

## **Immigration and inclusion in South Wales**

*Terry Threadgold, Sadie Clifford, Abdi Arwo, Vanessa Powell, Zahera Harb, Xinyi Jiang and John Jewell*

**This research explores the impact of new migration on established communities in south-east Wales, in particular on the issues of community, integration and cohesion.**

It documents everyday life for both migrants and receiving communities. It explores the views and experiences of people from a range of ethnically diverse geographical areas, and different kinds of migrants.

The study explores:

- the responses to new migration of settled receiving communities and geographical areas of south-east Wales, both historically and over the past ten years;
- people's understandings of key policy terms (e.g. community, integration, inclusion, community cohesion) at a number of levels: administrative, community leadership and grassroots;
- the way both new migrants and settled communities experience the major 'indicators of integration' or inclusion in their everyday lives: English language learning, interpretation and translation, education, housing, employment, healthcare, policing and community safety;
- what can support, and what can hinder, community cohesion.



**JOSEPH ROWNTREE  
FOUNDATION**



**Available in  
other formats**

This publication can be provided in other formats, such as large print, Braille and audio. Please contact:  
Communications, Joseph Rowntree Foundation,  
The Homestead, 40 Water End, York YO30 6WP.  
Tel: 01904 615905. Email: [info@jrf.org.uk](mailto:info@jrf.org.uk)

# **Immigration and inclusion in South Wales**

**Terry Threadgold, Sadie Clifford, Abdi Arwo,  
Vanessa Powell, Zahera Harb, Xinyi Jiang and  
John Jewell**



**JOSEPH ROWNTREE  
FOUNDATION**

The **Joseph Rowntree Foundation** has supported this project as part of its programme of research and innovative development projects, which it hopes will be of value to policy-makers, practitioners and service users. The facts presented and views expressed in this report are, however, those of the authors and not necessarily those of the Foundation.

Joseph Rowntree Foundation, The Homestead, 40 Water End, York YO30 6WP  
Website: [www.jrf.org.uk](http://www.jrf.org.uk)

All the authors of this report were employed by the Cardiff School of Journalism, Media and Cultural Studies for the duration of the project.

© University of Cardiff, 2008

First published 2008 by the Joseph Rowntree Foundation

All rights reserved. Reproduction of this report by photocopying or electronic means for non-commercial purposes is permitted. Otherwise, no part of this report may be reproduced, adapted, stored in a retrieval system or transmitted by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, or otherwise without the prior written permission of the Joseph Rowntree Foundation.

ISBN: 978 1 85935 645 6 (English PDF)

ISBN: 978 1 85935 646 3 (Welsh PDF)

A CIP catalogue record for this report is available from the British Library.

Prepared by:

York Publishing Services Ltd

64 Hallfield Road

Layerthorpe

York YO31 7ZQ

Tel: 01904 430033; Fax: 01904 430868; Website: [www.yps-publishing.co.uk](http://www.yps-publishing.co.uk)

Further copies of this report, or any other JRF publication, can be obtained from the JRF website ([www.jrf.org.uk/bookshop/](http://www.jrf.org.uk/bookshop/)).

# Contents

<b>Executive summary</b>	vii
<b>1 Introduction</b>	1
What we know from research	1
Research on inclusion in Wales	1
Ethnicity, class and disadvantage in Wales	2
Ethnicity, racism and poverty	3
Super-diversity	3
Social cohesion and policy development in Wales	4
The policy context: devolution	5
Aims of the research	6
The fieldwork	7
The communities	8
The interviews	9
Organisation of the report	10
<b>2 Exploring community cohesion</b>	11
Policy-makers' understandings	11
Grass-roots understandings	13
Different views of community	15
Rethinking community cohesion	19
Parallel lives: when isolation is a problem	20
Youth as a challenge to cohesion	23
Community cohesion and separation in middle-class Wales	26
Summary points	28
<b>3 Social class, immigration and inclusion</b>	30
Poverty, migration and social class	30
New migrants, work and social class	32
Social mobility and social class	33
Class difference in working-class environments	36
Education and inclusion	37
Social exclusion, poverty and class	38
Summary points	41
<b>4 Barriers to inclusion and community cohesion</b>	42
Racism and discrimination	42
Racism in traditional settled Cardiff communities	44
Access to work and services	44
Public service providers	51

Council workers, respect and identity	54
Parental fears about racism and British culture	55
Access to higher education	56
The role of the media	57
Summary points	61
<b>5 Conclusions and policy directions</b>	<b>63</b>
Welsh cohesion policy	63
Policy language and the making of 'common sense'	64
Cohesion: local realities	65
Poverty, social class and cohesion	66
External barriers to integration	67
History, integration and cohesion	68
Lessons for Wales	68
<b>References</b>	<b>70</b>
<b>Appendix 1: Terms and definitions</b>	<b>81</b>
<b>Appendix 2: The communities</b>	<b>84</b>

# Executive summary

Policy on migration has developed rapidly in recent years, especially since 2001, and continues to develop in response to concerns about community, or social, cohesion. However, although developments in the use of the terms have been based on extensive consultation and surveys of local populations, the meanings of community cohesion have rarely been challenged and explored through in-depth research with local communities. This research therefore set out to explore the potential disparities between the realities of everyday life in South Wales and the realities implied by recent policy. The research explored a range of ethnically diverse geographical areas and different kinds of migration, including the views and experiences of both settled communities and new migrants.

Our research found:

- There was no evidence that community tensions are an inevitable consequence of new immigration.
- Minority ethnic groups were not any more 'segregated' than receiving middle-class and working-class communities, nor were they any less well integrated than white working-class communities on council estates.
- While middle-class (particularly but not only white) migration is largely invisible; migration (particularly involving visible or language difference) into deprived working-class communities is not. The ability of new migrants to work is viewed favourably by settled populations and assists the integration process, but the experience of the workplace is neither always positive nor cohesive.
- Significant class differences existed within and across the communities and areas we researched and affected the ways in which integration and community cohesion were experienced in everyday life.
- In all the services discussed with research participants, members of minority groups reported experiences of discrimination, offensive cultural ignorance or racism. The kind of racism and discrimination described may be in part class- as well as poverty-related.
- Social mobility was restricted by the deprived conditions and the poverty in which new migrants often found themselves and they seemed to struggle to integrate into environments that they perceived as a threat to their cultural values

and lifestyles. Settled working-class communities in similarly deprived areas shared the struggle to integrate and also perceived difference as a threat to their community values and lifestyle.

- The appearance of integration and cohesion in what seem to be successful communities can hide groups who are isolated, exploited or vulnerable. Generational tensions of different kinds exist across all the groups and geographical areas we studied. This can be the result of new forms of family and community leading to the isolation of the elderly, or of different access to, and levels of, integration.
- Migrant groups in particular believed that their ability to integrate and become part of a cohesive community was constantly damaged by media-fuelled stereotypes.

We concluded that:

- There is a real need to avoid the common-sense, and now institutionalised, tendency to link together race equality, community cohesion and issues of community safety and extremism, and a related need to explore cohesion issues across settled and new communities, groups and areas.
- Politicians as well as those at local council level and in other service provision contexts must be trained to understand and deliver on new policy directions in order to produce better public understanding and the kind of mutual respect and trust talked of by the Commission on Integration and Cohesion (2007). There are many examples of good practice which could be used as models, especially in ESOL (English for Speakers of Other Languages) and schooling contexts.
- Social class in particular remains hugely under-researched as a factor affecting processes of both integration and cohesion, and needs to be more central in developing and implementing policy in this area.

# 1 Introduction

Policy narratives of migration and social cohesion, and of migration of certain kinds (poor or non-white) as a 'threat' to social cohesion, are now entrenched as common sense (since 2001) in at least UK policy and media discourses. At the same time, the 'multiculturalism' which has shaped policy for the past four decades is being increasingly called into question. Central to these debates are current notions of 'community' – 'host' or 'receiving', or 'minority ethnic' – and attitudes to 'integration' and 'cohesion'. These terms are generally unquestioned and homogenising.

This research set out to explore the disparities between the realities of everyday life in South Wales and those realities imagined by policy, by exploring a range of different kinds of migration into a range of ethnically diverse geographical sites and a range of different ethnic 'communities', including (mostly white) middle- and working-class groups. We wanted to see, from the bottom up, what different versions of migration and social cohesion might look like.

## What we know from research

There are a number of bodies of existing research that are relevant to this project, and it is an area of research that is attracting increasing interest. This section summarises key research that is relevant to our work, concentrating on literature focused on Wales, and mentioning briefly literature which shaped the research design. More detailed overviews can be found in three reviews commissioned at the start of the Joseph Rowntree Foundation's Immigration and Inclusion programme (Berkeley *et al.*, 2006; Robinson and Reeve, 2006; Zetter *et al.*, 2006).

## Research on inclusion in Wales

In Wales what academic work there is on the settlement experience of new migrants has tended to be historical (e.g. Evans, 2003a, pp. 14–35) or, more recently, associated with the arrival since the 1980s of asylum seekers and refugees (Speers, 2001; Robinson, 2003a, pp. 160–78, 2003b, pp. 179–201; Lewis, 2005) and here the focus tends to be more on media coverage of these issues, on racism and dispersal policies and on related public attitudes and beliefs than on inclusion or social cohesion.

The empirical academic evidence base for understanding the experience of minority ethnic people in Wales is therefore still relatively slight (Scourfield and Davies, 2005). However, recent contributions include Threadgold and Clifford (2005) on the experience of asylum seekers and refugees in Wales for the 2006 Welsh Refugee Inclusion Strategy; Scourfield *et al.* (2002) on the South Wales Valleys; Evans and Wood (1999) on the experience of harassment and service provision among the black and minority ethnic population in Ely; and Williams (1997) on minority ethnic groups in Torfaen and on Welsh children (Scourfield and Davies, 2005, p. 86). Hewett *et al.* (2005) published a significant report for Save the Children on asylum-seeking children in Wales and there are a number of unpublished academic theses in university libraries which make useful contributions, for example Ahmed (1998) and Jiang (2006), which deal respectively with the Somalis and undocumented Chinese immigration to South Wales.

### **Ethnicity, class and disadvantage in Wales**

One of the greatest challenges facing the devolved Welsh Assembly Government when it came to power in 1999 was the ‘intractable concentration of localised difficulties’ (Osmond and Mugaseth, 2007, p. 1) in the old industrial South Wales Valleys and in the post-industrial contexts of Cardiff Bay and surrounding areas. The worst areas of deprivation in Wales, measured by the Welsh Index of Multiple Deprivation, are also the areas in Cardiff where the greatest concentrations of migrants now live. These areas have complex histories of industrialisation, de-industrialisation and regeneration, accompanied by many migrations. Settled communities and new migrants share experiences of class, gendered, and racial, inequalities inherited from this common history.

The minority ethnic experience in Wales is extremely diverse and not ‘coupled with disadvantage and discrimination in consistent ways’ (Williams, 2003a, p. 154). However, there is ample evidence that marginalisation and perceived discrimination still inhibit those from minority ethnic groups in Wales from full engagement in civil society (Robinson *et al.*, 2003; Williams, 2003a, pp. 155, 2003b). There is similar evidence around the effects of multiple deprivation, and cultures of worklessness, in settled working-class communities, whatever their ethnicity (Williamson, 2004).

## Ethnicity, racism and poverty

There is a significant history of racism (Evans, 1980, 2003a, 2003b; Jordan, 1991, 2003, 2004; Williams, 1999) which does not always sit easily beside the 'myth of warm, accepting proletarian Wales' (Robinson, 2003a, 2003b; Robinson *et al.*, 2003; Scourfield and Davies, 2005, p. 86). The Chinese, for example, have been periodically considered a threat to the labour market and were one of the targets of the South Wales race riots in 1991 (Evans, 1980, 1988; Cayford, 1991; Holmes, 1988; Owen, 1992, 1993a, 1993b, 1994). The Somalis have an even longer history of being discriminated against. Scourfield and Davies (2005), in their study of children's accounts of Welshness as either racialised or inclusive, point to the prevailing whiteness and exclusiveness of the available discourses of Welshness (see also Williams, 1999), the historical connection between Welsh nationalist politics and Welsh-speaking communities, the consequent 'racial' implications of the 'collapsing of language and identity' when minority ethnic people are less likely to be Welsh speakers, and the reluctance of minority children to claim Welshness. They conclude that we are a long way from the reality of an inclusive Wales. An equally recent report on public attitudes to immigration and asylum seeking in Wales presents similarly ambivalent results (Lewis, 2005, p. 35). However, histories of interactions between local authorities, service providers and settled communities in Wales often suggest very similar patterns of 'discrimination' and 'marginalisation' in working-class contexts as are experienced by new migrants and assumed to be race-based (Osmond and Mugaseth, 2007, p. 6). In this research, students in Cathays in Cardiff, white, black and Asian, also poor and without much social or economic capital, reported very similar treatment at the hands of private landlords, for example.

## Super-diversity

Our work has also been centrally informed by Vertovec's work on 'super-diversity'. Super-diversity, he argues, is a feature of 'Britain's contemporary social condition' and is the result of 'a convergence of factors arising surrounding immigration since the 1990s' (Vertovec, 2006, p. 31). These include: country of origin; migration channel; legal status; migrant's human capital; access to employment; locality; transnationalism; and responses by local authorities, service providers and local residents. They may also involve a 'plurality of affiliations' (not just ethnicity) and cohere to 'different social worlds and communities simultaneously' (Zetter *et al.*, 2006, pp. 14, 19). These things will be dependent on, for example, immigration category and or transnational links (Zetter *et al.*, 2006, p. 15; Vertovec, 2006, p. 31). Vertovec further argues that policy is still focused too much on fixed ethnic identities

and on building relations with existing black and minority ethnic groups, while failing to link the integration of new migrants with 'community cohesion' or even to define what 'community cohesion' means or how it can be accomplished (2006, p. 30).

### **Social cohesion and policy development in Wales**

The community cohesion team at the Welsh Assembly are (at the time of writing this report) working on a cohesion policy for Wales. Their work will be influenced by the recent report of the Commission on Integration and Cohesion (2007) which makes a new and useful distinction between the process of social cohesion and the process of integration or inclusion:

... cohesion is principally the process that must happen in all communities to ensure different groups of people get on well together; while integration is principally the process that ensures new residents and existing residents adapt to one another. (Commission on Integration and Cohesion, 2007, p. 38)

In this definition the Commission recognises that social cohesion is not just about race, ethnicity and faith, or about security, that it includes all areas of society, and that integration is not about assimilation, but involves a two-way process. They also seem to recognise that virtually all places and neighbourhoods are now challenged by demographic and social changes and characterised by different patterns of inward and outward mobility. However, there is a loss here of the older sense of economic integration, which was key to a number of earlier definitions of this term where 'indicators of integration' included access to provision of various costly services: for example, learning English, translation and interpretation, education, housing, employment, community safety and policing, and healthcare.

The Assembly Government, in its Refugee Inclusion Strategy (WAG, 2006), has chosen on the whole to use the term 'inclusion' rather than 'integration', and has refused to construct 'social cohesion' as a problem to do just with new migrants (in this case refugees), preferring, like the Commission above, to see the long-term process of social and economic integration as a two-way process, but going further in recognising a range of different kinds of contribution which would characterise inclusion:

Refugee inclusion is a long term, dynamic, two-way process which places demands on both refugee individuals and communities and wider society. The objective of refugee inclusion is the establishment of mutual and responsible relationships between refugees and their communities, civil society and government. Refugee inclusion takes place when a refugee becomes a fully active member of society, participating in and contributing to the economic, social, cultural, civil and political life of the country. (WAG, 2006, p. 4)

It seems also to have avoided the assumption that any particular group would automatically be classed as the 'host' community:

The communities into which refugees settle are called receiving communities. This term can refer to the range of different communities – whether the immediate local community, a community of interest or broader society. Refugee inclusion is a two-way process and it is important for the receiving community to play an active role in its achievement, as it is for refugee communities. (WAG, 2006, p. 5)

It is likely that new policy on community cohesion in Wales will address the full complexities of contemporary Welsh society. However, despite the progress in policy direction that has been made since 2005, it is still worth remembering the multiple policy and funding contexts within which these issues are negotiated in Wales. Policy influences are complex and the languages people use to articulate these can vary enormously depending on which policy (European, UK, Welsh, local council, new, old) people are familiar with or attempting to implement, and indeed whether they have been trained or not. The constantly changing UK policy scene is also an issue.

## **The policy context: devolution**

Policy-making and implementation in Wales is of course complicated by the multiple policy contexts within which decisions are made and implemented. Strategies and initiatives in Wales to do with immigration and asylum operate within the context of international, European and UK policy and legislation as well as the Welsh Assembly Government's wider strategic agenda ([www.wales.gov.uk/themes/bettercountry/index.htm](http://www.wales.gov.uk/themes/bettercountry/index.htm)). The National Assembly for Wales has devolved powers to make rules and regulations, set standards and issue guidance in areas such as health and education within the basic framework of primary legislation made by the UK Parliament but no powers or responsibilities relating to immigration and asylum are devolved. The

Assembly Government has powers and responsibilities to support migrants given leave to remain in the country in relation to a whole range of services including (but not exclusively) culture, education and training, the environment, health and health services, housing and the Welsh language.

### **Aims of the research**

The research reported here sought to be both descriptive and challenging. The main research aims were:

1. To explore the responses to new migration of settled receiving communities and geographical areas of South Wales, both historically and over the past ten years.
2. To explore understandings of key policy terms (e.g., community, integration, inclusion, community cohesion) at a number of levels: administrative, community leadership and grass-roots.
3. To explore the way both new migrants and settled communities experience the major indicators of integration or inclusion in their everyday lives: English language learning, interpretation and translation, education, housing, employment, healthcare, policing and community safety.
4. To provide, through evidence-based case studies, understandings of what community cohesion and integration/inclusion can look like, and to explore issues which support, and which hinder, community cohesion.

We designed the research to explore different levels of engagement with, understanding of, and activity around, key policy ideas and terms (drawing on Baumann, 1998). Thus we chose to interview ‘administrators’ who make and implement policy, community leaders who need to ‘talk’ the policy ‘talk’ in order to apply for funding and to interact with ‘administrators’, and community members themselves for what they could tell us about everyday understandings at grass-roots levels. In our interviews and focus groups, we asked people about their understandings of key policy terms and their experience of those services and contexts where integration/inclusion is at risk. We also set out to probe these issues in participant observation encounters.

We were concerned to ask the question: What does *community cohesion*, as a policy construct and a concept in everyday use at many levels, do? What other words does it come to collocate with or become attached to (e.g., *community, race, integration, social exclusion, multiple deprivation, Muslim, terrorism*), and what effects does this have? How do policy documents on community cohesion produce or affect work designed to produce community cohesion? How do these kinds of work affect minority and settled groups? What kinds of governance, leadership or divisions does *community cohesion*, as policy construct, drive or produce? What does *cohesion* look like when we find it? Why? When it does not occur, why not? And in what ways is it dependent on or related to terms or realities like *integration* or *inclusion*?

We have used key terms throughout this report (as well as researching them) and details of our preferred definitions can be found in Appendix 1.

## **The fieldwork**

We began our 'fieldwork' in January 2005 and completed it in June 2006. We combined participant observation, triangulated with interviews with community leaders, and focus groups with community members to produce 'thick descriptions' of each site. These were carried out by a team of eight researchers, working initially through community leaders. Researchers spoke three community languages. We also involved additional minority ethnic women and some men in the research as participants to translate ethics statements and questionnaires, to help to moderate focus groups, questioning and interpreting as necessary, and later to help with the translation and transcription of focus groups. Cardiff University PhD students from different ethnic and national backgrounds also assisted with the transcription of interviews and focus groups.

Transcriptions were checked for accuracy by the researcher who carried out the interview or moderated the focus group. We were all involved in the initial round of interviews with administrators. We met regularly throughout the project to discuss theoretical approaches and practical methodological and analytical issues, and to debate and reflect on emerging results. We 'read' our interview and focus group 'data' as contextually produced 'discourse' and evidence of the patterned nature of lived social realities (Barbour and Kitzinger, 2001).

