene Stable Isotope Records. *Paleoceanogr.*
349 *Paleoclimatology* **33**, 825–839 (2018).
- 350 43. H. L. Ford, S. M. Soshian, Y. Rosenthal, M. E. Raymo, Gradual and abrupt changes during
351 the Mid-Pleistocene Transition. *Quat. Sci. Rev.* **148**, 222–233 (2016).

- 352 44. S. Sosdian, Y. Rosenthal, Deep-Sea Temperature and Ice Volume Changes Across the
353 Pliocene-Pleistocene Climate Transitions. *Science*, doi: 10.1126/science.1169938 (2009).
- 354 45. N. C. Thomas, H. J. Bradbury, D. A. Hodell, Changes in North Atlantic deep-water
355 oxygenation across the Middle Pleistocene Transition. *Science* **377**, 654–659 (2022).
- 356 46. M. E. Raymo, D. W. Oppo, B. P. Flower, D. A. Hodell, J. F. McManus, K. A. Venz, K. F.
357 Kleiven, K. McIntyre, Stability of North Atlantic water masses in face of pronounced climate
358 variability during the Pleistocene. *Paleoceanography* **19**, n/a-n/a (2004).
- 359 47. L. C. Skinner, Glacial-interglacial atmospheric CO₂ change: a possible “standing volume”
360 effect on deep-ocean carbon sequestration. *Clim. Past* **5**, 537–550 (2009).
- 361 48. A. Martínez-García, A. Rosell-Melé, S. L. Jaccard, W. Geibert, D. M. Sigman, G. H. Haug,
362 Southern Ocean dust-climate coupling over the past four million years. *Nature* **476**, 312–315
363 (2011).
- 364 49. L.-P. Nadeau, R. Ferrari, M. F. Jansen, Antarctic sea ice Control on the Depth of North
365 Atlantic Deep Water. *Journal of Climate*, JCLI-D-18-0519.1-38 (2019).
- 366 50. M. E. Raymo, L. E. Lisiecki, K. H. Nisancioglu, Plio-Pleistocene Ice Volume, Antarctic
367 Climate, and the Global $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ Record. *Science* **313**, 492–495 (2006).
- 368 51. J. Sutter, H. Fischer, K. Grosfeld, N. B. Karlsson, T. Kleiner, B. V. Liefferinge, O. Eisen,
369 Modelling the Antarctic Ice Sheet across the mid-Pleistocene transition – implications for
370 Oldest Ice. *Cryosphere* **13**, 2023–2041 (2019).
- 371 52. R. Schlitzer, R. F. Anderson, E. M. Dodas, M. Lohan, W. Geibert, A. Tagliabue, A. Bowie,
372 C. Jeandel, M. T. Maldonado, W. M. Landing, D. Cockwell, C. Abadie, W. Abouchami, E.
373 P. Achterberg, A. Agather, A. Aguliar-Islas, H. M. van Aken, M. Andersen, C. Archer, M.
374 Auro, H. J. de Baar, O. Baars, A. R. Baker, K. Bakker, C. Basak, M. Baskaran, N. R. Bates,
375 D. Bauch, P. van Beek, M. K. Behrens, E. Black, K. Bluhm, L. Bopp, H. Bouman, K.
376 Bowman, J. Bown, P. Boyd, M. Boye, E. A. Boyle, P. Branellec, L. Bridgestock, G.
377 Brissebrat, T. Browning, K. W. Bruland, H.-J. Brumsack, M. Brzezinski, C. S. Buck, K. N.
378 Buck, K. Buesseler, A. Bull, E. Butler, P. Cai, P. C. Mor, D. Cardinal, C. Carlson, G.
379 Carrasco, N. Casacuberta, K. L. Casciotti, M. Castrillejo, E. Chamizo, R. Chance, M. A.
380 Charette, J. E. Chaves, H. Cheng, F. Chever, M. Christl, T. M. Church, I. Closset, A.
381 Colman, T. M. Conway, D. Cossa, P. Croot, J. T. Cullen, G. A. Cutter, C. Daniels, F.
382 Dehairs, F. Deng, H. T. Dieu, B. Duggan, G. Dulaquais, C. Dumousseaud, Y. Echegoyen-
383 Sanz, R. L. Edwards, M. Ellwood, E. Fahrback, J. N. Fitzsimmons, A. R. Flegal, M. Q.
384 Fleisher, T. van de Flierdt, M. Frank, J. Friedrich, F. Fripiat, H. Fröllje, S. J. G. Galer, T.
385 Gamo, R. S. Ganeshram, J. Garcia-Orellana, E. Garcia-Solsona, M. Gault-Ringold, E.
386 George, L. J. A. Gerringa, M. Gilbert, J. M. Godoy, S. L. Goldstein, S. R. Gonzalez, K.
387 Grissom, C. Hammerschmidt, A. Hartman, C. S. Hassler, E. C. Hathorne, M. Hatta, N.
388 Hawco, C. T. Hayes, L.-E. Heimbürger, J. Helgoe, M. Heller, G. M. Henderson, P. B.
389 Henderson, S. van Heuven, P. Ho, T. J. Horner, Y.-T. Hsieh, K.-F. Huang, M. P. Humphreys,
390 K. Isshiki, J. E. Jacquot, D. J. Janssen, W. J. Jenkins, S. John, E. M. Jones, J. L. Jones, D. C.