As we worked on this research, we were also carrying out focus group research with asylum seekers and refugees across Wales for the Welsh Assembly Government Refugee Inclusion Strategy. We asked the focus groups if they would agree to

participate in both projects and had them sign both ethics forms. We have therefore sometimes in this report drawn on this inclusion research data to support our evidence from this project (Threadgold and Clifford, 2005; Threadgold and Court, 2005).

### **The communities**

Wales has a population of just under 3 million (compared to 58 million in the UK as a whole) and is a poorer country than England or Scotland. About 20 per cent of the population speak Welsh and the significance of this for Welsh identity is highly contested (Scourfield and Davies, 2005, p. 86), especially in Cardiff which people in Merthyr Tydfil characterise in our data as inhabited by 'English Welsh'. The 2001 Census shows 97.9 per cent of the population of Wales to be white, but Cardiff to have a non-white minority population of 8.4 per cent with another 7.52 per cent born outside the UK (more recent Cardiff Council figures, based on Annual Population Survey data, estimate that 30,500 people, or 10 per cent of Cardiff's population, were born outside the UK, and other sources, such as GP registration, suggest that the number is higher still).

Our research was carried out in eight 'communities' or geographical areas in Cardiff and in Merthyr Tydfil, in 2005/06. The communities and areas were selected to give us some insight into a range of very different experiences of migration and settlement, and to ensure that we included the perspectives of both settled communities and recent arrivals. These were:

- a group of 'administrators' who worked in policy, in policy implementation, or in the delivery of services in the key areas of integration/inclusion;
- the Somali community;
- the Chinese community;
- the cluster of Arabic-speaking communities (principally the Yemenis, Iraqis and Sudanese);
- the Cathays area, located around Cardiff University;
- the Splott, Tremorfa, Adamsdown and Roath (STAR) area of Cardiff;

- Llandaff (a middle-class suburb to the north-west of the city);
- Merthyr Tydfil (a Valleys town to the north-west of the city).

Further details of the communities can be found in Appendix 2.

## The interviews

We carried out individual and paired interviews, and focus groups across the eight communities and sites we chose to research. The scope and nature of the project prevented us from recording gender and ethnicity of all participants, especially those in the focus groups, and a small number of individuals were interviewed in more than one capacity and therefore may appear twice in our figures. This is partly a result of the complexity of interviewing within geographically bounded communities, ethnic groups and communities and those who have a professional interest in migration; it is of course possible for someone to be represented in all three. However, the overview in Table 1 and the brief descriptions in Appendix 2 provide some details of the extent of our work.

**Table 1 Number of interviews in each community or group**

Community or group	Focus groups	Paired interviews	Individual interviews
Administrators/refugee and BME leaders and professionals	3	6	21
Media	0	0	4
Somali	14	3	12
Chinese	11	0	16
Arabic-speaking groups	10	1	30
Llandaff	2	1	4
Cathays	16	3	7
STAR	7	0	11
Merthyr Tydfil	18	1	11

Further information about the interviews can be found in Appendix 2.

## Organisation of the report

Each member of the research team originally wrote up the findings in the areas where they had worked. These individual reports were then reworked into a long final report organised around the communities and geographical areas where we had worked. These detailed reports will be made available as pdf files on the Cardiff School of Journalism, Media and Cultural Studies website once this report is published. The long first draft was next read by Joseph Rowntree Foundation advisers and community members for feedback. Four themes emerged from this process as key to the findings overall.

The remainder of this report is organised around three of the themes: *meanings, and everyday versions, of social cohesion and integration; social class and social cohesion; and the internal and external factors which keep people within their own communities*. The fourth theme of *intergenerational tensions and issues* is briefly covered in the section on cohesion. The conclusion draws out the policy implications of the research and findings.

## 2 Exploring community cohesion

In this chapter we explore the different views of cohesion held by policy-makers, those who implement policy as service providers, and members of different communities at 'grass-roots' level. Policy definitions of cohesion have changed rapidly over the past ten years or so, even over the course of this research. The extent to which policy ideas are reflected in reality was therefore a key consideration for this study and we have explored some of the different experiences of community and cohesion that exist in South Wales and some of the realities of parallel lives and isolation among both minority ethnic groups and settled communities. What we found was a great deal of heterogeneity, with very different views and experiences of community/cohesion among different groups; but we also found shared views and experiences across and between the groups we studied. It is clear in this research that 'common-sense' or everyday understandings of policy concepts like cohesion often lag a long way behind the policy, but the very different ideas about cohesion which we have found do provide insights into how policy and practice might be shaped in this area.

### Policy-makers' understandings

As a government we have a role in ensuring that the diversity which is a real strength of this country is successfully managed and doesn't lead to problems in the way that people live and get along together.

The overwhelming majority of people in this country live successfully side by side but we cannot take this for granted. We have to keep our eye on the ball and continue taking the steps to address issues head on in order that we will be well placed to respond to the issues associated with population change and globalisation.

(Blears, press release, 4 February 2008: [www.communities.gov.uk/news/corporate/682056](http://www.communities.gov.uk/news/corporate/682056))

This quote is among the most recent UK Government statements on what cohesion now means, at least to this politician. The meaning here is not quite the same as that from the Commission itself (see Introduction) because it is again assimilationist (see Zetter *et al.*, 2006), and repeats earlier versions of what has been called 'elite racism' (Blommaert and Verschueren, 1998) in constructing 'diversity' as a 'problem'

to be 'managed' rather than a resource to be enjoyed. The association of cohesion with community also still connotes an earlier association with security issues and the 'dangerous' communities of the Cattle Report (2001) – living parallel lives and not mixing with 'host' communities. When we began this project the current phrase was 'social cohesion', referring then to this perceived need for communities to interact. The term 'inclusion', as we have defined it above, was the preferred word in Wales. As we have pointed out above, the speed with which policy changes, along with the multiple policy regimes which are negotiated in devolved contexts like Wales, means that policy languages are hardly ever fully accepted or understood in practice. Only those making policy, or those needing to apply for funding based on policy assumptions, really come to know what policy terms and agendas mean, and are meant to do, when strategy becomes action. And although government ministers and commissions move on, local understandings and uses of policy terms often lag a long way behind (Ahmed *et al.*, 2006).

The term 'social cohesion' was recognised by most of the 'administrator' interviewees although they generally saw it as contested and difficult to define. It was inferred by some to mean cohesiveness or togetherness in society; others who were perhaps working more at the cutting edge of policy development argued that it was an idea created by governments on the basis of faulty evidence rather than a description of real life. Administrators also clearly understood the very real difference between policy and reality. The new language of policy in Wales has not yet reached the grass roots of communities, nor is the imagined two-way relationship between civil society, government and communities and their members a reality yet.

... I know that a lot of communities have done well in terms of funding and they've really done a good work. But my gut feeling I would say is that they still feel distanced from the process of power – still feel disadvantaged.

In the devolved Welsh context, the term 'inclusion' has been maintained at policy level (Threadgold and Court, 2005), and 'cohesion' appears to be understood at least by those writing policy to encompass issues normally understood to fall within the term 'integration' in the economic sense, as well as the issues to do with networks, life chances and belonging in the softer sense. Indeed in some Welsh policy contexts, it even encompasses a clear understanding of class difference and the need to 'include' the 'marginalised' as well as immigrants:

But cohesion is more than harmony and I think that the equality aspect of it is key. We used to talk about class and class divisions, class conflict, but these terms have gone out of fashion. But really they are, in many ways,

at the basis of the issue of social cohesion. There is a real issue around whether you can achieve it realistically while there are very wide socio-economic divisions between groups of people. Social cohesion as dealt with by the Assembly tends to mean that the more marginalised groups in society are to be drawn in more fully to society and given a fairer chance, to put it in a basic way. So yes I think there is a difference but social inclusion should be a means of helping to achieve social cohesion. That is my personal take on it.

The majority of those interviewed, including those who were unaware of the term 'social cohesion' and those who contested it, seemed to be working consistently towards the kinds of cross-cultural understandings, local encounters and long-term engagements which we might want to say are examples of what social cohesion or now community cohesion actually looks like when you meet it face to face. Those who work in the devolved Welsh context to two, or three, government policy masters seem often to be very aware of the poverty and need which unite communities as well as of the racism which still divides them. In this their attitudes mirror the desire for 'transparency and fairness' in Blears's recent response (press release, 4 February 2008). They are also remarkably resistant to policies which harm and are conscious of the things that policies cannot, as well as things that they can, do. In government contexts in Wales in 2007/08 the focus, as argued above, is on 'community cohesion' and the term 'social cohesion' is now rarely used.

## **Grass-roots understandings**

When we asked in focus groups about the meanings of the terms 'integration' and 'social cohesion' we found that they were consistently conflated among white groups in our data to mean 'assimilation': for example, having white friends, speaking and looking like 'us', not making us feel uncomfortable because they are different, doing what we do, treating women like we do, not wearing the veil because it makes us uncomfortable, or being educated like us to occupy professional and leadership roles like us. The following quotes, from Merthyr Tydfil residents who took part in focus groups, illustrate the type of views expressed:

*Respondent 1:* The problem with them is they don't want to integrate – you can speak to them in the street and they totally blank you, you say good morning and nothing – and it's not what we are used to. We are trying to accept them – and we are told that we have to – and they don't want to know – pig ignorant, they are!

I have a lot of friends who are bouncers. They are forever having to step in. They find them very disrespectful to women. Touching them up and that. They warn them now on the way in. They give them one chance only. They have no respect for women ... not that Welsh men have a lot after eight pints!

*Respondent 2:* Yes, it's not the same any more. They won't talk to you – they don't even speak our language! How are we supposed to get on with them?

And from a group in Llandaff:

Another thing that worries me is ... their wives. Even though they've been here for such a long time, they still don't integrate the women, they don't integrate at all. They send them out shopping and they take a child with them and the child, 10, 12 years of age will explain what is needed and whatever.

Another participant told us about her daughter's reactions to Muslim women using the local pool:

... she said, 'I don't know if I can go anymore', it's become so unpleasant because the Muslim women are there on a women's night – and I mean women like – [*who've*] lost their shape, you know, the older women, they may go. But these women swim in – covered you see – and she said it's like trying to swim through cloth – and she doesn't like that. She doesn't like the concept of – because when you go in the water you take off your clothes and you put your swimsuit on.

In some interviews with residents integration seemed to mean one of two things: becoming like us and/or a hybrid mix where real difference is, as it were, modified by mixing, being assimilated and made safe:

Why is it that the Jews have kept their traditions but have integrated better than the other minorities? I don't know why.

But they [*my son's children*] went to a Welsh primary school, which is down near the Leckwith Road stadium. And that is unbelievable. It is a Welsh primary school but if you stand outside, it's amazing. The ethnic mix there is incredible because they come from Grangetown, from the Bay and they are every hue and colour. And it's lovely, it's good to see.

Very few people in either white working-class or middle-class communities or areas discussed 'integration' as being about fulfilling the potential of the individual or giving him or her access to equal economic or social opportunities. We also found that common-sense understandings of terms like 'asylum seeker', 'refugee', 'migrant worker', 'host', 'community', 'integration', 'inclusion' or 'social cohesion' bore a distant relationship to current policy debates. Indeed, many groups tended to equate all newcomers with 'illegal asylum seekers'. This appeared to be the only category of immigrant recognised and was never based on any experience of such people but derived from media representations.

## **Different views of community**

We found many different types of community within this study: some based on geography, some on shared interests or experiences and others on ethnicity and/or religion. Some were transnational or diasporic, and examples of these are given below. We actually found very little evidence of traditional forms of community except in Merthyr and in Llandaff (see the case study at the end of this chapter), and in stories told to us by white Cardiffians about what 'community' used to be like – they remembered street parties and everyone knowing everyone else, especially in the Valleys where they grew up. These kinds of community still exist among some minority ethnic groups (e.g., Somalis, Yemenis, in Butetown) but in many parts of Cardiff people live side by side without any close contact with neighbours.

All the areas and communities we researched seemed to have transnational or diasporic connections or to be connected into other parts of the UK through family and other links.

## **Transnational links**

We found evidence in many of the groups of transnational links which were sustained through the internet or satellite TV, and through remittances sent to family in other countries. These links create or maintain communities, and families, across continents alongside their local networks.

Many of the ethnic groups in Cardiff use the internet or satellite TV to continue to participate in their home culture. Statistics for internet access in Wales are not disaggregated for ethnic difference, but have improved since 2002 when access was well below the national average. By the beginning of 2006 access was 52 per cent,

not so far behind the national average of 57 per cent (ONS, 2006). The Arab groups and the Somalis in particular seemed to use transnational media, especially satellite TV, including pan-Arab stations such as Al-Jazeera, and national ones such as Iqra'a (a Saudi station), Future (Lebanese) and Al Iraqia (Iraqi). The Mandarin Chinese group also have access to Phoenix, a non-governmental station (though based in the People's Republic). Transnational TV is considered important to the lives of many respondents for a number of reasons, including the fact that it enables those without any English to connect to the 'outside world' beyond their own four walls: 'Because we do not speak English we found it necessary to have Arabic satellite channels'.

Satellite media is seen as a form of cultural transmission, a way in which to ensure children can learn and appreciate the language and culture of the parents. This explains the importance of national channels over the pan-Arab ones; as this Sudanese man explains, it is vital for him and his family that a connection as authentic as possible is maintained:

I am a bit concerned because in Sudan our Arabic is different with the Sudanese dialect so here I don't have to let them watch other Arabic channels but the Sudan channel otherwise their understanding of the Sudanese language will be lost because of the Arabic language.

This authenticity and familiarity is also important for the parents, and satellite TV clearly plays an identity-affirming role. In a cultural environment which can be difficult, hostile and unsettling, this media serves as a reassuring cultural resource. A group of Libyan men and women say that satellite TV adds 'family and Arabic atmosphere', means they 'don't feel homesick' and 'somehow, it shortens the distance' by giving you 'the language and music you miss'. There was a debate in several of the focus groups about whether watching home TV made learning the English language more difficult (there was no consensus, but people with other sources of instruction, such as a workplace or school, tended to believe that there was not a problem). However, it may have given them a sense of belonging and a much more sophisticated conception of the news and political bias than is often found in studies of monocultural viewers (e.g., Lewis, 2005; Durante, 2006). In particular they noted differences between British and Arabic coverage of events in the Middle East and the UK. Some found that since the advent of satellite, they had consumed less UK media:

We used to watch more British TV, movies and documentaries.

I used to read British newspapers daily, because of satellite I read them weekly now, and follow the Arabic news in addition to the internet.

Yemenis now report needing to have two television sets so that their children can watch UK TV in English.

Somalis read British newspapers and watch television. They also access Arab television by satellite and many have internet access to the websites which give them up-to-date information about affairs in Somalia. Those in the community with computer training offer IT support on a voluntary basis. There is an emerging Somali language media and interest in the media in Somaliland. The BBC in Wales now has a Somali language website.

These media uses introduce new meanings for 'cohesion' and 'integration', putting the focus firmly on the benefits and the disadvantages of the double loyalties of migrants which always look both ways, to the old country and the new.

### **Diaspora, money-sending and global/local politics**

The issue of remittances raises the same issues. The Somaliland diaspora in the UK, Europe, North America and the Gulf States continues to maintain contacts with and to support the self-declared republic of Somaliland. Somalis born of long-standing Welsh Somali families spoke of the excitement of visiting their country and sharing a culture they had never known, and of learning Somali under the influence of the new influx of refugees in the late 1980s and 1990s. Young Somalis interviewed in Cardiff had already visited Somaliland while still at school in Cardiff and many others spoke of sending money, of anxiety about relatives left behind in Somalia and of guilt about being happy here while they suffered there. One Somali who had an agency for overseas money transfers in Butetown told us:

The transfer of money strengthens the community. In my town in Somaliland there are no jobs, nothing. 90% are unemployed, so how can they feed themselves? So what keeps the country is the money sent from elsewhere.

This is mentioned as an issue for community and individual development in several focus groups:

Most Somalis work in unskilled jobs ... I think the reason for this is that most Somalis come here as adults and they have to send money to their families. At the same time they have to establish their own families and they start having children which makes it even more difficult for them to stop working and do something else. On the other hand their children have nobody to look up to as their fathers are unskilled.

It is clear that the issue of remittances does not affect everyone or every community group equally. Social class, education and family support all make a difference. What is clear is that unaccompanied minors who do not have family support, and who struggle to send money home to their families and worry about those who are left behind, have more difficulties than those who have the support of family, whether professional or asylum seeking. This issue also affects the Yemeni who are from predominantly rural backgrounds and live mostly in Butetown. New migrants, Yemeni themselves, believe that the established Yemeni community (here since the nineteenth century) is caught in a kind of cultural time warp, and quite unlike society in contemporary Yemen. The push to work in low-skilled manual jobs to earn money to send home, and to buy cars and houses, seems, in this case, to work against learning English and thus against further education or social mobility. Underemployment of graduates in their own and the Somali community only convinces people that education is a waste of time. There is evidence of generational change, with British-born Yemeni children now beginning to refuse to speak Arabic at home.

Transnational communities do not necessarily then conflict with current definitions of integration as mutual adaptation or of cohesion as 'getting along well together', either within communities or between them.

As pointed out above in relation to media use, there are clearly always tensions for migrants about their relationship to the old and the new country to which they belong. These often seem to become focused around intergenerational tensions. Participants argue that it is important that their children should share their love for their home country, but children may exhibit a variety of reactions to their parents' country of origin. This was discussed by Iraqi and Sudanese as well as Somali and Chinese respondents.

We have a deep nostalgia to our roots but children are our problem, they were born and raised here, they love this country so it is difficult to make them carry the same feeling towards Iraq.

These difficulties are also experienced differently, depending on variables such as the age of the child, the frequency of visits to the country of parental origin, and the closeness or otherwise of relatives there. Some of the very young Iraqi girls followed their parents in ascribing to themselves a mixed identity, for example the 7-year-old who said, 'I was born in Cardiff but I'm from Iraq'. Yet a 24-year-old woman who arrived in the UK when she was aged 4 told researchers:

It is impossible! I don't feel even I can spend my vacation there. Even if I am married to an Iraqi and he wants to go back to Iraq, I will not go, last time I had been there before 16 years.

Sudanese parents, who have been a relatively short time in Cardiff, voice a particular concern about their own culture and the possibility of their British-born children fitting back in if they return. According to one woman, they raise their children to love and embrace the Sudanese culture, but returning would not be easy for the children:

They'll face many problems, for the society here is different, the whole system is different ... in Sudan like in other Arab states it's all about contacts. The doctors who returned to Sudan to work there were rejected and harassed by their colleagues until they decided to return here.

## Rethinking community cohesion

Given the decline of traditional community, these new kinds of connection seemed normal for most groups, except perhaps the white working class in Merthyr Tydfil. The Chinese were strongly transnational in their affiliations, at least among the more mobile middle-class members of the group. People in Llandaff had diasporic links. The Cathays area was characterised by the kinds of flows of people which are produced by corporate internationalisation agendas like those of Cardiff City Council and Cardiff University, for example. The Arab groups had often lost these links because of the traumatic contexts in which they had left their home countries in war or as asylum seekers.

Different kinds of belonging and of civic engagement and economic integration go along with these different kinds of connections. Some involve and enable much more adaptation to the new place and much more 'getting along well' together than others. But if 'getting along well' (cohesion) is taken to mean 'lack of overt tensions' between groups or communities, as it is when the word is linked to 'security' and policing, and integration means adaptation in the new place, then these all seem to be forms of cohesion and integration.

What is questionable is whether this is an adequate definition of cohesion or indeed of integration. It seems to us that integration, in its old policy senses of economic integration, or the Welsh sense of 'inclusion' as involving full economic participation in civil society, must come first. Only then will 'cohesion' (getting along) that is based on fair and equal rights and responsibilities actually follow. And 'mutual

adaptation' or 'getting along' does not necessarily involve either of these forms of economic integration/inclusion. That is, people need the 'security' of good language skills, education, employment and good health and housing if the 'security' of safe communities and cohesion in the sense of communities getting along well is actually to happen.

Thus, for example, Cardiff administrators generally regarded the Chinese as a well-integrated 'community', despite the many differences and tensions within the group, and did not consider them to be a risk to community cohesion. This was largely based on the fact that they caused few problems, often did not claim welfare, and seemed to be self-contained. That is, they created no overt tensions. Yet our research shows a number of groups of very vulnerable people among this ethnic group (e.g., the undocumented Fujianese and the elderly), without community support of the kind presupposed in policies over many years, without English-language capacity to access services to which they are entitled, and some subjected to criminal exploitation. They also suffer from discrimination and racism. What we have here is a real conflict between perceptions and common-sense understandings of policy terms and the realities of everyday lives in the city. In relation to sections of the Chinese group then we would argue that there is neither integration nor cohesion. Lack of overt tensions or problems is not a good enough definition of either.

### **Parallel lives: when isolation is a problem**

Within communities we found groups or individuals who were isolated and potentially vulnerable, often for quite different reasons. Two particular groups are highlighted here: the elderly and women. These are the kinds of groups who require support in achieving either economic or social integration or both, and so seem to us to pose a challenge to community cohesion at a number of levels.

### **Neighbourhoods, the elderly, belonging and difference**

The isolation of elderly groups, caused by different factors, was common across ethnic groups including white long-term residents. A Llandaff resident confirmed, as did the focus group, that 'communities' of neighbours were a thing of the past:

I think it is inevitable that people do see less and less of their neighbours.  
I mean I know my neighbours but I wouldn't say they are close friends.

But on the other hand there are three or four around me that I could go to if I needed help. But on the other hand, if I was here on my own, as I am quite a lot because my husband travels a lot, if something happens to me during the night, I doubt very much if any neighbour would notice if I wasn't around in the morning or in the afternoon. So you are not in a sort of, for want of a better word, a nosy neighbour situation, a caring neighbourhood. But everybody is very polite, kind. But it's not a strong close community in that sense at all.

The isolation of elderly people in Llandaff, mostly widows living alone in large houses, was mentioned several times, both out of concern for them and as an obstacle to younger people getting on the housing ladder. In this case it is generational change, the passing of a generation, the decline of neighbourhood and community and the fragmentation of family (sometimes a transnational affair) that leave the frail elderly isolated.

However, other elderly residents tend to form a different kind of community within Llandaff, moving at a slower pace and still having time to stop and talk or to talk over back fences. Participants in the focus group spoke of occasionally chatting over fences with their 'elderly Italian neighbours' whom they had known for more than 30 years, or of crossing the road to have a chat, of looking after one another's houses when they took holidays, of attending funerals when residents in the street died as two had done in 2005, and of checking on elderly neighbours to see if they needed anything. And yet they all argued that they really had no close social contact with their neighbours.

In other contexts, it is histories of migration and the work patterns which have precluded learning English which keep the elderly within their communities and dependent on them for support. Elderly Somali seamen and women are one case in point and the Chinese participants spoke of the difficulties of their elderly people, who having worked all their lives in Chinese kitchens had not had the opportunity to learn English. They are consequently unable to access their welfare entitlements and mainstream voluntary services. The elderly Cantonese speakers from Hong Kong tend to rely on friends and family for help, so providing language support is an important function of the Cardiff Chinese Elderly Association. It, for example, prioritises helping the elderly with reading letters and filling out benefit application forms. The language barrier, and perhaps a cultural one too, also precludes the Somali, West Indian and Asian elderly in STAR from accessing charities such as Age Concern, as a staff worker testified:

I mean it is worrying because we know that the ethnic [*elderly*] population has increased but they don't seem to come to us. I mean there was a fear, which I don't any longer think it is true – but they feel they can solve their own problems rather have people solve their problems. A bit worrying really.

In these cases it is almost certainly the case that extended families and communities are providing the support that in fact the frail elderly in middle-class Llandaff often lack.

### Women

The isolation of women may be even more acute in some communities. Taff Housing told us about their initiatives to deal with this in Butetown, and Women Connect First offer another example. Here we will take the Yemeni as a case in point involving a range of age groups among women. Language is the main barrier between the Yemenis and the world outside Butetown. However, ESOL (English for Speakers of Other Languages) classes, according to the participants, are not sufficient for them to be able to communicate properly with others in English. This is a common complaint among minority ethnic groups. The Yemeni Centre hosts lessons for women in English language and work-related training such as IT. These opportunities are considered important and useful by those who have accessed them. However, the availability of lessons was reduced because the centre finds it difficult to secure funding:

... they bring a teacher to teach us English language and computer  
... They stopped paying her so now she comes less ... The difference between the Yemeni community centre and other community centres is that they do not give us certificates because they cut the teacher's salary, also there is no place to keep the babies. We [*would*] love to receive certificates for the learning we are doing which might help us in the future.

Another woman (aged 25) had been in Cardiff for more than two years and had never set foot in the city centre (which is ten minutes' walking distance). When asked who buys the groceries for the house, she said her father-in-law does and when asked who bought any personal things she might need, she said her husband buys them for her. She, like other Yemeni women in Butetown, fears the unknown, but with no language skills she also fears being alienated and lost. Most of the Yemeni women we met inside and outside Butetown were also married at a very young age (some at the age of 14). However, more recent Yemeni arrivals living outside Butetown were

very different and we met many articulate and ambitious young and older working women among all the groups we worked with. Women in the Somali community were particularly active and radical, especially around men and the effects on the community of the smoking of Ghat, around education and around policing and health.

## Youth as a challenge to cohesion

Other disadvantaged youth groups such as the white working-class (predominantly male) groups we heard about in STAR and Merthyr, as well as British-born mixed-race youths whose ancestors lived in Butetown and who live on council estates, seem also often to live lives which are anything but 'integrated' or 'cohesive' in the policy senses of these terms. A Somali youth worker said of the mixed-race youths with whom he worked in Fairwater:

They are young people of mixed race, mixed from Somali, West Indian background, Irish background but, again it's easy to define when someone has a colour and you ask where your father comes from and they say he is from Somalia or Pakistan or from here. A lot of them are third or fourth mixed generation. Unless you ask them, you think they are Welsh through and through.

A lot of their parents don't work, they are on social or do part-time work here and there. It is typical of a council estate ... it affects a lot of the young people – the perception of the council estate, where you got the cycle that their parents went through it and their grandparents went through it and now they going through it. The job market they, cannot get into the labour market. A lot of them are single parent children.

A lot of young people from this area no, they don't tend to mix with anybody. They got issues with Ely, problems with other youths from other parts of Cardiff. They're happy where they are and that's it. They don't want to mix with others.

Asian schoolchildren are the least likely to use the Cathays Community Centre, even though the nearby school, whose white pupils use the centre, also has many Asian and black students. The management of the centre say they would like to reach out to these pupils but 'we are perceived quite rightly as fairly kind of white'.

Some Somali youths like to work with youth workers who are also Somali, believing that an ethnic role model is important to developing their own self-confidence. Other young Somalis, however, have given up on the majority-white system and feel disaffected and negative about their job prospects, especially those who were born here and know that they have a right to equal treatment under the law, but perceive that they do not receive it because of racism. These young men are the most difficult to access, but a number of community members, and others working with the community, expressed anxieties about their disaffection in the increasingly difficult context after the terrorist attacks of 9/11 in the USA and 7/7 in London, and talked of the need to work to change their situation:

... and they [*young men*] would feel frustrated and they would use the words, say: 'what's the point?' And that's very worrying when it's reached that stage. You've got nothing to lose. 'What's the point?'

But at the Somali mosque in Butetown, the imam told us that they were working with the young men in the community: 'we have to encourage them, tell them to work and not to give up – to be tolerant'. A contact at the Somali Youth Association spoke of the work they were doing:

Because of the lack of the youth movement and employment, a lot of drug issues. We started the programme to get people off the streets, and we are helping them achieve their goals, so we're not there yet, but we're trying through training courses and empowerment courses.

Young Somali men are also angry about media stereotypes of youth as 'hoodies', which they see as helping to make them the targets of police attention. Young Somalis in focus groups at youth clubs told us:

People stereotype black people as being, especially Somali people, as being aggressive, lazy, criminals, taking drugs, unemployed. They just don't give us a chance, opportunities.

They feel that policies such as Anti-Social Behaviour Orders (ASBOs) are unreasonably targeted against them – 'the police officers harass us' – and they believe that the police favour whites in almost all situations. But for them there is no point in complaining. This focus group with six young Somali men who came to Cardiff between 1988 and 1994 agreed:

I have met one police officer who was not a racist and that one was not a British person. What does that tell you about the police? ... Sometimes there were some fights in town, and even though it was a fair fight, they'd lock you up and not the white people. They interviewed us straight away and the white people two weeks later. You can't complain. You complain to the ones you have a problem with. I was arrested and charged.

I also had the same problems with the police. I was involved in a fight and they arrested us and not the white people and they took us up the crown court. You complain to the police officer or his/her friend but they will not help you.

One university-educated Somali man told us of similar issues around white youths who had robbed his shop:

There's a drug problem – we never had it before – it's very recent – there are dealers working in the community. And using young guys who are unemployed ... I think racism as well is playing a part. No one cares. For example, two days ago at about 2pm, two white guys came into the shop and took some money from the till. There was a chase – they caught them – but the police said they couldn't charge them – there was no evidence – because they went to buy drugs. Imagine that the guy in the shop is white and the two guys are black – I told them – you've got a camera there – you can see them! They said the camera was facing the other way.

This was the same man who told us that the authorities believed that Somalis were 'more prone to terrorism' than other groups.

While all of these Somali participants believed that racism was the prime factor in their sense of being stereotyped and watched, as well as having no access to any real justice themselves, a 14-year-old Somali schoolgirl from Tremorfa, a predominantly white council estate, asked about the police in that area, told us they were around all the time dealing with white youth crime.

The connection between drugs and crime was also clear on council estates in Merthyr. Here people living on estates were also worried about the widespread use of drugs and the ease with which they can be obtained. They attributed the ruination of their estates largely to the drug culture and drug-related crime. They were also worried about the minority of 'youngsters' who in this case were 'out of control'. They supported a return to corporal punishment in schools and bemoaned the loss of respect for their elders among children and young people:

Well, my mother is 84 years old and goes to town every day on the bus. The other day she was waiting for the bus by the shops and kids – 9 and 10 years old – pelted her with stones! Nobody around lifted a finger to do anything! Somebody nearly got killed last week – an out of control car skidded into the bus stop and there were kids waiting for the school bus – they jumped out and run off.

It was the elderly people who talked most about the decline in manners and lack of respect for authority and seemed happy to remain within the confines of their sheltered accommodation where things ran smoothly and people were polite:

When one of mine did something and a parent came to tell me, I did something about it. You try knocking someone's door these days. You get a mouthful of cheek, nothing but abuse. It's gone terrible, we could never have imagined it would turn out like this. I suppose the police try their best, but their hands are tied. What can they do when the parents let them [*their children*] run wild?

## Community cohesion and separation in middle-class Wales

We found many different kinds of 'community' and forms of 'isolation' or 'separateness' which a community cohesion agenda would need to address. We have included Llandaff as a case study because it specifically relocates these issues in a middle-class area of Cardiff not normally associated with issues of migration or community cohesion.

### **Case study: Llandaff**

Llandaff is characterised by constant flows of new immigration which is invisible because it is middle class. Although The Llandaff Society recounts much inward movement and mobility in Llandaff at the end of the nineteenth century, there is no mention of the word 'immigration' or of the fact that many of those who built Llandaff as it is today came from England, or of the middle-class Welsh-speaking nature of part of the community.

There appear to be territorial issues and a sense of geographical identity to be associated with living in Llandaff. For example, certain areas were seen as dangerous to go into – predominately neighbouring council estates, with 'gangs of youths' – and there was a certain insistence that neither Danescourt, a very recent housing estate (built in the 1960s), nor Llandaff North, an older industrial part of the original Llandaff parish (Llandaff Society, 1996, p. 55), is part of Llandaff now. The other side of this geographical identity is its exclusivity. We were told in several areas of Cardiff that the Somalis were not integrated because 'they keep to themselves'. In the same way, the Pakistani residents in Cathays were said to be not integrated because they 'do not mix'. It could be said that the residents of Llandaff show a similar tendency not to mix, to keep to themselves, at least as far as their domestic arrangements are concerned, and for the same reasons as minority ethnic groups who try to avoid the excesses of the council estate and certain working-class behaviours and practices.

The very structure of the road and railway systems which bound and divide the area works against the formation of older kinds of community, while social changes like the car, the supermarket and the employment of women do the rest:

I think if you've got a household where perhaps two of you work, and you go elsewhere to work as most people do, to town or wherever they go – then you have less time to spend in your local community, don't you? In terms of being involved in community groups – I used to take my little ones to a toddlers' group when they were small. But we don't, we go to the cathedral and they're involved in Sunday school there. And – well, I live on a main road, so it's less easy then to know your neighbours, and you tend to get in your car and drive down the drive and off you go.

*(Continued)*

Interestingly, the traffic that stops the formation of close community seemed also to be producing communities of action and interest. Respondents from a local school told us of working with the local council and the Assembly Government on traffic planning:

Sustrans [*sustainable transport*] – safer routes to schools, so we've got very much, with other schools in the area, and the local community ... we've been able to work together and the Welsh Assembly Government have funded an enormous amount of money, we're waiting to see if we've got a third lot of money now – for safer routes to school. Which means we've got sort of joined up cycle routes, which are safer then to use. We've had pedestrian crossings put in on certain key roads so that's a really good example of us working with the local community in quite a different way ... And it benefits local people.

Talking about the absence of close community in his street, one man argues that they have nothing to say to one another except when there is an issue about planning permission. In similar vein focus group participants recalled that some years back when it was proposed that a home for young offenders be located in the street, there were petitions and protests, but residents finally agreed to its location provided that parking was controlled and off street. It seems clear that in the Llandaff area people have the social capital to mobilise around issues that concern them and that they share a common interest in preserving the nature (and property values) of their ward and local area.

### Summary points

- The reality of people's lives usually lags a long way behind the realities of policy, and the language of policy, circulated in the media and in everyday talk, acquires common-sense meanings which are very hard to shift.
- Unless people are involved in making policy, in charge of implementing it, or need to use policy languages to apply for funding, both settled groups and new arrivals still tend to understand integration to mean assimilation, and cohesion to mean lack of tensions between groups of people.
- The meanings and realities of community and family have changed in most areas covered by this research. This has effects on the way people integrate and on the kinds of cohesion that exist.

- Generational tensions of different kinds exist across all the groups and geographical areas we studied. This can be the result of new forms of family and community leading to the isolation of the elderly, or of different access to and levels of integration: e.g., grandchildren who no longer speak the language of grandparents; women and the elderly who do not have the language to access essential services and support. It can also take the form of fear of, or concern about, the behaviours of young people.
- The appearance of integration and cohesion in what seem to be successful communities can hide groups who are isolated, exploited or vulnerable.

### **3 Social class, immigration and inclusion**

In a number of complex ways, social class has kept emerging as a key factor in our findings about migration and community cohesion. We selected the ‘communities’ which form the focus of this research in part on social class and geographical grounds so this is not entirely surprising. However, we were also aware from the outset that the tendency to identify ‘communities’ on the basis of a conflation of ethnicity and country of origin (Vertovec, 2006, p. 1) was problematic with most of these groups and that many more variables than ethnicity and class were involved (e.g., among the very diverse Somali, Chinese and Arabic groups). What we found was that gender, religion (e.g., Islam, Christianity), language (e.g., Arabic and Chinese but also varieties of English and Welsh) and education as well as poverty or wealth both stratified single groups and unified apparently different ones. Significant class differences also existed within and across groupings in ways which are simply not addressed by current policy.

In this section of this report then we want to focus on the way social class and class differences intersect with the characteristics of new migrants and the existing characteristics of ‘host’ populations to enact different forms of integration and different versions of cohesion.

#### **Poverty, migration and social class**

Kyambi (2005) argues that migration policy in the UK has consistently involved forms of elite racism and classism which privilege English speaking, whiteness, education and economic capital. This is perhaps even more obvious now in 2008 with the introduction of the points system for new migration at UK level. In our research we found clear differences in the way ‘host’ populations receive different kinds of new migrants in the South Wales context. Thus white, middle-class (often English) migrants who come to Cardiff move into ‘ghettos’ (middle-class suburbs) where people like themselves tend to live (e.g., Llandaff/Pontcanna, Cathays or STAR), as do educated international groups and students (in Cathays/Roath). These groups are never even discussed as ‘migrants’ in our data (except occasionally among Welsh speakers and Welsh nationalists). ‘Social cohesion’ is taken for granted and the ‘host’ community is assumed to be happy. When we use the term ‘migrant’ below, then, it refers to those other ‘migrants’ who seem, in public perceptions, to be a ‘problem’:

especially asylum seekers, various forms of refugee and migrant workers and those who are black or visibly different, or who sound different. Despite the reputation Wales has for 'tolerance' and the tendency among some Welsh-speaking Welsh to regard themselves as a 'minority' and therefore more sympathetic to other minorities, our research tends to show that this tolerance is also class-based. It is related to education and experience of other cultures.

Thus in our work on council estates around Portuguese migrant workers in the meat industry in Merthyr Tydfil we found little understanding of, or sympathy for, difference, unless, or until, actual encounters with difference change people's minds. The most prevalent feeling in Merthyr towards the migrant workers was that they were 'taking over' many social spaces as well as 'taking our jobs'.

I go to [*the pub*] and it used to be great, but it seems now that the Portuguese are taking it over – and they stick together, they don't talk to you – the DJ even puts their music on now.

They're taking over – music and all!

I hate going to Tesco's now! It's full of 'em – they're everywhere!

My brother hates it up there now [*meat factory*] and he's been there over five years. It's full of Portuguese now and they've even put one in charge of him. He just can't work with 'em.

There was also a strong feeling that 'they don't want to fit in with us', but when we asked what personal experience people had of meeting and talking to migrants, very few had had any at all. Most information was based solely on hearsay. Only one participant had got to know a Portuguese migrant, and he spoke well of him. Only eight people in total had ever even spoken with the Portuguese and six of those were from a group of homeless men we spoke to. The hostel for the homeless is situated next to the houses of multiple occupation, flats and bed-sits occupied by many of the single Portuguese. They also mix with them in the town centre in pubs and clubs. Interestingly, when local people were told, at the end of focus groups, what (largely positive) things the Portuguese had said about them, many started to be more positive about the Portuguese:

Well, if there were more families it would be better, we wouldn't mind then.

They have to live somewhere, I suppose, and I hear it's bad over there.

They're working in terrible conditions, mind. They got a lot to put up with. And the houses they give them are filthy. It must be against the law – surely they can't get away with it.

### **New migrants, work and social class**

Across all the groups we worked with, there was a readiness to accept newcomers who studied or who worked and earned a living. In some cases (e.g., STAR) community tensions were easily resolved once people understood that the group they had taken exception to were not asylum seekers who were 'scrounging' or 'taking scarce resources' but migrant workers who, like them, were earning a living. In Merthyr the assumption that anyone new must be illegal and an asylum seeker seemed harder to shift, so the recognition that people were working did not change attitudes. Some knew the Portuguese were migrants working at the meat factory and one or two of the community workers had a pretty accurate understanding of why they were in Merthyr Tydfil and what conditions they worked in. People who knew nothing about them assumed they were asylum seekers or 'illegals' and used the terms interchangeably. Most people mentioned illegality at some point when talking about them. They assumed they had arrived illegally, were working illegally, or were claiming benefits fraudulently.

Even access to housing via the controversial points system caused less aggravation in local communities if the newcomers were working, and this was so even when our respondents were actually on welfare and unwilling to do the work the newcomers were doing. In Butetown, the difference between the old multicultural harmony which people remember with nostalgia and the current situation where many of our interviewees resented certain kinds of incomers (particularly single Somali mothers) is seen to be centred around the fact that the newcomers now do not work and therefore take resources others are entitled to: 'In the old days everyone who came here worked and paid their way'. This also seems to be a factor in the unproblematic acceptance of newcomers in middle-class Llandaff where everyone works and pays their taxes and in Cathays/Roath where transient student populations are understood to be in some sense middle class, 'in transit' and therefore not a threat, although they may be temporarily poor and a nuisance (noisy, drunk, or untidy/messy). It seems significant too that groups who employ their own incomers, like the Chinese, in ethnic specific trades like catering, are simply invisible to the rest of the population. One professionally qualified refugee, perhaps more perceptive about the receiving context in the UK than some government policy, told us that 'work is people's hobby in the UK. If you can't participate you can never be integrated'. This is particularly important

in relation to certain kinds of UK government policy around asylum seeking which refuses asylum seekers the right to work.