- 391 Kadko, R. Kayser, T. C. Kenna, R. Khondoker, T. Kim, L. Kipp, J. K. Klar, M. Klunder, S.
392 Kretschmer, Y. Kumamoto, P. Laan, M. Labatut, F. Lacan, P. J. Lam, M. Lambelet, C. H.
393 Lamborg, F. A. C. L. Moigne, E. L. Roy, O. J. Lechtenfeld, J.-M. Lee, P. Lherminier, S.
394 Little, M. López-Lora, Y. Lu, P. Masque, E. Mawji, C. R. McClain, C. Measures, S. Mehic,
395 J.-L. M. Barraqueta, P. van der Merwe, R. Middag, S. Mieruch, A. Milne, T. Minami, J. W.
396 Moffett, G. Moncoiffe, W. S. Moore, P. J. Morris, P. L. Morton, Y. Nakaguchi, N.
397 Nakayama, J. Niedermiller, J. Nishioka, A. Nishiuchi, A. Noble, H. Obata, S. Ober, D. C.
398 Ohnemus, J. van Ooijen, J. O’Sullivan, S. Owens, K. Pahnke, M. Paul, F. Pavia, L. D. Pena,
399 B. Peters, F. Planchon, H. Planquette, C. Pradoux, V. Puigcorbé, P. Quay, F. Queroue, A.
400 Radic, S. Rauschenberg, M. Rehkämper, R. Rember, T. Remenyi, J. A. Resing, J. Rickli, S.
401 Rigaud, M. J. A. Rijkenberg, S. Rintoul, L. F. Robinson, M. Roca-Martí, V. Rodellas, T.
402 Roeske, J. M. Rolison, M. Rosenberg, S. Roshan, M. M. R. van der Loeff, E. Ryabenko, M.
403 A. Saito, L. A. Salt, V. Sanial, G. Sarthou, C. Schallenberg, U. Schauer, H. Scher, C.
404 Schlosser, B. Schnetger, P. Scott, P. N. Sedwick, I. Semiletov, R. Shelley, R. M. Sherrell, A.
405 M. Shiller, D. M. Sigman, S. K. Singh, H. A. Slagter, E. Slater, W. M. Smethie, H. Snaith, Y.
406 Sohrin, B. Sohst, J. E. Sonke, S. Speich, R. Steinfeldt, G. Stewart, T. Stichel, C. H. Stirling,
407 J. Stutsman, G. J. Swarr, J. H. Swift, A. Thomas, K. Thorne, C. P. Till, R. Till, A. T.
408 Townsend, E. Townsend, R. Tuerena, B. S. Twining, D. Vance, S. Velazquez, C.
409 Venchiarutti, M. Villa-Alfageme, S. M. Vivancos, A. H. L. Voelker, B. Wake, M. J. Warner,
410 R. Watson, E. van Weerlee, M. A. Weigand, Y. Weinstein, D. Weiss, A. Wisotzki, E. M. S.
411 Woodward, J. Wu, Y. Wu, K. Wuttig, N. Wyatt, Y. Xiang, R. C. Xie, Z. Xue, H. Yoshikawa,
412 J. Zhang, P. Zhang, Y. Zhao, L. Zheng, X.-Y. Zheng, M. Zieringer, L. A. Zimmer, P. Ziveri,
413 P. Zunino, C. Zurbriek, The GEOTRACES Intermediate Data Product 2017. *Chemical*
414 *Geology* **493**, 210–223 (2018).
- 415 53. J. N. W. Howe, A. M. Piotrowski, Atlantic deep water provenance decoupled from
416 atmospheric CO₂ concentration during the lukewarm interglacials. *Nature Communications*,
417 1–7 (2017).
- 418 54. V. Dausmann, M. Frank, M. Gutjahr, J. Rickli, Glacial reduction of AMOC strength and
419 long-term transition in weathering inputs into the Southern Ocean since the mid-Miocene:
420 Evidence from radiogenic Nd and Hf isotopes. *Paleoceanography* **32**, 265–283 (2017).
- 421 55. R. Hu, T. L. Noble, A. M. Piotrowski, I. N. McCave, H. C. Bostock, H. L. Neil, Neodymium
422 isotopic evidence for linked changes in Southeast Atlantic and Southwest Pacific circulation
423 over the last 200 kyr. *Earth and Planetary Science Letters* **455**, 106–114 (2016).
- 424 56. D. Lüthi, M. L. Floch, B. Bereiter, T. Blunier, J.-M. Barnola, U. Siegenthaler, D. Raynaud, J.
425 Jouzel, H. Fischer, K. Kawamura, T. F. Stocker, High-resolution carbon dioxide
426 concentration record 650,000–800,000 years before present. *Nature* **453**, 379–382 (2008).
- 427 57. S. K. V. Hines, Cape Basin Authigenic Nd and Benthic Stable Isotope Data for the Mid-
428 Pleistocene Transition, noaa-ocean-39722, NOAA/WDS Paleo Archive (2024);
429 <https://www.ncei.noaa.gov/access/paleo-search/study/39722>.