## Social mobility and social class

Recent research has deconstructed the myth of social mobility which would have us believe that we are all now, or can aspire to be, middle class (Mathieu, 2007; Root, 2007). Emerging from a minority ethnic context into the middle class in Cardiff seems to be at least as difficult as emerging from a working-class estate into the middle class (Williamson, 2004), and this does seem to be associated not just with race or ethnicity, but with poverty, city space and its connections with class in ways that are not well understood or researched. Once people are located in a 'deprived' area of the city, they are identified by postcode, they have access only to certain kinds of school, they learn to speak (very quickly in the case of asylum-seeking children) with Cardiff working-class accents, and they take on the habitus, an embodied way of being and doing and thinking, which is perceived by others to be 'working class'. They then appear to others to be working class even once their own heads are somewhere else. It is at that point just as hard for them to move out of or beyond that space as it is and always has been for the white working class in Britain to move out of council estates.

There is a great deal of evidence in our data that teachers discriminate against minority ethnic children on both race and class grounds, seeing them as only capable of working-class ambitions, and recommending against high aspirations. An educated young Somali woman told us:

And people just assume, you know, the parents are not interested in education, the children don't want to learn, and there's a lot of attitudes like that, which come from the schools, you know.

Some told us how teachers had discouraged minority ethnic children when they had wanted to study difficult subjects such as medicine and talked about teachers refusing to allow able students to try to achieve their ambitions, or not pushing them to try. Another told us:

... and it really offends me when I go to – when I am sitting with my sister there and I'm listening to this teacher saying: 'It's better for you [*not to do science*]'.

A number of Somali parents have expressed their anger about this. Even when people have university degrees, that move from the working class to the middle class is difficult. Second- and third-generation migrants with tertiary qualifications, particularly from the Somali community in our sample, are still underemployed and our evidence is that this impacts negatively on the next generation who can then see no point in struggling to go to university 'if they all end up driving taxis'. We suspect that what is often called racism by those with degrees who have failed to get jobs is actually closely linked to class-based as well as cultural differences in expectations. We were told that employers still need education about cultural difference and that the community and community leaders sometimes act as a barrier between community members and employment. Leaders argue, when jobs are offered, that members are being pushed into low-paid occupations. The interviewees cite examples where specific plans for 'positive discrimination' are mooted and blue-chip companies have been willing to be involved, but 'some of the community representatives will pooh-pooh the idea, and stop it getting off the ground'. There is a lack of mutual understanding about what constitutes 'employability' and this seems to be as true of white working-class communities like Merthyr as it is of minority ethnic groups in Butetown.

There are, on the other hand, more recent initiatives by, for example, the Somali Integration Society and Women Connect First, to name just two, which involve middle-class community workers negotiating mentoring and work experience schemes with major employers to bridge these cultural, class and experience gaps and to provide the 'cultural' and 'social' capital which would make middle-class employers recognise people as 'employment ready' and able to aspire to middle-class jobs.

It is instructive that educated Chinese, who live in middle-class suburbs and go to good schools, do not have this difficulty. Uneducated Chinese from peasant backgrounds, working in the Chinese catering industry, find it almost impossible to move in any direction. Very recently established smaller groups, like the Sudanese or the Iraqis in Cardiff, if they are well educated and speak fluent English, are not seen as poor or working class, and do not see themselves that way, even when circumstances would define them as being both. Class background as well as self-confidence and social capital seem in these cases to count more than poverty or race/ethnicity.

On the other hand, working-class communities on housing estates in Merthyr Tydfil have similar attitudes and difficulties (including attitudes to what is 'outside' the community) to some Somalis or the Yemenis in Cardiff. The only close-knit communities of the traditional, geographically bounded kind, in this sample, are on

white working-class housing estates in Merthyr Tydfil. They are also among the most segregated of the groups we have worked with in that they have lived there all their lives, cannot imagine moving, and regard Cardiff as almost a 'foreign' place. They feel politically powerless and, in terms of other indicators of integration, are unemployed, lack qualifications and seem to resent incomers. Young people in particular expressed aggressively racist attitudes.

The group of young people aged 11–15 articulated the most extreme views about Portuguese migrant workers. When asked what they disliked about Merthyr, they shouted out 'Portuguese'. When asked why they did not like them, they said they smell. It may have been that they were articulating the attitudes of the wider population in Merthyr without the self-censorship that adults apply. Or it may have been that group acceptance is more important to them than to adults. Others offered the following comments:

I hate 'em, I do. They're always hanging around with knives and that ... give me the creeps.

*Interviewer:* Are there any at your school?

*Respondent:* No! Thank God!

*Interviewer:* What is it that bothers you so much about them?

*Respondent:* They're taking over our town! There's more and more of 'em all the time. Soon there'll be more of them than us.

*Interviewer:* What's wrong with that?

*Respondent:* They'll be telling us what to do and they'll have all the jobs ... we'll be their slaves!

There was a low level of satisfaction in Merthyr with all services in all groups. People who lived on estates were most vociferous in their complaints about the council, social services and the police:

The housing use it [*the estate*] as a dumping ground for rubbish [*problem families*] and the social services are up here then doing all sorts for them. A new family moved in the other day – single parent, five kids – nobody knows her, from away somewhere – and within hours social services were there and the housing, putting a new fence up, clearing the gardens ... you name it, she had it!

These kinds of accounts represent the other side of the stories we heard in Cardiff from minority ethnic families who were offered housing on estates like these and understood what it was like to be regarded as ‘the rubbish’. It seems very clear in our evidence that it takes self-confidence in one’s own economic security and a good deal of social capital to ensure tolerance.

### **Class difference in working-class environments**

Living in deprived, working-class environments in Cardiff has other consequences for both integration and social cohesion. In most of these areas the new migrants we spoke to perceive there to be some combination of youth crime, drugs and alcohol abuse, teenagers having too much social and sexual freedom, teenage pregnancies, and a general lack of respect for parents and the elderly (see also the section ‘Parental fears about racism and British culture’ in Chapter 4). This goes with what is perceived to be an ignorance of other cultures and racism in schools in these very diverse areas (with some notable good-practice exceptions). It is not surprising then if new migrants, whether they be single Somali mothers seeking asylum and living in poverty, third-generation Muslim families from whatever background or very recently arrived groups from the Sudan, Iraq or the Yemen, or long-standing British Chinese or Somali residents, see the need to protect their children from these influences (as indeed do middle-class parents in Llandaff and working-class parents in Merthyr). This produces a rather different perspective on ‘parallel lives’ (in STAR and among Somali and Arab parents).

Alcoholism and alcohol abuse is a serious issue in Wales (Coles, 2006), and the anxiety that is found throughout this research about the Welsh pub culture and excessive drinking is more than a Muslim religious issue. It is about wanting to avoid the worst excesses and influences in the new environment and to preserve the best of the cultures from which people come and to which they remain attached. Only the Chinese among our respondents sometimes try to join in with the pub culture and socialise there, but only those who are themselves middle class in a middle-class area (Llandaff), and they are happier in the casino among other Chinese. Moreover, there is little evidence in our research of pubs in Cardiff welcoming any form of visible difference. This has the parallel consequence of leading, among minority groups, to a stereotyping of British culture as always pub- and alcohol-related, and sometimes involving gangs of racist and criminal youth. This is what people experience and see, or hear about, in the deprived areas in which they live, and more recently in the media. These perceptions help neither integration nor cohesion or inclusion. And they are related to class difference and expectations as much as

to religious and cultural difference among the populations we worked with. Educated professionals and committed Muslims, as well as working-class families on housing estates, all like to protect their children or grandchildren from the perceived excesses of aspects of Welsh working-class culture.

## **Education and inclusion**

The Sudanese are the main group who share with Somalis the double discrimination of Islamophobia and racism. The group is very different from the Somali community, however, and experiences Cardiff in very different ways. The majority are very recent arrivals, having fled Sudan after 1989 as asylum seekers and refugees. Yet the Sudanese are unusual in reporting very few problems with discrimination. They are also an unusual group in their level of education: '99%' are educated, one community leader claims, and often to tertiary level, in universities teaching in the English language. Most came from a middle-class background. All the Sudanese who took part in this study spoke excellent English, easily understandable for a native English speaker, and this has clearly had a great impact on their ability to interact with the British and their consequent feeling of comfort in Wales. In fact, some insist that there is no racism in Wales:

In Cardiff their treatment is very smooth, no problems at all and generally Welsh people are not racists or arrogant. Maybe it exists in other areas of the UK but not in Wales.

The negative preconception to the refugee or the foreigner mentioned by some of the guys is slight. Generally in Cardiff they are highly classy. I live now in an area called Fairwater, before that I lived in another area and I did not feel like a stranger in the area when dealing with its people.

Yet other Sudanese have had a different experience, particularly after 7/7. Both male and female focus groups speak of racist incidents they were subject to, but talk of them as individual occurrences rather than as a problem with British or Welsh society. One man who lives in Grangetown speaks of his 'racist neighbour' who used to call the police and complain against him regularly for 'silly' reasons (also assuming that he was Somali):

From the first day harassments started from my neighbour who came out of his house and gave a look of despise. To cool things down I started by saying hello but he didn't reply, unlike my other neighbour who was

very helpful and friendly. On my second visit to the house with my keys I saw him again and he said: 'What are you doing here?' I replied: 'I'm in my home.' He said: 'No, in the UK.' So I said: 'Whatever I am doing, I am your neighbour.' He said: 'Go back to Somalia.' And I replied: 'I'm not from Somalia, and if you calmed down you'll find a very good neighbour.' He shouted: 'No, I don't want to calm down I want you to go back to Somalia.' And his harassments continued everyday, for example if I parked my car 10cm close to his parking space, he phones the police and he did it four times. The police recorded the incidents and the Council was informed.

Unlike groups with low levels of education and poor English language skills, such as the Yemenis, the Sudanese have been able to secure funding for a weekend school to teach Arabic and Islamic studies, and seem content with the level of service they generally receive from statutory authorities. Where they receive poor service (for example, waiting a long time for an operation), they believe this is the case for all, not that they are being discriminated against, as, for example, the Congolese in STAR believed. However, despite their ability to interact by speaking English, Cardiff is still a different culture for them:

Yes, it's very hard even with the language ... But the difficulty to integrate into the system remains. You wouldn't know where to start and how to enter this different society.

### **Social exclusion, poverty and class**

Although a traditionally white working-class area, Merthyr Tydfil illustrates many of the exclusions based upon social class experienced by new migrants.

### Case study: Merthyr Tydfil

Most people interviewed had been 'born and bred' in Merthyr Tydfil and lived there all their lives. A few had lived elsewhere (rarely outside Wales), having moved for work, but had returned within five years, mostly less. A small number of the participants were English or Irish and had moved to Merthyr through marriage.

In general, there seemed to be a strong dissatisfaction with the levels and manner of service provision.

Most people talked about safety. The people living on estates were worried about the widespread use of drugs and the ease with which they can be obtained. They attributed the ruination of their estates largely to the drug culture and drug-related crime. They were also worried about the minority of 'youngsters' causing mindless vandalism. They supported a return to corporal punishment in schools and bemoaned the loss of respect for their elders among children and young people. The elderly people talked most about the decline in manners and lack of respect for authority and seemed happy to remain within the confines of their sheltered accommodation where things ran smoothly and people were polite:

I don't go out unless I have to. I'm afraid, I am. I never go out alone, day or night. I've got everything I need here, and my family come to see me – I'm alright ... It's lovely in here, it is. Everybody's very nice, polite, anyway. Everything is as it should be.

The hostel dwellers were a very interesting group made up of ten young men with a background of drugs, crime and prison. They talked about the difficulties of trying to turn over a new leaf when living in such close proximity to their former dealers and adversaries, and the police constantly stopping them:

You can't go down town without hassle ... they [*the dealers*] come on to you all the time, trying to break you, like ... bastards, they are.

It's terrible; it is, stop you for absolutely nothing. We were only standing next to a car the other day, talking – I hadn't even noticed the car – and they [*the police*] stopped. 'Get away from there,' he said, 'and I don't want to see you up the top of town, don't forget it.' I live at the top of town! And that's how it is, all the time.

(Continued)

In this, their reports are very similar to the stories we heard from young black men in Cardiff. We have to assume in all this that the 'parents' who are blamed for the unruly youngsters are not the interviewees but belong to the generation who have children of the right age to be causing the kinds of problems described. It is worth noting that the throwing of stones at an elderly woman is paralleled in incidents reported in STAR where the stones were thrown at Czech and Somali new migrants. The vandalism and car crime are reported all over Cardiff's housing estates, mostly attributed to white youth but sometimes to other ethnic groups. Somali and Czech parents also blamed the children and young people's parents. The only difference is that these white working-class people in Merthyr want the police to be able to deal with it.

Almost everyone identified Merthyr Tydfil as being on the up and cited numerous developments and improvements in the town recently. There was a sense that these new initiatives would bring people into Merthyr Tydfil who would revitalise the town but also a feeling that someone else would benefit from them other than the people we were speaking to. There was a sense that they themselves would be excluded because of being too old or too poor to participate. There are parallels between these comments and the sense you get in Butetown of being surrounded by new developments you cannot share.

Oh, it's marvellous, like [*the new retail development*] ... but you have to have money, don't you? We won't be going there! The old giro won't go far up there!

We asked local people about Cardiff – how often they visit, whether they like it etc. – to find out the extent to which they ever leave Merthyr and the extent to which they define their identity in opposition to Cardiff. Almost all participants expressed extreme dislike of going to Cardiff because of their negative opinions of Cardiff people. The only group who said they liked Cardiff and would happily live there was the hostel group. They all mentioned the higher level of facilities for the homeless in Cardiff. Most participants could count on one hand how many times they had visited Cardiff. A couple of the younger, homeless lads had never been. The other lads had been no more than twice. A woman from the Gurnos estate, aged 34, had never been. One of the older women living in sheltered accommodation had driven a taxi in Cardiff for years and loved it:

I work down there quite a bit and it's only half an hour away but it's totally different. The people are different. Their whole attitude to life ... They're very materialistic.

(Continued)

Cardiff is too big and too fast and the people are unfriendly. They're not like us. I hate it down there.

They're English Welsh aren't they? I was in hospital down there for six months with Cardiff people and nursing staff – they were cold, really cold. I used to cry my eyes out.

## Summary points

- Social class is a key and under-acknowledged factor in the way new migrants deal with migration and in the way settled communities and new migrants interact.
- While middle-class (particularly but not only white) migration is largely invisible, migration (particularly involving visible or language difference) into deprived working-class communities is not.
- There is considerable evidence that the ability of new migrants to work is viewed favourably by settled populations and assists the integration process; but the experience of the workplace is neither always positive nor cohesive.
- Social mobility is restricted by the deprived conditions and the poverty in which new migrants find themselves, as it is for settled working-class communities in similarly deprived areas.
- Both new migrants and settled working-class communities present evidence of discrimination and prejudice in their accounts of service delivery, including education, employment, policing, healthcare and housing.
- New migrants may struggle to integrate into working-class environments that they perceive as a threat to their cultural values and lifestyles, while middle-class areas also come together to exclude deprivation from their own spaces.
- Class difference is as important an issue within as across communities, especially in large complex groups like the Somalis and the Chinese. What is clear is that class background (including a good education and fluent English) makes real differences to the way people respond to the migrant experience, to poverty and even to racism, as well as to the ways in which settled communities accept new migrants. The small Sudanese community experience is a case in point.

## 4 Barriers to inclusion and community cohesion

We have already explored the role poverty and social class can play in enabling or preventing the inclusion of new migrants and settled working-class groups. However, there were other conditions that made it difficult for migrants to be included, or to feel that they had equal access to resources and opportunities; some of these factors were external, imposed by the circumstances in which migrants found themselves, and these were generally underpinned by racism and discrimination. Other barriers were more closely related to the fears and concerns of communities and groups themselves.

### Racism and discrimination

Across all the minority communities and groups encountered in this project, our research findings show that racism, institutional racism and discrimination are significant factors in producing social exclusion, and inhibiting both economic integration and community cohesion. Racist and class-based discrimination stops people from enjoying their full civil rights and participating fully in society, leads to poor delivery of services and keeps people from feeling that they belong. Our research suggests that this creates marginalised subcultures where people come to feel at best frustration at what is happening to them and at worst hopelessness, and where they express real fear of leaving their communities for white environments.

One mixed-gender Somali focus group, asked if they felt safe in Wales, first said yes and then reflected on the places they did not feel safe:

*Respondent 1 (male):* I have been to Swansea train station on a Friday night – that was not good. I don't feel safe going alone for example to a small town in North Wales.

*Respondent 2 (female):* Not in the Valleys. You get the stares.

*Respondent 3 (male):* In a mainly white area you may not feel safe.

*Respondent 1 (male):* Obviously there are times like July 7 – it was a shock – and no one felt comfortable.

*Respondent 2 (female):* Even going to the city centre, we'd go in pairs, being visible, your identity as a Muslim was so visible [post 7/7].

We asked people about their experiences in relation to key indicators of economic and social integration, such as English language, translation and interpretation, housing, education, employment, healthcare, policing and community safety. Racism and discrimination and/or inadequate access and provision were reported across all minority groups in all of these contexts. It is worth recalling (see Chapter 3 above) that settled communities living on housing estates in Merthyr had similar complaints. In their case, poverty, deprivation and social class, not race, were seen to be the causes.

Despite this, many people we spoke to were in fact remarkably reticent about calling things 'racist', especially after 7/7, always trying to make excuses and preferring to believe that what had happened to them was a 'one off' incident. The Yemenis, especially those living in Butetown, do not speak of discrimination or racism against themselves. However, incidents that they label as 'not important' happened after the 7/7 bombing in London, as one woman explains:

When the explosion happened in London I was ill in the hospital and patients with me in the room were watching TV. After they watched the news, they started looking at me as if I am the guilty one. I was afraid of such looks. So I asked the doctor if I can leave the hospital as soon as possible. What those patients and the British people did not know is that we were all upset and not only the British people.

Women wearing the headscarf said that they were looked at with suspicion when walking on the streets after 7/7, but again said that this had not affected the relationship they had with their neighbours. Some spoke about racist incidents their children encountered at school in the same period, but still they put it down to a few individual incidents, not institutional racism. However, it seems to us that the very fact that people took the opportunity across all minority groups we worked with to tell us about these incidents suggests the significance that such events have for people trying to adapt and settle in the new place.

There are also of course issues internal to groups which make communities closed and inward focused. In what follows we will discuss the way these issues play themselves out in the different communities we have explored.

## Racism in traditional settled Cardiff communities

Members of the traditional white working (retired) class in Cathays/Roath are more resentful of their mainly Asian long-term neighbours than of the white students and white Eastern European migrant workers who also live among them. In particular, they do not like spaces they see as their 'own' being 'taken over' by those of another race or religion. Thus the conversion of St Monica's Church in Wales School into Cardiff Muslim Primary School produced the following comment:

It is a shame for us that have been to the school to see it turned over like that ... It's hard to see your school taken over, it does, it upsets me almost.

This is echoed by a member of the younger generation, a former student who stayed in the area after graduation, in an entry-level to middle-class career job, talking about an Asian shop in the area:

... apparently it's like – an Asian only shop. I mean, I haven't heard, they haven't told me that – and I kind of make a point by going in every now and again, just to get served ... and you do get funny looks in there. You do feel like you're not wanted.

Asians (Pakistanis and Indians) have a high visibility in the area, but were not part of this study.

## Access to work and services

Black asylum seekers and refugees told us about discrimination in the job market and from service providers such as the NHS and the police. A Congolese male refugee described the hierarchy of 'employability' as he saw it from his many attempts to apply for jobs:

Who can do the job? A Welsh [*person*], if there is no Welsh, ok now – we follow the level, or the scale, first of all Welsh, if they can't find a Welsh, they say ok now, European Union, ok they can't find it, they say ok those white people, after white people they say those who look like white, if they can't find it, they go now for black people or ethnic minority who have citizenship, if they can't find, they ok who now, those who have married with Welsh or white, if they can't find them, ok now we can do a [*black*] refugee.

Others told us about discrimination in the health service:

They said because she is an asylum seeker, and it is an expensive operation, then they won't make it to her ... she said she's keeping losing weight and she has pains every day. (*Translator for Somali woman asylum seeker*)

And a Congolese male refugee in STAR told us about racism from the police in pubs:

It was in a pub, big pub, so it was drinking, a lot of black guys, a lot of white guys as well ... police said – 'all black people, out'. What is the reason, 'no reason, out'.

Yet there is also in Splott and Roath a young white professional and arts community which celebrates its diversity in their working lives. Good examples are the headteacher of a local Church in Wales school (around 60 per cent 'ethnic minority children') who said of asylum-seeking children that 'they bring a new flavour to the school'. According to this headteacher, all the children get on and the school is a socially cohesive one, and the enthusiasm of asylum-seeking and refugee children for learning improves the classroom character for all. The manager of a community-based radio station (on a short-term FM radio licence) confirmed this middle-class interest in diversity but also the difficulty of getting people involved. She was keen to set up a community radio station in the area, to recover histories and to 'represent the networks that exist', but found it difficult to engage people because they were all so overstretched with their own community support projects:

I met all the local groups ... I had support, in terms of people writing letters to say they will support it in terms of getting funding. But actually now we are here, they've all disappeared ... they are overstretched within their own organisations.

The local groups she found difficulty involving in her radio project were Muslim and minority groups. For example:

Yes. I contacted the Somali Women's group and I actually went to meet them. I went to meet them and they said: 'Oh yes, we got your letter. We would be really keen to do something.' And then I said: 'You need to like just phone me up and I'll come down and do something with you. And they never got back.'

And the people who actually did come in, apart from some of those diverse groups mentioned above, were people like herself, wanting to actually construct community:

And then other people that have come in and got involved have been, I think, probably people like myself who'd moved to the area to maybe to come to university.

So – I've had a lot of people coming in, who are obviously the people that are not traditionally from the area who's moved here, who really care about things like community and they come and say: 'Oh, I want to do something for the local community.'

These were on the whole young professionals or students:

These are people who are feeling that we need to make changes in society because we are kind of heading towards some kind of weird situation. Yes, there are people around who really care. But then, I think, that within one geographical area, you have got all these different things happening and they never meet, even though there is goodwill.

Lack of communication between very busy groups seems to be one of the factors that keeps people apart. But sometimes interactions are more fraught.

One more recent factor causing change and then community tensions, according to one churchman in STAR, is the housing of asylum seekers in the area. He acknowledges that 'one feels desperately for the new migrants' but feels, along with local tradespeople, that the council has been 'unfair' in the number of hostels it has set up in the area:

... we've [*i.e.*, STAR has] got loads of hostels, and that's why they should put them up in Lisvane or Cyncoed [*wealthier middle-class suburbs*], but no they plonk them all in one, and they make a ghetto there, I mean it's unfair to the local community because if you flood anywhere ... and it's not, you know, I'm not against – I think we should have hostels here.

And he mentions similar difficulties with migrant workers:

... and then we had a lot of problems just up the road with the immigrant workers, who, some of them were causing chaos. And we did have a meeting with the police and the local people, which I think has solved everything.

... that was just up the end of this street, they took over a house there, I think they had 30 of them living there, something quite ridiculous.

... they were [*immigrant workers from*] Slovakia mainly. I mean nice people, if they're willing to work ... they're not scroungers or something like that, and they'd do the sort of job that our people wouldn't dream of, they're willing to work in the hotel – I went to the St David's Hotel, and all the waiters in there were from overseas, because our people don't want to do those sorts of jobs and they're willing to do them, they work hard ... but the noise and chaos they caused [*in the house where they lived*] was horrendous. It was unpopular with the person next door who wanted to sell, he couldn't sell it obviously.

Here he points to the genuine issues to do with some of the often criticised aspects of the media discourse of *swamping* and *flooding* in relation to migration and asylum, to the damage unplanned immigrations can do to local economies and livelihoods, and to the tendency to locate the burdens of immigration in already deprived areas:

What I am against is when they flood a particular area with one particular patch of society, then you can kill it, which is what's in danger of happening here.

It is noteworthy that his complaint is that of other 'administrators' who also record the ability and power of residents of middle-class areas, like those he names, to lobby against the housing of asylum seekers in their areas. There is clearly lobbying going on in Adamsdown (the area he speaks from) too but it seems to have been less powerful to date. There is also evidence in this case of police and community coming together to resolve the issue. The locals were satisfied once they knew the migrant workers were not asylum seekers and were in fact there to work. Like people in Merthyr, they also assumed that any newcomers were illegal and asylum seekers: evidence of the effects of media coverage of these issues over a long period. In terms of community cohesion, he points out that people do accept newcomers 'because we've always been a mixed community area' but that asylum seekers are seen as not being able to fit in: 'the thing is that the local incomers don't really get involved in the community that much, I mean there's not a great deal they *can* get involved in I suppose'.

### **Case study: the Somalis**

For the Somalis, the most important forms of discrimination they suffer are those which trap them in poverty. Unemployment and perceived discrimination in service delivery convince some that they can do nothing to improve their own situation. The absence of any Somali employees at County Hall, just down the road from Butetown, is seen as iconic of what happens to them. Racial discrimination does prevent Somalis getting jobs – this is a problem argued by community leaders and also acknowledged as the first and foremost of all barriers by Jobcentre Plus:

I want to be careful how I frame this first one, but I think it's important and I want to flag it up and get it out of the way now, and that's the D word, discrimination ... when you say a postcode or where a customer's living from, or you say a name, and he's had a negative response on some occasions from some employers.

People talked to us of endless unsuccessful job applications and gave examples of white people they had graduated with, and done better than, who actually got positions for which they had applied. This leads to huge levels of underemployment. What most people do not know about the second- and third-generation British-born Somalis is:

... the majority of us did go to university. You know, most of the boys now who are taxi drivers – they've all got their degrees.

Some of them have an engineering degree and you say to them: 'You're doing this job?' They say: 'Oh, this is the only thing I can find.' It is a waste of human potential.

Participants spoke of incidents of 'benign' racism in the workplace which they excused on the grounds of ignorance. Others felt that ignorance about other cultures and religions in the workplace was inexcusable, resenting the way they were treated. These resentments are added to the cumulative family histories of racism which they have inherited. More recent Somali asylum seekers or family reunion migrants face further barriers to employment such as having to have their overseas qualifications recognised. Moreover the contexts of surveillance and the official culture of disbelief about the traumatic causes of asylum seeking or even people's identities (Baynham and de Fina, 2005) can be soul- and identity-destroying:

*(Continued)*

She came in 2001, still has no status, nothing, they're telling her that she's not Somali, that she doesn't look Somali.

These newcomers will often also face a language barrier. For most, learning the new language will be a priority, but can be difficult to access for people who are already poor, lack childcare, need to work, or are so depressed about their situation that it seems pointless. Those who do go to classes argue that there is little variety available for people at different levels of competency, and few Somali-speaking teachers. Learners find a reluctance on the part of white people outside classes to engage with those who have an accent, or who struggle to express themselves. There is a need for translation of official and community information into Somali, but there is a serious resource issue when so much money in Wales is devoted to Welsh-language translation. Somalis brought up in Cardiff had learned Welsh at school but none of the focus group participants used it. Many adult Somalis are keen to learn their written language, which was finally codified in 1972. One body, the Taff Housing Association, has found ways to use Somali oral culture to inform older clients, using audio tapes instead of letters. Somalis experience cultural ignorance and rudeness on the part of white service providers:

... when they're [*white workers*] dealing with services for other people from other groups ... they say derogatory things – I am constantly having to say something, a lot of them are not well trained to deal with it.

Men and women speak differently about their interactions with the police, although both feel that they are regarded with suspicion. Both feel that they are under surveillance in public places, but several male respondents have had closer brushes with the law where Somali and white have been treated differently:

I also had the same problems with the police. I was involved in a fight and they arrested us and not the white people and they took us up the crown court. You complain to the police officer or his/her friend but they will not help you.

Issues in the health services appear to emerge from a lack of health service knowledge about the Somalis. Language is a problem here too, and we were told by many participants of GPs and hospitals failing to use Language Line (the interpreting service), and of young children having to interpret for their mothers and taking time out of school to do so. Others report being turned away when

(Continued)

there is no interpreter available, or being asked to wait until another Somali comes in; as this woman said: 'I don't want to discuss a health problem with a complete stranger off the street'.

The worst health cases are those of single asylum-seeking mothers and their children, among whom we have found illness brought on by the poor accommodation in which they were living, poverty-limited diet, and post-traumatic stress exacerbated by their inability to access support because of language problems and social exclusion. They speak of damp, dirty bedding and blankets, in draughty, damp and cramped houses:

They've [*the children*] caught eczema due to the damp in the housing, it's not actually a house that's in good condition for her kids to be there, she has told them but nothing's been done.

Post-conflict trauma often goes unrecognised, but can cause severe debilitation. It often impacts most badly on those with the least support, such as these single mothers, but there is a lack of awareness in the medical profession about the extent of the stress, and a severe lack of funding for mental health services for tortured and traumatised asylum seekers.

When she went to the doctors they asked her: 'Mentally – you are not there – so what have you been through, what has happened?' And she's explained everything and you know, they were quite shocked themselves to see that she's been through so much.

One community worker, dealing with youth, unemployment and poverty in Butetown, felt that this segment of the community, whether asylum seeker or born here, was 'suffering from depression' just as individuals do. The health issue of the men's chewing of Ghat is considered by some as a symptom of this depression, although, according to the women, it also contributes to the economic depression of the community. There are two chewing houses in Butetown which can be described as equivalent to pubs (Somali informant). They are houses where men gather to chew green leaves from either Ethiopia or Kenya, called Ghat (Kat, khat, Jaad). 'Ghat is similar to amphetamine. In the Somali tradition everything is discussed during the chewing period. If you want to get married, you have to supply the Ghat for all your wedding guests.' Ghat is legal in the UK but in a number of European countries and America and Canada it is illegal. Chewing Ghat is therefore deeply embedded in the culture and the legality of it is a controversial issue among Somalis. Nonetheless, Somali

*(Continued)*

elders told us, and our research bears it out, that approximately one-third of the community is now well integrated and living in cohesive mixed communities outside Butetown. For them, 'integration' often meant having a university degree and driving a taxi, because at least that meant economic independence and the ability to buy a house, for example. There are also loud community voices, both male and female, demanding that Ghat be made illegal.

## **Public service providers**

Our research suggests that constant policy changes, often in response to media panics, can produce confusion and inefficiency in service delivery at local levels. Our respondents include minority ethnic women and men working in these contexts trying to deal with these issues. Encounters with housing provision, healthcare, policing, education and welfare services are key sites for integration and social cohesion. They are also one of the ways in which, as Cohen *et al.* (2002) described it, those who are put in charge of administering various kinds of government, council and other controls, including welfare controls, can actually come to implement, on a daily basis, radical failures of integration and community cohesion. These encounters drive people back into their own communities for support. One of our informants, working as a social worker, told us of her impressions of constant policy changes and failures in staff training in relation to a particular instance involving a female asylum seeker and her daughter. The mother had been refused leave to remain and her 12-year-old daughter had been accepted, so NASS (the National Asylum Support Service) was paying the rent and the bills for accommodation but there was no money for food:

... certain people at a certain level of management, they're not knowledgeable themselves, or they don't go to the training on the different policies, the policy is always changing and it causes a lot of confusion ... there's hardly enough time to go to the training as well – and then you've got staff going in and out and leaving – new staff – with children there's certain things we have to do – in certain areas where the policy keeps changing people do get confused. This lady was refused section 17 on two occasions and I think it had to do with the individual worker and the manager. When the child is a minor she must be supported. The mother was happy I was a black person and she can see that I was able to listen and do the assessment – and say we need to be supporting this family. They were relying on food parcels from the church. And they had said they would take the child into care – and that's ridiculous. We managed to get them £45 a week.

Our respondents also included new migrants from a wide range of communities and groups who had been on the receiving end of what appears to them to be racism and discrimination in these contexts. The current climate of anxiety about migration and asylum seems to encourage a culture of disbelief and dismissal where migrants in need are concerned. This is the case whether they are asylum seekers, refugees, others with forms of temporary leave to remain, migrants whose English is not perfect, migrants who speak with an accent, or migrants who are visibly different. Thus when it came to talking about everyday life and interactions with the 'host' white community, in almost all services the daily struggle to deal with negative attitudes was a constant refrain in focus groups and interviews. Talking of interactions with the health service, one educated Muslim woman said:

As far as, you know and I don't like to use the race card, but in a minority community, they seem to be really not interested and very relaxed – I don't know whether to use that word 'relaxed', but they're really disinterested. As soon as they see you, something happens, 'I'm not interested.' Whether it's the health service, whether it's housing, wherever you go, you see what I mean?

Asked about racism in Cardiff, these women went on to talk about the way they experience it:

They [*white people*] know they can't say anything direct, you know what I mean? – So people are aware ... that the way they look at you, the way they talk to you, their behaviour and attitude. More their attitude than anything. – And their attitude's all wrong.

They go on to give examples. They talk about interactions with the police:

You've got your headscarf on, automatically it means that you're a ... They assume that you've got no English ... yes, illiterate, you know in either ... language. And when the words come out of your mouth, you're looked at differently.

There is a general sense that the white Welsh or English will not bother to struggle with a foreign accent:

I think when it's a Welsh, or Englishman or whoever it may be, behind that desk, they won't understand the accent – they [*non-English speakers*] won't be able to speak the language fluently and [*things*] don't flow as they want it to be, it's just ...

Two male interviewees who have both lived in Cardiff for a very long time and are successful men spoke of the same intransigent forms of racism and discrimination in relation to their own careers and histories in Cardiff. One felt that despite the good people, there is no 'belonging' for 'others' in Wales:

There is something here in the system that you can't touch and I think it's very difficult to live with ... People are polite, but things are done in another way.

It is worth recalling here the way people on council estates in Merthyr felt they were viewed, and treated, by the administrative classes in that context:

They [*the council*] don't come anywhere near the place [*the estate*]; we can't get anything out of them. My mother has been in her house for 50 years and she's having her first new bath tomorrow, and she's had to fight for that. The Gurnos [*another estate*] get the lot, double glazing, everything; but we they've never got any money when it comes to us. Great for passing the buck! No one in that building [*the civic centre*] will take responsibility for anything. You can't get no sense out of them.

The case study included on Merthyr also shows that residents feel they are on the receiving end of poor services, and people dependent on benefits (the hostel dwellers and other unemployed) in Merthyr reported very similar treatment to that reported by minority groups elsewhere:

They're a joke [*welfare*]; they are, honest to God. They can't get nothing right. He, by there, is living on £20 a week cos they stopped his money, wrongly, but they won't reinstate him!

They [*Jobcentre*] do nothing to help you. I've never had any advice about jobs and that. They don't want to know. All they're good for is giving out forms and stopping your money first chance they get.

Merthyr administrators, on the other hand, speak disparagingly of such people, indicating very clearly the gulf in communication that is to be bridged here:

So maybe if they realised why those people [*the Portugese*] are here, and again, some of our long-term limiting illness people got up off their backsides and went and got a job, probably that wouldn't need to happen.

In Cathays/Roach students who are only transiently poor for the duration of their study report similar treatment at the hands of landlords, banks, the council and other service organisations. Poverty seems to be the common factor here.

### **Council workers, respect and identity**

At another level are those council workers who maintain or repair properties, those who act as security men, or immigration officials. In one focus group with the daughters of single Somali asylum-seeking mothers, our respondents talk about being Muslim and subject to the daily regime of service provision as an asylum seeker in Cardiff. It is the lack of respect for Muslim practices and notions of cleanliness and privacy which is foregrounded as an issue. Men come into their houses unannounced without removing their shoes and are rude when asked to. The fact that those who work for the council are often guilty of this kind of lack of respect for recent arrivals has been reported in several of our focus groups. They tell many stories at this point of lack of privacy in their council accommodation, of finding men in the house when they were not wearing their hijab, or of being harassed by immigration officials. The daily threat of being disbelieved and deported if an asylum claim fails is also something which in these very young girls' stories becomes a way of life for whole families:

Even after all that [*threats of deportation*], the parents they [*don't*] show their kids that they are having these problems. Maybe I'm old enough, my mum can tell me, cos when I was younger I didn't know about all this. But now she ... when she gets the amount of money that she gets from the ... the income support ... it's not enough, so I have to back off on the books that I need and like, cos now I know what she's going through ... as a daughter I have to be there for my mum, but, you know, as a person, as well, I have to be there for myself, like to educate myself.

And these children grow up very fast, learning English faster than their parents and becoming the interpreter for the family. The impact of all of this on schooling becomes very clear in the following explanation:

I missed lessons and I didn't do well in my year before because I had to miss a lot of lessons to go with her to the hospital and go with her ... My mum was there every moment with us. She was like guiding us, but she couldn't do anything by herself.

The children of new arrivals in the UK are substantially helped to integrate by the school system, and therefore have less difficulty learning English than their parents. In fact children report that learning to speak English is the quickest way to deal with the bullying that may occur. However, racist bullying from other children does happen. Muslim girls, for example, spoke of the discrimination and bullying because of their head coverings. This 9-year-old Iraqi girl described her strong feelings on the issue:

I'm not going to take off the scarf no matter what they're going to do anything to me – they're not making me take this scarf off. I'm not going to do it. Even if they try, if they gave me anything I will not take this scarf off. Never. I'm doing it for God and not for the people to think I'm stupid.

The often well-meaning discrimination from teachers also presents a barrier to inclusion, as discussed in the previous chapter.

## **Parental fears about racism and British culture**

Migrant and refugee children, living in deprived areas of Cardiff, can find that parental expectations for them are constrained by the fear of racism and by anxieties about their safety in the Welsh working-class contexts where they live (see also the section 'Class difference in working-class environments' in Chapter 3). They are kept indoors as much as possible, especially the girls, and go to schools as close to home as possible; this can also rule out university. We were told, for example, about a single Somali mother who was waiting to be reunited with her husband:

At school they play with different nationalities, but at home, no one visits them at home ... because she is single and dad is not here so she doesn't let them go out and now they are happy staying at home because if they got into any trouble she couldn't sort it out.

Children can also be restrained from mixing with other children because the parents do not want them to take on the British culture entirely and become different from themselves. We found this particularly in the Yemeni community and particularly in relation to girls:

Do you know why we do not mix with the British, because we are afraid that our children might behave like them. We come from a different culture and there are no limits to what they can do. For us it is enough what they learn in schools.

And from a child:

As soon as I come into our home there is nothing called English, as if you have taken your coat off and stepped into a small Yemen.

Many parents send their children to a weekend private school and for families who have recently arrived such schools remain crucial for the acquisition of familiar forms of social and cultural capital and maintaining the home language. In Cardiff there are several such private schools including Mandarin and Cantonese, Saudi, Libyan, Yemeni, Sudanese, Iraqi and Jordanian.

### Access to higher education

Some children and young people whose parents are seeking asylum have been in Cardiff without a decision for as long as five or seven years. These children have learned English and been integrated through the schools. However, they are not entitled to enter the universities as home students and face having to pay fees at much higher overseas rates. Not surprisingly, this prevents many from continuing to higher education. The following accounts are telling:

He's *[the son of one focus group mother]* got his A levels but because of no status there's nothing he can do university-wise, that's something he's waiting on.

*Respondent 2:* They *[the college]* said to him don't dream, because you'll never get to university.

*Respondent 3:* The school told him to do them *[fill in application forms]* and just see what the university says.

In a focus group with Cymru Refugee & Asylum Seekers Academic Council (CRAC), this was described in broader terms as a serious issue. The numbers quoted are almost certainly well below the actual numbers involved.

... this year there were about fifty-something *[of these children in Cardiff]*  
... and I know a lot of families whose children are getting the A level this year and they are worried, they don't know what to do.