- 430 58. M. R. Palmer, H. Elderfield, Variations in the Nd isotopic composition of foraminifera from
431 Atlantic Ocean sediments. *Earth and Planetary Science Letters* **73**, 299–305 (1985).
- 432 59. N. L. Roberts, A. M. Piotrowski, J. F. McManus, L. D. Keigwin, Synchronous Deglacial
433 Overturning and Water Mass Source Changes. *Science* **327**, 75–78 (2010).
- 434 60. T. Tanaka, S. Togashi, H. Kamioka, H. Amakawa, H. Kagami, T. Hamamoto, M. Yuhara, Y.
435 Orihashi, S. Yoneda, H. Shimizu, T. Kunimaru, K. Takahashi, T. Yanagi, T. Nakano, H.
436 Fujimaki, R. Shinjo, Y. Asahara, M. Tanimizu, C. Dragusanu, JNdi-1: a neodymium isotopic
437 reference in consistency with LaJolla neodymium. *Chem Geol* **168**, 279–281 (2000).
- 438 61. S. B. Jacobsen, G. J. Wasserburg, Sm-Nd isotopic evolution of chondrites. *Earth Planet. Sci.*
439 *Lett.* **50**, 139–155 (1980). doi:10.1016/0012-821X(80)90125-9
- 440 62. S. Kotov, H. Pälke, “QAnalySeries – a cross-platform time series tuning and analysis tool,”
441 abstract no. PP53D-1230, AGU Fall meeting (2018).

442

443 Acknowledgments

444 This research uses samples provide by the IODP and would not have been possible without the
445 efforts of the Expedition 361 Scientific Party and the JOIDES Resolution technical staff
446 and crew.

447 **Funding:** This study was supported by National Science Foundation grant OCE-1831415
448 (S.R.H., S.L.G., S.K.V.H.).

449 **Author contributions:** Conceptualization: S.R.H., S.L.G., C.D.C., and S.K.V.H. Methodology:
450 S.K.V.H., M.P., L.B., and C.D.C. Funding acquisition: S.R.H. and S.L.G. Supervision:
451 S.R.H., S.L.G., and S.K.V.H. Writing – original draft: S.K.V.H. Writing – review &
452 editing: All authors.

453 **Competing interests:** The authors declare that they have no competing interests.

454 **Data and materials availability:** All data are available in the main text, the supplementary
455 materials, or the NOAA/WDS Paleo Archive (57).

456 **License information:** Copyright © 2024 the authors, some rights reserved; exclusive licensee
457 American Association for the Advancement of Science. No claim to original US
458 government works. <https://www.science.org/about/science-licenses-journal-article-reuse>

459 Supplementary Materials

460 [science.org/doi/10.1126/science.adn4154](https://www.science.org/doi/10.1126/science.adn4154)

461 Materials and Methods

462 Supplementary Text

463 Figs. S1 to S9

464 References (57–61)

465 Data S1 to S2

466

467 Submitted 8 December 2023; accepted 4 October 2024

468 **Fig. 1. Atlantic Ocean hydrography with core sites.** (A) A depth-latitude ϵNd section through
469 the Atlantic (20, 23–25, 52) with neutral density contours following the red outlined path in (C),
470 crossing from the western to the eastern basin at $\sim 30^\circ\text{S}$. Site U1479 (this study) is marked with a
471 pink circle. Other sites discussed in the text also marked. EQ, equator. (B) A salinity section with
472 neutral density contours following the same path as in (A). (C) Sediment core sites plotted in
473 map view with the transect from (A) and (B) marked. Small blue dots mark seawater Nd isotope
474 stations.

475 **Fig. 2. ϵNd data for the last glacial cycle and MPT from across the Atlantic Ocean.** (A)
476 Benthic stable oxygen isotope data from site U1479 (light blue; this study) (29) and the LR04
477 benthic stack (black) (1) with marine isotope stages marked. ka, thousand years ago. (B) ϵNd
478 data from across the Atlantic basin for sites 607 and U1313 (purple stars) (8, 27), 929 (light teal
479 diamonds) (53), 926 (dark teal right-facing triangles) (9), 1267 (yellow left-facing triangles)
480 (10), U1479 (pink circles and bold line; this study) (29), 1088 (orange squares; orange diamonds
481 mark bulk leach samples) (3, 54, 55), and 1090 (red triangles) (3, 55). Glacial intervals are
482 marked by gray vertical bars, and the 0.9 Ma event during MIS 23 is marked with a tan vertical
483 bar. (C) Glacial and interglacial ϵNd box plots at site U1479 (pink) for different time intervals.

484 **Fig. 3. Ocean circulation and carbon cycle changes over the past 1.5 Ma.** (A) Benthic stable
485 oxygen isotope data combined from sites U1479 (this study) and U1475 (16) (black, see
486 methods) and spliced data from site 1090 and TN057-6 (yellow) (41). Filled squares mark glacial
487 maxima and open circles mark interglacial maxima; these points are used to calculate vertical
488 isotope gradients. (B) ϵNd (pink) and benthic $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ (black) data from site U1479 over the past
489 ~ 1.3 Ma. (C) Atmospheric pCO_2 records from Epica Dome C in Antarctica (black solid line)
490 (56), Allen Hills [gray squares, (32, 33)], and boron isotope measurements [yellow circles, (30);
491 gray line and shading, (31)]. ppm, parts per million. (D) Deep ocean phosphate (green) and
492 carbonate ion (maroon) records from site 1267 (10). (E) Box plot of vertical oxygen isotope
493 gradient during glacial maxima. Gradients were calculated at glacial maxima (filled squares)
494 between the combined record from sites U1479 and U1475 and the spliced data from site 1090
495 and TN057-6.

496 **Fig. 4. Ocean circulation changes during the MPT.** (A) Modern ocean circulation with
497 locations of key sites marked. Light gray lines are isopycnals, which also constitute lines of
498 constant $\delta^{18}\text{O}$, and colors mark water masses (NSW, blue; SSW, red). (B) Glacial ocean
499 circulation configuration after the MPT, with increased stratification between NSW and SSW
500 (isopycnals lie close together). Site U1479 is near the boundary between NSW and SSW, sharing
501 a water mass with site 1090 such that these sites have similar $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ values. Fresh meltwater from
502 Antarctic icebergs may have contributed to enhanced stratification between NSW and SSW by
503 lowering the density of NSW with the addition of fresh meltwater while expanding Antarctic ice
504 sheets and increasing sea ice production, which increased the density of SSW through salt from
505 brine rejection. The overall result is an increase in the NSW-SSW density contrast.