## The role of the media

The way the mainstream media influences the public understanding of migration and social cohesion, and the lived experience of these things, was a constant theme in our research. The people who seemed to understand best the media's stereotypical mode of representing these issues were those who felt their lives and themselves to be misrepresented in, and by, the UK media. Interviewees and focus group participants from minority ethnic groups raised this issue even when we did not ask about it. Community leaders and ordinary members of communities could rehearse the terms of the typical media representation of migrants and newcomers. They knew they were identified by 'public opinion' (the 'host' community) as 'scroungers', as 'bogus' and as a drain on scarce resources, that they were unwelcome, and that they tended to be identified with the perpetrators of acts of crime and terrorism:

They don't like you because of the media ... So when they see black person they think that this one is a refugee, automatically, so the first question: where you from, why did you come in this country, and when are you going back? You see, you feel like you are not welcome.

Muslims in particular felt that they were vulnerable to media and political misrepresentation after 7/7 and the terrorist threats of summer 2006. They were also clearly vulnerable to actual harassment and attack in these contexts and believed the media was to blame. This situation is not entirely new (Buchanan *et al.*, 2003) but it does have serious implications for policy to do with integration/inclusion or community cohesion. The negative effects of media coverage on community relations were recognised in our research by senior managers in healthcare and the council as well as other administrators. It is primarily the national media which is identified as racist and anti-asylum by our respondents, while the local Cardiff and Merthyr media is considered more responsible.

Stereotypes of the Chinese are periodically recirculated among the wider population through the media. During both the 2001 foot-and-mouth outbreak and the 2003 SARS crisis both the Ministry of Agriculture, Fisheries and Food (MAFF), and the media, connected the diseases and the Chinese catering community. During this research a local paper also attacked a Chinese takeaway, reporting that health inspectors found 'rat droppings ... in a Chinese stir-fry'. Many of our Chinese respondents referred to this, and the catering workers used their knowledge of the cooking process to challenge its veracity:

It needs procedures to finish the fried rice, even in the steamed rice, you can't miss the rat droppings ... I think it is either to accuse the Chinese meals based on rumours or some guys wanted to have free meal. Many British are like this, they put some hair in the dish themselves and blamed us.

Others believed that the media was biased, and argued that the media often portrayed China and Chinese culture in an inaccurate and damaging way:

I think it is propaganda ... I argue that western media always distort the truth about China, which blind some public ... Chinese takeaway becomes a scapegoat for anything that is not clean.

However, during the course of this research, there were signs of positive change too. As Cardiff celebrated its centenary as a city in 2005, a number of programmes on its history and peoples were broadcast on BBC1 or BBC 2W. The major Welsh broadcasters shared an agenda with the Welsh Assembly and Cardiff Council to celebrate Cardiff, the capital of Wales, as a successful and socially cohesive city. These programmes produced a celebration of diversity and a representation of a tolerant, cosmopolitan Wales, and its histories of immigration, in a 'positive images' mode, in the form of documentaries and documentary series. The press coverage of the arrival of Portuguese and Polish migrant workers in Merthyr focused on their willingness to learn English, their importance to the Welsh economy and the fact that they were doing jobs that residents did not want (*Wales on Sunday*, 20 February 2005). By later in the year, *The Western Mail* was covering the exploitation of these same workers, and the formation of a support group, the Migrant Workers Forum, in Merthyr Tydfil together with the concern of the Valleys Race Equality Council at what was happening there (20 October 2005, 27 October 2005).

Nonetheless, there is ample evidence in our work with settled communities to show that much of what people understand about migration and migrants still relies on television news, rather than thoughtful documentaries, or on the worst excesses of the UK national tabloid press, and that major news events around migration issues can colour people's perceptions for decades. Two examples kept recurring in our data, both to do with the Somali immigration that occurred from 1988 in Cardiff. It had become common sense all over settled Cardiff by the period of this research that Somalis had been given unfair access to housing at that time and that Muslim women were seeking to have unique access to a blacked-out swimming pool in the city. Both myths can be traced back to media news activity around 1988 and still circulate as rumour, gossip and common sense at least 20 years later.

### **Case study: the Chinese**

The Chinese community in Cardiff is extremely diverse, including different nationalities and different language groups as well as class and political differences. There have been several waves of immigration over the last century, and each has originated from a different part of China. When businesses prospered, friends or relatives came to join those already succeeding here. Kinship and clan networks led to chain migration, extending the network to more distant relations. This pattern was common for UK diaspora communities originating from Canton and Fujian provinces (Zhou, 1992). The Chinese population in Cardiff is divided into two dominant groups, the Cantonese speakers from Hong Kong and the Mandarin speakers from mainland China. A small number come from Malaysia, Singapore and Taiwan.

Those Chinese who are educated, professional and mobile clearly have family and other close networks, often business-related, but these are much more like those shared by middle-class white communities. All the Chinese groups have diasporic and transnational links just like, for example, the Somalis and the mobile middle-class British. They are able to live in middle-class areas of Cardiff, to send their children to middle-class schools and universities, and to move in and out of areas as opportunity offers. They share what Ong (1999), in a book on the 'cultural logics of transnationality', called 'flexible citizenship'. Their high levels of education and their economic capital protect them from a good deal of the racism and discrimination that other groups encounter. However, many tend to remain within their own circle of 'BBC' (British-born Chinese) because they say they never feel that they truly belong. Their families emphasise traditional Chinese values of diligence, modesty, moderation, family values and respect for the elderly, which they find lacking in their British peers. In this they are comparable to other groups.

By contrast, the Chinese catering enclave is one of the limited options that the Fujianese have. Their English ability is limited and in these contexts they do not need to speak English. Furthermore, the ethnic catering business was for a time one of the few places where an undocumented migrant, or a migrant without the right to work, could find employment. However, with the increasing number of Fujianese migrants, the job market has become more and more competitive and the wage level has fallen. The only options for new migrants, once positions in the catering business had filled up, were jobs like cockle picking or fruit picking, which were less attractive because they were seasonal, less well paid and dangerous (Jiang, 2006).

*(Continued)*

It is not therefore always easy to secure a steady income, and some mainland Chinese fall on very hard times in Cardiff, becoming 'homeless' and relying on Chinese friends or acquaintances to support them. One focus group respondent offered evidence that their lives are severely afflicted by poverty:

I happened to meet a guy who was smuggled here a couple of days ago. He asked for direction in the street. He lived in Chinatown so we walked together and started to have a chat. He told me he pays snakehead 240,000 RMB for the journey. I asked him why to come here if he had this big sum of money. He is from Fujian and he worked for a Hong Kong boss here. The minimum wage here is £5 per hour, but his was £2.50, he worked 12 hours a day. The food provided by the boss was very bad.

Members of Cardiff Council and community managers are aware of the existence of a Chinese community, but not of their problems, and characterise them as self-sufficient, integrated, and not a problem where cohesion is concerned. There is an assumption that they have no needs that current services cannot cover. However, this obscures the very real problems that different Chinese face.

The primary difficulty is language. New Mandarin-speaking immigrants have language needs, but so do the elderly Cantonese speakers from Hong Kong, who spent too many hours in Chinese restaurant kitchens to have learnt English to the standard required by official documents such as welfare application forms. They tend to rely on friends and family for help, and do not access the state benefits to which they are entitled. Providing language support is still an important function for Chinese communities all over the country. The Cardiff Chinese Elderly Association, for example, prioritises helping the elderly with reading letters and filling out benefit application forms. This low level of access of first-generation Chinese can cause cases of extreme poverty:

They don't really know what their rights are because nobody is there to tell them because of the language barrier. In fact there are a lot of people unemployed who are eligible to income benefits but they don't know how to go about it ... In fact I actually witnessed some people starve to death in a house, because he was out of work, there was no money.

In Cardiff, it was believed that the council did not provide the Chinese with adequate interpretation and other social services. The vacancy left by the departure of the only qualified full-time Chinese social worker in Cardiff Council

*(Continued)*

had not yet been filled at the time of writing (May 2006). Language support for medical appointments and job seeking and service from other facilities were fragmentary or non-existent, and even where services are available, they are not always considered successful.

What is missing in Cardiff among the Chinese is the kind of 'ethnic community' activity and construction, which, among other groups, is driven by the government policy which demands self-identification as a community, with community leaders, before funding is made available. Chinese immigrants in Cardiff, as elsewhere in the UK, are different from other immigrants in that 'negotiating difficult constraints in the labour market have taken priority over political participation' (Parker, 1998, p. 67). Despite the long history of the Chinese presence in Cardiff and the increasing visibility of the Chinese in recent years, all participants agreed that there are very few organised activities, and many are unaware of those there are or do not participate because of lack of time or interest. The long-term Chinese residents had a clearer vision for a Chinese community because of what they had learned about other UK Chinese communities. For them 'community' included a drop-in centre with various activities targeting their needs, sheltered accommodation for the elderly, and more support for supplementary language schools.

## Summary points

- In all the services discussed with participants in the research, members of minority groups reported experiences of discrimination, offensive cultural ignorance or racism.
- Public spaces, like the city or the trains, were also places where visibly different minorities felt uncomfortable, especially after the London transport attacks of 7/7.
- All those who were poor in this research tended to report similar kinds of bad experiences with housing, landlords or council workers. Migrants interpreted this as racism, others as people in power just not caring and the students as being exploited. These different perceptions of bad experiences were common across other areas such as education, healthcare and employment.
- There were examples of tensions between newcomers and settled communities in STAR, in Cathays and in Merthyr. In each case it was settled working-class groups responding negatively to newcomers, but in each case for very different reasons:

- In STAR people resented the noise, the overcrowding, the drain on resources and the unfair burden placed on deprived areas by migrant workers and asylum seekers when middle-class areas would not do their share.
  - In Cathays the settled older working-class community found the students noisy and messy.
  - In Merthyr the Portuguese migrant workers seemed to be resented because they were different and everywhere.
- Migrant groups in particular believed that their ability to integrate and become part of a cohesive community was constantly damaged by media-fuelled stereotypes.

## 5 Conclusions and policy directions

This research set out to explore a range of communities and geographical areas in Cardiff and Merthyr Tydfil to establish how new migration impacted on receiving communities and how community, integration and social and community cohesion were imagined and enacted in these contexts. What we have found indicates that there are as many forms of community and cohesion, and indeed stages and kinds of integration, as there are localities in Cardiff and Merthyr Tydfil, that it is perfectly possible for groups to live 'parallel' lives without any apparent impact on community cohesion, that on the other hand the appearance of integration and cohesion can conceal real need, and that social class, race, age, gender and relative wealth and poverty are key factors in determining what kind of 'integration' and 'cohesion' will actually accompany the complex variety of new migrations.

Our findings look in many ways quite close to the findings of the Commission on Integration and Cohesion (2007) and offer all the challenges for policy of the 'super-diversity' described by Vertovec (2006) and largely accepted by the Commission as the new migration reality.

### Welsh cohesion policy

The Home Office in 2006 funded a Community Cohesion post in the Equality Policy Unit (EPU) within the Communities Directorate of the former Department of Social Justice and Regeneration within the Welsh Assembly Government, placing the imprint of Home Office policy on it in this context. There is now in 2008 a community cohesion team of three. Wales contributed to the EU consultation on cohesion policy which closed in early 2008 and the community cohesion team at the Assembly are working on developing a cohesion policy for Wales.

After the Welsh elections in 2007, the new Departments of Environment, Sustainability and Housing, and of Social Justice and Local Government have incorporated between them a good deal of what had been included in the Department of Social Justice and Regeneration. Community Cohesion is now located in the Community Safety area as in most current UK administrations. It is too early to tell at this stage, given the time it has taken for the new coalition government in Wales to bed in, just exactly how these departments will take the community cohesion issues forward.

Some clues are offered by recent approaches to poverty. After a Welsh Assembly Government (WAG) review of the Communities First programme (2008), the flagship scheme under the former Labour Government to tackle exclusion and deprivation, it was renamed Communities Next and directed to focus on deliverable outcomes in e.g., health, jobs and skills, and strong and safe communities. The Assembly focus appears to be to target what it is now calling 'economic inactivity' across communities, and ministers and civil servants are indicating that four large projects encompassing several areas or communities will replace the former divisive plethora of small funded projects. In these respects, the WAG appears to be following closely the UK Government's response to the report of the Commission on Integration and Cohesion. It is likely then, in this context, that new policy on community cohesion in Wales will follow suit.

In late 2007, the Assembly Government Equality of Opportunity Committee undertook a consultation on the experience of migrant workers in Wales. The consultation response has yet to be published (as of March 2008). This initiative too appears to be a mapping exercise of the kind recommended by the Commission on Integration and Cohesion (2007).

On the other hand, the Welsh Refugee Inclusion Strategy, produced under the former Labour Government, is currently undergoing impact assessment (March 2008) and will be published soon. This policy importantly includes both integration and cohesion within its definition of inclusion and appears to appreciate the need for economic and cultural integration, as essential forms of mutual adaptation, to precede or at least accompany cohesion.

### **Policy language and the making of 'common sense'**

In *Our Shared Future* (2007), the Commission for Integration and Cohesion asked the Government to be clearer about the difference between race equality, community cohesion and preventing violent extremism. The Government's response has at no stage actually succeeded in disentangling these now profoundly connected issues. The links between them have actually become political 'common sense'. Thus the response (2008) tells us that 'in central, regional and local government the same person or group of people is often responsible for all three' and there remain 'synergies between them'. Race equality will 'promote equality and tackle extremism', while 'extremist messages' are less likely to find support in 'cohesive communities' (1.7–1.9). Thus while the Commission has moved on a long way since Cantle (2001), the Government actually has not. Hazel Blears's statement (February 2008) is still

talking of 'managing diversity' so that it does not become a 'problem', articulating the very kind of 'elite racism' which Blommaert and Verschueren identified in 1998. This is not far removed in fact from the language used after the northern riots in 2001, when the focus on minority ethnic groups who were seen as a 'problem' in living 'parallel lives' in 'segregated neighbourhoods' first gave rise to the shift in focus to 'community relations' as the solution (Cantle, 2001). These kinds of dominant messages are communicated, and perceived to be communicated, through the media's reliance on powerful government spokespeople as sources.

Our research, in exploring common-sense understandings of this kind of language, has shown how difficult it is to change these powerful stories, and how remote they are from the realities of people's everyday lives. Thus we found that despite changes in the policy arena by 2005/06 and despite what the Commission might go on to say in 2007, ordinary people in Cardiff and Merthyr in 2006 overwhelmingly still understood immigration policy to be about assimilation, migrant communities to be segregated and living 'parallel lives', and the default categorisation of all migrants in deprived areas to be 'illegal' and 'asylum seekers' or 'refugees'.

Policy and government languages are very powerful. They accumulate dangerous connotations over time, they have the power to stop people seeing reality, and they must be embedded and enacted at all levels in local and regional government and service delivery if they are to do the work they are designed to do. Their messages must also be communicated effectively to both settled and new populations if mutual trust and understandings of rights and responsibilities are to be a reality.

## **Cohesion: local realities**

There is no evidence in our research that community tensions are an inevitable consequence of new immigration. Our evidence indicates that the nature of relations varies according to: the local socio-economic context; the social class background and gender of both new immigrants and receiving communities; the history of previous settlement and the ethnic, age and class profile of the area; the actual and perceived ethnicity and class of new immigrants; national and local media representations of immigration, asylum and migrant workers; the legal status of new immigrants; and, in deprived and middle-class areas, the success of local agencies and groups in mediating between, and communicating about, established and incoming populations.

White immigration, whether middle-class professional, student or migrant worker, appears to be invisible to local populations in Cardiff. There are strong indications that the ability of migrants to work aids integration and cohesion.

There is no evidence that minority ethnic groups are any more 'segregated' than receiving middle-class and working-class communities and none that they are any less well integrated than white working-class communities on council estates. White youth in Cardiff and youth and the homeless and poor on the council estates we worked with in Merthyr appear to be among the least well-integrated groups in our data and youth behaviours appear to cause the greatest community tensions in almost all areas. Intergenerational tensions are present in all contexts, and intergenerational change is an important aspect of long-term integration and social cohesion. Other groups who, perhaps not surprisingly, appeared isolated and in need across our data were some elderly groups, some children and some women.

### **Poverty, social class and cohesion**

Significant class differences exist within and across the communities and areas we researched and affect the ways in which integration and social cohesion are experienced in everyday life. In this study, poverty featured as a central condition of many of the participants' lives. This is because certain kinds of new migrants inevitably end up living in the most 'socially excluded' and 'deprived' areas. However, class background and current life trajectories made enormous differences to the way people responded to poverty or to the migrant experience in its various forms. Middle-class migrants with education and fluent English tend to appear better integrated, even if still very poor, as do students in Cathays who see their poverty as transient.

These middle-class ethnic community 'leaders' with a level of education and experience which allows them to mix and negotiate with the middle-class 'administrators' (e.g., civil servants, council workers and so on) make a huge, largely unrecognised, contribution to the local and national economy in supporting new migrants, often through volunteering. On the other hand, there is evidence of real class difference and of tensions in Merthyr between the administrative class and people living on housing estates.

Welsh working-class culture, especially youth culture, is often seen as inimical to much that new migrants (from both middle- and working-class backgrounds) value. Thus new migrants, whether they be single Somali mothers seeking asylum and

living in poverty, third-generation Muslim families from whatever background, very recently arrived groups from the Sudan, Iraq or the Yemen, or long-standing British Chinese or Somali residents, see the need to protect their children from these influences (as indeed do middle-class white Welsh parents in Llandaff and older residents in Merthyr Tydfil). This produces a version of 'parallel lives' (in Llandaff, in STAR and among Somali and Arab parents in our data), but not the one the policy tells us about.

Children and young people, on the other hand, sometimes resist these protective tendencies, and sometimes, as in the Somali community, see youth clubs and attempts 'to keep them off the streets' as important in challenging stereotypes about the community and protecting them from police scrutiny. There seems on the whole to be more community responsibility taken for youth behaviours in minority ethnic communities and in middle-class Llandaff (where many middle-class Chinese send their children to school) than is the case in other areas.

### **External barriers to integration**

There is evidence in our research that the kind of racism and discrimination described by minority ethnic groups in Cardiff as affecting services which have a potential role in relation to integration (including language, legal support, housing, education, employment and health) may be in part class- as well as poverty-related. The same complaints are made about service provision on Merthyr Tydfil estates and by students in Cathays.

Barriers can also be complex and ambivalent. For example, there is resentment within the Somali community about the underemployment of university graduates, many of whom drive taxis. This is seen to be a result of racism and discrimination. However, older members of the community, while recognising this, also understood it to involve a process of slow integration and cohesion. Somali graduates who drive taxis are at least able to earn a living and buy houses, and their work involves them in many interactions with other groups.

Economic integration, however, must and does come before cohesion. This is much better understood in our research by those struggling to belong in the new place than by members of settled communities. Thus for some Somali respondents it was clearly more important to have good housing, good education and jobs than white friends. Indeed they argued that they probably had more white friends than white people in Cardiff had black ones but that this did not solve the problems of unemployment, poor housing, educational disadvantage, poverty and racism.

### History, integration and cohesion

Histories also matter and they may impact in positive or negative ways on how people see themselves and how they live their lives. Three generations of racism and discrimination may impact more severely on people's sense of belonging than a few months of this kind of experience. Thus Somali women remembered their fathers' stories of landlords putting up signs saying 'No Blacks Need Apply' and still felt excluded by this, while settled communities still talked about the fact that Somali asylum seekers in 1988 had been given large new housing by Cardiff Council, a story which had been front-page news in the local press at the time. Younger people who had arrived more recently were still reluctant to call things 'racist' and wanted to give the locals the benefit of the doubt.

### Lessons for Wales

There are real lessons here for policy development in Wales around community cohesion. Political leadership must buy into and understand the policy and know how to communicate it to the media if public understanding is to follow. But if policy is to do any real work, then those at local council level and in other service provision contexts must also be trained to understand and deliver on new policy directions in order to produce the kind of mutual respect and understanding the Commission on Integration and Cohesion (2007) speaks about. There are many examples of good practice which could be used as models, especially in ESOL and schooling contexts.

There will also be a real need to avoid the common-sense, and now institutionalised, tendency to link together race equality, community cohesion and issues of community safety and extremism and a related need to explore cohesion issues across settled and new communities, groups and areas. Our research shows very clearly that to focus on only the first will miss many of the issues much of the time. There are real barriers to integration and cohesion across new and established, minority ethnic and majority settled and white groups and areas in Cardiff and South Wales.

Social class in particular remains hugely under-researched as a factor affecting processes of both integration and cohesion. The evidence of racism and discrimination in services and contexts that should promote integration belies any simple solution to the perceived 'problems' of new migration that might be offered by citizenship tests/ceremonies or agreed rights and responsibilities alone. Barriers to integration and cohesion exist within communities and groups and between them.

Intergenerational tensions of different and complex kinds cross all communities and groups we researched and are also underestimated in relation to both integration and cohesion. The issue of the many groups of isolated, vulnerable individuals within a range of apparently successful and less successful communities leads to failure in each of the three areas defined as producing community cohesion in the recent government response to the Commission (Blears, 2008).

Communication and myth-busting are recognised as key and necessary activities but in fact we have few models which have been shown to actually work in changing entrenched public opinion (Gross *et al.*, 2008). Effecting real changes in attitudes between social class groups may be more important.

Mapping the size of populations and issues in local areas and changing the funding models will be helpful but will take time. There needs at least to be an understanding of the complexity and layered nature of the super-diversity which is now the norm in Wales and of the many factors and issues which are actually shared between and among both new and settled communities.

# References

Ahmed, Eid Ali (1998) 'Socio-economic disadvantages of the Somali community', MBA thesis, University of Glamorgan

Ahmed, Sara (2004) *The Cultural Politics of Emotion*. Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press

Ahmed, Sara (2006) 'Doing diversity work', *Policy Futures in Education* (co-edited with Elaine Swan), Vol. 4, No. 2. Available at [www.wwwords.co.uk/pfie/content/pdfs/4/issue4\\_2.asp](http://www.wwwords.co.uk/pfie/content/pdfs/4/issue4_2.asp)

Ahmed, Sara, Hunter, Shona, Killic, Sevgi, Swan, Elaine and Turner, Lewis (2006) *Race, Diversity and Leadership in the Learning and Skills Sector, commissioned by the Centre for Excellence in Leadership*. Available at [www.goldsmiths.ac.uk/media-communications/staff/finaldiversityreport.pdf](http://www.goldsmiths.ac.uk/media-communications/staff/finaldiversityreport.pdf)

All Wales Refugee Policy Forum (Housing Sub Group) (2005) Draft Refugee Housing Action Plan

Amit, Vered (ed.) (2002) *Realizing Community: Concepts, Social Relationships and Sentiments*. London: Routledge

Anti-Poverty Network Cymru (2006) *Walk the Talk: Communities on Communities First*. Cardiff: Oxfam Cymru

Balibar, Etienne and Wallerstein, Immanuel (1991) *Race, Nation, Class: Ambiguous Identities*. London and New York: Verso

Ballard, Roger (ed.) (1994) *Desh Pardesh: The South Asian Presence in Britain*. London: Hurst & Co.

Barbour, Rosaline and Kitzinger, Jenny (eds) (2001) *Developing Focus Group Research: Politics, Theory, Practice*. London: Sage

Barsky, Robert F. (2005) 'Stories from the Court of Appeal in literature and law', in M. Baynham and A. de Fina (eds) *Dislocations/Relocations: Narratives of Displacement*. Manchester: St Jerome Publishing

- Baumann, Gerd (1998) *Contesting Culture: Discourses of Identity in Multi-Ethnic London*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press
- Baynham, Mike and de Fina, Anna (eds) (2005) *Dislocations/Relocations: Narratives of Displacement*. Manchester: St Jerome Publishing
- Berkeley, Rob, Khan, Omar and Ambikaipaker, Mohan (2006) *What's New about New Immigrants in Twenty-First Century Britain?* York: Joseph Rowntree Foundation. Available at [www.jrf.org.uk/knowledge/findings/socialpolicy/0086.asp](http://www.jrf.org.uk/knowledge/findings/socialpolicy/0086.asp)
- Bhachu, Parminder (1985) *East African Sikh Settlers in Britain*. London: Tavistock Publications
- Bhavnani, Reena, Mirza, Heidi Safia and Meeto, Veena (2005) *Tackling the Roots of Racism: Lessons for Success*. Bristol: The Policy Press
- Blears, Hazel (2008) *The Government's Response to the Commission on Integration and Cohesion*. Available at [www.communities.gov.uk/publications/communities/governmentresponsecoic](http://www.communities.gov.uk/publications/communities/governmentresponsecoic)
- Blommaert, Jan and Verschueren, Jef (1998) *Debating Diversity: Analysing the Discourse of Tolerance*. London and New York: Routledge
- Bourdieu, Pierre (1984) *A Social Critique of the Judgment of Taste*. Trans. Richard Nice. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press
- Buchanan, Sara, Grillo, Bethan and Threadgold, Terry (2003) *What's the Story? Results from Research into Media Coverage of Refugees and Asylum Seekers in the UK*. London: Article 19
- Cantle, Ted (2001) *Community Cohesion: A Report of the Independent Review Team*. London: The Home Office
- Cardiff Communities First (2005) *Black and Minority Ethnic Communities Consultation Report*. Available at [http://archive.cardiff.gov.uk/SPNR/communities\\_first/BME/Reports%202005/2005%20BME%20Consultation%20Report%20English.p](http://archive.cardiff.gov.uk/SPNR/communities_first/BME/Reports%202005/2005%20BME%20Consultation%20Report%20English.p)
- Castles, Stephen (2004) 'Why migration policies fail', *Ethnic and Racial Studies*, Vol. 27, No. 2, March, pp. 205–27

- Castles, Stephen, Korac, Maja, Vasta, Ellie and Vertovec, Steven (2002) *Integration: Mapping the Field*, report of a project carried out by the University of Oxford Centre for Migration and Policy Research and Refugee Studies Centre, contracted by the Home Office Immigration and Research Statistics Service (IRSS)
- Cayford, Joanne M. (1991) 'In search of "John Chinaman": press representations of the Chinese in Cardiff 1906–1911', *Llafur*, Vol. 5, No. 4, pp. 37–50
- Cohen, Anthony P. (1985) *The Symbolic Construction of Community*. London: Tavistock Publications
- Cohen, Steve, Humphries, Beth and Mynott, Ed (eds) (2002) *From Immigration Controls to Welfare Controls*. London and New York: Routledge
- Coles, E. C. (2006) *Alcohol and Health: A Major Public Health Issue*. Cardiff: National Public Health Service for Wales
- Commission for Racial Equality in Wales (2006) *Statutory Code of Practice on Racial Equality in Housing in Wales*. Available at [www.info4local.gov.uk/documents/publications/30395](http://www.info4local.gov.uk/documents/publications/30395)
- Commission on Integration and Cohesion (2007) *Our Shared Future*. Available at [www.integrationandcohesion.org.uk/Our\\_final\\_report.aspx](http://www.integrationandcohesion.org.uk/Our_final_report.aspx)
- Dench, Geoff, Gavron, Kate and Young, Michael (2006) *The New East End: Kinship, Race and Conflict*. London: Profile Books
- Drake, St Clair (1954) 'Value systems, social structure and race relations in the British Isles', PhD thesis, Chicago, Illinois
- Durante, Lula (2006) *Deliberative Workshops: Exploring Communications on Asylum Seekers*. London: IPPR
- Equality of Opportunity Committee (forthcoming) *Report on Inquiry into Migrant Workers in Wales*. Cardiff: WAG
- Evans, J. and Wood, F. (1999) *Living in Ely: The Experience of Service Provision and Harassment among the Black and Ethnic Minority Population*. Cardiff: Barnardo's
- Evans, Neil (1980) 'The South Wales race riots of 1919', *Llafur*, Vol. 3, No.1, pp. 5–29

Evans, Neil (1988) “A tidal wave of impatience”: the Cardiff general strike of 1911’, in G. H. Jenkins and J. B. Smith (eds) *Politics and Society in Wales, 1840–1922*. Cardiff: University of Wales Press

Evans, Neil (2003a) ‘New migrants and minorities in Wales, 1840–1990’, in Williams *et al.* (eds) *A Tolerant Nation? Exploring Ethnic Diversity in Wales*. Cardiff: University of Wales Press

Evans, Neil (2003b) ‘Through the prism of ethnic violence: riots and racial attacks in Wales, 1862–2002’, in Williams *et al.* (eds) *A Tolerant Nation? Exploring Ethnic Diversity in Wales*. Cardiff: University of Wales Press

Fairclough, Norman (2000) *New Labour, New Language?* London and New York: Routledge

Fortier, Anne-Marie (2000) *Migrant Belongings: Memory, Space, Identity*. Oxford and New York: Berg

Gillespie, Marie (1995) *Television, Ethnicity and Cultural Change*. London and New York: Routledge

Gross, Bernhard, Moore, Kerry and Threadgold, Terry (2008) *Broadcast News Coverage of Asylum April to October 2006: Caught Between Human Rights and Public Safety*. Cardiff: Cardiff School of Journalism, Media and Cultural Studies and Oxfam

Harris, Hermione (2004) *The Somali Community in the UK: What We Know and How We Know It*, commissioned and published by the Information Centre about Asylum Seekers and Refugees in the UK (ICAR)

Hewett, Tracy, Smalley, Nina, Dunkerley, David and Scourfield, Jonathan (2005) *Uncertain Futures: Children Seeking Asylum in Wales*. Cardiff: Save the Children

Holmes, Colin (1988) *John Bull’s Island: Immigration and British Society, 1871–1971*. London: Macmillan

Home Office (2001) *Integration Matters: A National Strategy for Refugee Integration*. London: HMSO

Home Office (2004) *Working Together: Co-operation between Government and Faith Communities*. London: HMSO

Home Office (2006) *A New Model for National Refugee Integration Services in England: Consultation Paper*. London: HMSO

Housing Associations' Charitable Trust (HACT) (2005) 'The Refugee Housing Partnership Project', *Accommodate*, Issue 3, Summer

Hubbard, Anne (2005) 'Migrant workers: Wales', paper tabled at the All Wales Refugee Policy Forum

ICAR (2004a) *Understanding the Stranger: Final Report*, commissioned and published by the Information Centre about Asylum Seekers and Refugees in the UK (ICAR)

ICAR (2004b) *Media Image, Community Impact: Assessing the Impact of Media and Political Images of Refugees and Asylum Seekers on Community Relations in London: Report of a Pilot Research Study*. Information Centre about Asylum Seekers and Refugees in the UK (ICAR) for the Mayor of London, April

Jiang, Xinyi (2006) 'Fujianese migration on the margin: a study of migration culture through history, media representation and ethnography', unpublished PhD thesis, Cardiff University

Jordan, Glenn H. (1991) 'On ethnography in an intertextual situation: reading narratives or deconstructing discourse', in Faye V. Harrison (ed.) *Decolonizing Anthropology: Moving Further Toward an Anthropology of Liberation*. Washington DC: Association of Black Anthropologists

Jordan, Glenn (2003) 'Voices from below: doing people's history in Cardiff docklands', in Stefan Berger, Heiko Feldner and Kevin Passmore (eds) *Writing History: Theory and Practice*. London: Arnold

Jordan, Glenn (2004) "'We never really noticed you were coloured": postcolonial reflections on new migrants and minorities in Wales', in Jane Aaron and Chris Williams (eds) *Postcolonial Wales*. Cardiff: University of Wales Press

Jordan, Glenn, with the assistance of Ahmed, Akli and Arwo, Abdi (2004) 'Somali Elders: Portraits from Wales', photographs and text by Glenn Jordan

Kyambi, Sarah (2005) *Beyond Black and White: Mapping New Immigrant Communities*. London: IPPR

- Laclau, Ernesto and Mouffe, Chantal (1985) *Hegemony and Socialist Strategy: Towards a Radical Democratic Politics*. London and New York: Verso
- Law, John (2004) *After Method: Mess in Social Science Research*. London and New York: Routledge
- Lewis, Miranda (2005) *Asylum: Understanding Public Attitudes*. London: IPPR
- Llandaff Society (1996) *Llandaff: The Archive Photographs Series*. Gloucestershire: Tempus
- Machin, David and Niblock, Sarah (2006) *News Production: Theory and Practice*. London and New York: Routledge
- Maloutas, T. and Pantelidou Malouta, M. (2004) 'The glass menageries of urban governance and social cohesion: concepts and stakes/concepts as stakes', *International Journal of Urban and Regional Research*, Vol. 282 (June), pp. 449–65
- Mathieu, Marika (2007) 'Britain: our divided nation', *New Statesman*, 13 August, pp. 30–1
- Nagel, C. (2002) 'Constructing difference and sameness: the politics of assimilation in London's Arab communities', *Ethnic and Racial Studies*, Vol. 25, No. 2, pp. 258–87
- Nicholl, Anna (2005) *Refugee Inclusion Strategy Scoping Report: A Report on Issues Relevant to the Development of the Welsh Refugee Inclusion Strategy*. Cardiff: Welsh Assembly Government. Available at <http://new.wales.gov.uk/topics/housingandcommunity/research/refugeescoping?lang=en>
- Ong, Aihwa (1999) *Flexible Citizenship: The Cultural Logics of Transnationality*. Durham and London: Duke University Press
- ONS (Office for National Statistics) (2006) *Internet Access: Households and Individuals*. Available at [www.statistics.gov.uk/pdfdir/inta0806.pdf](http://www.statistics.gov.uk/pdfdir/inta0806.pdf)
- Osmond, John and Mugaseth, Jessica (2007) 'Community approaches to poverty in Wales'. Available at [www.iwa.org.uk/publications/pdfs/poverty\\_debate.pdf](http://www.iwa.org.uk/publications/pdfs/poverty_debate.pdf) (accessed 10 February 2007)
- Owen, David (1992) *Ethnic Minorities in Great Britain: Settlement Patterns*, National Ethnic Minority Data Archive 1991 Census Statistical Paper No. 1. Coventry: Centre for Research in Ethnic Relations, University of Warwick

Owen, David (1993a) *Ethnic Minorities in Great Britain: Age and Gender Structure*, National Ethnic Minority Data Archive 1991 Census Statistical Paper No. 2. Coventry: Centre for Research in Ethnic Relations, University of Warwick

Owen, David (1993b) *Ethnic Minorities in Great Britain: Economic Characteristics*, National Ethnic Minority Data Archive 1991 Census Statistical Paper No. 3. Coventry: Centre for Research in Ethnic Relations, University of Warwick

Owen, David (1994) *Chinese and 'Other' Ethnic Minorities in Great Britain*, National Ethnic Minority Data Archive 1991 Census Statistical Paper No. 8. Coventry: Centre for Research in Ethnic Relations, University of Warwick

Parekh Report (2000) *The Future of Multi-Ethnic Britain*, report by the Commission on the Future of Multi-Ethnic Britain. London: Profile Books

Parker, David (1998) 'Chinese people in Britain: histories, futures and identities', in G. Benton and F. N. Pieke (eds) *The Chinese in Europe*. London: Macmillan

Race Relations (Amendment) Act 2001. London: HMSO

Robinson, David and Reeve, Kesia (2006) *Neighbourhood Experiences of New Immigration: Reflections from the Evidence Base*. York: Joseph Rowntree Foundation. Available at [www.jrf.org.uk/knowledge/findings/socialpolicy/0086.asp](http://www.jrf.org.uk/knowledge/findings/socialpolicy/0086.asp)

Robinson, Ian and Frankenberg, Ronald (2005) *Reconsidering Ethnicity: A Study of 'Non-Ethnic' People in the Midst of Ethnicity*. London: ESRC

Robinson, Vaughan (2003a) 'Exploring myths about rural racism: a Welsh case study', in Williams *et al.* (eds) *A Tolerant Nation? Exploring Ethnic Diversity in Wales*. Cardiff: University of Wales Press

Robinson, Vaughan (2003b) 'Croeso i Gymru – Welcome to Wales? Refugees and asylum seekers in Wales', in Williams *et al.* (eds) *A Tolerant Nation? Exploring Ethnic Diversity in Wales*. Cardiff: University of Wales Press

Robinson, Vaughan (2006) *Mapping the Field: Refugee Housing in Wales*, commissioned by HACT and the Welsh Refugee Council. London: HACT

Robinson, Vaughan, Andersson, Roger and Musterd, Sako (2003) *Spreading the 'Burden'? A Review of Policies to Disperse Asylum Seekers and Refugees*, a project funded by the European Commission. Bristol: The Policy Press

- Root, Amanda (2007) *Market Citizenship: Experiments in Democracy and Globalization*. London: Sage
- Scottish Refugee Integration Forum (SRIF) (2003) *Action Plan*. Edinburgh: The Scottish Executive
- Scourfield, Jonathan and Davies, Andrew (2005) 'Children's accounts of Wales as racialized and inclusive', *Ethnicities*, Vol. 5, No. 1, pp. 83–107
- Scourfield, Jonathan, Evans, Jonathan, Shah, Wahida and Beynon, Huw (2002) 'Responding to the experiences of minority ethnic children in all-white communities', *Child and Family Social Work*, Vol. 7, No. 3, pp. 161–75
- Shaw, Alison (1988) *A Pakistani Community in Britain*. Oxford: Basil Blackwell
- Smith, Dorothy (2005) *Institutional Ethnography: A Sociology for People*. London and New York: Rowman & Littlefield
- Speers, Tammy (2001) *Welcome or Over Reaction? Refugees and Asylum Seekers in the Welsh Media*. Cardiff: Wales Media Forum
- Sproston, K., Pitson, L., Whitfield G. and Walker, E. (1999) *Health and Lifestyles of the Chinese Population in England*. London: Health Education Authority
- Taylor, Monica (1987) *Chinese Pupils in Britain*. London: National Foundation for Educational Research
- Threadgold, Terry (2005a) *Focus Groups with Refugees: Report to the Welsh Refugee Council: Findings*. Available at <http://wales.gov.uk/topics/housingandcommunity/communitycohesion/research/focusgroups/?lang=en>
- Threadgold, Terry (2005b) *Refugee Inclusion: A Literature Review: Findings and Recommendations*, pp. 1–8. Available at <http://wales.gov.uk/topics/housingandcommunity/communitycohesion/research/focusgroups/?lang=en>
- Threadgold, Terry (2005c) 'Performing theories of narrative: theorising narrative performance', in Joanna Thornborrow and Jennifer Coates (eds) *The Sociolinguistics of Narrative*. Amsterdam: John Benjamins
- Threadgold, Terry and Clifford, Sadie (2005) *Focus Groups with Refugees: Report to the Welsh Refugee Council*. Available at <http://new.wales.gov.uk/topics/housingandcommunity/research/?lang=en>

Threadgold, Terry and Court, Geoff (2005) *Refugee Inclusion: A Literature Review*, produced for the Welsh Refugee Council and the Welsh Assembly Government. Available at <http://new.wales.gov.uk/topics/housingandcommunity/research/refugeelit eraturereview?lang=en>

Van Dijk, Teun (1993) *Elite Discourse and Racism*. London: Sage

Vertovec, Stephen (2004) 'Diaspora', in Ellis Cashmore (ed.) *Encyclopedia of Race and Ethnic Studies*, 4th edn. London and New York: Routledge, pp. 106–7

Vertovec, Stephen (2005) *The Political Importance of Diasporas*, Migration Information Source. Available at [www.migrationpolicy.org/pubs/Migration\\_Development.php](http://www.migrationpolicy.org/pubs/Migration_Development.php) (accessed June 2005)

Vertovec, Stephen (2006) *The Emergence of Super-Diversity in Britain*, Working Paper No. 25. Oxford: Centre on Migration, Policy and Society, University of Oxford

Vertovec, Stephen (2007) 'Super-diversity and its implications', *Ethnic and Racial Studies*, Vol. 30, No. 6, pp. 1024–54. Available at [www.compas.ox.ac.uk/about/publications/steve/vertovec%20-%20super-diversity.pdf](http://www.compas.ox.ac.uk/about/publications/steve/vertovec%20-%20super-diversity.pdf)

WAG (Welsh Assembly Government) (1999) *Mapping Social Exclusion in Wales, Annual Report*. Available at <http://new.wales.gov.uk/topics/statistics/publications/mse1999/?lang=en>

WAG (Welsh Assembly Government) (2000) *Mapping Social Exclusion in Wales and Communities First: Regenerating Our Most Disadvantaged Communities. Consultation Document*

WAG (Welsh Assembly Government) (2003) *Wales: A Better Country: The Strategic Agenda for the Government of Wales*. Available at [www.wales.gov.uk/themesbettercountry/index.htm](http://www.wales.gov.uk/themesbettercountry/index.htm)

WAG (Welsh Assembly Government) (2004a) *Making the Connections*. Available at [www.wlga.gov.uk/english/internal-publications/wag-making-the-connections-report/](http://www.wlga.gov.uk/english/internal-publications/wag-making-the-connections-report/)

WAG (Welsh Assembly Government) (2004b) *Mainstreaming Equality: A Strategy by the Welsh Assembly Government*. Available at <http://new.wales.gov.uk/caec/publications/equality/mainstreaming/mainstreaminge.pdf?lang=en>

- WAG (Welsh Assembly Government) (2005a) *Delivering the Connections: From Vision to Action – Our 5 Year Action Plan for Delivering Better Services in Wales*. Available at <http://new.wales.gov.uk/topics/improvingservices/newsevents/publications/actionplan/?lang=en>
- WAG (Welsh Assembly Government) (2005b) *Race Equality Scheme 2005–8*. Available at <http://new.wales.gov.uk/topics/equality/publications/raceequalityscheme/?lang=en>
- WAG (Welsh Assembly Government) (2006) *Refugee Inclusion Strategy: Consultation Document*. Available at <http://new.wales.gov.uk/consultations/closed/housandcomm/refugeeinclusion/?lang=en>
- Welsh Refugee Council and EQUAL (2005) Report on the Cardiff Employability Forum Conference held on 6 September 2005
- Werbner, Pnina (2001) 'The limits of cultural hybridity: on ritual monsters, poetic licence and contested postcolonial purification', *Journal of the Royal Anthropological Institute*, Vol. 7, No. 1, pp. 133–52
- Williams, C. (1997) *Ethnic Minorities in Torfaen*. Cymbran: Torfaen County Council
- Williams, Charlotte (1999) 'Passports to Wales? Race, nation and identity', in Ralph Fevre and Andrew Thompson (eds) *Nation, Identity and Social Theory: Perspectives from Wales*. Cardiff: University of Wales Press
- Williams, Charlotte (2003a) 'Social inclusion and race equality in Wales' in Williams *et al.* (eds) *A Tolerant Nation? Exploring Ethnic Diversity in Wales*. Cardiff: University of Wales Press
- Williams, Charlotte (2003b) 'Claiming the national: nation, national identity and ethnic minorities', in Williams *et al.* (eds) *A Tolerant Nation? Exploring Ethnic Diversity in Wales*. Cardiff: University of Wales Press
- Williams, Charlotte, Evans, Neil and O'Leary, Paul (eds) (2003) *A Tolerant Nation? Exploring Ethnic Diversity in Wales*. Cardiff: University of Wales Press
- Williamson, Howard (2004) *The Milltown Boys Revisited*. Oxford: Berg
- Yuval-Davis, Nira, Anthias, Floya and Kofman, Elenore (2005) 'Secure borders and safe haven and the gendered politics of belonging: beyond social cohesion', *Ethnic and Racial Studies*, Vol. 28, No. 3 (May), pp. 513–35

Zetter, Roger, Griffiths, David and Sigona, Nando (2006) *Immigration, Social Cohesion and Social Capital: What are the Links?* York: Joseph Rowntree Foundation. Available at [www.jrf.org.uk/knowledge/findings/socialpolicy/0086.asp](http://www.jrf.org.uk/knowledge/findings/socialpolicy/0086.asp)

Zhou, Min (1992) *Chinatown: The Socioeconomic Potential of an Urban Enclave*. Philadelphia: Temple University Press

# Appendix 1: Terms and definitions

A key aim of this research was to look at how different groups define and use terms like *cohesion*, *integration* and *inclusion*, and we therefore endeavoured to avoid imposing our own definitions. However, the terms are important in considering the settlement of migrants and the changes that take place in, within and between communities; indeed, it is difficult not to employ them. In writing this report, for our own use, we have referred to the definitions used by the Commission on Integration and Cohesion, which seem to us to be particularly clear and useful, the definitions in the Government's response to these and the definitions used in Wales in the Refugee Inclusion Strategy (2006). They are as follows:

## Integration and cohesion

1. Commission on Integration and Cohesion (2007) *Our Shared Future* ([www.integrationandcohesion.org.uk/Our\\_final\\_report.aspx](http://www.integrationandcohesion.org.uk/Our_final_report.aspx))

An integrated and cohesive community is one where:

- There is a clearly defined and widely shared sense of the contribution of different individuals and different communities to a future vision for a neighbourhood, city, region or country
- There is a strong sense of an individual's rights and responsibilities when living in a particular place – people know what everyone expects of them, and what they can expect in turn
- Those from different backgrounds have similar life opportunities, access to services and treatment
- There is a strong sense of trust in institutions locally to act fairly in arbitrating between different interests and for their role and justifications to be subject to public scrutiny
- There is a strong recognition of the contribution of both those who have newly arrived and those who already have deep attachments to a particular place, with a focus on what they have in common

- There are strong and positive relationships between people from different backgrounds in the workplace, in schools and other institutions within neighbourhoods. (p. 10)

2. *The Government's Response to the Commission on Integration and Cohesion* (2008) ([www.communities.gov.uk/publications/communities/governmentresponsecoic](http://www.communities.gov.uk/publications/communities/governmentresponsecoic))

Between August 2006 and June 2007, the Commission embarked on a significant programme of regional visits, round tables and stakeholder consultations, with the aim of assessing progress in cohesion practice since the 'Cantle Report' in 2001 and identifying new opportunities for central and local government to improve their work in this area. (p. 6)

The Commission argued that we needed a new definition of integration and cohesion which reflected increasing local complexity and changing patterns of migration, and one that goes beyond issues of race and faith. (Section 1.3)

### **A new definition of Community Cohesion**

Community Cohesion is what must happen in all communities to enable different groups of people to get on well together. A key contributor to community cohesion is integration which is what must happen to enable new residents and existing residents to adjust to one another.

Our vision of an integrated and cohesive community is based on **three foundations**:

- People from different backgrounds having similar life opportunities
- People knowing their rights and responsibilities
- People trusting one another and trusting local institutions to act fairly

And **three key ways of living together**:

- A shared future vision and sense of belonging
- A focus on what new and existing communities have in common, alongside a recognition of the value of diversity
- Strong and positive relationships between people from different backgrounds. (p. 10)

### 3. Cantle (2001)

Community cohesion has become increasingly popular in public policy debates. It is closely linked to other concepts such as inclusion and exclusion, social capital and differentiation, community and neighbourhood. In this way it has indirectly been the focus of a number of policies and initiatives aimed principally at reducing social exclusion. (Cantle, 2001, p. 14)

## **Inclusion**

Refugee inclusion is a long term, dynamic, two-way process which places demands on both refugee individuals and communities and wider society. The objective of refugee inclusion is the establishment of mutual and responsible relationships between refugees and their communities, civil society and government. Refugee inclusion takes place when a refugee becomes a fully active member of society, participating in and contributing to the economic, social, cultural, civil and political life of the country. (WAG, 2006, p. 4)

## **Community**

The communities into which refugees settle are called receiving communities. This term can refer to the range of different communities – whether the immediate local community, a community of interest or broader society. Refugee inclusion is a two-way process and it is important for the receiving community to play an active role in its achievement, as it is for refugee communities. (WAG, 2006, p. 5)

# Appendix 2: The communities

## Administrators, BME and refugee leaders and professionals

These people worked or volunteered for the Assembly Government, the councils in Cardiff or Merthyr Tydfil, the NHS, NASS, faith groups, refugee community organisations, NGOs and charities. Included in this group were four media professionals. Wherever there was a 'community' which self-identified as such we also spoke to community leaders whose roles sometimes overlapped with those of 'administrators'.

Most of the interviews were with individuals or pairs and included slightly more men than women. Those we interviewed in senior jobs tended to be white (18), and those working with refugees or black and ethnic groups were from a range of origins, including Congolese and Somali. The focus groups were with members of Cymru Refugee & Asylum Seekers Academic Council, the Welsh Association of Refugee Doctors and Refugee Voice Wales. The media interviews were with journalists and an adviser with responsibility for diversity issues.

## The Somali community

The Somali community is the largest minority ethnic group in Cardiff, estimated at between 6,000 and 10,000. The first Somalis arrived in the nineteenth century to work in the docks. The older generations of mostly single men settled in Cardiff, and some married local women and raised families in 'Tiger Bay'. The first Somali families, and Somali women, to settle in Wales were in fact in Newport, and not until the 1960s (Jordan, 2004, p. 21). From the 1970s to May 1988, some members of the community brought their wives and children to Cardiff. Others who had retired to Somaliland returned to Cardiff with their wives and children. But from May 1988, with the beginning of 'all-out' civil war in Somalia, everyone who had family in Somaliland applied for family reunion (Ahmed, 1998, p. 13). The majority of refugees came between 1989 and 1993 (Ahmed, 1998, p. 14). Two very different groups of people were involved: first, the elite of the society in northern Somaliland – qualified professionals and businessmen, some expatriates from the Gulf States, and young single males who were students in Somaliland; and second, since the 1999 Immigration and Asylum Act and the Home Office dispersal of asylum seekers to Cardiff, Somalis from the south, e.g. Mogadishu, and there have been increasing

numbers of unaccompanied minors and single mothers with several children each (Jordan, 2004, p. 25).

We interviewed 18 people in relation to the Somali community and carried out 14 focus groups in a range of locations. These groups involved: 28 male Somalis and 36 female; 14 children between 11 and 18 years; 23 people aged between 19 and 25 years; 17 between 26 and 35 years; 6 between 51 and 65 years; 1 over 65 years (none between 36 and 50 years). Three did not give their ages. They came from all the 'fragments' of communities within the 'community' and included community leaders.

## The Chinese

The Chinese presence in Britain can be traced back to the seamen hired by the East India Company in the late eighteenth century (Holmes, 1988). During the nineteenth century the Opium Wars opened China up to British trade development and this in turn brought more Chinese labourers to Britain. Cardiff was one of the earliest cities to see the gradual evolution of a Chinese seafaring community in the Butetown area, along with several other minority ethnic seafaring communities (Holmes, 1988, p. 32). There have been several waves of immigration over the last century, and each has originated from a different part of China. When businesses prospered, friends or relatives came to join those already succeeding here. Kinship and clan networks led to chain migration, extending the network to more distant relations. This pattern was common for UK diaspora communities originating from Canton and Fujian provinces (Zhou, 1992). The Chinese population in Cardiff is divided into two dominant groups, the Cantonese speakers from Hong Kong and the Mandarin speakers from mainland China. A small number come from Malaysia, Singapore and Taiwan.

Sixteen interviews were recorded with Chinese business people, teachers, academics and two representatives of voluntary organisations, and eleven focus groups. A total of 64 people participated, including 37 males and 27 females. Purposive selection ensured the diversity of participants in terms of region of origin, length of residence, immigration status, education and socio-economic backgrounds. The sample included first-generation Chinese from Hong Kong, and second-generation British-born Chinese (BBCs) and academics/professionals/students and migrant workers from mainland China, Hong Kong, Taiwan and Malaysia. Their occupations included mainstream non-ethnicity-related fields as well as ethnicity-related fields such as catering, traditional Chinese medicine (TCM), importing and travel agency work. Interviews and discussions were conducted in Mandarin Chinese and in English by a Mandarin- and English-speaking community researcher.

### Arab groups

By the end of the nineteenth century Yemeni seamen started settling in the UK in port cities like Cardiff and Liverpool (see Drake, 1954). They came mainly from South Yemen which was colonised by Britain for more than 160 years. After the Second World War, thousands of Yemenis from Aden and other parts of Yemen were recruited to work in the steel mills in British industrial cities like Sheffield.

Nagel (2002) estimates that around 2.5 per cent of the UK's Arab population live in Wales. Yemenis are the dominant group, followed by the Sudanese and the Iraqis. It is estimated that there are 2,000 Yemenis in Cardiff. The Iraqis and Sudanese are very new communities, having established themselves only in the 1990s. These three migrant groups are the main settled Arab groups in South Wales. There are also a number of very small communities whose members number only a few families. Among these are Libyans, Egyptians, Palestinians, Jordanians, Lebanese, Syrians and Algerians. There are a handful of Tunisian and Moroccan families in Cardiff. Finally, there is a group of 'transient communities', consisting mainly of students from Saudi Arabia, Oman, Kuwait, Bahrain, United Arab Emirates and Qatar who stay for five or six years then return to their home countries. Most of the Saudi students study at Cardiff University. These groups live all over the city, from Butetown and the STAR area to more middle-class areas.

Individual interviews were held with those with origins in the Yemen, Sudan, Iraq, Egypt, Libya and Saudi Arabia along with four who were mixed race. Most interviews were with men (24). Many of those interviewed were active in their communities, and some were teachers in schools serving their communities (such as the Shiite school and the Libyan school). The focus groups included men, women and children from the different groups.

### Llandaff

Not only is Llandaff richly supplied with open and recreational space and the possibility for residents to walk or cycle through Llandaff Fields to the city, but the houses too tend to be larger semi-detached and to have gardens which for the UK are reasonably large. Around the Cathedral Green the architecture tells the story of an older history of wealthy churchmen and industrialists who built large houses with huge gardens (now gone), while in the side streets running off the green, and along Cardiff Road, stand much smaller labourers' terraced houses (Llandaff Society, 1998, p. 55): the differing property values and the different-sized houses preserve the same

diversity of class and occupation within the confines of modern Llandaff as in the late nineteenth century.

Although The Landaff Society recounts much inward movement and mobility in Llandaff at the end of the nineteenth century, there is no mention of the word 'immigration' or of the fact that many of those who built Llandaff as it is today came from England. The BBC moved to Llandaff from Park Place in 1967 and BBC Cymru has been located on Cardiff Road in Llandaff ever since, helping to bring immigrants to the area of the kind that go largely unnoticed here and in policy documents.

Our research in Llandaff was conducted at a less in-depth level than in other areas, partly because of time constraints, and partly because many of those we have labelled 'administrators' or media professionals above are among the middle-class inhabitants of this area. The area is predominantly white and many of those who live in Llandaff have encountered minority ethnic groups in Cardiff as part of their work or research. This was true of all those to whom we spoke, although in very different contexts and capacities. One interview and one focus group from the Chinese section of the report have also been drawn on here since they were undertaken with Chinese who worked in Llandaff. Interviews were conducted with the landlady of a village pub, with senior representatives of a private girls' school, and (individually) with a retired married couple, a retired media professional and a teacher of Welsh. An unrecorded focus group was also held with residents from one road in Llandaff: a social worker, a retired and widowed Welsh-speaking television actress, a retired post office owner (male, now deceased), a male solicitor, a female librarian and a male lecturer.

## **Cathays**

Cathays and Roath are located in the north-east and north (respectively) of the city centre. Immediately south of Cathays is Cathays Park, where Cardiff University, the Welsh Office (the administrative offices of the Welsh Assembly Government), Cardiff Council offices, the law courts, main police station and City Hall are found. The university and the Assembly, along with the council, are the major employers in the area. There are two large populations or communities in the Cathays/Roath area which we have not included at all. The first is the group of people employed by the major employers in the area. These are dealt with elsewhere in this report as 'administrators'. The other is the large Asian population which is well established. Asian visibility is high in the area: there are three mosques, one of which is on the main Crwys Road, and a Muslim school, and a considerable proportion of the shopkeepers are Asian.

The groups we have looked at are the student community, migrant workers and the older white working-class community who originally occupied the area. Originally these choices were made because we wanted to see if transient populations of immigrants, such as students, and especially international students, produced different effects in and for local populations than those immigrants who came to stay. We had not anticipated finding migrant workers as well. One interviewee estimates that of the 22,000 students at Cardiff University, approximately 8,000 live in Cathays. There are approximately 3,000 international students from over 100 countries. Our own data, derived from the demographic questionnaires filled out by focus group participants, identifies twelve different self-descriptions of ethnicities among the 70 focus group members who chose to answer this question. The three largest groups are 'White' (40 per cent), 'European' (17 per cent) and 'White European' (17 per cent). There are eight different nationalities: Welsh, British, English, Portuguese, Polish, Spanish, Lithuanian and Slovakian.

The information about the student community comes from three focus groups with students and interviews with four student leaders (a Student Union campaigns and public relations sabbatical officer, a student newspaper editor, and two Student Volunteer Cardiff managers), a landlord, and a community police officer ('community constable for the students') dealing with students. There are five focus groups with migrant workers – three mixed groups with Poles, Portuguese and Lithuanians, one with Slovaks and one with Spanish women. The remaining focus groups were with older, retired, working-class residents.

## STAR

The population of STAR (Splott, Tremorfa, Adamsdown and Roath) is a very diverse one with interesting histories and is one of the older areas of Cardiff undergoing a degree of gentrification as property prices in the capital continue to rise and young professionals buy houses in STAR at much lower prices than elsewhere. According to interviewees from the STAR area of Cardiff, workers in the creative industries are moving in 'because house prices are lower' than in the traditional arts/media centres in Llandaff and Canton. There is now 'a tremendous variety of restaurants', and a new snobbery, linked to the regeneration of Cardiff Bay. The area began to develop from the mid nineteenth century, with docks built in 1839 and 1846 to export coal mined in the Valleys.

These industries attracted immigration, mainly from the Welsh counties, then from the Midlands, Devon, Cornwall and Somerset, but by far the highest number came

from Ireland as South Wales imported labour to speed up industrialisation. This produced a strong Irish Catholic and English influence in Splott. By 1861 there were 18,000 Irish living in South Wales. In 1891, the East Moor Steelworks opened in Splott and many more workers and their families arrived in Cardiff to live and work in the area. In the 1930s the gradual decline of Merthyr Tydfil saw the closure of the steelworks there and the transference of business to East Moor. Business boomed until the mid 1960s when a world surplus of steel saw the beginnings of a steady decline, which led to the closure of the plant in 1978. At its peak in the early 1960s the plant had employed 10,000 men. Unlike Butetown, however, the STAR area of Cardiff has had, over the last century, a mainly white, and originally immigrant, population.

This report on STAR is based on eleven interviews and one focus group conducted with 'administrators' working and often living in the STAR area and with white residents (mostly senior citizens). In addition, in this section, we have utilised focus group material from the Welsh Assembly Government Refugee Inclusion project we were working on alongside this one in 2005 (Threadgold and Clifford, 2005). All participants signed ethics forms for both projects and agreed to participate in both. These included focus groups conducted with: Somali women; Somali children aged 11–17 (and living in Tremorfa); Eastern European women who were asylum seekers before the accession of their home nations to the European Union (which granted them leave to remain in the UK in 2005), living in Splott/Adamsdown and Splott/Grangetown; Congolese refugees and asylum seekers (in Roath and carried out at the African shop in Roath although not all of these people live in the STAR area); destitute Congolese asylum seekers; and an interview with the leader of Voice of the Congo, who is a refugee himself. We make no claim here to an in-depth study, only to offer some snapshots of the kinds of issues around migration and social cohesion which seem to emerge from our limited work in the area.

## **Merthyr Tydfil**

Merthyr Tydfil is approximately 30 miles to the north-west of Cardiff in the South Wales Valleys. A predominantly white community which was part of the former South Wales coalfield, it has had waves of English, Irish, Italian, Russian, Polish and French new migrants, with the biggest influx of immigration between 1901 and 1911. Between the wars, on the other hand, half a million people emigrated from the Valleys looking for work. Merthyr has a small population of Pakistanis, is the site for multinational industry, and in the year preceding our fieldwork had experienced a sudden arrival of 100 Portuguese meat workers to work for a company supplying

supermarkets. Merthyr is a regeneration area with considerable unemployment and disadvantage among the majority white population and one where the issues around social cohesion and new migration might be expected to be very different to those in the other areas profiled above.

Thirteen participants took part in the individual and paired interviews – nine men, three women and one unrecorded. All were white administrators. Eight of the focus groups were held with Portuguese migrant workers then living in Merthyr, two with residents in hostels, two with residents in sheltered accommodation and two with young people. The remainder were with residents from the estates.